The Higher Education Academy
Business Education Critical Review Series

A CRITICAL REVIEW OF CONTEMPORARY PRACTICE AND EDUCATIONAL RESEARCH IN INTERNATIONALISATION WITHIN THE BUSINESS EDUCATION SUBJECT COMMUNITIES

FINAL REPORT

February 2012

Dr Viv Caruana & Dr Josef Ploner

Leeds Metropolitan University

leeds
metropolitan
university

CONTENTS

AIMS AND SCOPE OF THE CRITICAL REVIEW

This report critically reviews contemporary educational research and practice in the field of internationalisation within the business education subject communities in order to inform curriculum development and pedagogy geared towards the development of international perspectives and intercultural learning. Drawing on current pedagogical literatures as well as staff and student consultations, it identifies a number of key points which reflect good practice in business education curricula. Due to the broad disciplinary scope of the subject area in focus and the diversity of curricular activities across the UK, this critical review is selective rather than exhaustive and seeks to stimulate further discussion and research in the field. The report is structured as a reference text around key themes and issues emerging from the review, providing the reader who has a particular interest or issue in their practice with an outline of key texts which can be followed up as appropriate. The report thus:

- provides a compact overview of effective practice in business education internationalisation;

- outlines the methodology used to undertake this critical review;

- contextualises business education discourse within a framework of globalisation and internationalisation;

- provides clarification of identified key themes and discusses current trends and tendencies in BMAF internationalisation;

- identifies gaps in research and practice related to the internationalisation of business education curricula.

I   EXAMPLES OF GOOD PRACTICE

I.I   CULTURALLY MIXED GROUP WORK

- Particularly in International Accounting engage students in various forms of co-operative learning to create supportive team experiences and foster the development of discussion skills and enhanced engagement with content (Farell and Farell, 2008);

- Workshops, videos and computer-mediated content and communication complemented by reflective journaling can improve English writing ability and enable students to express feelings in preparation for sharing ideas, perspectives etc. in face-to-face group situations (Abraham, 2007);

- Structured pair work tasks can be used to involve students in extended periods of cross-cultural learning based on for example, field trips within the local multicultural community where students interact with the community and observe behaviours. Activities which enable students to examine each other's cultural biases, beliefs, values and ways of meaning making are also more effective when conducted in pairs over a period of time (Briguglio, 2007; Calvert et al, 2009);

- Multi-media tools can be used to enable students from different cultural backgrounds to feel more comfortable with highly participatory activities and assignments through providing greater anonymity and more time for reflection before response (Budde-Sung, 2011);

- Be explicit about the reasons for organising culturally-mixed groups, sharing ideas about the sort of learning they promote, the difficulties likely to be encountered and how team projects are integrated into unit curricula (Briguglio, 2007):
- Organise an initial workshop to prepare students for team work, raise awareness of language and cultural issues and generate team members' commitment (Briguglio, 2007);

- Think creatively about processes of group composition challenging the popular tendency for student or teacher selection, to encompass alternative strategies such as asking individuals to find say, four people with whom and from whom they feel they are likely to learn most in intercultural settings (Antal and Friedman, 2008);

- Monitor team progress, particularly group members' contributions and be prepared to manage fairness and cultural and linguistic diversity within teams (Briguglio, 2007);

- Require students to maintain a portfolio to illustrate cultural and linguistic aspects of intercultural business discourse (including written, video and other visual medium 'texts') and endeavour to build in an individual and/or peer assessment component (Abraham, 2007; Briguglio, 2007);

- Since students' attitudes to multicultural group work are in large part determined by the accumulation of experience with multiple languages and cultures over a period of time, semester-long group projects may provide a more positive learning experience than projects of much shorter duration (Summers and Volet, 2008);

- Give diverse student cohorts more choice in assessment, offering a variety of assessment types that balance vigorous discussion with less demanding and intrusive ways of interacting (Abraham, 2007; Budde-Sung, 2011).

1.2 EXPERIENTIAL LEARNING STRATEGIES FOR INTERNATIONALISATION

- International case studies may be more a part of the business education problem rather than the solution if they are used in a traditional, prescriptive manner which calls forth initial excitement and anticipation, but in practice affords little enhancement of analytical skills and powers of synthesis (Sharma and Roy, 1996);

- Deploy case study method as an indirect form of experiential learning which initiates reality by putting the reader in the role of participant in the situation, thereby encouraging students to construct their own meanings and solutions (Ramburuth and Daniel, 2011);

- Encourage students to develop case studies themselves by adapting commercially produced versions to alternative cultural perspectives in national groups and pooling results in class, or by working in multinational teams to produce original case studies based on business-related cultural dilemmas and problems they have experienced (Briguglio, 2007);

- Engage diverse groups of students in authentic innovative student-centred learning strategies such as student organised and administered conferences (Aggarwal and Goodell, 2011);

- Provide integrative, interactive, realistic business experiences through action learning in a live and real-time situation which emphasises the need to actually do something, rather than simply write a report about what could be done (Blaycock et al, 2009);

- Use simulation and other experiential learning strategies in comparative cross-cultural settings to challenge Finance and Accounting students' tendency to focus on the ability to recognise and appropriately apply numbers to models and to show that these disciplines are not only about more than numbers, but they are also about more than just the UK (Blackburn, 2011);

- The experiential learning embodied in student international exchanges, travel, internships etc. should involve opportunities for critical engagement, active learning and reflection (Crossman, 2009);

- In International Business and related areas develop teaching and learning practices which not only address pragmatic best practices of multinational corporations (MNCs) etc. but also help to develop the 'global mind-set' and embrace citizenship education based on concepts of self, universe etc. Citizenship perspectives can be promoted through an approach which extends beyond the immediate impact of globalisation to consider causes and key drivers in terms of sustainability, technology and demographics (Aggarwal, 2011; Aggarwal and Goodell, 2011);

- Global MAPs or multidisciplinary action projects can be organised around team teaching focused on how to lead, manage and use knowledge of each subject area to achieve world class operational effectiveness. Faculty teaching basic concepts can liaise with field 'experts' in guiding students through projects which improve a specific process in a sponsoring

company (Sharma and Roy, 1996);

- A mission-based approach offers a tiered framework in which global perspectives are developed in steps through awareness, understanding and competence (Kedia and Englis, 2011).

1.3   DEVELOPING AND EXTENDING TEACHERS' SKILLS IN THE FACE OF DIVERSITY

- Teachers particularly of international topics need flexible curricula and pedagogy which can be tailored to the cultural make-up of cohorts. Teachers' own skills in cross-cultural communication can be developed by learning from 'cultural bumps' – defining own cultural values in context, defining expectations of appropriate behaviour in own culture, determining the human quality that this behaviour manifests and exploring with students how other cultures demonstrate this human quality (Abraham, 2007; Budde-Sung, 2011);

- Extensive use of team work and team teaching in pedagogy serves to underscore the interdisciplinary nature of business education in the globalised world of the 21st century extending teachers' knowledge, attitudes and skills beyond the functional mind-set (Sharma and Roy, 1996);

- Global perspectives for students are supported by teachers sharing their experiences of teaching internationally in small illustrations, 'war stories' and vignettes and encouraging students to do likewise;

- Business education encompasses a relatively complex customer-base ranging from full-time MBA to short term executive education cohorts, whilst increasingly embracing a 'world-wide' contingent. Library services can support mainstream teaching staff in business schools through extending and diversifying beyond the traditional elements of business school support to provide a range of teaching/training offerings (Broadhurst, 2010);

- Pedagogical approaches which engage multinational companies and other employers are more effective than surveys in identifying the sorts of intercultural communication skills required to enable graduates to work effectively in diverse contexts (Briguglio, 2007).

2 THE CONTEXT OF HIGHER EDUCATION IN BUSINESS, MANAGEMENT, ACCOUNTING AND FINANCE IN THE 21ST CENTURY – THE INFLUENCE OF GLOBALISATION

2.1 BUSINESS SCHOOLS RESTRUCTURING AROUND GLOBALISATION AND INTERNATIONALISATION – KEY DRIVERS AND TRENDS

2.1.1 GLOBAL BUSINESS SCHOOLS MIRRORING THE GLOBAL BUSINESS ENVIRONMENT

The internationalisation of business education became popular after the Second World War although universities like Harvard and Stanford have offered international business courses and internships from the 1920s. The Academy of International Business was created in 1959 but internationalisation in earnest did not register until the 1980s when the end of the Cold War facilitated the latest wave of globalisation which eradicated existing restrictions to global commerce, enhanced market integration and increased the level of interdependency among the world's economies (Elahee and Norbis, 2009; Bill-Bin et al, n.d.).

The global economy of the 21st century is characterised by growing influence on the part of international and multinational businesses and large numbers of cross-border mergers, strategic alliances, company expansions etc. In some ways trends in global business schools mirror the trends in international business itself as is the case in for example, the aggressive development of educational networks (vertical, horizontal, regional and international) with foreign universities and the incidence of joint ventures involving two schools in two different countries, which is probably the most potent emerging form of globalised management education (Bennett and Kane, 2009; Elahee and Norbis, 2009).

2.1.2 PROFESSIONAL ACCREDITATION BODIES DRIVING EDUCATIONAL PROCESSES

In the 21st century the business school curriculum is being internationalised largely because of rising levels of student demand for internationalised courses which reflects employers' needs for staff with international perspectives. However, for Leggott and Stapleford (2008) a key driver of internationalisation in business schools is the satisfaction of the requirements of the major business school accreditation bodies such as the Association to Advance Collegiate Schools of Business (AACBS) and the European Qualification Improvement System (EQUIS). As early as 1974 AACBS required evidence of international topics in accredited business schools. By the 1990s this focus had been extended to coverage of global issues and global environments, in the context of leadership and citizenship roles in business and society - domestic and worldwide. More recently, AACSB International Standard 15 demonstrates a growing focus on global education with requirements to include globalisation and information systems in curricula and to prepare graduates to interact with people from other cultures (Bennett and Kane, 2009; Finley et al 2007; Sharma and Roy, 1996).

2.1.3 DIFFERENT STRATEGIC ASPIRATIONS ACROSS THE GLOBE INFLUENCING CURRICULUM ASPIRATIONS

Generally, there are significant differences in strategic aspirations as between East and West, North and South and relatively riche, as opposed to poorer parts of the world. Such differences can in large part be explained in terms of economic strategy, government action, supply and demand, perceived quality issues, academic career opportunity costs, professional accreditation and prevailing world view, although resource flows and availability are key determinants. In Canada for example, a tendency towards the early introduction of international electives to Western business programmes in the 1980s has more recently given way to measures to internationalise the curriculum more generally and to a more strategic focus on partnerships and student exchanges which has had far reaching implications in terms of both costs and benefits (Elkin et al, 2008; Felton and Kusy, 2009; Le Blanc, 2005).

Such trends are in stark contrast to, for example, Latin America where internationalisation of the curriculum has always been considered a key component of internationalising business education in the relative absence of large numbers of international students and staff and other measures traditionally used to judge the extent of internationalisation (such as study abroad, foreign internship). In global business terms Africa is very much an emerging but neglected continent along with other regions like Latin America demonstrating the link between international development and business (Elahee and Norbis, 2009; Moore, 2010; Pestonjee, 2010).

2.1.4   VALUES – A MAJOR DETERMINANT OF MANAGEMENT THEORY AND PRACTICE

Bill-Bin et al (n.d.) alert us to the importance of understanding that some national cultures where variance is relatively limited, may be seen as forming discrete blocs (such as Chinese and Western) where teaching and learning approaches in one bloc are not necessarily complementary to practices in another bloc. For the authors this point assumes overwhelming significance when broader contextual factors are considered such as: the increase in the number of joint ventures involving Chinese and Western firms; the increasing incidence of foreign-owned enterprises operating in China; the fact that China represents the largest potential market for goods and services in the world and is possibly the largest new market for management education. Addressing the historical and cultural factors which have influenced learning processes in Chinese and in European cultures shows the extent to which values determine the theories and practice of management and business education (perceptions, value judgements and behaviours acceptable in one group being regarded as completely abnormal in another) (Bill-Bin et al, n.d.).

2.1.5   MODELLING THE TRAJECTORY OF INTERNATIONALISATION ACROSS UK BUSINESS SCHOOLS

Whilst most UK business schools and departments offer numerous courses incorporating the word 'international' the content, purposes, directions and delivery of these courses varies considerably reflecting differences in the depth, scope and mode of internationalisation of business education. In some cases internationalisation is interpreted as simply a requirement to improve facilities for international students, in others it is associated with root and branch reform of syllabuses and teaching methods. Sometimes the focus is on standardisation of content and structures which will facilitate the co-ordination of activities which in themselves accelerate global processes, at other times the focus appears to be on building 'global mind-set' which implies the development of graduates capable of operating

effectively in a multitude of diverse global environments. Different directions may manifest in different programmes of study but this is not necessarily always the case, since the same content can be used in different ways to satisfy different (professional or academic) orientations (Bill-Bin et al n.d.; Elkin et al 2008).

Bennett and Kane (2009) posit a model where various dimensions of internationalisation (extent, speed, intensity, degree of curriculum internationalisation etc.) can be explained by a university's general financial situation and relative reliance on income from foreign students; size, age and employability record of the business school; the extent of the school's motivation to recruit more students from abroad; the managerial predilection in favour or otherwise of internationalisation and the belief that the employability of domestic as well as international students improves with an internationalised curriculum. The authors conclude that engagement in internationalisation in UK business schools is substantial and particularly prevalent in larger business schools and older universities, with a clear focus on franchised provision overseas and the recruitment of foreign teaching staff (Bennett and Kane, 2009).

2.2 FROM FUNCTIONAL FIELDS IN BUSINESS SCHOOLS TO 'INTERNATIONAL BUSINESS'

2.2.1 STAND-ALONE PROVISION VERSUS INTEGRATION

The globalised world of the 21st century is more inter-connected politically and economically than at any time in the past and this has a significant impact on the traditional functional fields of business schools. International dimensions are increasingly being catered for by the introduction of dedicated stand-alone modules like International Business. Alternatively, units dealing with international considerations are developed within specific business functions. Another way of teaching for globalisation and internationalisation is simply injecting appropriate materials and content into pre-existing modules. In contrast to the narrow focus of functional fields in business like finance, marketing or management, international business is cross-disciplinary, integrative, multidimensional with potentially a high degree of complexity, since it is concerned both with international and business issues. Broader contextual issues assume importance in exploring multinational enterprise (MNE) activities and interactions, cross-border activities of firms, impact of the international environment on firms, cross-country comparative studies, and the international dimensions of organisational firms (Aggarwal and Goodell, 2011; Ashcroft et al, 2008; Bennett and Kane, 2009; Manuel et al, 2008; Taylor and Finley, 2010; Zettinig and Zsuzsanna, 2008).

2.2.2 AN ALTERNATIVE MODEL – SEMI-GLOBALISATION

The rhetoric of globalisation in business education is seen by some authors as engendering a 'craving' for distinctly global content in MBA programmes. A pre-occupation with multinational enterprises (MNEs) to the detriment of other key organisations and actors is compounded by an obsession with the perceived skills gap in relation to what global industrial leaders of companies like the Fortune 500 require and what academia supplies. Ghemawat (2008) argues that consideration of cross-border issues are thereby overshadowed and proposes that 'semi-globalisation' which addresses the large differences that arise at national borders, as well as the bridges across them, is a useful conceptual framework for organising curricular change. Thus, rather than insertion of stand-alone international courses like International Business or infusion of international courses into

functional courses, an alternative model would blend infusion and insertion as complementary concepts. The CAGE framework (culture, administrative/political/institutional, geographic and economic dimensions of countries) is proposed as a means of considering why countries differ relevant to cross-border relations (Ghemawat, 2008; Milhauser and Rahschulte, 2010; S'liwa and Cairris, 2009).

2.2.3 COUNTERING CULTURAL BIAS IN INTERNATIONAL BUSINESS TEXTS

A fundamental issue is the deconstruction of culture in mainstream international business textbooks. Authors suggest that the canon of classical economics dictates the focus of education for international business. In the absence of fundamental re-alignment which acknowledges recent advances in cultural intelligence, critical reflexivity and post-colonial perspectives on management education, constructive critical pedagogy within the classroom assumes heightened significance (Kyvik, 2009; S'liwa and Cairris, 2009; Witte, 2010). Fougere and Moulettes (2011) are noteworthy in their use of post-colonial theory as a lens for examining the power relations concealed in the literature, largely constructed from a central or Western position, which views the rest of the world as periphery. It is argued that powerful discourse rather than author intention perpetuates a '…critical guise of neutrality…' which effectively silences and suppresses alternative views.

Despite claims to cultural empathy, what transpires is 'ready to use knowledge' about different national cultures, where dichotomies abound between western and non-western, the latter stereotyped most crudely with the former similarly stereotyped in mirror image. Furthermore, in pursuit of a 'purified canon' based on rationality the historical, political and socio-economic influences on the development of organisations are ignored. The authors engage in a rich and comprehensive discussion of these emerging patterns in texts and suggest how the problems related to them can be addressed (Fougere and Moulettes, 2011).

2.3 DO ALL BUSINESS STUDENTS REQUIRE GLOBAL PERSPECTIVES AND CROSS-CULTURAL CAPABILITY?

2.3.1 THE PROFESSIONAL BODIES

Internationalisation of the curriculum has been a priority of professional organisations since the early 1970s and its influence has increased significantly over the last 15 years or so. With internationalisation has come a more apparent concern with culture - recently ranked five in the top 12 issues in international accounting – which provides people in early life with a national set of values which influence what information is processed and considered reliable both in paper and electronic media. However, whilst members of the professional bodies might acknowledge the need for international perspectives and cross-cultural skills, educators in the field are more ambivalent (Ashcroft et al, 2008).

2.3.2 EDUCATORS' VIEWS - INTERNATIONALISATION FOR ALL

Some practitioners claim the study of internationalisation and cross-cultural topics in business-related degrees is essential for professional success. Killick (2008) cited in Bennett and Kane (2009) for example, argues that globalisation has changed the world of work both at home and abroad, therefore all graduates need to be equipped with cross-cultural

capabilities. Miller (2007) similarly highlights the influence of labour migratory patterns on the global working environment and emphasises the need for managers to be able to work compassionately with diverse people both at home and abroad (Miller, 2007).

2.3.3 EDUCATORS' VIEWS – INTERNATIONALISATION FOR INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

McGowan and Potter (2008) as cited in Bennett and Kane (2009) see the internationalisation of business curricula as serving the needs of international students alone, enabling institutions to gain the competitive edge in the international market, whilst 'crowding-out' materials and activities more relevant to domestic students' future employability. Undoubtedly, business is one of the most popular areas of study for international students at British universities with 31% of students opting for majors within business fields (Budde-Sung, 2011) yet the current (2007) QAA benchmark statement, for Accounting (an update of a prior version published in 2000) makes no mention of 'international' or 'global' competence or capability (Gutowska, 2007; Ashcroft et al 2008; Blackburn, 2011; Budde-Sung, 2011).

2.3.4 PEDAGOGICAL IMPERIALISM OR STUDENT EMPOWERMENT?

The management of global resources has become a key issue for business schools the world over in the 21st century, as has the inculcation of the global mind-set, global knowledge and skills, but to what degree have teaching practices adapted? Drawing on data about business schools in 26 countries Kragh and Djurssan (2006) use the 'student empowerment index' to demonstrate a relationship between teaching styles and various indicators of cultural and political modernity. The emerging model emphasises the empowerment of students within a more socio-cultural and political learning environment (Alyoshina, 2007; Kedia and Englis, 2008; Kragh and Djurssan, 2006).

A moot question is who is being empowered and in which direction? Bennett and Kane (2009) show that whilst attempts at curriculum internationalisation are widespread across UK business schools, this does not generally extend to the inclusion of non-Western cultural issues and topics within courses and only a minority attempt to assess and grade intercultural competence. Similarly, Ng (2007) cited in Budde-Sung, (2011) notes that Western educators need to beware of 'pedagogical imperialism' or the application of Western theories and Western ethics to an Eastern concept of business where perceptions of the structure and meaning of business and thus of business ethics, can differ greatly (Bennett and Kane, 2009; Budde-Sung, 2011).

2.4 MAINTAINING CURRENCY IN 'INTERNATIONAL ACCOUNTING'

2.4.1 DIVERSE DIRECTIONS IN A GLOBAL CONTEXT

Global business means more international accounting issues and new directions within accounting education. In the U.S. accounting for and by multinational corporations (MNCs) assumes priority with a focus on reporting and disclosure problems. In Europe understanding foreign accounting and harmonisation is a central consideration. The UK generally has a longer tradition in international accounting and curricula may include topics as diverse as corporate social responsibility accounting, conceptual framework development, comparative

standards and harmonisation, accounting for MNCs, international standard enforcement etc. (Aisbitt, 2005; Ashcroft et al 2008).

2.4.2   RESPONDING TO GLOBAL CHANGE – THE PROBLEM OF 'KEEPING UP'

What was once considered optional is now becoming integrated within the core curriculum of business, yet the global landscape is changing with such rapidity and complexity that textbooks can be out-of date before they are published (Aisbitt, 2005; Ashcroft et al 2008). Many authors refer to the recent political pressures to increase transparency in financial reporting and attendant calls for the adoption of International Financial Reporting Standards (IFRSs) which in turn, suggest the need to integrate IFRSs alongside national accounting practices in accounting curricula. The literature recommends supplementing textbooks with readily accessible resources, links to companion websites providing updates and to the websites of larger accounting and business firms and regulatory bodies. However, for some new topics in the accounting curriculum like intellectual capital, it may be the case that the teacher has to use particular ingenuity in framing and developing the subject (Abeysekera, 2008; Aisbitt, 2005; Ashcroft et al 2008; James, 2010; Langmead et al, 2010; Larson and Street, 2011; Tyrrall and Aggerstam, 2011).

3 DISCUSSION OF KEY THEMES IN PEDAGOGY, CURRICULUM AND TEACHING AND LEARNING PRACTICE

3.1 MISMATCHED EXPECTATIONS, CULTURAL DIFFERENCE AND PEDAGOGY – BRIDGING THE GAP BETWEEN STUDENTS AND STAFF

3.1.1 CULTURAL MARGINALISATION AND ADJUSTMENT – A QUESTION OF POWER RELATIONS?

MBA pedagogy can be patriarchal or ethnocentric reflecting the predominance of an Anglo-American model which expects students to be proactive, make contributions to lectures, critically analyse, construct and verbalise an argument. It is frequently argued that international students are marginalised within this model, although for young Chinese students in the UK for example, adaptation to varying degrees in ideology, socialisation, forms of discourse and face system does take place, with the extent of adjustment moderated by individual learning approaches and contextual mediation (Currie, 2007; Wang et al, 2011).

Many authors explain the pedagogical problem in terms of cross-cultural considerations although others explain the problem more in terms of power relations. Currie (2007) shows how MBA pedagogy is in fact enmeshed in a wider set of power relations, whereby the recipients of a broadly Western-based knowledge may struggle to assert their own identities. A key issue in this context is lecturers' persistent lack of understanding of international students' initial and continuing issues during study, whereby language is seen as the root of the problem whilst students cite a lack of culturally – related knowledge of local HE academic norms. Whilst differences in expectations and competing perspectives on the pedagogical problem may be closely related to norms, conventions, values and beliefs within the disciplines, they may equally reflect a general lack of empathy and reflexivity on the part of educators (Currie, 2007; Clifford, 2009; Hall and Wai-Ching Sung, 2009; Sawir, 2011).

3.1.2 MODELLING SHIFTING VALUE DISPOSITIONS TO ENHANCE THE STUDENT LEARNING EXPERIENCE

Abraham (2007) applies the Model of Basic Values (Lingenfelter and Mayers, 2003) to reveal core differences in expectations between students and educators based on a value continuum which addresses time versus event orientation, task versus person focus, crisis versus non-crisis direction and willingness or reluctance to expose one's own vulnerability. The author goes on to suggest teaching methods and personal interactions which can assist in building bridges between teachers and multicultural cohorts. In a case study of one institution's attempts to implement curriculum internationalisation in six core business disciplines of Economics, Management, Marketing, Accounting, Commercial Law and Quantitative Analysis, Crosling et al (2008) show how the philosophy of internationalisation differs fundamentally within each field. Emerging from this discussion is the need for organisational change involving planning and a sense of psychological ownership by staff who are required to teach different materials in a different way. Guidance on internationalising the curriculum and shifting staff expectations through self-

initiating change processes like practitioner research are provided by Crosling et al (2008) and Hills and Thom (2005).

3.1.3   DIALOGICAL PRACTICE TO LEVERAGE CULTURAL DIVERSITY

Evidence suggests that discussions within lectures are sometimes deemed an unnecessary 'side-show', that difficulties are experienced in relation to criticising theory and practice and that cultural asymmetry is experienced in light of UK students' and management teachers' pedagogical assumptions about group work. Confusion, fear and anxiety stemming from the need to unlearn previously socialised patterns of cognition and behaviour result in feelings of isolation and silence. Currie (2007) goes on to argue that MBA pedagogy needs to be radically reconfigured to take account of the new world order and presents a number of vignettes of dialogical practice which can leverage cultural diversity and the knowledge of international students more effectively for internationalisation (Currie, 2007).

3.1.4   LEVERAGING CULTURAL DIVERSITY IN LARGE CLASSES

Cockburn-Wootton and Cockburn (2011) is useful in addressing the mismatch of expectations not only as between teachers and students but also among peer groups. These authors argue that Business and Management students can be heavily socialised towards competitiveness and searching for the right and truthful answer. They can manifest 'trained incapacities' which tend towards reproduction of the status quo, neglect of diversity in practice and neglect of the responsibilities of business within the wider, societal context. This article shows how issues of power, context, discourses, inequalities and diversity in management and organisational communication, can be integrated into large classes by using Lecture Learning Groups and 'game activity'. Such interventions create a safe learning environment where students can challenge their 'trained incapacities', make mistakes, 'think aloud', develop as a community of learners and begin to see the world as others see it (Cockburn-Wootton and Cockburn, 2011).

3.2   CULTURAL CAPITAL AND PREFERRED LEARNING STYLES

3.2.1   SURFACE LEARNING OR DEEP LEARNING?

Evidence suggests that although culture-anchored values are a strong predictor of learning style preferences, such preferences are not static and in some instances a learning approach that initially leads to surface learning outcomes is the first step towards a deep learning outcome. For example, memorising can be meaningless rote learning or it can be meaningful memorisation as a stepping-stone for a deep learning outcome. Within a framework of Hofstede's (1986) understanding of the 'dimensions of culture' Abeysekera (2008) challenges popular notions of international students as surface learners, showing that on comparison with home students they have a preference for interactive lectures and group-based learning, even in the context of new topics not encountered before. The corollary is that societal culture influences student learning in different ways in different learning settings, but students can in time embrace the societal culture of the country in which they study (Abeysekera, 2008; Mitsis and Foley, 2009).

3.2.2 ACADEMIC CULTURAL CAPITAL AND ACADEMIC ACHIEVEMENT

The traditional MBA teaching style premised upon the values of individualism, competition, self-interest and masculinity, can be problematic for students whose cultures centre on intrinsic, feminine values characterised by high humane orientation, low assertiveness, high collectivism and low performance orientation. The power-distance dimension of culture also influences learning preferences with students from countries with low power-distance feeling most comfortable criticising scholars, engaging in classroom discussion and often being the most demanding of multimedia technology in the classroom (Budde-Sung, 2011). Grayson (2011) provides insight into the possible connections between academic achievement and high-brow culture, the involvement of parents in students' schooling, students' problem-solving ability and maths, speaking and writing skills. This work suggests that student background is highly influential in the sense that Chinese students may be served by different types of cultural capital than their domestic counterparts, or that deficiencies in one area of cultural capital may be offset by strengths in other areas (Budde-Sung, 2011; Grayson, 2011).

3.3 INNOVATIVE PRACTICE FOR THE INTERNATIONALISED CURRICULUM – SOME EXAMPLES FROM EXPERIENTIAL LEARNING

Critical and rigorous experiential learning, often referred to as 'learning by doing' is a central component of international and intercultural learning in business contexts, which involves a sense-making process of active engagement between the 'inner world' of the individual and the 'outer world' of environments. International exchanges, internships etc. provide students with the opportunity to think 'outside the box' and develop 'soft skills' (Crossman 2009). Blackburn (2011) shows how important international university partnerships are in developing fruitful business simulations which challenge students to explore their 'mental mind maps and theories' by thinking about behavioural aspects of people and organisations in terms of motivation, group dynamics, leadership and effective communication.

Whilst an experience-based, active, problem-oriented approach to business education is popularly regarded as the gold standard all too often cases, simulations, experiential learning projects and other strategies fall short of expected outcomes (Blaycock et al, 2009). This may reflect the absence of a balanced, holistic approach addressing affective, behavioural and cognitive domains aligning emotional intelligence with global literacy (Crossman, 2009). The interventions discussed below may go some way in supporting this more holistic approach.

The Business School Laboratory – Blaycock et al (2009) present an adaptation of the classic Nursing School Clinical Laboratory in the form of the Business School Laboratory (BSL) which is – rather than a supplement to a traditional course – the foundation on which all learning experiences are based. It is claimed that continuous immersion in the lab can assist in keeping curricula relevant and current, creating a context for subject matter and enhancing students' placement experiences. Advice is provided on creating 'experiments', strategies for and issues associated with implementation and how to overcome resistance to change (Blaycock et al, 2009).

Caruana and Ploner, 2011, Higher Education Academy, Business and Management
(previously the HEA Business, Management, Accountancy and Finance Subject Centre)

17

Action learning – Action learning is a popular form of experiential learning, focused on the introduction of real world critical perspectives on management practices and processes. Hay (2010) argues that action learning in unfamiliar international locations are particularly useful in taking managers 'out of place', removing them from everyday work settings, which enables them to more readily challenge taken-for-granted aspects of the management function and role. Sharing experience of an MBA international consultancy project, Hay (2010) provides comprehensive and in-depth guidance on how the project was set up and executed whilst also exploring the field experience and project learning outcomes. He goes on to suggest how action learning may be developed as a process of organising as well as a process of learning, how in assessment, action should be complemented by a focus on organising and how action learning in international settings can leverage the benefits of 'unsettling experiences' (Hay, 2010).

Simulations - Woods et al (2011) address the role of simulations in assisting integration among diverse cohorts of business students by providing a detailed description of an intervention called 'the production game', exploring student learning preferences and different interactive learning strategies and indicating the ways in which students valued their experience of the game. It is concluded that the game not only heightened awareness of the need for group collaboration in business operations, but proved to be an excellent enabler of integration providing a nuanced balance of complexity and challenge which encouraged individuals to co-operate in teams.

Learning by proverbs – Sronce and Li (2010) provide us with an example of the way in which country-specific proverbs may be used to develop solutions in cross-cultural management situations. A discussion around how cultural dimension frameworks and proverbs are linked is followed by a detailed description of the learning activity and its objectives. The activity involves the five stages of experiential learning – awareness, analysis, knowledge acquisition, synthesis and evaluation and reflection. The activity demonstrates how culture is passed down the generations and how sayings reflect essential beliefs. Based on new knowledge students go on to formulate responses to realistic management dilemmas (Sronce and Li, 2010).

Part-time employment as a site for experiential learning – Morasuna and Hadley, (2010) deploy Bourdieu's concept of cultural capital as a lens for understanding students' experiences beyond academic settings and how this experience may be harnessed to develop culturally embodied traits. Theoretical and policy implications are derived from an exploration of three sites of accumulation of cultural capital – academia, informal/social and part-time employment – the particular skills developed within each site and the impact they have on academic attainment and future development (Morasuna and Hadley, 2010).

International community and corporate citizenship 'service learning' – The literature suggests how service-learning can provide hands-on experiential learning particularly appropriate to ethical and moral considerations in a variety of fields including accounting and business and in consideration of corporate citizenship more generally (Sharifi et al, 2009; Vega, 2007). Korfhage (2010) in explaining the development and rationale for a project-based course conducted in partnership with the local consulate office and Mello (2006) both provide us with important examples of the way in which intercultural learning does not necessarily have to entail going abroad. Metcalf (2012) also details a project-based capstone marketing course which strengthens competencies acquired through earlier coursework, developing cross-cultural and other work-

related competencies to prepare students for global and diverse workplaces. A framework for course design is provided along with a set of pedagogical materials that can be adapted to different subject contexts (Korfhage, 2010; Mello, 2006; Metcalf, 2010; Sharifi et al, 2009; Vega, 2007).

Case study method and 'virtual exchanges' – Ramburuth and Daniel (2011) show how case study method can leverage classroom diversity by the use 'virtual exchanges' to enhance intercultural competence and prepare students to manage across political, economic, national and socio-cultural boundaries. The article also provides invaluable advice for finding cases, developing your own cases and publishing them (Ramburuth and Daniel, 2011).

SMEs as a site for PBL – Saatci (2008) shows how PBL can be used to tackle the ill-structured communication problems in business relationships related to internationalising the operations of SMEs. The reactions of students, external participants and teachers to the PBL approach are discussed.

3.4   THE 'INTERNATIONALISATION AT HOME' OR INTERCULTURAL DIMENSION OF LEARNING

3.4.1   INTERCULTURAL COMPETENCIES - FROM CURRICULUM DESIGN RESOURCES TO EMBEDDING PROCESSES

Freeman et al (2009) report the findings of an ALTC-funded collaborative project to embed the development of intercultural competence in business courses and programs in HE and identify appropriate strategies for developing intercultural competencies among business students. In addition to investigating the 'how to' the report also addresses the central issue of what we mean by intercultural competencies. The report concludes that resources in themselves without accompanying embedding processes are likely to be ineffective. Nonetheless, a very useful taxonomy to guide curriculum planning with recommendation of 20 learning activities to develop intercultural competencies to different levels, along with examples from informal curricula that can support development of competencies, are also included in project outcomes.

The work of Freeman et al (2009) is complemented by Woods et al (2011) which rehearses the challenges of multicultural group work for management students and suggests specific strategies for embedding them in curricula in order to realise significant benefits.

3.4.2 EMBEDDING THE CONCEPTS OF CULTURE AND IDENTITY IN BUSINESS CURRICULUM AND PEDAGOGY

Evidence suggests that students - even on International Business programmes who one might assume would be receptive to notions of culture - display uncertainty and confusion when the concept of culture is encountered in their studies. Provision of specific readings that explicitly address business activities from a cultural perspective may be helpful complemented by pedagogical strategies which will enable teachers to build on the cultural and linguistic strengths of students themselves in order to develop cross-cultural capability (Blasco, 2009; Briguglio, 2007). Jameson (2007), Salacuse (2010) and Yamazaki and Kayes (2004) all argue the case for a stronger focus on oneself - one's own values and beliefs - in the context of immersion in different cross-cultural situations. It is also argued that in embedding the cultural dimension in curricula conceptualisations of cultural identity – rather than privileging nationality identity – should balance components of identity related to nationality, geography and language with considerations more directly related to business such as economic class, professional affiliation etc. (Jameson, 2007).

The focus on 'self' in cultural terms may not only be alien to students in business contexts but may also present particular challenges for teachers in designing activities that can support this kind of reflexive pedagogy. Antal and Friedman (2008) is very useful in reinforcing the focus on self in the context of the core intercultural skills necessary for 'negotiating reality'. Students' awareness of the culturally-shaped interpretations of any given situation is heightened as they openly inquire into the interpretations of others and jointly test interpretations, with a view to designing action strategies that make sense to all parties. In shifting the focus from 'foreigners' or 'culture' to their own reasoning and behaviour, students realise that learning while engaging and making conscious decisions about how to respond to situations - rather than extensive knowledge about the world's diverse cultures – is the key to effective intercultural interactions (Antal and Friedman, 2008).

'Learning to Negotiate Reality: A Strategy for Teaching Intercultural Competencies, *Journal of Management Education* 32(3): 363-386 (Antal and Friedman, 2008) provides comprehensive detail of a 22-hour course which guides students through a conscious and intensive process of analysis and experimentation which shifts the focus of learning from intellectual performance to the more reflective and behavioural kind of learning that negotiating reality requires. In learning groups students systematically work through their own personal cases which describe a problematic situation or conflict involving cross-cultural elements. As well as sharing experiences students receive challenges to interpretations or behaviours. By comparing and contrasting goals, strategies, spoken words and unspoken thoughts and feelings, students discover gaps or contradictions between how they wanted to behave and how they actually performed and in turn, they try out new ways of seeing and doing things (Antal and Friedman, 2008).

3.4.3   ENGLISH FOR ACADEMIC PURPOSES (EAP) – A SUBJECT-BASED APPROACH?

Many business and EAP tutors alike will be familiar with issues of low attendance and general lack of engagement of international students with in-sessional EAP provision. The time-tabling of EAP provision as an 'extra', insufficient departmental emphasis on the importance of EAP, lack of credit for study and the implication of 'deficit' in students who have previously been high achievers, insufficient curriculum contextualisation and additional student workload, are all cited in the literature as just a few of these issues. (Sloan and Porter, 2010; Warwick, n.d.).

Sloan and Porter, 2010 explore the CEM model of provision (Context- in which learning and teaching of EAP takes place; Embedding - the EAP programme within the overall degree programme and Mapping - or co-ordinating EAP teaching with student learning needs and outcomes throughout the academic year). Piloting the model has shown that increased negotiation between EAP and business tutors promotes the design of contextualised teaching materials for the EAP programme and ensures that key areas of EAP are the focus of seminars at point of need for international students. Finally, the integration of EAP tutors within business teaching teams was found to positively influence both staff and student perceptions of the role of the EAP tutor (Sloan and Porter, 2010).

3.4.4   INTERCULTURAL COMMUNICATION AND NATIVE SPEAKERS OF ENGLISH

Whilst more units of study in business schools carry 'international' in their title reflecting a change in content to include international perspectives, equipping business graduates with intercultural communication competencies is often approached via the use of ready-made materials and simplistic courses for intercultural development. Briguglio (2007) argues that competence in intercultural communication requires a much deeper awareness of language issues across the curriculum and acknowledgement that successful communication entails not only the requirement for second language speakers to make themselves understood (intelligibility), but also first language speakers need to develop skills in interpreting different accents and varieties of world English (interpretability) (Briguglio, 2007).

3.4.5   THE GLOBALLY DIVERSE WORKFORCE – 'OUTREACH' AND PATHWAYS

Calvert et al (2009) discuss the role of university 'outreach' in responding to increasing diversity of cultural origins within the local workforce and in adapting management studies to include considerations of diversity within the workforce. The article calls for more study of pathways by which potential students might become candidates for degree programmes and includes a very useful sample survey which was used to explore students' learning interests to produce what is termed the 'Business Concepts Value Measure' (Calvert et al, 2009).

3.5   THE 'INTERNATIONALISATION ABROAD' DIMENSION OF LEARNING

3.5.1   STUDENT PREFERENCES FOR LEARNING ABROAD EXPERIENCES

A common phenomenon across the globe and across the disciplines is the general reluctance on the part of 'home' students to engage in study, work placement or other experiences abroad. In some ways the pre-occupation with encouraging international experience abroad is a Western one, since 'brain drain' is a more common phenomenon in other regions of the world like the African continent (Mpinganjira, 2009; Myopi and Earl, 2008). Goel et al (2010) identify a theoretical framework that explains 'intention factors' and Presley et al (2010) use The Theory of Planned Behaviour (TPB) and trait theory to derive a model that predicts study abroad intentions. These studies show that attitude, perceived behavioural control and subjective norms are all significant predictors, rather than the absence of personal, domestic, financial and other practical constraints (Goel et al, 2010; Mpinganjari, 2009; Myopi and Earl, 2008; Presley et al 2010).

3.5.2   CULTURAL IMMERSION - SHORT VERSUS LONG TERM AND EXPERIENCE VERSUS LEARNING

All too often students engage in international immersion programmes of one sort or another with little by way of framework and structure for thinking about the different locations they are visiting (Ghemawat, 2008). However, several authors demonstrate how even quite brief visits overseas can offer significant learning opportunities with appropriate learning interventions. Johnson et al (2010) provide a convincing rationale for engaging International Accounting students in a short term study tour and suggest a possible itinerary. A short term study tour is also the subject of Tchaichi and Davis's (2005) work. Similarly, Taylor and Finley (2010) and Finley et al (2007) explore the process of creating a 'for-credit', short-term international travel course which - through exposure to different cultures and ways of doing business - enables graduates to broaden and deepen their understanding of the complexities and realities of international business. Invaluable details of pre-departure preparation and re-entry de-briefing activities are provided and the experience is evaluated in terms of Cant's (2004) competencies required by global managers. Students cite educational value in terms of: heightened cultural consciousness or increased interest in foreign clients and customers; greater cultural self-awareness and understanding of the complexities of dealing with a culture which can be very different from one's own and enhanced relationships with other students (Finley et al, 2007).

3.6   TRANS-NATIONAL EDUCATION (TNE)

3.6.1   'ONE SIZE FITS ALL' OR ADAPT PRACTICE TO THE HOST ENVIRONMENT?

Whilst the literature provides those delivering transnational programmes in diverse locations with advice on managing and supporting the international student experience overseas and dealing with diverse preferences in learning styles there are distinctly competing perspectives on

Caruana and Ploner, 2011, Higher Education Academy, Business and Management
(previously the HEA Business, Management, Accountancy and Finance Subject Centre)

the central issue of adaptation in TNE. For example, research in a Chinese university with an academic programme delivered jointly with the U.S. shows that students' may have a general preference for Chinese teacher-centred approaches to teaching and learning, despite feelings that their U.S. counterparts are more expert and adopt student-centred approaches. Similar research around Chinese students' experience of courses delivered by foreigners in China suggests student preferences for close replication of delivery at the accrediting location because courses tailored to the local market lack authenticity (Ho, 2010; Randall, 2008; Willis, 2010).

3.6.2   FROM TNE TO 'TOP-UP'

Burnapp and Wei (2011) concern themselves with a relatively neglected area of practice in TNE – the phenomenon of the TNE student who then moves across borders to progression courses and in so doing, might follow a different adjustment trajectory to students with no prior TNE experience. In a comparative study of a 'top-up' cohort with direct entry students, it was found that there were issues of timing and methods of support for both groups. For the 'top-up' students a major issue was getting them to notice and act on information, suggesting a need to focus support on assisting cultural adjustment processes, rather than simply providing information. In contrast the 'straight from China' cohort displayed initial 'rosy optimism' which was challenged by experience and countered by re-doubled determination to succeed. This evidence suggests that preparation courses at the start of programmes might be ill-timed and that adjustment should not be viewed as transformation arising from induction processes, but rather as a trajectory over time (Burnapp and Wei, 2011).

4   4.0 KEY WEBSITES FOR THE INTERNATIONAL AND INTERCULTURAL DIMENSION OF LEARNING WITHIN THE BUSINESS EDUCATION SUBJECT COMMUNITIES

4.1   UK-BASED WEBSITES

The world-wide web (www) spawns websites dedicated at least in part, to the global interconnectedness of curriculum and the intercultural dimension of learning in HE - some of which are UK-based such as the Kings-Warwick project available at:
http://kingslearning.info/kwp/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=134&Itemid=109

The BMAF Internationalisation Special Interest Group (SIG)
http://www.heacademy.ac.uk/BMAFInternationalSIG is itself a rich source of information in the field of internationalisation. The SIG's annual conference has been a significant mechanism for disseminating innovative and challenging work in the field with most recent contributions including for example: John Buglear's (2011) work around retention and the international student experience; Gillian Bishop and Annie Yeadon-Lee's (2011) exploration of international student transition; Simon Mercado's (2011) discussion of how internationalisation is being re-conceptualised within the business education community and elsewhere and Yvonne Turner's (2011) exploration into the academic development needs of staffing in a context of shifting cultural identities.

4.2   AUSTRALIA-BASED WEBSITES

Two websites of Australian origin are of particular relevance to teaching and learning practice for internationalisation and intercultural learning within the business education subject communities:

Internationalisation of the Curriculum in Action available at:
http://www.ioc.net.au/main/course/view.php?id=2

This site hosted by Associate Professor Betty Leask, Australian Learning and Teaching Council Fellow, focuses on active engagement of practitioners across different disciplines and institutions with Internationalisation of the Curriculum (IoC). A framework for IoC in Action is illustrated by a series of case studies and supported by a practical 'how to' guide. Here practitioners in Accounting and Business can, for example, access a PowerPoint presentation which suggests how 'Internationalisation of the Accounting Curriculum' may be operationalised and browse a literature which explores issues such as the implications of rising numbers of international students and appropriate responses. Practitioners can also access materials related to the key features of IoC in Accounting and engage with practical micro-level approaches to IoC at the course level.

The ExcelL Intercultural Program website available at:
http://www.excellinterculturalskillsprogram.com/interculturalskills.html

This website developed by Westwood, Mak, Barker and Ishimaya introduces ExcelL (Excellence in Cultural Experiential Learning and Leadership) which is a best practice intercultural social effectiveness program designed from established principles of learning. The site has particular significance in the context of this review since much work has been conducted in the Business and Health areas of HE learning and practice. Unlike other cross-cultural, information-giving and sensitivity training programs ExcelL focuses on behavioural competence training, involving observational learning and guided practice while addressing potential psychological barriers like interpersonal anxiety in intercultural encounters and threats to one's own identity. In summary, the program provides people new to a culture with the tools to build effective intercultural social relationships for educational and career success. A list of manuals, recommended reading, links and training workshops are available on the site and practitioners can access key publications which address the management of cultural diversity in classrooms, explain the use and benefits of culture mapping and other strategies for enhancing participation in multicultural groups and learning socio-cultural competencies.

In 2010 the ExcelL team extended their collaborations with other colleagues in an ALTC-funded project *Internationalisation at home: enhancing intercultural capabilities of Business and Health teachers, students and curricula* and this project is on-going **http://www.altc.edu.au/project-internationalisation-home-enhancing-intercultural-capabilities-business-and-health-teachers-**

Anticipated outcomes of the project include adaptable curriculum resources for up-skilling international and local students' competencies in increasingly multicultural education and work settings. Critical incident scenarios in intercultural interactions in business and health classrooms and practice sites will be integrated with components of the ExcelL program to inform the design of discipline-specific professional development for teachers.

5   GAPS IN EDUCATIONAL RESEARCH AND PRACTICE

5.1   POTENTIAL GAPS IN THE CRITICAL REVIEW

As stated earlier this review is essentially selective rather than exhaustive in engaging with the literature related to the internationalisation of curriculum, pedagogy and learning, teaching and assessment practice more generally, in the business education subject communities. The emphasis has been on the work being generated by practitioners themselves operating at the 'chalk-face', grappling with the forces of globalisation and internationalisation in their everyday encounters with students. Much of the literature cited here appears in the main teaching journals for business and related subject areas such as the Journal of Teaching International Business, the Journal of Accounting Education, the Journal of Management Education and the Journal of Financial Education. It may well be the case that some ground-breaking work in the business education subject community published in the generic HE journals has not been identified within the literature search. In this sense Caruana and Spurling (2007) remains a key reference text for practitioners.

5.2   SUGGESTED AREAS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

The business education subject community is generally realising new levels of sophistication in conceptualisation and operationalisation in respect of both the internationalisation agenda within business school structures generally, and in applying the principles of the internationalised curriculum within programmes and courses of study. However, this critical review suggests the need for further research of practice in particular areas:

- The international business classroom is more culturally diverse than ever before, yet many students share a common identity in terms of their 'generation Y' status. In other words, they have never known a world without the internet or mobile technologies; they tend to have a preference for the digital, expect technologies to be part of their learning processes and anticipate technological immersion which provides not only continuous learning, but also continuous feedback (Budde-Sung, 2011). Whilst Thane and Welle-Strand (2005) provide us with a case study showing how ICT is used in supporting teams in internationalisation processes within business and management schools, there are few examples of how learning technologies are being applied to learning, teaching and assessment practice within the business education subject community;

- In international accounting particularly (but also across the business education community more generally) an element of colonialism persists with the assumption that the practices of emerging markets like China and other developing countries can be shoe-horned into practices designed primarily for the developed world's commercial activities and structures (Aisbitt, 2005);

- Trans-National Education (TNE) is a central focus of many UK business schools in the 21st century, but there is relatively little educational research related to both student and staff experiences in the field. This seems quite paradoxical given that this was a key concern for staff during conversations about their practice. Colleagues referred to the difficulty of trying to apply Western concepts in non-Western contexts. For example, the concept of career is alien to African culture based on notions of altruism, collectivism, community, family, clan etc. and in Africa businesses must survive with no

insurance, social benefits etc. This environment impacts hugely on how business topics can be taught on the African continent, underscoring the importance of using local case studies;

- The intercultural dimension of learning within the business education subject community is receiving much attention in contrast to say ten years ago. However, the area of 'internationalisation abroad' is now relatively eclipsed, particularly in relation to the means by which experience is transformed into learning:

- With increasing numbers of international post-graduate students in the UK, further research needs to address the expectations, motivations and experiences of this cohort more vigorously;

- 'Informal', 'extended' or 'hidden' curricula are not directly addressed in the literature. Making sense of personal experiences and narratives relating to students' social environment/space, housing, friendships, relationships, etc. is particularly significant for a subject community which focuses on the key concept of service to economy and society where 'oft skills' are critical to effectiveness;

- The literature provides substantial guidance to practitioners anxious to leverage the cultural diversity of their students in order to support global perspectives and cross-cultural capabilities. However, the impact on staff of teaching diverse cohorts is relatively neglected as is the experience of international staff teaching on UK campuses.

5.3   STUDENT AND STAFF PERCEPTIONS OF THE GAPS IN PRACTICE

- In some specialist areas such as Public Relations, curricula can be particularly UK-centric in content and approach. Students would value greater encouragement to develop global perspectives through for example, international placement and the opportunity to study languages;

- International students value opportunities to mix with home students and learn more about university life, the course etc. However, the way some courses are structured affords little opportunity to build up meaningful relationships with others;

- Despite being prior high achievers academically and having extensive experience in business education-related work in their home country, international students can encounter difficulties in acquiring placements, internships and relevant part-time work opportunities;

- Staff refer to a lack of induction or cross-cultural training to prepare them for teaching overseas and to a similar lack of awareness of the influence of culture on students' learning style preferences more generally.

6   METHODOLOGY

The critical review comprises two complementary activities in order to capture literature and evidence of curriculum and pedagogic practice and research/evaluation of practice within subject communities.

6.1   REVIEW OF LITERATURE

- The literature review focuses on both published and 'grey' literature, defined as publications available in both print and electronic formats, but not controlled by commercial publishing interests and where publishing is not the principal driver. This strategy reflects that much of the useful and ground-breaking practice and research/evaluation of practice is available as conference proceedings, resources on websites, as well as journal articles:

- The review focuses on identifying effective practice with some exploration of emergent issues, trends and barriers across the business education subject communities in the UK and wider context. Much innovative practice beyond the UK sector is cited, in order to shed light on UK experience. The review of published material is therefore confined to practice-based and research-based literature (e.g. descriptions, reflections on and evaluations of practice) rather than solely theoretical or conceptual pieces, published in scholarly peer-reviewed journals;

- The review of published literature is confined to subject-specific, peer-reviewed HE learning and teaching journals dating back to 2005 and excludes books and book chapters. The timeframe from 2005 to 2011 was chosen to guarantee currency while identifying emerging trends and tendencies relevant to the business education subject community;

- The sources have been identified via key word searches of Google Scholar as well as other resource pages of key websites such as the BMAF website itself (www.heacademy.ac.uk/business). Complementary to that, the review team has searched for relevant material within associations and networks focussing on Internationalisation more generally, such as CAPRI, CICIN and TIS. Appropriate educational research biographical databases and Open Educational Resource sites have also been trawled for relevant sources;

- Colleagues operating in the field have been approached either via appropriate mailing lists (BMAF, CAPRI, TIS, ATHE) or personally, in order to support the identification of relevant practice and research of practice across the UK sector.

6.2   ONLINE FORUM, STAFF AND STUDENT ADVISORY MEETINGS

Complementary to the literature review, academic staff across the sector were invited to partake in a business education online forum facilitated by Leeds Metropolitan's Carnegie Faculty to explore effective practice in the field (http://www.all4carnegie.com/hlst/). Due to scant mid-semester online participation, the review team decided to invite local university staff for advisory meetings, addressing the issue of internationalisation of the curriculum in the business education subject areas. Students were also engaged in short conversations about their learning experience of internationalisation within the business education subject areas.

REFERENCES:

Abeysekera, I. K. (2008) Preferred Learning Methods: Comparisons between International and Domestic Accounting Students, *Accounting Education* 17(2): 187 - 198

Abraham, A. (2007) Exploring the Values Orientations of International Accounting Students: Implications for Educators, *19th Asian-Pacific Conference of International Accounting Issue,* Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, University of Wollongong Research Online

Aggarwal, R. (2011) Developing a Global Mind-set: Integrating Demographics, Sustainability, Technology and Globalization, *Teaching in International Business* 22(1): 51-69

Aggarwal, R. and Goodell, J.W. (2011) Scholarship of Teaching International Business: Challenges and Opportunities, *Journal of Teaching in International Business* 22(1): 1-12

Aisbitt, S. (2005) International accounting books: Publishers' dream, authors' nightmare and educators' reality, *Accounting Education: an international journal* 14(3): 349–360

Alyoshina, I. V. (2007) Globalization as a challenge for business education: Are we ready for reforms? *Achieving Competitive Advantage Through Managing Global Resources,* GBATA (Global Business and Technology Association) Ninth Conference. Taipei, Taiwan: 8.

Antal, B. and Friedman, V.J. (2008) Learning to Negotiate Reality: a Strategy for Teaching Intercultural Competencies, *Journal of Management Education* 32(3): 363 - 386

Ashcroft, P., Chevis, G. and Murphy Smith, L. (2008) Faculty perspectives on international accounting topics, *Advances in Accounting, incorporating Advances in International Accounting* 24: 139-144

Bennett, R. and Kane, S. (2009) Internationalization of U.K. University Business Schools: A Survey of Current Practice, *Journal of Studies in International Education* 20(10): 1-23

Bill-Bin, P., Fleta, J. and Pan, S-F. (n.d.) *The internationalization of Business Studies: a comparative framework between the European Higher Education System and the Chinese one*

Blackburn, M. (2011) Using a business simulation to develop internationally-minded UK/China-based accounting students: a case study, *Assessment Learning and Teaching Journal* Leeds Metropolitan University 11: 100-106

Blasco, M. (2009) Cultural Pragmatists? Student Perspectives on Learning Culture at a Business School, *Academy of Management Learning & Education* 8(2)

Blenkhorn, D. L. and Fleisher, C.S. (2010) Teaching Competitive Intelligence Skills to North American and Overseas Audiences: A World of Difference in Pedagogic Effectiveness, *Journal of Teaching in International Business* 21(4)

Briguglio, C. (2007) Educating the Business Graduate of the 21st Century: Communication for a Globalizes World, *International Journal of Teaching and Learning in Higher Education* 19(1): 8 - 20

Broadhurst, D. (2010) Never mind the width, feel the quality: The provision of library services to a global business school, *Business Information Review* 27(3): 144 - 151

Caruana and Ploner, 2011, Higher Education Academy, Business and Management
(previously the HEA Business, Management, Accountancy and Finance Subject Centre)

30

Blaylock, B.J., McDaniel, J.L., Charles, F.F., Hollandsworth, R. and Kopf, J.M. (2009) A Borrowed Approach for a More Effective Business Education, *Journal of Management Education* 33(5): 57 - 595

Budde-Sung, A. E. K. (2011) The increasing internationalization of the international business classroom: Cultural and generational considerations, *Business Horizons* 54(4): 365-375

Burnapp, D. and Wei, Z. (2011) The experience of Chinese students entering top-up courses: comparing students from UK=style HND courses and students from Chinese diploma courses, *International Journal of Management Education* 9(3)

Calvert, C., Cleavenger, D., Barth, S. and Salazar, J. (2009) The Need for Culturally Sensitive Curriculum for Spanish-Speaking Students at the University of South Carolina Beaufort, *Global Business Languages* 14(1 Borders and Frontiers Article 7): 73 – 86

Caruana, V. and Spurling, N. (2007) *The Internationalisation of UK Higher Education: a review of selected material,* York: Higher Education Academy

Clifford, V. A. (2009) Engaging the disciplines in internationalising the curriculum*, International Journal for Academic Development* 14(2): 133 - 143

Cockburn-Wootten, C. and Cockburn, T. (2011) Unsettling Assumptions and Boundaries: Strategies for Developing a Critical Perspective about Business and Management Communication, *Business Communication Quarterly* 74(1): 45 - 59

Crosling, G. E., Edwards, R. and Schroder, B. (2008) Internationalizing the curriculum: the implementation experience in a Faculty of Business and Economics, *Journal of Higher Education Policy and Management* 30(2): 107 – 121

Crossman, J. (2010) "Act them into a new way of thinking" Multiple stakeholder perspectives on developing international and intercultural leadership (ICL) through experiential learning *International Journal of Management Education*, 9(1)

Currie, G. (2007) 'Beyond our Imagination' The Voice of International Students on the MBA, *Management Learning* 38(5): 539 - 556

Felton, C. S. and Kusy, M (2009) *The Internationalisation of a Canadian Business School: A Case Study,* EDULEARN09 available at: http://library.iated.org/view/CYR2009THE

Elahee, M., & Norbis, M (2009) Internationalizing business, education in Latin America: Issues and Challenges, *Journal of Teaching in International Business* 20(1): 312 – 329

Elkin, G., Farnsworth, J. and Templar, A. (2008) Strategy and the internationalization of Universities, *International Journal of Educational Management* 22: 239-250

Elkin, G., Templer, A., Sharma, R.R. and Liao, J (2008) Internationalisation of business education: a comparison of Eastern and Western universities, *Euro Asia Journal of Management* 36(18): 85-101

Farell, B. J. and Farell, H.M. (2008) Student satisfaction with cooperative learning in an Accounting curriculum, *Journal of University Teaching and Learning Practice* 5(2): 39 - 54

Finley, J. B. Taylor, S.L. and Warren, D.L. (2007) Investigating Graduate Business Students' Perceptions of the Educational Value Provided by an International Travel Course Experience, *Journal of Teaching in International Education* 19(1): 57 - 82

Caruana and Ploner, 2011, Higher Education Academy, Business and Management
(previously the HEA Business, Management, Accountancy and Finance Subject Centre)

31

Fougere, M. and Moulettes, A. (2011) Disclaimers, dichotomies and disappearances in international business textbooks: A postcolonial deconstruction, *Management Learning* 1(20)

Freeman, M., Treleaven, L., Ramburuth, P., Leask, B, Caulfield, N., Simpson, L., Ridings, S. and Sykes, C. (2009) *Embedding the Development of Intercultural Competence in Business Education*, The University of Sydney and Queensland University of Technology, Report on project funded by Australian Learning and Teaching Council

Ghemawat, P. (2008) the globalization of business education: through the lens of semi-globalization, *Journal of Management Development*, 27(4): 391 – 414

Goby, P.V. (2007) Business Communication Needs: A Multicultural Perspective, *Journal of Business and Technical Communication* 21(4): 425 - 437

Goel, L., de Jong, P. and Schnusenberg, O. (2010) Toward a Comprehensive Framework of Study Abroad Intentions and Behaviors, *Journal of Teaching in International Business* 21(4): 248-265

Grayson, J. P. (2011) Cultural capital and achievement of Chinese International and Canadian domestic students in a Canadian Business programme, *The International Journal of Management Education* 9(2): 13-24

Gutowska, A. and Bechkoum, K. (2007) The Issue of Online Trust and its Impact on International Curriculum Design, *The Third China-Europe International Symposium on Software Industry-Oriented Education,* Dublin, 6-7 February, 2007, Dublin, pp. 134-140

Hall, G. and Sung, W-C. (2009) Mind the gap? A case-study of the differing perceptions of international students and their lecturers on postgraduate business programmes, *International Journal of Management Education* 8(1)

Hay, A. (2011) Action learning in international settings: Possibilities for developing organising insight, *International Journal of Management Education* 9(3)

Hills, S. and Thom, V. (2005) Crossing a Multicultural Divide: Teaching Business Strategy to Students From Culturally Mixed Backgrounds, *Journal of Studies in International Education* 9(4): 316 - 336

Ho, R. (2010) Assessment of Chinese Students' Experience with Foreign Faculty: A Case Study from a Chinese University, *Journal of Teaching in International Business* 21(3): 156-177

James, M. L. (2011) Integrating International Financial Reporting Standards into the Accounting curriculum: Strategies, benefits and challenges, *Academy of Educational Leadership Journal,* 15, Special issue

Jameson, D., A. (2007) Reconceptualizing cultural identity and its role in intercultural business communication *Journal of Business Communication* 44(3): 199 - 235

Johnson, L. R., Rudolph, H.R. and Seay, R.A. (2010) An Accounting International Experience Course, *American Journal of Business Education* 3(10): 55-62

Kedia, B. L. and Englis, P.D. (2011) Internationalizing Business Education for Globally Competent Managers, *Journal of Teaching in International Business* 22(1): 13 - 28

Kedia, B. L. Harveston, P.D. and Bhagat, R.S. (2008) Orienting Curricula and Teaching to Produce International Managers for Global Competition, *Journal of Teaching in international Business* 13(1): 1 - 22

Korfhage Smith, R. (2010) A Case Study in Project-Based Learning: An International Partnership, *Journal of Teaching in International Business* 21(3): 178-188

Kragh, S. U. and Djurssan, M. (2006) Modernization and Management Business School Teaching across Countries, *International Journal of Cross Cultural Management* 6(1): 19-36

Kyvik, O. (2009) *The Internationalization of Business: Educational Challenges,* EURAM Conference 2009: 23

Langmead, J. M. Sedaghat, A.M. and Unger, L.M. (2010) Incorporating International Accounting into the MBA Curriculum: Exploring Implications of the Financial Reporting Crisis of 2001-2009, *Journal of Teaching in International Business* 21(2): 132 - 152

Larson, R. K. and Street, D.L. (2011) IFRS Teaching Resources: Available and Rapidly Growing, *Accounting Education* 20(4): 317-338

LeBlanc, E. (2005) Internationalizing the Curriculum: A Discussion of Challenges and First Steps Within Business Schools, *Higher Education Perspectives* 3(1): 28 - 44

Lee, C. and Bisman, J.E. (2006) Curricula in introductory accounting: An international student focus, *3rd International Conference on Contemporary Business*, New South Wales, Australia: 39.

Leggott, D. and Stapleford, J. (2008) Internationalization and Employability in Jones, E. and Brown, S. (eds.) (2008) *Internationalizing Higher Education,* London: Routledge

Mak, A.S. and Buckingham, K. (2007) Beyond communication courses: Are there benefits in adding skills-based EXCELL socio-cultural training? *International Journal of Intercultural Relations* 31:277-291

Manuel, T. A. Shoostari, N.H., Fleming, M.J. and Wallwork S.S. (2001 - available online 2008). Internationalization of the Business Curriculum at U.S. Colleges and Universities, *Journal of Teaching in International Business & Economics Research Journal* 12(3): 43 - 70

Mello, J. A. (2006) Enhancing the International Business Curriculum Through Partnership with the United States Department of Commerce: The "E" Award Internship Program, *Journal of Management Education* 30(5): 690-699

Metcalf, L. E. (2010) Creating International Community Service Learning Experiences in a Capstone Marketing-Projects Course, *Journal of Marketing Education* 32(2): 155 - 171

Milhauser, K. L. and Rahschulte, T. (2010) Meeting the Needs of Global Companies through Improved International Business Curriculum, *Journal of Teaching in International Business* 21(2): 78-100

Miller, A. N. (2007) Teaching Business Students about HIV and AIDS in the Workplace: Curriculum and Resources, *Journal of Management Education* 32(2): 210 - 227

Mitsis, A. and Foley, P.W. (2009) Do Business Students' Culturally Anchored Values Shape Student-Driven or Teacher-Driven Learning, *Journal of Marketing Education* 31(3): 240 - 252

Moore, K. N. (2010) Development through business: what do American Business students know about emerging markets and opportunities in Africa? *Journal of Teaching in International Business* 21(3): 200-219

Morasuna, L. and Hadley, K. (2010) Learning beyond the Institution: A Cultural Capital Perspective on the International Student Experience, Paper presented to the SRHE Annual Conference, *Where is the Wisdom we*

Caruana and Ploner, 2011, Higher Education Academy, Business and Management
(previously the HEA Business, Management, Accountancy and Finance Subject Centre)

33

have lost in knowledge: Exploring Meaning, Identities and Transformation in Higher Education, 14-16 December, Celtic Manor Resort, Newport

Mpinganjira, M. (2009) Comparative analysis of factors influencing the decision to study abroad, *African Journal of Business Management* 3(8): 358-365

Mpinganjira, M. (2011) Retaining Africa's talent: the role of Africa's higher education, *International Journal of Emerging Markets* 6(2): 168-179

Mpoyi, R. T. and Earl, T.R. (2008) International business education: an empirical examination of the impact of curriculum coverage on student knowledge of global issues, *Review of Business Research* 8(5)

Pestonjee, D. D. Spillan, J.E., Song, H and Virzi, N.D. (2010) A Comparative Analysis of Curriculum in International Marketing and Business Between Peruvian and Guatemalan University Students, *Journal of Teaching in International Business* 21(4): 282 - 306

Piercy, N. and Caldwell, N. (2011) Experiential learning in the international classroom: Supporting learning effectiveness and integration, *The International Journal of Management Education* 9(2): 25-36

Presley, A., Damron-Martinez, D. and Zhang, L. (2010) A Study of Business Student Choice to Study Abroad: A Test of the Theory of Planned Bahavior, *Journal of Teaching in International Business* 21(4): 227-247

Ramburuth, P. and Daniel, S. (2011) Integrating Experiential Learning and Cases in International Business, *Journal of Teaching in International Business* 22(1): 38-50

Randall, S. (2008) The Enhancing Series Case Studies: International Learning Experience Strategies for Internationalisation - Supporting Students through Overseas Collaborative Partnerships, *Hospitality, Leisure, Sport and Tourism Network: Enhancing Series: Internationalisation,* November 2008, Higher Education Academy: 12

Ross, D., Zufan, P and Rosenbloom, A (2008) Experiences From Cross-Institutional Exchanges of Undergraduate Business Student Written Cases, *Journal of Management Education* 32(4): 444 - 475

S´liwa, M. and Cairns, G. (2009) Towards a Critical Pedagogy of International Business: The Application of Phrone¯sis, *Management Learning* 40(3): 227-240

Saatci, E. (2008) Problem-Based Learning in an Intercultural Business Communication Course: Communication Challenges in Intercultural Relationships in Internationalizing Small- or Medium-Sized Enterprises, *Journal of Business and Technical Communication* 22(2): 237 - 260

Sawir, E. (2011) Academic staff response to international students and internationalising the curriculum: the impact of disciplinary differences, *International Journal for Academic Development* 16(1): 45-57

Sethi, M. (2010) Local-Global-Local Loop in International Curriculum Development - Evidence from Designing a Financial Markets Curriculum for Management Students, *International Conference on Internationalization of Higher Education.*

Sharifi, M., McCombs, G.B., Fraser, L.L. and McCabe, R.K. (2009) Structuring a Competency-Based Accounting Communication Course At the Graduate Level, *Business Communication Quarterly* 72(2): 177 - 199

Sharma, B. and Ray, J.A. (1996) Aspects of internationalization of management education, *Journal of Management Development* 15(1): 5-13

Caruana and Ploner, 2011, Higher Education Academy, Business and Management
(previously the HEA Business, Management, Accountancy and Finance Subject Centre)

Sloan, D. and Porter, E. (2010) Changing international and business staff perceptions of in-sessional EAP: using the CEM model, *Journal of English for Academic Purposes,* 9: 198-210

Sronce, R. and Li, L. (2011) Catching flies with honey: Using Chinese and American proverbs to teach cultural dimensions, *The International Journal of Management Education* 9(2): 1-12

Summers, M. and Volet, S. (2008) Students' attitudes towards culturally mixed groups on international campuses: impact of participation in diverse and non-diverse groups, *Studies in Higher Education* 33(4): 357 - 370

Suutari, V. and Smale, A. (2008) Designing IB Curricula for Future Global Careerists: A Boundaryless Career Perspective, *Journal of Teaching in International Business* 19(2): 167 - 191

Taylor, S. L. and Finley, J.B (2010) An Examination of U.S. AACSB International Accounting-Accredited Schools to Determine Global Travel Experience Requirements in Accounting Masters Programs, *Journal of Education for Business* 85(2): 119 - 123

Taylor, S. L. and Finley, J.B (2011) Adding value to the Masters of Accounting curriculum through an international travel experience, *Global Perspectives on Accounting Education* 8: 47-66

Tchaïcha, J. D. and Davis, M.M. (2005) The Impact of Culture on Technology and Business: An Interdisciplinary, Experiential Course Paradigm, Journal of Management Education 29(5): 738-757

Thuane, T. and Welle-Strand, A. (2005) ICT for and in internationalization process: a business school case study, *Higher Education: The International Journal of Higher Education and Education Planning,* 50(4): 593-611

Tyrrall, D. and Aggerstam, C. (2011) International Financial Reporting Standards: Expanding Standards, Expanding Geographically, Expanding Literature, *Accounting Education* 20(4): 441-456

Vega, G. (2007) Teaching Business Ethics Through Service Learning Metaprojects, *Journal of Management Education* 31(5): 647 - 678

Warwick, P. (n.d.) *International students in the UK: how can we give them a better experience?* University of York, Department of Management Studies, Working Paper no. 6

Wang, Y. Harding, R. and Mai, L-W. (2011) Impact of cultural exposure on young Chinese students' adaptation in a UK business school, *Studies in Higher Education*: 1 - 19

Willis, M. (2010) Reaching out to the West: An assessment of Chinese Students' Views Regarding Foreign-Delivered University Programs in China, *Journal of Teaching in International Business* 21(1): 53-68

Witte, A. E. (2010) The Global Awareness Curriculum in International Business Programs: A Critical Perspective, *Journal of Teaching in International Business* 21(2): 101-131

Woods, P., Barker, M. and Hibbins, R. (2011) Tapping the benefits of multicultural group work: An exploratory study of postgraduate management students, *The International Journal of Management Education 9(2): 59-70*

Zettinig, P. and Zsuzsanna, V. (2008) Developing the International Business Curriculum: Results and Implications of a Delphi Study on the Futures of Teaching and Learning in International Business, *Journal of Teaching in International Business* 19(2): 109 - 141

ATTRIBUTIONS

Item Metadata

Author	Viv Caruana and Josef Ploner, Leeds Metropolitan University
Institution – Owner	The Higher Education Academy
Title	Critical review of contemporary practice and educational research in internationalisation within the business education subject communities
Date Created Date or year resource was made	12 February 2012 (revision of Jan-12 version)
Description	The report is part of a series of critical literature reviews commissioned by the BMAF and HLST Subject Centres of the UK Higher Education Academy, at that time based at Oxford Brookes University
Educational Level	HE/ HE in FE initial and continuing professional development
Keywords	Internationalisation, business education, globalisation, good practice
Creative Commons License	Attribution-Non-Commercial-No-Derivatives 2.0 UK: England & Wales

Contemporary Practice and Educational Research in Internationalisation in Business Education Communities

If you have any thoughts or feedback on this Open Education Resource, both the authors and the current Higher Education Academy Discipline Leads for Business and Management would love to hear from you.

Contact: **richard.atfield@heacademy.ac.uk**