COUNT ME IN

The Dimensions of Social Inclusion through Culture & Sport

a report for the
Department for Culture, Media & Sport

prepared by the
Centre for Leisure & Sport Research

LEEDS METROPOLITAN UNIVERSITY

March 2002
COUNT ME IN
COUNT ME IN

The Dimensions of Social Inclusion through Culture & Sport

a report for the Department for Culture, Media & Sport

prepared by the

Centre for Leisure & Sport Research
Leeds Metropolitan University
Fairfax Hall, Beckett Park, Leeds LS6 3QS

Research Team

Director:
Professor Jonathan Long

Project Manager:
Mel Welch

Researchers:
Dr. Peter Bramham - Jim Butterfield - Kevin Hylton - Eddy Lloyd

Assistants:
Karen Bowden - Paul Robinson

March 2002
# Count Me In

## Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>DCMS and PAT 10</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Evidence Based Policy and Planning</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>The Research Brief</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Diversity</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Project Profiles</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Overview of Types of Project</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Social Exclusion</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>How should cultural policies be orientated to secure inclusion?</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Milestones, outputs and outcomes</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Outcomes and convincing indicators</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Attributing cause</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Process and procedures</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Evaluators' Symposium</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Impact on Education</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Impact on Employment</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Impact on Crime Prevention</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>Impact on Health</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
8.1 Poverty, Health and Social Exclusion 49
8.2 Healthy Alliances, Health Partnerships and Health Action Zones 50
8.3 The Health Benefits 50
8.4 ‘Arts into Health’ Projects 51
8.5 The Nature of Evaluation 52
8.6 Examples of 'Arts into Health' Projects 53

CHAPTER 9: Personal Development
9.1 Measuring Personal Development 56
9.2 Self-Esteem 57
9.3 Self-Confidence 59
9.4 Enjoyment – Plain and Simple 59

CHAPTER 10: Social Cohesion
10.1 What is Social Cohesion? 61
10.2 Social Networks 62
10.3 Civic Pride 64
10.4 Common Values and Shared Respect 65

CHAPTER 11: Making Structures More Open
11.1 The Nature of Citizenship 67
11.2 Involvement in Decision-Making 69
11.3 Active Citizenship 71

CHAPTER 12: Good Practice
12.1 The Practice of Promoting Social Inclusion 73
12.2 The Practice of Evaluation 77

CHAPTER 13: Conclusions, recommendations and the way ahead 81

APPENDIX I - Taxonomy of Measurable Indicators 88
APPENDIX II - References 89
APPENDIX III - Other Useful Literature 93
Appendix IV - Summary of Projects Studied 104
1. Introduction

1.1 DCMS and PAT 10

1.1.1 The report to the government’s Social Exclusion Unit from the Policy Action Team (10) on arts and sport (1999: 5/6) opened with a series of assertions and exhortations that included:

- Arts and sport are inclusive and can contribute to neighbourhood renewal.
- Arts and sports bodies should acknowledge that social inclusion is part of their business.
- Arts and sport are not just an add-on to regeneration work.

The PAT 10 report continued: ‘They are fundamental to community involvement and ownership of any regeneration initiative when they offer means of positive engagement in tune with local interests’ (p6).

1.1.2 In his foreword Chris Smith (then Secretary of State for the Department for Culture Media and Sport (DCMS)) - wrote:

The report shows that art and sport can not only make a valuable contribution to delivering key outcomes of lower long term unemployment, less crime, better health and better qualifications, but can also help to develop the individual pride, community spirit and capacity for responsibility that enable communities to run regeneration programmes themselves. (p2)

Similar statements have followed from other politicians, particularly in the recent Commons debate on sport and social exclusion (22/11/01), and again in the public health debate (13/12/01). Such propositions are of course not new. For example, they lay behind much of the spending on sport and the arts through City Challenge and the Single Regeneration Budget1, and were previously evident in the context of the Minister for Sport’s Review Group (DoE, 1989). However, the report also came to the same conclusion as previous commentators (e.g. Glyptis, 1989b; Allison & Coalter, 1996; Long & Sanderson, 1998) that there is little ‘hard’ evidence of the social costs and benefits involved (p37).

1.1.3 Because of the range of the DCMS remit we shall refer here to cultural projects as the collective term, no matter which part of leisure they deal with (arts, sport, recreation, heritage, media, adventure, etc.). This also fits with the

---

1 For example, Simmonds (1994: 9) calculated that some £67 million had been secured for sport, leisure and related projects by twenty authorities in the first round of City Challenge.
current injunction on local authorities to produce ‘cultural strategies’.

1.2 Evidence Based Policy and Planning

1.2.1 One of the touchstones of the New Labour approach to government was that emerging policy should be based on evidence rather than being ideologically motivated or purely pragmatic. Indeed, the Cabinet Office’s Performance and Innovation Unit has produced weighty tomes demanding more planning, more rational analysis, and more evidence. The government itself has put more money into evidence gathering. In 2000 the Economic and Social Research Council was allocated 3% more in real terms than the previous year and the ESRC has a new ‘evidence-based’ initiative. Moreover, Whitehall research (e.g. in the Home Office and the DoEE) has also received a significant boost. There is a growing enthusiasm for ‘what works’, a commitment ‘to base policies on demonstrable evidence of effectiveness’\(^2\). This approach can be made to work when evidence already exists, but if new data are required there may be problems if the time needed for the research does not fit the timescale associated with the legislative programme or the need for swift departmental / Non-Departmental Public Body (NDPB) / local authority initiatives. The pressure of ‘real’ politics and media-orchestrated campaigns often mean that politicians feel the need to be tackling problems head-on and immediately.

1.2.2 Various bodies have sought to construct performance measures to assess and compare performance in terms of service delivery. However, the transience of Audit Commission and Best Value indicators, for example, illustrates the difficulty of devising convincing measures of cultural provision that are capable of supporting benchmarking exercises. It seems that like refuses to come together with like in any meaningful way.

1.2.3 In conjunction with the concern for performance measurement, QUEST (the Quality, Efficiency and Standards Team), who work with DCMS, have been exploring the extent to which outcomes can form the basis of performance measurement as expressed through the funding agreement for NDPBs. The initial concern with indicators of matched funding for specific social inclusion projects and social inclusion projects reaching stated outcomes has been refined to a proposal for an approach based on the process of policy implementation. However, being concerned with the practices of the NDPBs and other agencies this stops a stage

short of our current challenge, with a suggested indicator of evaluation as being the percentage of work properly evaluated.

### 1.3 The Research Brief

#### 1.3.1 Despite the opening remarks in this report, we need to be cognisant of how small a part cultural activities play in wider, official considerations of social inclusion. For example, in the recent survey by the Local Government Association (2001a) of local authority approaches to social inclusion cultural activities were peripheral to considerations of strategic partnerships, local management schemes, ICT, promoting retailing, working with businesses, delivering financial services, or dealing with anti-social behaviour. Hence the current imperative to identify available information that might secure cultural activities a more prominent position on the agenda.

#### 1.3.2 The challenge of this project has been to work with 14 projects (see chapter 2) that are using cultural activities to promote social inclusion, in order to gather together evidence of their contribution to social inclusion. This has entailed:

- a consideration of the different understandings of social exclusion/inclusion (see chapter 3 for a summary)
- using existing literature to provide a context for the practice and achievements of these projects
- an examination of alternative indicators of social inclusion and how these can be implemented
- an attempt to identify, wherever possible, evidence of good practice in the form of what is seen to work, both in terms of securing social inclusion goals and evaluation (see chapter 12).

#### 1.3.3 Our own work and a preliminary analysis of the summaries of projects included for this project suggested that in terms of sport and arts initiatives, most claims of benefits relate to:

- **empowerment** - exercising own ability to act
- **social exchange** - interpersonal and inter-group ties
- **citizenship** - access to privileges, benefits and entitlements

It was recognised that these are notoriously difficult to assess, and few projects have the resources to attempt such complex evaluation. Even those who do attempt it are rightly being encouraged to evaluate against their own aims, so no consistency of practice or procedure can be expected. DCMS
COUNT ME IN

was keen that the projects should only be assessed against their own aims and objectives. It would hardly be fair to do otherwise, but it makes generalising about the capabilities of cultural projects very difficult. Therefore our challenge has been to try to establish order from disparity. We have sought to do this by identifying a set of evaluation domains (see chapter 4) and then accepting whatever evidence each project can offer to a consideration of the use of cultural activities to promote social inclusion within those domains (chapters 5-11).
2. The projects involved

2.1 Diversity

2.1.1 DCMS selected a range of 14 projects from around England to make sure that different styles, purposes and targets were included. One of the original selections (Camborne, Pool and Redruth Success Zone) later decided not to participate and was replaced by the mobile provision of Somerset Library Service. Although all of the projects share the common purpose of enhancing the quality of life in areas of disadvantage, they cover a wide geographic area and a diversity of specific aims and objectives (Table 1).

2.1.2 These are complex projects so simple classifications are not easy. However in broad terms they can be said to represent:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sport</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Focus on providing sporting opportunities as a constructive socially acceptable focus for the energies of young people (one incorporates training in and awareness of issues of racial equality).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts &amp; Media</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Two projects use the arts to stimulate public awareness of health issues; three are directed to skills development among disaffected/vulnerable young people with a view to improving employment prospects; and one is more directly orientated to educational development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heritage (incl. Libraries)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>One is an education project designed to attract disadvantaged groups into the museum; one is an arts in education project using 'heritage' to stimulate imagination; and one is a library service to develop communication in rural areas.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outdoor adventure</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Provide adventure education as a means of personal development and the fostering of self-confidence and self-esteem.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Moreover, five of the projects are directly concerned with education and the encouragement of motivations to learn within the school system. The other major themes addressed are training for employment, diversion from 'crime', health awareness, and personal development.
COUNT ME IN

2.1.3 Further diversity can be seen in the following:

- **The Aim of the Projects** - The aim of all of the projects is to engage the attention of participants and provide a stimulating and enjoyable experience, without which their objectives will fail to be realised. To further this aim the projects build on the policies and experiences of the parent organisations, some of which have clearly articulated policies and guidelines. While conforming to these guidelines, the projects, in general, have taken care to identify specific local needs and consulted widely with the resident communities and voluntary organisations. However, taken together many different activities are included, for example, drama, art, video, radio broadcasting and magazine production, adventure activities and a range of sports.

- **Funding Range** - The range of annual funding is from £20k to £200k, excluding the two projects at the gestation stage and sources include DfEE Education Action Zone funding, Health Action Zone funding, Single Regeneration Budget, Objective 2, New Deal as well as National Lottery Heritage Fund, charitable trusts and local fund-raising. Some projects are part of wider schemes and some are funded by a series of roll-over arrangements working to different timings.

- **Geographical Coverage** - One of the projects covers the area of five district councils, but some restrict their activities to areas identified as having a preponderance of exclusion within a single borough.

- **Target Populations** - The target population for the health projects comprises all age groups and coaching courses and training potential football managers may include adults, but for the most part the concentration is on young adults and those of school age. Recruitment of participants may arise from working with schools but also includes the identification of young people at risk, filtered by interview for their potential to benefit from participation. Employment agencies and voluntary organisations are sources of recruits but for some projects contact may be initiated on the street corner, in a pub or club or at a hospital or surgery. There is wide variation in terms of numbers of participants and intensity of contact. Those concerned with employment training having more or less continuous contact with relatively small numbers over a period of months, compared with one of the educational projects which plans to reach some 8000 participants in 26 schools in the course of a year. One of
the adventure education projects may retain contact with young people for up to three years.

- **Organisation & Management Systems** - Each project has developed a form of organisation and management tailored to its own needs, but common to most of them are Steering Groups, Forums or Committees, to which a Director, Co-ordinator or Facilitator reports. Such steering groups may include senior members of the parent organisation together with professional contacts and representatives from the voluntary sector. Both of the health projects encompass a number of projects, each of which has specific objectives, its own steering group and budget.

- **Staffing** - A typical staffing arrangement for a project is the appointment of an officer to be responsible for the project, using networking skills to draw in the relevant professional inputs (e.g. health workers, teaching staff). Face to face contact with participants may be achieved by, for example, arts companies or freelance artists, coaching leaders from sports governing bodies or instructors at the outdoor centres. The centres at gestation stage are each expected to employ both full and part-time staff. In addition to their complement of paid staff, several of the projects also make use of volunteers.

- **Facilities** - Two projects involve the creation of centres with the necessary task of acquiring buildings and equipment and are as yet at the gestation stage, although they have made progress in terms of public consultation and community involvement. The rest of the projects make use of existing facilities, for example sports centres, outdoor education centres or schools.

- **Project Length** - Some of the projects are for a fixed term, others are not finite but depend on continuing to attract funding. Apart from the two centres, all of the projects are operational, having either gone through a recent pilot stage or been in existence for a number of years.

- **Evaluation** - Wherever possible outputs are monitored in quantified terms, i.e. so many people attended an event, or so many began a training course and so many completed it. Such outputs are reported on a regular basis to steering groups or management committees and are often required by funding bodies. Where the numbers of participants are small then some form of profiling and follow-up may be undertaken and it is the intention of some of the projects to develop a series of indicators to form the basis of review and evaluation (for example,
school attendance rates, take up of medical screening opportunities, etc.). Systematic review procedures have been built into some of the projects and these are used to modify and improve them as they progress, for example in one of the education projects the head teachers of all of the participating schools have been interviewed and meetings held to discuss the experience with groups of teachers. One project has conducted a series of seminars and hosted a national conference. In some cases external evaluation has been used which proved helpful.

2.2 Project Profiles

2.2.1 Halifax Learning Zone Arts Programme

The Halifax Learning Zone (HLZ) is one of 25 Education Action Zones, partnerships established by government in 1998 to deal with problems of underachievement and social exclusion in disadvantaged areas. The HLZ includes 3 secondary schools, 1 secondary school for special needs and 25 primary schools, all within the administrative area of Calderdale Metropolitan District Council. HLZ activities are intended to facilitate improved standards of educational attainment within the zone. OFSTED inspected the zone in November 2000 and found that it had made a good start: 'Its priorities are matched appropriately to the needs of pupils and students in the zone and its work is beginning to contribute to improvement in the provision for them'. The report notes that the zone is well led, with appropriate management structures and a well-informed forum. The contribution to improvement is marked, although areas of little success were also identified. It was considered that monitoring and evaluation need to better grounded. The arts programme, with which this report is concerned, is singled out as being highly cost effective and contributing to improvements in pupils’ attitudes and their social and cultural development.

The arts programme (according to OFSTED this represents about 4% of the HLZ budget) began in 1999 with pilot projects that were followed up in 1999/2000 with ZAP2K, a summer festival run by an arts company. ZAP2K involved putting visual and performing artists in the schools but also bringing schools together in a celebratory event. In 2000/01 HLZ sought to embed arts programmes more within individual school curricula, but still retaining the inter-school network links established previously. The arts programmes have been well received within the schools and are seen as an

important focus for stimulating creative activities as well as overall motivation at a time when other attainment activities are stressed.

The programme was begun with a firm belief in the value of the arts in education, and that is very clearly the aspect of social inclusion on which attention is focused. From the start of the research project HLZ expressed a strong keenness to co-operate in research that might reveal hard evidence of this value, should resources be available to undertake it.

2.2.2 Somerset Libraries Mobile Service

This is part of Somerset Library Service, a statutory public service, and has been established for more than forty years to serve the needs of those of the rural population for whom access to branch libraries (30 in the county) is difficult. The main users of the service are the elderly, the infirm, those without private transport, mothers with young children and those school children that can get to a vehicle stop after school. The eight-vehicle fleet stopped at 1315 locations in the year 2000/01, with daily visits of between 200 and 500 people and an annual total of 7000 borrowers. Vehicles operate on a fortnightly cycle (three weeks for Exmoor) and the route network is reviewed annually to ensure an optimum number of users at each stop. Seven of the vehicles are equipped with wheelchair lifts and the librarians also carry out home visits for the housebound. The mobile libraries are now on-line, with the Internet used to increase the efficiency of the service, permitting instant access for catalogue and availability information. The Internet may also be used for more general purposes, but the stops are too short for it to be used as a significant means of enhancing information technology skills, which was one of the original intentions. However, those familiar with the Internet would be able to search for specific information within the stopping time of 20-30 minutes.

Most of the users are readers for pleasure but there is also listening for pleasure, with audio books being popular. In addition the mobile service serves educational and other information needs. The visit of the library is very much a social occasion as well as an opportunity to return and borrow books and there is a strong sense of personal service; the absence of elderly ‘regulars’ being a cause for enquiry fulfils a social service function.

The aims of the mobile service are contained within the Library Plan and management of the service is informed by annual User Consumer Panels and a Public Library User Survey, associated with Best Value performance assessment. These are concerned with the full range of library service and
COUNT ME IN
demonstrate high levels of satisfaction by library users in
general. This may imply that that there is a high level of
satisfaction on the part of users of the mobile service.

2.2.3 Thetford Imagine Project

The vision for Imagine is that it ‘will be a bright, lively and
engaging environment, in which children will be able to
access a range of development and learning experiences’. It is
being promoted by Kids’ Clubs Network as one of six
‘trailblazer’ Centres for Curiosity and Imagination. Three of
Thetford’s four wards are categorised as deprived, with high
unemployment and a record of low educational achievement.
The Centre is intended to raise educational achievements,
complementing the work of the Education Action Zone by
providing children and their families with opportunities for
enjoyment, which simultaneously stimulate discovery and
creativity. Other aims of the project are concerned with
community building, health and employment. Community-
based discovery centres draw on experience in the U.S.A.
where there are a number of established and successful
similar centres. Management of the project has been in the
hands of a Development Group, drawn from Norfolk
Museums Service, Thetford Partnership (now Keystone
Community Partnership, which may become a development
corporation), Thetford Education Action Zone, Norfolk
Education Department as well as the parents, teachers and
children who already have been consulted. Progress towards
funding, land acquisition, design, construction, and
installation has been slower than appeared to be the case
when Kids Clubs Network put the Thetford Imagine Centre
forward for inclusion as a ‘Beacon’ project. Keystone
Community Partnership may extend the scope of the centre
to include broader themes - to appeal to older children and
also to attract tourists. Earlier suggestions for a location have
been abandoned, but once this question has been resolved
funding applications will be made.

In the meantime an Outreach Project has been launched,
based in the ‘Ancient House Museum’ and is running a series
of events (or shows) for young children in schools, playgroups
and holiday play schemes. These have a heritage theme and
are directed by an outreach worker, who calls on support
from outside artists and also volunteers. An event involving
drama and visual art is devised and put on offer for groups of
20 - 30 children at a time over a six week period. During that
time 600 or so children will take part. The third series of
events was completed in December 2001. The proposed
Imagine Centre is referred to at each event and there is some
linkage with the educational activities on offer at the Ancient
House Museum. The outreach worker has completed an
evaluation of the first series of events based on completed
feedback forms and comments by group leaders, together with the views of the volunteers.

### 2.2.4 Common Knowledge: The Arts in Health Initiative for the Tyne and Wear Health Action Zone (HAZ)

The *Common Knowledge* project is a programme designed to promote the use of Arts in health programmes at a regional level, with an objective of enhancing the well-being of patients in care settings and also those who consider themselves to be healthy. Common Knowledge ‘pioneers a new approach to placing arts activities at the heart of community health and clinical practice’. It seeks to eliminate health inequalities and focuses on networks of creative capacity, healthy citizenship and community development. Arts into health projects are intended to raise self esteem and awareness, to reduce social isolation and to inform local people of the resources available to improve quality of life.

*Common Knowledge* takes the form of a three-year training programme to disseminate good practice: in the first year, by developing a regional network of training events, Revelation Days and conferences; in the second year, by funding diverse pilot hybrid projects; and in the final year, by providing a showcase for regional pilot projects. The current steering group behind the *Common Knowledge* project include the Tyne and Wear HAZ, regional arts development officers, senior health care managers and health promotion advisers from the Tyne and Wear region.

*Common Knowledge* seeks to consolidate emergent cross-sectoral partnerships, exchanges and initiatives with diverse community groups throughout the five boroughs - Newcastle, North Tyneside, South Tyneside, Sunderland and Gateshead. An external evaluation process has been instigated for the overall project, conducted by Tom Smith from the Judge Institute of Management Studies at Cambridge University (Smith, 2001: 90). All arts into health pilot projects include some kind of participant and artistic record and evaluation.

### 2.2.5 Arts into Health: Walsall Health Action Zones

The *Arts into Health* project co-ordinator works with four area steering committees in north, south, east and west Walsall to identify how the arts might help the city's four Health Action Zones (HAZs) achieve their overall health objectives. The steering committees seek local participation and voluntary sector involvement to identify health needs amongst particular ‘at risk’ groups, located in disadvantaged neighbourhoods. The underpinning rationale of this policy initiative is both one of health promotion and of local
COUNT ME IN

empowerment of disadvantaged groups and neighbourhoods to access existing health services. It also provides a challenge to mainstream inequities in health care policies, provision and outcomes.

Each Health Action Zone can inform their priorities by drawing on national strategies and plans, as well as examining local data about the incidence of coronary heart diseases and cancers as well as indicators about lifestyle issues such as smoking, alcohol and diet. Since 1999 project themes for each of the four Heath Action Zones have been identified and steering groups established for each project. In Walsall, the Heath Action Zones are partnerships between the Health Authority and the Community Arts Team, located in Walsall MBC Leisure Services.

The diverse projects are aimed to have a measurable impact on the community’s health through the use of arts as a medium for stimulating awareness and discussion around particular health issues. During 2000-01, 19 projects were funded, artists commissioned, and diverse projects realised and evaluated in different parts of the city. Partnerships are felt to be essential to good practice. Specific groups and neighbourhoods have been targeted and have involved a wide age range addressing health issues around class, gender and ethnicity, eg. a Schools Liaison Officer has been appointed to work on a Personal and Social Health Education initiative about smoking and young people.

2.2.6 Leeds Football Community Link (LFCL)

This project was set-up by NACRO, the crime reduction charity, in 1997 and has been funded by various sources over the years. It uses football to engage young people and divert those at risk from self-destructive anti-social and criminal behaviour. The model for LFCL was developed from NACRO projects elsewhere, and a similar project is now being set-up in Tyne and Wear. Over 600 youngsters have been involved on a regular basis. One of the distinctive features of the Leeds project is the way in which training and support is provided for those who want to run teams. The project is as much about these volunteers as about the youngsters, and all the teams have to be set-up by established community groups so that there is local support for the volunteers.

Weekly training happens at each club and teams come together for tournaments in the school holidays (including half-terms) for U8, U10, U13, U16 and an open age competition for the volunteers. The project is based in Beeston, South Leeds, and although teams from elsewhere in the city are involved, only those from the SRB4 area can be supported financially (now the project once again has another
funder, the Football Foundation, this restriction will be removed). It’s not just the youngsters who benefit; the adults do too. Confidence and skills increase among the volunteers, and positive community relations are strengthened, and one of the team managers is now the project co-ordinator. At the outset the majority of volunteers were originally unemployed, but this is less often the case now. 69 volunteers have completed Junior Team Management and First Aid courses, and four have successfully completed the FA Coaching Certificate (1 going on to do the UEFA ‘B’ licence).

Each team keeps records of who participates, but these are used essentially to demonstrate to funders that the project is successfully involving young people. Before our involvement, a one-off consultation exercise was conducted with representatives of the various teams. We worked with LFCL to conduct a small-scale questionnaire survey of players (n = 111), and some qualitative research is just starting with the volunteers to establish what they perceive to be the benefits of the project to themselves and to the players.

2.2.7 Community Arts Programme for the Young Unemployed - Haringey Arts Council

As the funding agencies change the terms and conditions change slightly, though the idea of using the arts and media to re-engage disaffected youth remains. The project recruits 17-24 year olds borough-wide, though different sources of funding have been attached to different geographical areas (New Deal allows recruitment from anywhere, the European Social Fund from just 3 wards, and the Single Regeneration Budget from the old borough of Tottenham). The goal is to provide participants with the basis for work or full-time education. There are tensions between funders’ desire for roll-on / roll-off and project management desire for cohorts. Typically 20 are recruited at one time for a six-month programme, a high proportion of whom are from minority ethnic groups. Lack of capital means that the groups have to be divided in two to allow them to have access to the equipment.

The intention is to develop personal and generic skills (e.g., reliability, working with others, copyright/ownership) alongside specialist and basic technical training and assistance with a tailored job search. The central vehicle for this is experiential training in sound and video recording technology to produce computer generated music and video programmes, normally of issues of local importance. Outputs in both media have been well received by people outside the project. Participants gain accredited learning through the Open College Network – 4 to 10 credits at Level 1 or 2. However, attempts to include a work placement were
COUNT ME IN

abandoned. Project staff believe that if people go through the programme they will be open to going into work, but there is no guarantee a job will be there, especially if they want to remain in the sector.

Different funders have different funding processes and timetables and require different forms of monitoring. New Deal practices encourage qualitative appraisal, but the record of the personal development plan requires very formal information regarding time keeping and attendance, for example. One of the concerns of the project is that data are provided to the funding agencies, but are not subsequently processed either to provide overall assessments or feedback to individual clients in their search for jobs.

2.2.8 Charlton Athletic Race Equality (CARE) Partnership: Sports Initiative

The CARE Sports Initiative is a section of the CARE Partnership which is jointly led by Charlton Athletic Football Club and Greenwich Council. There are another thirty stakeholder partners ranging from the police to minority ethnic organisations. The Partnership was established to oppose discrimination through proactive interventions in the arts, training and empowerment, victim support, community schemes, education, youth schemes and sport. CARE aims to break down barriers and assist those groups in most need of help by empowering socially excluded groups with the skills necessary to compete in the job market.

CARE uses sport to tackle racism in a wide variety of ways, from empowering and training people with qualifications and employment opportunities to offering free sports coaching in the community. The focus of the sports section is on socially excluded groups, particularly black and minority ethnic groups, refugee groups, young people and the unemployed. They work towards governing body awards and the opportunity to become employed by a local sports provider. Unlike most governing body awards these normally include a module in equalities learning and cultural diversity. Participants are charged with delivering free coaching in the community to CARE partners soon after they become qualified as coaches. In the period between April 1999 and March 2001 some four hundred people participated in 18 different courses.

At the end of each course a feedback form is completed by the participants, and the co-ordinator evaluates courses using these comments, supported by the quantitative data of participants’ personal details as well as ad hoc feedback from tutors. This mainly descriptive feedback has met the needs of the key stakeholders. The most comprehensive evaluation of
the Sports Initiative to date was commissioned from the University of Leicester (Garland and Chakroborti, 2001). This included a survey of the perceptions Charlton Athletic season ticket holders (4000 approached; 22.5% response) and semi-structured interviews were conducted with the CARE team and partners to assess their perceptions of the impact of their work. However, as a generic evaluation of the CARE Partnership, sport specific data were based largely on the Sports Co-ordinator’s reports.

2.2.9 Focus E15 - Newham

*Focus E15* is a six week radio broadcasting project for East London youth (16-25) run by young people themselves from the Newham area. The Foyer is a national charitable organisation established to work with disadvantaged, often homeless, young people. It was Foyer tenants who first requested the programme of training and talent showcasing, which resulted in a course followed by two weeks of broadcasting. 2001 saw the second of these projects with forty recruits. A recent change in the length of the course from sixteen weeks to six has seriously affected the potential of the course to achieve its aims although these have not been amended to date. The Foyer has used partners to generate extra funding and resources (e.g. from the Basic Skills Agency to improve literacy and numeracy), free internet access (from UK Online) and staffing support (e.g. tutors from Newham College and E15 Foyer, and youth-workers from Newham Youth Service).

The course and broadcast were originally developed to attract disengaged young people back into formal education using music radio, which is popular with youth, and would also allow the teaching of transferable skills. These young people first have to complete a music technicians’ course that develops the skills of media technology for disc jockeys. They are involved in studio operations, editing, interviewing, scriptwriting, presentation, and programme production. The project was also designed to raise awareness of employment issues and to provide them with a demo tape to start this process off. The participants are given the opportunity to work in teams, by themselves and with people from the local community (and occasionally celebrities). They have artistic freedom in planning their own shows and their connection with the youth of Newham gives them grounded knowledge of the music and social issues that are current and popular.

When participants join the course their needs are assessed. This involves a basic life skills assessment to identify individual training to address those needs. Tutors monitor student progress through the course in terms of attitude and aptitude, and project evaluations are completed at the end.
Passing the course requires participants to have achieved a satisfactory level of competence in all of the life skills and technical skills that the course has to offer. The one evaluation to date reflected upon how well the objectives were being met on the basis of successful completion of the course by participants (Focus E15, 1999: 4).

2.2.10 Galleries of Justice – Nottingham

The Galleries of Justice is a museum based in the Shire Hall buildings, many of which were in actual use until the mid 1980s. The particular social inclusion agendas that the programme focuses on are:

- to encourage social groups who would not commonly visit museums to come and experience the Galleries; and
- to provide those who may be unsure of, or averse to, the legal system (especially disaffected young people at risk of entering criminality) with reassurance of the merits of the system and the demerits of a life of crime.

The museum uses interactive scenes with staff in costume to explain and re-enact a wide range of aspects related to the legal system.

The particular project under consideration is supported by Heritage Lottery Fund and aims to run 136 drama sessions over a 3-year period involving over 3,700 children, young people and families. The intended audience is young people, but with a particular focus on disaffected young people age 16 to 25 (17%) and young people with special needs (10%).

The funding agreement from HLF is very tightly related to milestones, and delivery outputs. For example, during the period 3rd April to 28th August 2001. To run:

- 7 sessions for Primary schools
- 3 sessions for special needs groups
- 5 sessions for Secondary schools
- 5 sessions for disaffected youth groups
- 10 sessions for family groups

Evaluation concentrates on the quality of the service delivery and customer satisfaction. Evaluation of outcomes is left to the visiting groups, if they so choose. It is expected that there will be a contribution to education through the project’s informative and stimulating sessions, to civic pride by drawing on the history of the city of Nottingham, and to inter-personal skills through role play that helps to improve personal confidence levels and encourage participants to speak in a ‘public’ forum. However, there is no formal
evidence of such benefits. This project succeeds in social inclusion by widening the consumer base of an enjoyable ‘cultural experience’. If it impacts on crime prevention, this should be regarded as a bonus – certainly there is no real evidence to support that outcome, although some of those spoken to (visit organisers) were firmly of the view that it “will have helped”.

2.2.11 Key in Project – Brighton

This NACRO project is funded as part of ‘New Deal’, to engage long-term unemployed young people in creative work and skills development. The central feature of the project is the publication of a magazine, Sorted, which is distributed free of charge to young people in Brighton and the surrounding area. The trainees take responsibility for editorial, design, marketing and distribution under the direction of a member of NACRO staff. The topics featured in the magazine focus on issues of concern and interest to young people – especially those who are having difficulty with integration with wider society. The project aims to encourage and enable trainees to secure permanent employment by the end of their programme (up to 6 months). In addition, many of the trainees are deemed to be at risk of entering criminality, and the programme tries to influence them to stay out of crime. During their time on the programme, the trainees are carefully monitored and mentored.

Those reading Sorted may also be helped towards social inclusion. This is a publication, which although supported by an establishment organisation, is seen to be caring and interested in their needs, speaking with a credibility lent by people on the Key In Project. Many of the articles present worthwhile advice and information to help disaffected young people to re-connect with mainstream society. No direct relationship exists with the readership, but some are encouraged to contribute articles for publication in the magazine, which may in turn raise their self-esteem and social connectedness.

During the programme, the trainees work in a normal employment relationship (although they may be resentful of the “very low rate of pay” for this ‘work’) and receive significant help to ensure their social-connectedness. The intention is that they should continue with this lifestyle when they leave the programme and informal contact is maintained with some. However, there is no formal system for tracking how they get on after the project and a longitudinal study of former trainees would be of benefit to monitor the long-term impact.
2.2.12 Youth Charter for Sport, Culture and the Arts - Manchester

It was originally intended that the Granby and Toxteth Social Centre of Excellence in Liverpool should be included as one of the 14 projects. However, the anticipated funding did not come on stream in time for it to be included, so attention was redirected to its promoter, the Youth Charter for Sport, Culture and the Arts, which had already opened the first centre of this kind in Moss Side, Manchester. This is a charity established as a collective response in recognising the role of sport and the arts in combating anti-social behaviour among young people. The project aims to encourage the development of cross-curricular social and personal development by exposing young people at risk to sport and the arts in an attempt to establish lifelong pathways of learning and citizenship. The Youth Charter acts as a facilitator to broker agreements that involve the target groups themselves as active parties to the agreement. The programme has spawned up to 30 social inclusion and regeneration projects. Other programmes are now being launched under the ‘Youthwise’ banner – at school, at work, in the community or in an institution, all based on the same concept. Plans are now in place to develop similar centres elsewhere in the country.

Essentially, the aim is to engage disaffected young people in what is described as ‘a win-win arrangement’. This programme seeks to engage socially excluded young people in a ‘give and take’ arrangement whereby the benefits are readily available, but only if they make the personal commitment in return. As a result, the benefits are highly regarded, and there is healthy competition for a place on the programme. Participants enjoy benefits, as long as they make a personal commitment to good citizenship. Many of the benefits are cultural (sport, music, etc) but others are about empowerment – giving the individual responsibility and control of their own destiny (and the destiny of others):

- Opportunities to enjoy cultural activity
- Education and training leading to employment opportunities
- Lifestyle adjustment, reducing susceptibility towards criminality and drug abuse

Individuals who are accepted onto the programme are monitored thoroughly as long as they remain part of the programme. This is a condition of participation, and it is accepted that the programme provides desirable benefits, but only for those who are prepared to make their own personal commitment to accept the conditions. Outputs are measured by the numbers joining and staying on the programme.
Positive outcomes can readily be seen in the social development of some participants, although such data are usually collected via personal networks rather than by independent evaluation techniques.

2.2.13 Aiming Higher - Birmingham

Launched in January 2000, Aiming Higher has broad aims to raise the learning potential of selected target groups of school pupils. The first of the scheme’s three components involves the pupils in preparing for their attendance on an outdoor residential course. The adventure courses have been developed by Birmingham LEA working collaboratively with Outward Bound (Aberdovey). In the third component the work the experiences gained in each residential are followed-up when the pupils return to their schools to capitalise upon gains made while away. A second residential is offered in the following year. There is also an annual scheme wide event designed to celebrate the successes of all those involved. With the assistance of a member of staff from Aiming Higher schools are now encouraged to work within this template to develop courses that more precisely meet their own needs.

The strength of the relationship between Birmingham LEA and Outward Bound (Aberdovey) is central to the scheme. Training involving staff from both Birmingham and Outward Bound has attempted to ensure that there is continuity and effective planning throughout the scheme. However involvement in the scheme does come at a price and there has been some turnover in regard to the schools involved. In Project Two 130 students have participated in the scheme from a total of eight schools.

The scheme provides participating schools with the residential courses and some training before and follow up after each course but schools have to provide for transport to/from Aberdovey and for teacher replacement. It has been the norm for members of staff from each school to attend ‘their’ school’s residential with the clear benefit of helping with the links before and after each residential. Workloads and staffing pressures have been reported as causing ‘some problems’.

There have been many ‘successes’ reported by the staff and pupils involved. However, there is no common system employed to evaluate the scheme as a whole or individual courses. The evaluations are as yet so varied in nature style and content that it is not possible to make any substantial claims about the scheme other than at a rather general level. Staff involved in the scheme are aware of this and are keen to find ways to develop more formal evaluation methods.
Schools have to measure cost against benefit in a complex equation. The main evidence to support continued involvement is transmitted via a combination of teacher enthusiasm and a range of positive reports and comments from the staff and pupils involved.

2.2.14 Police and Youth Encouragement Scheme – Bootle (PAYES)

Community police in Bootle have been running this scheme since 1993 as an incentive to divert youngsters from becoming involved in crime. The scheme recruits children (12 to 13 years) who are perceived to be at risk of becoming involved in crime. Referrals come from schools, churches, youth groups etc. Once admitted they go to a series of events (mainly sporting and social) in their home area, which lead up to an annual residential course featuring adventurous and other activities. The residential offers a break from home, a unique opportunity, a chance to see the countryside and to learn new skills.

Under this guise the whole scheme is a personal development course over three years with a structured residential each summer. Anxious to avoid criticism for rewarding young criminals with holidays, the scheme is explicitly for those who have ‘never been in trouble with the police’.

Over the years PAYES has worked with a number of outside providers to run the summer residential courses but a strong partnership has now developed with Brathay Hall (Cumbria) to provide the residential support for all three levels of the scheme. There are typically 60, 40 and 30 children on the scheme at levels 1, 2 and 3 respectively. There is also acknowledgement of the need to provide an exit strategy for graduates of the scheme in supporting them as they begin to develop formal qualifications and a record of their achievements.

Records of the scheme are maintained which show how children are recruited and of their gains if they attend each successive residential course. Children move away from the scheme for a variety of reasons: some elect to withdraw and others are rejected if they are felt not to be contributing sufficiently or if they ever get into trouble with the law. PAYES staff in attendance at the residential keep records, but these are somewhat perfunctory recording yes/no for each of four questions – eg “Did he become fully involved in activities?” These are, however, supported by a brief commentary from the same staff.

There is clearly scope here for further evaluative work including consideration of the pupils’ experiences. Brathay is
currently involved in a number of research projects that look at what makes residential effective.

A short summary of the main aims, organisation and management structures, activities and target population for each project can be found by reference to APPENDIX IV. These reviews were conducted during the course of the research, and in many cases the conditions pertaining at the time were subject to a changing environment, and may not now apply in exactly the same form.
## Table 1 - Social Inclusion Projects
### Overview of types of project

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project Title &amp; Location</th>
<th>Education/encourage learning</th>
<th>Sport</th>
<th>Racial equity training</th>
<th>Outdoor Adventure education</th>
<th>Arts/health issues</th>
<th>Training for employment</th>
<th>Arts/media connection</th>
<th>Museum</th>
<th>Personal development</th>
<th>Crime prevention</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Somerset Mobile Library Service - Bridgwater</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thetford Centre for Curiosity &amp; Imagination - Thetford</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charlton Athletic Race Equality Sports Coach Qualifications - Charlton</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aiming Higher - Birmingham</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts &amp; Health Work - Walsall</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zap 2K: A Feast for the Arts - Halifax</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Arts Programme for Young Unemployed - Haringey</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leeds Football Community Link Project - Leeds</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tyne &amp; Wear HAZ Arts project - Tyne &amp; Wear</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus 101.4 FM - Newham</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Galleries of Justice Human Activity Education Project - Nottingham</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police &amp; Youth Encouragement Scheme - Bootle</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key-In Project 'Sorted' Magazine - Brighton</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth Charter for Sport, Culture and the Arts - Manchester</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3. A consideration of social ex/inclusion

3.1 Social Exclusion

3.1.1 According to Castells (2000) the term, *social exclusion*, originated in a policy context with the European Commission, where it was defined as ‘the social rights of citizens... to a certain basic standard of living and to participation in the major social and occupational opportunities of the society’ (Room, 1992: 14). Perhaps not surprisingly this has normally been interpreted in terms of being without regular employment and its associated income.

3.1.2 In apparently broader terms, the Social Exclusion Unit explains social exclusion as follows:

*Social exclusion is a shorthand term for what can happen when people or areas suffer from a combination of linked problems such as unemployment, poor skills, low incomes, poor housing, high crime environments, bad health and family breakdown.*

But these are symptoms rather than causes and there is an argument about whether social exclusion should be treated as a product or a process⁴. Conceptually the revised definition from the Commission of the European Communities is more helpful than that offered by SEU as it is set within a context that draws attention to the processes involved:

*Social exclusion refers to the multiple and changing factors resulting in people being excluded from the normal exchanges, practices and rights of modern society. Poverty is one of the most obvious factors, but social exclusion also refers to inadequate rights in housing, education, health and access to services. It affects individuals and groups, particularly in urban and rural areas, who are in some way subject to discrimination or segregation; and it emphasises weaknesses in the social infrastructure and the risk of allowing a two-tier society to become established by default.* (Commission of the European Communities, 1993: 1)

⁴ Castells (2000: 71) is quite insistent that 'social exclusion is a process not a condition'. 

3.1.3 Arguably then, social exclusion represents separation/alienation from the political, economic and frequently socio-cultural processes of society. Room (1995) stresses this relational aspect of social exclusion in light of little participation/integration and, importantly, power. The implication of the SEU logic is that measures taken to reduce the selected indicators of exclusion (health, education, employment, crime and housing) will necessarily serve to achieve social inclusion. Important though such challenges may be, we argue that a simple inversion, if it fails to address the processes of exclusion, will not promote social inclusion\(^5\). Addressing such inequity is surely a necessary, but not sufficient condition of social inclusion.

3.1.4 The nature and extent of exclusion also varies considerably, embracing as it does those who participate less than some presumed norm, low income groups, the long term unemployed, rough sleepers and persistent offenders. Feelings about ‘social inclusion’ might therefore be expected to vary just as considerably among those who are taken to be ‘excluded’.

3.1.5 One of the advantages of the current SEU definition is that it does help to redress the preoccupation with the labour market. Undoubtedly unemployment is associated with other aspects of exclusion, but not all can be economically active and this emphasis detracts from the other dimensions even for those who are looking for work. Disappointingly the emphasis of the PAT 10 report was heavily upon consuming rather than producing and contributing. It has to be questioned how inclusion and regeneration can be expected if all that people are invited to be party to is consumption.

3.1.6 There are, of course, critics of the focus on social exclusion. For example, Burden (2000) has suggested that focussing on social exclusion demotes (distracts from) redistribution policies designed to promote greater equality. And Levitas (1996) objects to the integrationist agenda, and suggests that more fundamental questions require to be addressed about why everyone should be incorporated into the dominant vision (a particularly sensitive issue once more in light of last summer’s ethnic tensions). She argues that the emphasis on integration devalues unpaid work and tends to obscure inequalities between those who are in paid employment. Her identification of three policy styles - reintegrating people into the labour market; addressing low income and lack of resources; blaming an underclass for their moral failings -

\(^5\) It seems that the approach of the Scottish Executive of setting minimum targets for health, education, employment, crime and housing (the same concerns as the Social Exclusion Unit) to be achieved under the banner of *social justice* is a sounder conceptual link.
suggests a policy emphasis on the personal rather than the systemic.

3.1.7 Partly because of the tradition of policies for neighbourhood renewal there is also a strong geographical dimension to social inclusion initiatives with the Index of Multiple Deprivation 2000 (for example) being used to target the most needy areas. There can be little doubt that the collective burden of multiple deprivations can have a disproportionate effect on those living in such areas. But more than this, Castells (2000) argues that whole areas are bypassed by what he calls ‘information capitalism’ as being superfluous to its needs. The state has long accepted a role in redressing such imbalances. Moreover, some policies are simply more easily directed to areas than to individuals, though there can then be no guarantee that those most in need are the beneficiaries of such policies. In the areas of the 14 projects it may be that the excluded either do not know that they can, or do not care to, take up the offer of involvement (perhaps because they feel they have been subject to a history of discrimination). It may be those who are already included who are most likely to take part. This possibility may be particularly strong in rural areas where there can be great socio-economic diversity within relatively small populations.

3.2 How should cultural policies be orientated to secure inclusion?

_Cultural services already make a substantial contribution to the social, cultural, educational, health and economic life of communities, although more needs to be done to extend participation among currently under-participating groups. Further, the ability of cultural services to provide accessible, inclusive and safe social spaces underpins their potential to move beyond the simple extension of participation and to address a range of personal, social, economic and environmental issues – to move from developing cultural services in communities to developing communities through cultural services._ (Coalter, 2001: 1)

3.2.1 We have already noted in Chapter 1 the kind of claims made for the potential of cultural activities to promote social inclusion. There are a number of arguments by which this might be considered to have been achieved:

1. Involvement in cultural activities = de facto inclusion? Sport, arts and other cultural activities may be seen to be in and of themselves a good thing, and increased participation in them benefits the individuals concerned
because they are thereby included in something valuable. By virtue of being included in cultural activities people might de facto be considered to be included in society. This might be linked to a general quality of life philosophy.

Higher participation rates in cultural activities by groups presumed to be excluded? If supposedly excluded groups (e.g. minority ethnic groups, the unemployed, older people) reveal greater participation rates then inclusion may be said to have increased. This may be particularly appealing to projects operating on the ground: ‘people may be excluded from society as a whole, but at least we can be inclusive’. However, just because ‘it’ gets to the socially excluded does not necessarily mean that anything has been done to promote social inclusion – unless giving the socially excluded ‘something’ makes for social inclusion It is interesting to note that in addressing ‘groups at particular risk of social exclusion’ the PAT 10 report considers groups excluded from arts/sport activity. The argument has thereby been subtly transposed from considering whether/how using cultural activities can benefit those who are socially excluded to a consideration of how to encourage participation in cultural activities by those identified by the agencies as currently having low participation rates in such activities.

Involvement in cultural activities improves policy indicators (currently, education, employment, crime, health)? This can be said to have been achieved if involvement in cultural activities can be shown to improve health, reduce crime, etc. This is dependent of course on what policy areas are presumed to be susceptible to such change (or the government’s current priorities).

Increased human potential? As a result of these projects there may be benefits at the individual level or collectively as ‘community capital’. At the individual level this is typically considered to encompass factors like confidence, esteem, skills. Beyond that community capacity can be seen to have advanced if projects result in extended social networks, increased community cohesion, civic pride, collective skills, etc.

Opening-up social structures/institutions/organisations through participation? Arguably inclusion is not possible unless institutions allow it to be so, hence the significance of those projects that involve excluded people in decision-making. The response from the Arts Council for England to the SEU stressed the importance of local people
developing strategies to achieve ownership and sustainability.

3.2.2 Different projects certainly appear to use the terms in different ways. Consequently some are predicated on the belief that social inclusion can be achieved by promoting access to cultural activities by those who are thought to be excluded (or live in areas where a significant proportion are thought to be excluded). Others seek to tackle the conditions of social exclusion (e.g. improving currently poor standards of health), but it is not clear that this necessarily promotes social inclusion. Others seek to use cultural activities more instrumentally to promote social inclusion by the attainment of a set of conditions. It should be noted that although the 14 projects considered here are all very much concerned with social inclusion, they may not have been set up with that as their primary aim. Thus the feedback they obtain may be directly relevant to their original aims, but may address social inclusion only obliquely.

3.2.3 Overall then the potential of cultural projects to promote social inclusion appears to be increasingly recognised. However, we must also be alert to countervailing views that are offered on two counts. The first is an organisational/bureaucratic issue. For example, while recognising the potential, Muddiman et al. (2000) have questioned the practice, challenging the ability of the library service (as opposed to individual projects) to deliver social inclusion goals. Secondly, at a more fundamental level, critics suggest that our political system actually requires people to be ‘excluded’ (e.g. Sibley, 1995; Byrne, 1999).
4. The approach adopted

4.1 Milestones, outputs and outcomes

4.1.1 Three levels of recording project development and delivery can readily be identified.

Some projects are evaluated only/largely in terms of timely meeting the **milestones** established for the staging posts of project development (first consultation meeting, co-ordinator in post, etc.). This is done largely to satisfy funding agents regarding due process and is commonly accepted as perfectly adequate to demonstrate proper project management.

The next level considers measures of **outputs**: e.g. the number of events staged, the number of people attending on at least one occasion or for the duration.

But a consideration of the power to promote social inclusion requires an evaluation of the success in securing **outcomes** that at the very least advance the position of those who are socially excluded. So, do people get jobs, does their health improve, do they move into gainful employment, is crime reduced? In other words, in what ways have the outcomes changed the lives of the participants?

It was our task to review the third of these, but unfortunately evaluation of outcomes is harder for projects to achieve. This is because of the cost of evaluation and the complexities of measuring elusive outcomes.

4.2 Outcomes and convincing indicators

4.2.1 There is a growing appreciation that the scientific model of research is unlikely to provide the kind of assessment required. Convincing hard data are also difficult to come by beyond the (perhaps not so) simple monitoring of participants from different groups. Sometimes through despair and frustration and sometimes through natural inclination, some have dismissed a naïve faith in the validity and reliability of quantitative measures of participation as indicators of inclusion. Sometimes this extends to a rejection of the idea that there is any point in engaging in evaluation at all. The feeling that ideas of confidence, esteem, community cohesion, etc. are not amenable to quantitative measurement may be
perfectly correct, but the challenge then has to be to identify what does constitute ‘evidence’.

4.2.2 Many of the projects have latched onto the idea of ‘soft’ indicators, but despite our promptings there are few signs to date that they have moved beyond the conceptual stage to identify indicators and gather the associated evidence. Those in the arts world seem to know of the Comedia work, *Use or Ornament* (Matarasso, 1997) but have yet to find a way to operationalise it successfully.

4.2.3 It is common for project workers to report specific examples of people from the project who have achieved something valuable. Whether rightly or wrongly this is vulnerable to being dismissed as merely anecdotal evidence. The point is that few people doubt that such projects can produce social benefits, which is what such instances demonstrate. The question is to what extent they occur and whether there is something going on that rises above pure happenstance. It would be helpful if such examples could be treated more formally and aggregated to make a compelling case, but this can only be done convincingly if accompanied by a consideration of the counter examples. A critical examination is needed of why there should be the different outcomes.

4.2.4 The projects involved here are disparate and there was never any intention that a standardised set of indicators should be imposed. We therefore sought a possible set of outcome measures. Our starting point were the key DCMS interests

1. Improved educational performance
2. Increased employment rates
3. Reduced levels of crime
4. Better (and more equal) standards of health

DCMS does not expect social inclusion projects normally to address the fifth consideration of improved housing conditions.

4.2.5 Beyond those four we identified a large range of alternative social inclusion outcomes as a result of our review of the literature (we could have selected many more).

- Self-esteem
- Personal performance
- Raising aspirations / Self-confidence
- Employability
- Interpersonal skills
- Control over own destiny
- Sense of ownership / ‘stakeholding’
- Relationships with ‘establishment’ groups
COUNT ME IN

- Relationships with ‘peer’ groups
- Relationships with ‘other cultural’ groups
- Celebrating own culture
- Involvement in decision making
- Active Citizenship (exercising rights & taking responsibilities)
- Social connectedness (relationships between individuals)
- Community cohesion (people and groups operating in concert to secure common interests)
- Civic pride (identification with local community and pride in the local community for its own residents)

4.2.6 For convenience in this report, we have grouped this second set of outcomes into:
- Personal development
- Social cohesion
- Making structures more open

4.3 Attributing cause

4.3.1 Even where projects have been gathering ‘evidence’, it is difficult to attribute cause.

- Youngsters may forsake ‘delinquent’ or ‘deviant’ ways because their interests and disposition shift as they ‘mature’ or they get a job or boyfriend/girlfriend or...
- People’s health may improve because they change job and experience less stress or they get a job as the economic climate improves so they have the income to allow a better diet or they give up smoking because their best mate dies of cancer...

4.3.2 If we were talking about outcomes in the aggregate, perhaps this should not matter, but often our projects are small scale and individual circumstances matter. Moreover, many of the outcomes (as defined above) may only occur ‘down the line’ after the project has been wound-up.

4.4 Process and procedures

4.4.1 Working with the 14 projects identified in chapter 2 we used a four stage approach

1. Orientation and profiling

Profiles were constructed of all projects using material deposited on file with DCMS, information gathered from field

---

^6 Including other religious, other socio-economic, other age groupings etc.
visits and supplementary information collected by telephone, electronic and written correspondence. Apart from the key contact details each profile contained:

- Project aims
- Funding sources/scale
- Staffing: employees & volunteers
- Project organisation and management
- Activities of project - where and when
- Geographical area covered
- Target population and how engaged/recruited
- Stage of development of the project
- Monitoring and evaluation: process & criteria matched to aims (indicators of success)
- Progress to date
- Future timetable/programme/duration
- Other distinguishing characteristics

2. Assisting evaluation and guiding procedures

We organised a workshop day in London with representatives of the projects and DCMS to consider the issues around involvement in the project and how appropriate indicators might be constructed and implemented. We distributed information about each project to all those involved, disseminated the outcomes of the day and set-up a restricted access web site. Our intention was to try to stimulate interest and activity in evaluation among the projects by fostering a feeling of collective endeavour. These discussions were then followed up in detail in each of the individual projects (3).

3. Identifying indicators

Each of the projects was assigned to a member of the CLSR team such that specialist staff interests could be deployed to best advantage. The programme of field visits was supplemented with telephone, fax and email correspondence and was designed to take account of the possible need to observe activities or interview participants as well as interviewing key personnel and collecting relevant documentation.

On the basis of the respective stage 1 profiles we carefully reviewed with each project team the objectives of their project (DCMS had rightly been insistent that this had to be the basis of any evaluation) and considered carefully not just milestones and outputs, but what outcomes they were seeking to achieve. This started with the four DCMS categories of outcome, but was extended to a much broader conception of inclusion (see above).

We then worked with them to try to identify appropriate indicators of performance linked to these outcomes. In some
cases these were off-the-peg indicators, while others were bespoke.

4. Collating evidence

The projects have been involved in very different styles of evaluation...
- external consultants employed either to support the development of the project or to conduct one-off evaluations
- Consumer Panels run for the service as a whole
- ad hoc survey
- feedback forms from group leaders
- interviewing intermediaries – e.g. head teachers
- demonstration through photographic and other evidence

These evaluations produce different levels of evidence:
- the (informed) claims of those working on the project
- feedback from those they work with
- internal evaluation
- externally audited evidence

We do not wish to infer a truth hierarchy, but it probably does represent a gradient of credibility, even though those who should have the greatest knowledge of the processes and outcomes are those working on the project.

4.5 Evaluators' Symposium

4.5.1 This process was supplemented by a symposium that brought together in Leeds a range of people currently engaged in similar/related evaluation challenges to share experiences and pool knowledge. Each of the 19 delegates was involved in studying the efficacy of cultural programmes and their impact on social inclusion. Their expertise covered a wide range of different kinds of cultural activity, yet it became clear that many of the experiences and conclusions were similar, and that most of the evaluative processes relied heavily on the professional judgement of key practitioners. The issues debated included:
- the consequence of using different definitions of social inclusion
- whether cultural inclusion is necessarily synonymous with social inclusion
- the value placed on the intrinsic benefits of engagement with cultural activities
- the recognition that, since outcomes usually fall outside the time-frame of the project and its funding agency cycle, indicators that are typically selected are those that make
sense and provide purpose for the project staff themselves.

4.5.2 It was concluded that it should be possible to develop a taxonomy of recordable, if not measurable, indicators of social inclusion that might arise from cultural programmes (see Appendix I). However, since many of these indicators neither have an impact on, nor contribute to, the project itself they tend not to be measured. Furthermore, the benefits to a community do not always equate with the original intention or expectation of the project. Often there can be unexpected but welcomed impacts that would not have been foreseen when the project was at its formative stage and aims and measures of outcomes were being formulated.
5. Education

5.1.1 Low educational achievement may not of itself constitute exclusion, but it may precipitate social exclusion through jeopardising employment opportunities, denying access to information because of illiteracy, and feelings of alienation. Criminality (at least in terms of recorded crime) is also strongly associated with poor educational performance. Indeed, interlinkages can be identified with each of the other dimensions of social in/exclusion considered in this study.

5.1.2 The research evidence around the link between sport and education is rather ambivalent. In North America the work of Snyder and his colleagues has suggested links between sport and academic performance (e.g. Snyder, 1989). However, some have argued that this is more appropriately attributed to exercise or physical activity (e.g., Thomas et al., 1994). Although the evidence is equivocal the meta-analysis by Etnier et al. (1997), for example, found that exercise had a small positive effect on cognition, but that this came from long term involvement in exercise rather than acute treatment. Nor does this need to be limited to the young (Boucher, 2001). One of the causes of the 'mixed messages' is the difference in levels of activity (moderate intensity appearing to be most beneficial) and the aspect of cognitive functioning (attention, problem solving, etc.) being assessed (Zervas & Stambulova, 1999). Some work has examined more directly the link with academic achievement. For example, Sallis et al. (1999) demonstrated that ‘elementary’ school children involved in an increased PE programme gained better scores for academic achievement than a control group. Not surprisingly there are also concerns that spending more time on PE will distract from academic development (Shephard, 1997).

5.1.3 The strong identification of many youngsters with football is what lies behind the Playing for Success initiative. Educational benefits are secured by attending lessons at a local high profile sports arena. Evaluation of the national scheme, conducted by NFER (Sharp, 2001), has demonstrated:

- numeracy scores improved by 21 months for primary pupils and 8 months for secondary pupils
- reading comprehension improved (by 6 months for secondary pupils)
- ICT skills improved significantly
In one case, at the learning centre belonging to Leeds United F.C., anecdotal evidence from school staff (LUFC, 2000: 31) suggests:

- "some KS3 pupils were gaining new research skills at the Centre and developing those skills back at school"
- "KS2 pupils from one school, who were borderline level 3-4, all attained level 4 in their SATs"
- "SATs results from many schools had been improved in the children who attended study support at the Leeds United Centre"

These improvements are secured via the association with, and enthusiasm, for all things football, rather than playing sport itself.

5.1.4 The link between arts projects and education has been similarly contested. Similar to our current project, the Comedia project on the social impact of the arts (Matarasso, 1997) sought evidence from individual projects around the country. Evidence is presented there of favourable teacher assessments of the link that involved, in one school, reviewing language skills, physical co-ordination, observation skills, creativity and imagination, and social skills. As recognised there, the aggregate picture may be confused by these various components of performance, the art form and the situation of individual children. Matarasso (1997: 20) concluded that ‘whatever value the arts have in their own right in the curriculum (and they have much), their potential for supporting broad educational goals should be recognised’. He also argues that arts projects may encourage people back into education (both school and lifelong education). The Ofsted Report on the Halifax Learning Zone did note that the arts programme had had a positive impact on pupil motivation.

5.1.5 Perhaps not surprisingly the link between library projects and educational achievement, although not yet extensively researched is rather more clear. For example, Matarasso (1998b) cites evidence from library based reading and homework projects that suggested increases in literacy and reading skills as well as the youngsters participating feeling cleverer.

5.1.6 Enhancing academic performance was not one of the primary intentions of the Leeds Football Community Link, but the participants were still very positive when asked if their school work had improved, 62 % reporting that it was better or much better.

5.1.7 A research visit to one of the outreach events of the Thetford Imagine Project in a primary school confirmed the enjoyment and enthusiasm of the children and teachers who were
involved. So impressed was she that the Head Teacher was most insistent that the development of the Imagine Centre (which she welcomed) should not bring an end to the outreach work which she valued for its beneficial effect on the school.

5.1.8 The OFSTED report for the Halifax Learning Zone (in January 2001 on the basis of a visit the previous November) notes that the Arts Programmes have contributed to improvements in pupils' attitudes and their social and cultural development at the same time as being highly cost-effective. Interviews were conducted with three Head Teachers of participating schools and all three confirmed that both their schools and individual pupils had benefited greatly from the arts programmes, although relating these benefits to specific educational attainments and the recorded performance of individual children was not possible. Extra resources for the arts and outside expertise had generated creative enthusiasms beyond the scope of normal school routines. Public performances and exhibitions of children's work had been good for the reputation of the schools as well as boosting the children's self-esteem and confidence through outside recognition. Specific improvements identified by Head Teachers were:

- enhanced cohesion and a sense of community
- the socialisation of teenage boys
- the programmes being 'good for children with behavioural difficulties'

In the secondary school, the arts programme had led to more pupils opting for arts courses in Further Education and the establishment of a collaborative GCSE Dance module.

5.1.9 The interviews confirmed the intuitive view that the arts have a major role to play in improving the quality of education. The OFSTED report states that:

*Monitoring and evaluation need to be better grounded. Clearer measures of progress are necessary to support professional judgement on the achievement of the objectives of the plan.*

5.1.10 HLZ offered their full co-operation in any future research that might be set up to work in this direction, were resources and support to be made available. However, even with clearer measures of progress, it is doubtful whether quantification of some of the specific benefits of the arts programmes would have been possible. Focus group sessions with teachers and pupils would be a constructive approach in this direction, but would need to be conducted by trained facilitators for valid results to be obtained. More concrete evidence may be
obtained by structured discussions with pupils and teachers from a number of schools within the HLZ.

5.1.11 In Birmingham the Aiming Higher scheme was specifically set up on the basis that pupil involvement in a structured programme of activities leading to a residential outdoor adventure course will lead to improvements in their educational attainment. The target being to ‘raise their self-esteem and confidence and, in the case of primary children, to ease the transfer between Primary and Secondary school’ (Roberts, 2001). Reports to the research team by staff involved in the project largely (but not totally) support this claim but it has been difficult for staff to gather appropriate data systematically or to measure these changes. For example, of the reports received the majority (but not all) indicate positive changes in attendance rates. Data obtained to date deal mainly with the impact on pupils at, or soon after, completion of a residential course, but it has not been established how long the impact of the course is felt by the pupils. Equally, research still needs to be conducted to establish what can be done to maximise these benefits.

5.1.12 Interviews identified some potentially adverse effects on pupils’ education. The business of the normal school timetable is inevitably disrupted when pupils go on the residential course. This is particularly so when, as in Aiming Higher, it is only a few pupils from any one class who go on the course while their peers continue with their normal work (staff in one school visited by our researcher advised that Aiming Higher pupils will miss ten days of school to complete their course).
6. Employment

6.1.1 Despite the ‘education, education, education’ mantra of the government, within the social inclusion debate the bulk of attention has been given to employment in what Levitas calls a ‘social integrationist discourse’. This is because of the very obvious equating of the condition of unemployment with social exclusion (e.g. Roche & Annesley, 1998). The equating of employment with social inclusion is not quite so straightforward, and indeed has been questioned by writers such as Sennett (1999). Levitas (1998), like many feminists, argues that the focus on employment has sidelined unpaid work, contributing to a very gendered debate as it is women who are more likely to be involved in unpaid work than men. However, paid work is necessary to provide the financial resources for full participation in (post)modern consumer society and elevates people from a dependent status. Beyond that there are consequential effects on confidence and esteem that may encourage people to feel more a part of society.

6.1.2 Many of the large scale regeneration projects based around cultural provision (e.g. the Baltic Exchange or the National Stadium or Opera House in Cardiff) presume substantial job creation. Major festivals and sporting events are also seen to be desirable for the same reason. The effectiveness of these large scale, prestigious initiatives has, however, been questioned. For example, in North America (Rosentraub & Swindell, 1998) concluded that sports teams/facilities are not a significant source of economic development or job creation and that they are extremely expensive ways of delivering the jobs they do. Nonetheless, the cultural sector (as represented by the sports/arts/heritage/media field of DCMS operations) is now an important and growing sector of the economy (see, for example, Local Government Association, 2001b). However, the contribution of the projects included here is only peripherally to direct job creation and more to providing participants with the skills necessary to allow them to compete more effectively in the labour market.

6.1.3 The Factory 21 project run by Haringey Arts Council works with disaffected young people to try to re-engage them to become ‘job-ready’. Despite initial appearances this is not a training course, at least not in the conventional sense. Participants do not ‘do a course’ to learn skills; they are encouraged to produce music and videos and shown how to develop the skills to do so. In this case music and video are used as vehicles to consider and acquire work-related skills, both technical skills and more general attributes: e.g., reliability, working with others, knowledge of copyright/ownership. This training by seduction can still lead
to certification of their skills. As a result of negotiations with the Open College Network participants can gain 4-10 accredited units at Level 1 or 2.

6.1.4 The project is small scale and from 1999-2001 the cohorts involved amounted to just 73 people. Of these, 18 (25%) secured employment at the end of the project\(^7\) and 17 (23%) went into further or higher education. In the evaluation of the project team, if people go through the programme they will be open to going into work, but there is no guarantee a job will be there for them. Because so much of the sector is based on own account working it is not easy to place those leaving the programme into employment.

6.1.5 Participation in the project initially included work placements. These were undertaken by eleven people, but some of the participants were not ready to commit themselves to a work environment and compromised / jeopardised the project’s relationships with employers. However, the reintroduction of work placements is being considered now that there are other organisations in the same building that could offer work experience close enough for the project team to keep a watching brief.

6.1.6 The project produces records for the various funding bodies (indeed their income is dependent on doing so). However, putting together good information is difficult, in part because of the number of organisations involved - apart from the different funders, work with the main funding agency, Employment Services, is channelled through an intermediary organisation - and good employment data are partially dependent on the employers. Project staff are concerned that despite their conscientious efforts to provide reliable data these are not turned into useful information by the NDPBs (themselves understaffed) they report to. Moreover, the feedback loop needs to be closed with information flowing back into the project from those responsible for collating employment data.

6.1.7 Even working out the percentage who successfully complete the course is not straightforward because that requires knowing how many started. To those from outside it may seem peculiar that there should be any confusion about this. However, the number referred by, for example, Employment Services may differ from the number who effectively embark on the course because some never turn up and some come for an initial meeting, but fail to return having decided it is not for them. Given the background of many of the young people involved in the scheme, persevering to complete a six month

\(^7\) For the New Deal, which accounts for the majority on the project this is defined as gaining employment within 13 weeks and remaining in employment for 13 weeks.
commitment demonstrates a greater degree of inclusion than they previously evidenced. Through the history of the programme 61% of participants have successfully completed training, and there has been steady improvement in completion rates - whereas at the start of the programme approximately half were completing it, over the past 12 months this has risen to almost three-quarters. These figures include clients who may only have attended for a few days and then dropped out or even clients who have been referred but never attended; those who attend for at least a month, generally go on to completion.

6.1.8 Other 'outputs' represent successful outcomes because of the skills they embody. For example videos produced on the scheme have been of a high enough quality to impress outside organisations, for example:

- Metropolitan Police use the video on bullying in schools for training purposes
- Lea Valley Authority agreed to fund a graffiti project as a result of the video on the Lea Valley art project, and use the video at park ranger conventions around the country and even in South Africa

These products are used to showcase participants’ work at public events and broadcasts: e.g. the project’s annual Open Studios event, festivals of short films, Carlton Television, LWT. CVs are also produced on the project to aid job seeking.

6.1.9 Some people clearly resent being on a scheme (possibly any scheme). However, despite a healthy dose of scepticism those in the group interview did not feel that they were in a training programme or employment, but that they had been given the opportunity to do something that enthused them.
“You can’t get a job if you don’t have the experience and you can’t get the experience without a job”.

So has it been any good?

Chorus of agreement [from those who were there of course].
“In here you can do a couple of tracks if you want, maybe 10, but then it’s up to you what you do with them”.

When you get up on a Monday morning do you think, ‘Oh no it’s Monday again I really don’t want to go in to the Chocolate Factory’.

“No way.”
“No.”
“It’s want I want to do. That’s what I say it’s what I want to do so it’s good to get in.”
“When I was at school I was what you call a naughty boy... well I wasn’t really there, and when I was I didn’t learn anything, I didn’t do any work, I wasn’t interested. But I want to do this.”

Those who’ve stopped coming - why do you think that is?

“It’s like I say, you’ve got to be committed.”
“I think some of them just came because they thought they had to, but they weren’t really that interested.”

OK so you’ve learnt a whole load of skills, but what about other things? Have you changed at all?

“We’ve been learning how to work together as a group.”
“Better at selling our ideas.”

6.1.10 One of the problems at the Key-In project in Brighton is the reverse, in that working alongside other employees produces some resentment of the low level of income provided by a government scheme (New Deal). The trainees are encouraged to feel part of the workforce and yet are receiving little more payment than if they were unemployed. While they have a sense of pride in having a job alongside regular staff, some can feel economically exploited. This is a very small scale project (only 13 participants in the past year). Although many leave without doing the full 6 months or getting employment (6 of those 13), the visit by the CLSR researcher, which coincided with an editorial board meeting, recognised the skills they had acquired in publishing a magazine, using computers competently and doing graphic design. Some occasionally seek certification of their learning, but this is not usual.
6.1.11 Participants in the Foyer project in Newham, Focus E15, were very positive about the skills they had learnt as part of their radio technician and DJ training. There are a number of examples of successful participants who have gone on to work or even teach in the media. From a survey in 1999, 40% said they would be going on to study in a related area, 20% said they would be looking for work in a related area, 20% were planning to study on a non-related course, and 20% said they were already studying in non-related areas but would also like to learn more radio skills. Some have gone on to work part time in the local FE college having achieved their BTEC HNC in Media Studies, many now DJ in local clubs, pubs and pirate stations, some are in higher education and one is working for MTV.

6.1.12 The CARE project aims to build the capacity of young people, the unemployed and refugee groups so that they have the opportunity to become employed by a local sports provider or to compete elsewhere in the job market. Over the two years 1999-2001 some 400 young people took part and passed one or more of 8 governing body awards including badminton, the Junior Team Managers Award in football and the sports medic first aid course. In the second year this represented 72% of those embarking on the course leaving with at least one such qualification. The overwhelming feedback emerging from the participants of the sports courses at Charlton was one of personal development leading to raised aspirations and improved confidence in their ability to work in sport, or any other area for that matter. The connection with the course and in particular the sports co-ordinator, acted as a motivator towards developing the skills needed for employment or further education. Unfortunately, because the sports co-ordinator has insufficient resources to track people after they leave the project there is no formal record of successful employment outcomes: the project relies on leaders keeping in touch through informal networks rather than formal monitoring.

6.1.13 At the outset it was envisaged that the people engaged by Leeds Football Community Link to run the teams would be unemployed, and that through their involvement they would develop transferable skills that they would be able to present to potential employers. In the event this has proved of less importance and none of the current team managers/coaches is unemployed. This does not, of course, mean that they have not acquired skills to advance their careers. Indeed, the current project worker is a team manager who reported that when she first became involved she did not imagine that she had the skills necessary to do her current job. Many others (69) have gained their junior team manager and first aid qualifications, four have gained their FA Coaching Certificate, one is now doing his UEFA ‘B’ licence, and
several have gone on to do youth work qualifications. Meanwhile, as many as three-quarters (73%) of those playing in the teams thought that their involvement in LFCL would stand them in good stead when applying for jobs once they left school.
7. Crime Prevention

Even with regard to reducing crime, vandalism and delinquency, researchers and policymakers have found it difficult to get robust, consistent data (Long, 1998: 10).

7.1.1 Although still limited, it is perhaps in the area of reducing crime that most effort has been made to gather evidence of the success of projects. The popular arguments that involvement in cultural activities helps to reduce crime tend to be twofold: that it ‘keeps them off the street’; and that it has beneficial psychological consequences which lessen the person’s disposition to commit crime.

7.1.2 However, our previous review suggested ‘it would still be true to say though that there are mixed views about the effectiveness of sport and leisure in diverting young people from crime and anti-social behaviour’ (Long, et al., 2000: 36). For example, Coalter’s (1989) assessment had been that none of the studies he reviewed succeeded in establishing a causal link between low incidence of ‘delinquent behaviour’ and participation in sport. In fact later research in New Zealand indicated quite the reverse, that those involved in sport were more likely to be delinquent (Begg et al., 1996). Moreover, Emler (2001) argues that in fact the evidence suggests that enhancing self-esteem and self-confidence does not serve to reduce delinquency; hence questioning the link upon which many of these schemes are founded.

7.1.3 These concerns notwithstanding, evidence from North America (e.g. Farrell et al., 1995; Witt & Crompton, 1997) and from West Yorkshire Sports Counselling (Nichols & Taylor, 1996) has been much more positive. Participation in WYSC was associated with a significant reduction in re-offending rates. Evaluating the Midnight Basketball Leagues, Farrell claimed that beyond the headline 30% reduction in crime rates in the target area, participants and fans not only had a safe haven where they could engage in positive social activities and channel their energies, but also increased their educational and career aspirations.

7.1.4 Recently, the Youth Justice Board has claimed some success for its prevention programmes which use a range of measures, including cultural activities. Some evaluative data are available for the Splash schemes and the Youth Inclusions Programmes (YIPs), though it is not clear precisely what the data relate to and the Youth Justice Board (YJB) acknowledge the difficulty of accessing crime data covering the exact project boundaries. The 102 Splash projects operate in the school holidays to keep young people
'off the streets' by engaging them in art, drama, sport, etc., and the 70 YIPs work with the young people most at risk of offending. Areas with the Splash programmes are reported as recording a fall in crime during the period, against a rise nationally. Similarly, in YIP areas the reduction in crime ranged from 14% - 32%, and arrests and exclusions also fell (YJB, 2001).

7.1.5 Such changes may in fact be attributable in part to changing attitudes and policing practices, but nonetheless they are impressive. Here too it is difficult to attribute cause, but it is interesting to note the Youth Justice Board (2001: 4) observation that ‘the conventional team sports offered were the least well attended of activities, possibly because they were too similar to activities offered in schools’. Elsewhere though they note the success of the Midnight Basketball scheme in North Washington (Sunderland) YIP.

7.1.6 Caught in the public spotlight, ‘diversionary’ projects are somewhat constrained in what they are able to offer for fear of being seen to reward anti-social behaviour. There is similarly considerable pressure on such projects to be seen to be successful. Indeed in some cases this causes them to reject the young people arguably most in need of what they can offer for fear that they may compromise the record of success (as has been the case with at least one project in the current group). In some cases there are also other concerns about how much it is reasonable to expect of volunteers working on the project if they have to deal with very difficult or dangerous youngsters. This exclusion of the most excluded may be eminently sensible for the individual projects, but highlights the need for alternative, perhaps more resource intensive, schemes to address their needs.

7.1.7 Despite the pressure to demonstrate success, evidence from the 14 projects is extremely limited. For example, although the Leeds Football Community Link project is conceived in large part as a diversionary project, no information is gathered on behaviour or offending patterns. The position is difficult because to gather such data would go against the principles of many such projects where they operate on the basis of ‘no questions asked’, trying instead to win the trust and commitment of the individuals concerned. Even when LFCL participants were asked in the questionnaire whether they got into trouble less since being involved in the project some were wary of the question because the wording implied that they were typically in trouble when they first became involved. Nonetheless, nearly two thirds (64%) reported that they thought it was the case that they were now in trouble less (4% suggested it was more – all of secondary school age). Almost without exception the team managers talked in terms
of doing something to keep them off the street. This was treated as both the purpose and the outcome.

7.1.8 In addition to their educational rationales the projects in both Bootle and Birmingham seek to divert young people from crime by using outdoor adventure activities as part of their programme. The PAYES scheme recruits young people on the basis that they are ‘at risk’ or evidence some risk factors. To remain on the scheme they have to stay out of trouble with the police. To that extent, continued participation in itself is taken to represent successful diversion from offending behaviour. However, there is no information on those who leave, or are removed from, the scheme, so it is not possible to judge whether they are less inclined to deviant behaviour. As we know from our previous work, some people working on such schemes take any offending by the participants as an indication of their own failing. Some outside the project have similarly harsh standards and are ready with criticism. It is useful therefore to recall the Coopers & Lybrand study (1994) for the Prince’s Trust which demonstrated the large savings to the public purse of keeping even small numbers of potential offenders out of trouble for a year. And to that can be added the reduction in distress caused to victims. They estimated that the projects they examined ‘would be cost effective if they prevented between 1-in-22 and 1-in-75 of their participants from pursuing any criminal activity over a 12 month period8 (Coopers & Lybrand, 1994: 2).

7.1.9 Such schemes, of course, cannot operate independently of the daily environment in which the young people interact. Partly because of this, Taylor et al. (1999) argue that the evidence suggests part of the success of therapeutic schemes is dependent upon their length (i.e. longer involvement increases the chances of success) and it seems reasonable to expect the same argument to hold for diversionary schemes.

7.1.10 Quite apart from the possible exclusion of the most awkward youngsters by project workers, there may be a process of self-selection (either in initial recruitment or in completion) with those who are positively affected by the projects the people who were in any case less likely to offend/re-offend. However, this should not devalue the work that is done with a range of young people ‘at risk’.

7.1.11 In search of an economy of solutions that will impress funders many projects ‘expect’ to address a wide range of ‘anti-social behaviour’, seemingly independent of cause. There is clearly a need for a differentiated response (see, for example, Utting, 1996). As Begg et al. (1996: 341) conclude

---

8 It should be noted that these figures related to people who were known offenders rather than simply those ‘at risk’.
recreational activities should take into account the specific needs and norms of the delinquent to have any chance of success’. Evaluation of the programmes needs to do likewise; it is difficult for catch-all programmes to identify appropriate outcomes against which to measure. The study by Witt and Crompton (1996) in the United States found that only 4% of the programmes they identified for at-risk youth conducted before and after evaluation of changes related to participation. From our investigations it seems that a similar shortcoming is evident in the UK.

7.1.12 The Galleries of Justice in Nottingham aims to aid crime prevention by bringing at risk young people into a legal framework that enables them to see all sides of the issue (criminal, police, legal and victim). It hopes that this wider perspective will improve relationships and make them better citizens. In talking to some groups that had undertaken a visit, it was clear that most visitors had found it interesting and enjoyable; indeed they had often been pleasantly surprised, finding it a good day out, though others had become bored. For the most part, however, they doubted whether it will have made a lasting impression. Interestingly those community workers working with disaffected youth had a more positive assessment of the experience believing that it will have been of benefit by demonstrating the fairness of the law and allowing the young to appreciate the establishment view.

7.1.13 Apart from its training remit, the NACRO project in Brighton seeks to influence trainees to stay out of crime. During their time on the programme, the trainees are carefully monitored and mentored. Every encouragement is given to them to help them to obtain qualifications, and stay away from criminality. Staying on the programme is taken as a measure that this is successfully accomplished as it is taken to indicate a progression to an employment mindset. However, there is no long term information regarding their behaviour patterns after they leave the programme.

7.1.14 The Youth Charter for Sport ensures that those who are accepted onto the programme are monitored thoroughly as long as they remain part of the programme. This is a condition of participation, and it is accepted that the programme provides desirable benefits, but only for those who are prepared to make their own personal commitment to accept the conditions. Outputs are measured by the numbers joining and staying on the programme. Proof of positive outcomes are readily available in some cases by viewing the social development of individuals, although this data is usually collected via personal networks rather than by independent evaluation techniques. For example, the progression from being a youth with criminal convictions to
an Olympic medallist is offered as testimony to the Charter’s efficacy.

7.1.15 The PAYES scheme accepts some 60 young people in any one year (60% male 40% female); the records show that approximately 40 progress to the second year of the scheme and 30 to the third year of the scheme. The reasons for withdrawal are mixed. Some young people withdraw for their own personal reasons while others have moved from the area and hence lose contact with the scheme. There are also those young people who are required to withdraw from the scheme but again these are for a variety of reasons. The criterion of 'never being in trouble with the police' (as stated within the PAYES publicity material) is central to the scheme and is made clear to all the young people involved. This is applied at all stages of the scheme and accounts for some of the withdrawals. There is another group of young people who have been required to withdraw because they have not thrived within the scheme. For example immediately following each of the residential courses a decision is made as to the merits of each young person and whether they would benefit by moving on to the next stage of the scheme.

7.1.16 It is difficult to be clear about the extent (if at all) that involvement in PAYES can truly be credited with diversion from crime. There are no ‘norms’ for the groups selected or control groups existing beyond the scheme to provide comparison. However in a pilot study of this scheme Cole, (1998) found that:

*Taking part in the PAYES scheme did seem to effect a change in the young people’s attitude towards the police...*

His research also suggested that in regard to the self-esteem of the young people involved "the PAYES scheme (and going to Brathay Hall) is having a positive impact".

Unfortunately Cole felt unable to make any more substantial claims, suggesting that further and larger scale research would be necessary.
8. Health

Significant health inequalities persist. Premature deaths are becoming more geographically concentrated, children in the manual social classes are twice as likely to die in an accident as those in non-manual classes, and the poorest two fifths are one and a half times more likely to be at risk of mental illness as the richest two-fifths.

(http://www.jrf.org.uk/knowledge/findings/socialpolicy/D20.htm)

8.1 Poverty, Health and Social Exclusion

8.1.1 The tenor of the government’s current approach to developing health policy is evidenced in the publication of the New Policy Institute annual reports of indicators of poverty and social exclusion. The report illustrates the government’s commitment to ‘joined-up’ policy making as well as empirically based policy research. It draws together data from a wide range of sources including government-funded surveys, some administrative data and some local and health authority returns. The study for the Joseph Rowntree Foundation Monitoring Poverty and Social Exclusion (Rahman et al., 2000) highlights that trends in the medium term are uneven. Some of the poverty and social exclusion indicators related to health have actually improved (children’s accidental deaths, long-standing illness or disability amongst adults [aged 25 - retirement] and older people), many more have remained steady (% of low birthweight babies, births to girls conceiving under age 16, young adult suicides, adult mental health, anxiety amongst older people) and some have even worsened (problem drug use among young adults, comparative premature death rates amongst adults, obesity in adults, excess winter deaths of older people).

8.1.2 During the 1990s and now into the new millennium there has been growing acknowledgement in government that economic inequalities in capital, property, employment and income have important impacts on health outcomes. Broadly defined concepts of health, well being and quality of life remain shaped by social disadvantage. Even using rough measurement by area postcodes, health inequalities correlate with inequalities in educational achievement, housing density, crime rates, and ‘social capital’ of neighbourhood networks.

8.2 Healthy Alliances, Health Partnerships and Health Action Zones (HAZs)
8.2.1 Since 1997, with the landslide election of New Labour, there has been a growing recognition that health is the central concern of the electorate and that both the performance and structure of the National Health Service are crucial to future electoral success. Consequently, there has been a range of new policy debates, organisational initiatives and audits around health alliances and health partnerships. This has led to the establishment of the National Institute of Clinical Excellence (NICE), the political furore over hospital ‘waiting lists’, and promised publication of diverse performance indicators or league tables for clinical practice. This is all part of the continuing crisis in the NHS, a demand for more democratic accountability and media-led re-evaluation of professional medical practice, particularly in relation to general practitioners and community-based services.

8.3 The Health Benefits

8.3.1 There is now substantial evidence of the health benefits derived from being physically active (see, for example, Surgeon General, 1996), though not always agreement over the amount and intensity necessary to secure those benefits. The study by Roberts and Brodie (1992) of 7000 people in six UK cities found measurable health gains from sports participation whatever their lifestyle. However, they concluded that ‘improving one’s health through sport is hard work’ (p140) and that participation in sport did not reduce health inequalities. Blair and Connelly (1996) argue that the greatest improvements in health across the population would come not from getting the active to increase the intensity of their involvement but from getting those who are currently inactive to increase their levels of activity. Some of the cardiac benefits certainly require quite high intensity and frequent activity, but many other benefits may be derived from quite moderate levels. The recommendation from the Health Education Authority (now Health Development Agency) has shifted from sweaty exertion to moderate activity with a target of half an hour a day of moderate intensity physical activity (equated with brisk walking). The issue then is what pursuit is going to be sufficiently appealing to encourage that activity. More generally the government’s emphasis has altered to reflect a concern to avoid unhealthy lifestyles (health problems from sexual behaviour to drug use, smoking, and eating patterns as well as inactivity), which apart from causing individual distress also lead to public cost.

8.3.2 There are of course deleterious effects attributable to sports injuries or accidents in outdoor activities, and longer term wear and tear to the body. However, the net balance is commonly assumed to be so obviously positive by
professionals in the field that evaluation is thought to be largely unnecessary. Although several of our projects involved physical activity they placed little emphasis on benefits to health. 88% of the youngsters involved in the Leeds Football Community Link did think that it had made them fitter, but beyond that there was little evidence available to us.

8.3.3 Although not as well established as the link to physical health, there is growing evidence of physical activity contributing to mental wellbeing. This stems largely from research that has examined the relationship to self-esteem, anxiety, depression, mood state, and cognitive functioning (see, for example, Mutrie & Biddle, 1995, and Biddle et al., 2000). However, the study by Roberts and Brodie (1992), which took a longitudinal perspective, found no relationship between participation in recreational sport and levels of stress.

8.4 ‘Arts into Health’ Projects

8.4.1 Beyond physical activity there are well-established claims of the contribution to health made by other cultural activities. For example, participation in arts activities is presumed to have a positive effect on mental wellbeing, and the art in hospital movement and art therapy have put forward persuasive cases for their support. Two of our projects were using the arts within the framework of Health Action Zone (HAZ) initiatives.

8.4.2 The context of change within health policy communities mentioned above provides opportunities for new alliances and new initiatives to develop. Indeed Health Action Zones (HAZs) have provided one vehicle for key ‘stake holders’ in the production and consumption of health care services to meet and to identify local health priorities and tackle social exclusion. The HAZs are beginning to challenge the medical model of health and scientific discourses around clinical trials and experimental research to measure the precise impact of treatments. Advocates suggest that there are other testimonies of evidence, ‘softer’ forms of evidence which need to be listened to, and arts-into-health projects will result in short, medium and long-term impacts on lifestyles that are hard to evaluate objectively.

8.4.3 Both Walsall Community Arts and Health and Tyne and Wear’s Common Knowledge are very active participants in the emerging National Network for Arts into Health Work (NNAHW). Both are keen to share their good practice with others and both organisations have hosted and contributed to
an emerging policy network around arts into health<sup>9</sup>. Neither Walsall nor Newcastle health projects operate with a single distinctive strategy for dealing with health issues and social exclusion nor a particular philosophy for inclusion when working with disadvantaged groups as defined in national health strategies. However, both projects have put considerable effort into mobilising health professionals, local politicians, local authority officers and local communities to participate in defining and taking ownership of local health initiatives and explore the role that the arts could play in achieving health outcomes<sup>10</sup>. The arts into health projects respond to locally identified health issues, often highlighted by health professionals, but then they seek to develop creative solutions to health needs and health education. This represents a real attempt to change institutional practices and to encourage medical professionals to examine their existing policies and particularly community-based service delivery. Because both projects operate in officially defined boroughs and regions of deprivation, it is not surprisingly assumed that projects tackle issues of social exclusion.

### 8.5 The Nature of Evaluation

#### 8.5.1

The idea of ‘evaluation’ and the language of its surrounding discourse has long been established in the arts and more recently in arts into health movement. Artistic and cultural performances, as well as works of art, have always been subject to critical evaluation and reflection. This demand has been pragmatically reinforced because of partnerships with local health authorities and the financial and bureaucratic disciplines of working in HAZs. The latter have designated Evaluation Officers whose jobs are to monitor the costs and audit spending of all projects. There are evaluation procedures, pro-forma and three-monthly reviews of process and spending. Projects have been defined in terms of outputs and budgets associated with short-term appointments of artistic animators to work on particular community-based health projects. Consequently, both Walsall and Tyne and Wear HAZs can confidently claim that all projects are evaluated but as one would expect they are done so primarily within the community artist’s language of creativity, artistic standards, lessons to be learned for future projects, engagement of participants with the art form, whether performances, exhibitions were well received and well

---


<sup>10</sup> See Conferences: Revelation Days - 2 day induction meeting involving 80 people - artists, health professionals, including NHS trust executives, GPs, community nurses, teachers and academics, local authority officers, voluntary sector entrepreneurs and community participants (see Smith, 2001a) and Walsall’s Arts into Health Strategic Framework (see Gant, K., 2000)
attended by audiences, local communities and so on. That is not the same as evaluating the arts into health projects in terms of social inclusion.

8.5.2 Given the relatively short-term nature of HAZ funding, both Walsall and Tyne and Wear have been under heavy pressure to secure long-term funding and sustainability. Those working in art-into-health networks are keenly aware of the need to generate 'hard' data which can quantify the impact of projects on health and, more broadly, social exclusion. Given a commitment to preventative rather than curative models of health care, art-into-health projects seek to achieve long-term impacts so as to empower local people to engage with health issues and adopt healthier lifestyles. Corresponding long-term data sets do not exist. Those working in short-term projects, are not necessarily best placed or best equipped (with little time to acquire the skills) to conduct longitudinal research into health outcomes.

8.5.3 Both Walsall and Tyne and Wear HAZs have engaged in the sound practice of commissioning some form of external audit to assess the nature and the precise impact of their arts-into-health projects. Tyne and Wear’s Common Knowledge has commissioned a report of how the skills-exchange network has developed over a three-year period. In the case of individual projects in Walsall, academic consultants on one project have completed action-research and research work has been commissioned from a consultant from the Theatre in Health Education Trust. Given a commitment to fund a wide range of pilot projects on arts into health initiatives, budgets tend to be spread quite thinly amongst diverse communities and cover a myriad of health issues with different ‘at risk’ groups. Both HAZs have supported about fifteen separate projects each costing an average of approximately £3k.

8.6 Examples of Arts into Health Projects

The aims, delivery and evaluation varied considerably, as evidenced by the examples below.

8.6.1 Men’s Health 2000 - The Stand Up Check Up (Walsall)\(^1\)

In the first phase a stand-up comic developed a routine in working men’s clubs to tackle the issue of testicular cancer. There was much local and national media interest and men were encouraged to take up health checks (MOTs) by community nurses working in the club. Data were collected from the audiences (173 questionnaires returned) exploring

\(^1\) See Male Art booklet and also Walsall HAZ, Arts into Health Work Supporting Information unpublished documents
Count Me In

men’s responses to the health issues. Health professionals reported measures of increased attendance at local GP surgeries. Although the second phase did not involve any of the original contacts/people it was based in the same community and encouraged local men to develop a review show around men’s health. Five or six local men worked with community artists over a period of 10 weeks to develop material and produce a show. Community-based practice nurses again provided MOT health checks in the working men’s club on the nights of the rehearsals and the performance. Although there is no indication of long term health benefits, the uptake of this health check can be documented, though often is not. During the rehearsals and show at one venue, 30 people took up the offer of an on-the-spot health check. The final phase of the project was to take the show to a dozen separate locations in all four Walsall HAZs.

8.6.2 Pictures of Health in Caldmore and Palfrey: Eight focus groups of women (approximately 70 in total) contributed to an arts project around Asian women’s health, focusing on cancer screening. Feedback indicated that screening differentials in take-up of tests between white and Asian women closed in local statistics. Project workers also received hearsay evidence of Asian women attending screening armed with promotional/artistic material developed by/in the project.

8.6.3 Safety Soap Box (Walsall): This involved work with young people, women working as prostitutes and local residents to use arts to articulate health/gender issues in the red-light district of Walsall12 to explore safety issues. Data were collected from focus groups to provide inputs to the project and the artistic outcomes exhibited for the local community to view in the new Art Gallery, Walsall.

8.6.4 It’s On the Table (Tyne and Wear): This collaborative project was developed with (15) diverse community groups (of 6-12 people) meeting to discuss diet and nutrition. This included two primary school groups, an OAP dance group, an OAP day centre group, a women’s refuge group, a carers’ support group, and a psychiatric ward group. Each group worked with a different community artist throughout the HAZ to design a themed table top, as a work of art that can be individually / collectively displayed. This culminated in an event/exhibition at Custom House Gallery, in South Shields. Each community group has an Evaluation Book to document the involvement of participants and community artists. These testimonies have become works of art in themselves and can

---

12 see Walsall HAZ Consultation Through Arts document
be offered to potential funders to allow them to provide their own assessment of the significance of the project.

| The desire to extend considerations of health beyond the simple absence of illness to more general state of ‘wellbeing’ makes evaluation even more complex. For example establishing whether or not people have a ‘healthy lifestyle’ is particularly difficult. |
9. Personal Development

9.1 Measuring Personal Development

9.1.1 There is a presumption that involvement in cultural activities is naturally associated with personal development: e.g., increasing self esteem and self confidence, learning social skills, sense of achievement, learning to exercise one's own ability to act (empowerment), or more simply extending oneself in new directions. These inevitably underpin many of the other beneficial outcomes discussed in other chapters of this report.

9.1.2 Unfortunately, personal development is rarely able to be measured except subjectively. Even then, the measurement is by those working at the heart of the project. Their evidence tends to be given limited regard since they are in effect evaluating their own performance in stimulating and developing the minds and/or bodies of those with whom they are working.

9.1.3 That having been said, in almost every case studied in this research, the project workers were convinced that many of those on their respective programmes had enjoyed a fulfilling experience, which had made them more-rounded individuals, better able to appreciate and respond to what life has to offer. In the Key-In project (Brighton), the young people actively engage with writing, editing and marketing a magazine with the enthusiasm that only comes from a sense of 'ownership'. The Galleries of Justice (Nottingham) use role-play to re-enact the trial of Robin Hood, giving them a rare opportunity to experience performing arts and simultaneously to see a familiar scenario through the perspective of others (eg. the judge, jury or counsel). The Halifax Learning Zone Arts Programme brings out the innate creativity of the participants through a range of arts and drama based programmes. In CARE Sports Initiative the equalities module allows leaders and coaches to engage with social and personal issues around race and racism.

9.1.4 Including the excluded can only really be expected to happen in the current context when the activity serves to inspire. One of the big advantages of sports based programmes is that they can provide a key focus for those for whom life may not hitherto have had much purpose; e.g. the Youth Charter for Sport has produced an Olympic Silver Medallist.

9.1.5 Success is an experience with which many of the participants in many of the programmes are unfamiliar. To succeed in a
cultural activity which is regarded by society as wholly acceptable is a good thing. It can elevate self-esteem, promote self-confidence, and provide vital steps towards social inclusion for disaffected members of society.

9.1.6 However, measurement of those positive benefits can only be done by close observation. The changes from day to day are small, and only those working closely with the subjects are likely to be able to make the longitudinal assessment. Being there gives an appreciation of the process of learning by which they develop and gain a richer cultural experience.

9.2 Self-Esteem

9.2.1 Many of those on social inclusion cultural programmes, especially young people, come to the programme with low self-esteem. It is not unusual for them to have been branded as failures – educationally they have few or no qualifications, socially they are alienated (certainly from mainstream society), and intellectually they are convinced that they have little to offer, even when they have immense potential but have become socially or relationally disadvantaged.

9.2.2 Consequently, they do not expect to be able to make a worthwhile contribution or for their efforts to be valued by others. They are therefore unlikely to give their best in the early stages of a programme, and it is dependent on the skill of the project workers to dispel this self-doubt. Our visits to the various projects suggested that there are many examples of succeeding in this challenge, but this can only be based on repeated evaluation or over a lengthy period.

9.2.3 The impact of sport on self esteem can come from several directions (see, for example, Fox, 1997). Some of the increases in self-esteem may be because of positive feedback from others regarding one’s competence and success, though of course the reverse can also apply. Alternatively, self-esteem may be enhanced because of self-perceptions, as demonstrated by Sonstroem and Morgan, (1989) in relation specifically to exercise. Their research indicated that an exercise intervention enhanced self-esteem because of the resultant increase in physical self-efficacy (the expectation that one can perform a task successfully) which in turn increased perceived physical competence (one’s own evaluation of overall physical ability) and physical acceptance (regard for oneself).

9.2.4 A recent report for the Joseph Rowntree Foundation (Emler 2001) noted that improvement in self-esteem is an area ‘without any strong inbuilt concern for proper evaluation’ (p60). When evaluation has been conducted it has often produced evidence that seems to contradict the accepted
wisdom. For example, Kaplan et al (1986) and Jang and Thornberry (1998) concluded that low self-esteem did not lead to delinquent behaviour. Indeed, in relation to our work, Emler’s (2001: 59) review indicated that low self-esteem is not related to crime or the abuse of drugs and alcohol and concluded that ‘high self esteem is therefore very unlikely to be the all-purpose social vaccine that some have supposed it to be’. Indeed he pointed out that young people with high self-esteem are more likely to be racist, reject social influences and subject themselves to physical risk. For people like this their feeling of high self-esteem may derive largely from their skills in socially unacceptable activities. In such circumstances involvement in cultural activity (e.g. a member of a sports team, or performing in the arts) can give them a better appreciation of the contribution of others in society and may go some way to reminding them of their personal fallibility in some areas.

9.2.5 The British Cohort Survey contains data that seem to show a relationship between the self-esteem of young people and their later experiences of unemployment, but the relationships vary between males and females (Feinstein, 2000). The ability to dispel the lack of self-esteem was certainly seen to be an important attribute of the majority of the current projects, and was typically expected to improve employment opportunities in due course. However, for many the benefit is likely to be in some future beyond the life-time of a project and therefore difficult or impossible for project staff to measure.

9.2.6 In practice, most of our projects make no real distinction between self-esteem and confidence. Reports from school staff involved in the residential courses of Aiming Higher support claims that there have been improvements in self-esteem. Staff involved in the scheme all appear to be strongly in favour of using physically challenging and adventurous activities as a vehicle to promote personal development.

9.2.7 Self-reporting from individual pupils was similarly (extremely) positive about their experiences. One pupil reported that:

\[\text{I feel I am changed and I'm more confident than before. I will never forget the week because it was super.}\]

To date these reports are variable in their nature and lack an overall research design that would be capable of allowing claims of a higher order to be made. The results appear to be positive but there is a need to advance the measuring within the scheme to substantiate (or not) these indicators.
9.3 Self-Confidence

9.3.1 Although only small scale, Matarosso’s (1998) work suggested that three quarters of participants in library-based projects reported improved self-confidence as a result of taking part. In an earlier study of 243 adult participants in six arts projects (Matarasso, 1997: vi) he similarly found that 84% felt more confident about what they could do. And Moriarty (1998) provides a range of positive personal statements from participants in the arts projects she surveyed. Similarly in our research, participants in the Leeds Football Community Link reported feeling more confident (84%), more ‘chilled’ (85%) and less bored (78%).

9.3.2 Interviews with head teachers in Halifax confirmed that public performances within the Learning Zone Arts Programme enhanced the self-esteem and confidence of the participating pupils. It was through enjoyment of the arts activities that they had improved their general motivation and held more positive attitudes to other school activities.

9.3.3 By introducing people to new activities many of these cultural projects can claim to give them new skills and open up their horizons to enjoy new experiences. These intrinsic benefits of the projects often stimulate a wider realisation that mainstream society has more to offer. Furthermore, they demonstrate that other benefits are accessible and attainable. New skills mean that the poverty of expectation is reduced. The confidence that participants come to have in their fellow citizens is also increased. At the outset many of the participants are estranged from society, and may view those in authority or the establishment with scorn or suspicion. By working closely with them, they have the opportunity to realise that the authority figures are likely to enjoy similar things to themselves, and may have faced and overcome similar difficulties.

9.3.4 One of the benefits recorded by the police in the PAYES (Bootle) project is that the ongoing relationships between police officers and young people at risk of criminality, has been much improved. This leads to a more harmonious society, and improves the quality of life of the young people, the police officers and the residents of the area. There are many instances whereby the project leader (the ‘establishment’ figure) becomes a mentor, a colleague, a friend.

9.4 Enjoyment – Plain and Simple

9.4.1 There is much to celebrate in projects that provide cultural experiences to members of society who might not ordinarily encounter, or even welcome, such exposure. The
COUNT ME IN

enhancement of the quality of life is, of itself, the purest yet most complex and indistinct of all benefits. The preceding chapters have suggested that can be:

- educational, even though it may not lead directly to qualifications
- improve employability by providing new skills and enhancing self-confidence and self-esteem
- reduce crime by engaging those at risk of committing crime and fostering positive attitudes to society
- improve health by providing exercise and social connectedness

9.4.2 But underpinning all this, all of the projects studied significantly enhance the quality of life of those engaged in them. So for example, in Thetford the outreach worker’s evaluation of the first series of visits to schools confirmed that the children had enjoyed the events. Moreover, on his meeting the children at summer play scheme events, he reports that they still had fond and happy memories of the first events.

9.4.3 It is perhaps disconcerting that so much of the cultural provision for young people in particular seems to be validated by the extrinsic benefits that it provides (especially crime reduction). It should be remembered that culture, in its widest sense, improves the quality of life. It refreshes and expands the capacity of the mind and body and provides intrinsic benefits, which go a long way towards providing the rights of citizenship which in themselves encourage active and responsible citizens.
10. Social Cohesion

10.1 What is Social Cohesion?

10.1.1 The Office for Public Management (Miller, 1999) recognises the problems policy makers have surrounding social exclusion and their strategy to tackle it. They represent social cohesion as the third point of an exclusion-inclusion-cohesion triangle. Those who believe that social cohesion is the major focus argue that whole communities, their participation and governance, not solely the needs of excluded individuals, are vital factors. This rests on the contribution social cohesion makes to tackling exclusion and promoting inclusion aims through the extending of social networks and building social capital. The accumulation of social capital is a contributory process to ensuring social cohesion. In the eyes of Forrest and Kearns (1999: 7) social cohesion encompasses:

- A shared sense of belonging
- Social solidarity between groups and across generations
- Shared values and beliefs
- Active, well intentioned citizens
- Dense networks of friends, family or acquaintances
- Positive attachment to local traditions, institutions and places

10.1.2 Moreover the concept of ‘social capital’ includes notions of social networks that encourage active communities and citizens that become the catalysts for purposeful local developments. This is a significant aspect of the National Strategy for Neighbourhood Renewal sponsored by the Government as a result of the SEU’s PAT Audit (2001). In the context of the current group of projects, these ideas clearly underpin the arts into health work in Walsall and in Tyne and Wear, for example. Both projects seek to build and develop health promotion networks and partnerships to celebrate local people, local skills and local initiatives. As we have seen, Common Knowledge (Tyne and Wear) chooses to define itself as a learning initiative, to disseminate information and skills in experimental arts into health projects, to develop structures and channels for working partnership and to promote a shared culture of arts/health thinking. The very nature of artistic practices, their creativity, preparation /creative performances, the siting of artistic events and displays generate a heightened density in social networks and local community identity.
10.1.3 The recent Denham report (2001) on community cohesion - one of a series in the wake of last summer’s racial tensions - once again insisted that:

*Sporting and cultural opportunities can play an important part in re-engaging disaffected sections of the community, building shared social capital and grass roots leadership through improved cross-cultural interaction.* (p28)

10.1.4 It is, of course, difficult to identify just what effects might be attributable to any one initiative. In trying to evaluate the role of the arts in a renewal project Matarasso (1997: 45) noted:

*Without them, refurbishment would still have taken place, but the development of community relationships and activity which turn houses into homes would not have been so effective. It is one thing to keep people warm and safe: quite another to make them proud of where they live. This is where the arts work has made itself felt...*

10.1.5 The PAT 10 report itself (DCMS, 1999) noted that community arts projects helped in establishing networks and developing community pride. Over 80% of participants reported less social isolation two thirds maintained they had an increased understanding of other cultures or lifestyles. Although many working in our projects would subscribe to similar views, and the majority of projects are directly addressing such dimensions of social inclusion, little clear evidence of outcomes was forthcoming.

10.2 Social Networks

10.2.1 The interconnectedness of the different aspects of social inclusion are reflected in the Acheson Report (Health Education Authority, 1999: 2/3) on inequalities and health:

*...people with good social networks live longer, are at reduced risk of coronary heart disease, are less likely to report being depressed or to suffers a recurrence of cancer, and are less susceptible to infectious illness than those with poor networks.*

10.2.2 One of the Comedia reports (Matarasso, 1998) marshals arguments to demonstrate the social potential for libraries through developing community links (including the bridging of generations) and fostering a local community identity. 7000 borrowers annually demonstrate how the visits of the Somerset mobile library service provide a focus that draws
members of a rural community together and help to reinforce a sense of belonging. The fortnightly visit of the library service is very much a social occasion, keenly anticipated and valued for the opportunities it brings for social interaction. For the house-bound, the librarian's visit reduces any sense of isolation. Moreover, the mobile service gives the rural population a sense of being included within a much respected public service.

10.2.3 Just bringing together in partnership individuals and organisations supports this interconnectedness, whether in the same sector (as with the different schools drawn together through the arts initiatives of the Halifax Learning Zone) or from different sectors (as with the involvement of the Women's Institute in the heritage project in Thetford. However, the interconnections may be internal to an organisation. For example, interviews with head teachers in the Halifax Learning Zone identified better collective morale, better cohesion and the development of a sense of community within their schools as a consequence of the project. Public performances and art exhibitions had encouraged greater interaction with parents and raised the standing of the schools in the local communities.

10.2.4 Almost without exception the footballers in the LFCL teams reported improvements in their social networks: 94% said that they had met more people as a result of their involvement and 96% reported making new friends. Almost as many suggested that they were now able to get on better with other people.

10.2.5 One thing stressed by the past and present trainees of the Focus E15 course is that they have appreciated the way their social network has expanded. These ‘at risk’ young people report that the increase in their personal and professional connections has given them more opportunities to achieve more than they could have done before they completed the course. These social connections are effected in particular through the production of the two weeks of radio broadcasts, but also in the preceding training as radio technicians and DJs. In the media of all vocations, networks are important for anyone hoping to be successful. At the same time the personal friendship links with other local people enables a sharing of information and a reassuring support network that strengthens the chances of a closer rather than closed community (see also Miller, 1999). Although the project is output driven, in the judgement of the co-ordinators by successfully completing the course the participants have achieved the goals associated with social connectedness.

10.2.6 Similarly, the Key-In Project in Brighton puts emphasis on getting disaffected young people to work together in pursuit
of a common goal. In doing so they are also expected to widen their own and others’ social networks through the publication of the Sorted magazine. By bringing issues of interest and concern to young people they are themselves encouraging cohesion through social awareness. The magazine engages with issues as diverse as youth clubs, play areas, leisure time, and health. The process that occurs between the publication team and members of the local community offers the opportunity for a social connectedness and community identity that are catalysts for civic pride and active communities.

10.3 Civic Pride

10.3.1 Museums have an obvious role promoting a community identity. The GLLAM Report (2000) notes that although participation objectives within museum projects may be specific at the outset (e.g. to promote adult literacy) outcomes may be much wider and serve as cultural ‘catalysts’ for community development. Some of the museum-instigated projects cited as examples within the report have ultimately been taken over by community groups themselves with funding identified to sustain them. The Keyham Project, for instance, used the local history and reminiscence sessions organised by Plymouth City Museum and Art Gallery as the impetus for a touring exhibition and the production of a publication, with local people themselves taking on the role of community historians:

"It helped them view their experience of belonging to the area and encouraged them to use the museum as a resource for different projects. It has made them more adventurous. The group now has both lottery and SRB III funding, and there is no stopping them. (GLLAM, 2000: 27)."

10.3.2 Part of the thinking behind the Galleries of Justice project is that pride in their neighbourhood and their social networks can be used to break negative cycles between ‘at risk’ young people and the presumed outcomes of their particular lifestyle. The aspiration is that as a consequence they should become responsible community members rather than becoming involved in crime. Whatever the impact on crime (chapter 7) its ability to develop social capital and cohesion is less obvious. The project centres on a proud city and therefore civic pride at the same time as promoting a civil society. Still it has to be recognised that the depth of civic awareness and influence in changing attitudes about the neighbourhood are likely to be limited by the relatively short time that participants spend with the project. One of the goals of the outreach work of Thetford Imagine Project is to enhance civic pride in a town that seems to have struggled with its
collective sense of identity since the London overspill of a generation ago. The strategy is to increase an appreciation of heritage to try and awaken an awareness of shared identity. The outreach work stimulates young children through a range of activities based on heritage themes, connecting children not only to the local area’s distant past but also to the world of their grandparents. However, here too there is no research evidence to date capable of demonstrating the project’s impact in these terms.

10.3.3 Like the *Galleries of Justice* project, PAYES in Bootle has a remit to work with young people with a significant focus on promoting a civil society amongst at risk and excluded youngsters. At the same time the demonstrable citizenship displayed by the young people (they have to avoid offending in order to stay on the programme) is working towards promoting the civic pride that is so important in building strong communities.

10.4 Common Values and Shared Respect

10.4.1 A shared sense of belonging, common goals and core social values for the common good are constituents of community cohesion identified by the Home Office Ministerial Working Group on *Building Cohesive Communities* (Denham, 2001: 2). It is this type of community support that the Home Office were hopeful would succeed in achieving social inclusion.

10.4.2 The *Charlton Athletic Race Equality Sports* project has some very clear goals for social cohesion and a more civil society. In Greenwich the site of the Stephen Lawrence and other racially motivated incidents there is a clear message from the key stakeholders to the project to raise awareness and tackle racism through sport. The trainees who complete short national governing body awards have also to complete a module in equalities learning and cultural diversity that challenges prejudice and stereotypes and considers the skills needed to manage those with racist views in the community. The successful sports leader/coach is then encouraged to give something back to their local community not just as a coach but also as a role model and conscious citizen able to tackle racial issues through sport. The project is unable to comment on the totality of the outcomes of this process as successful leaders are not tracked systematically because of the limited resources available to the sports co-ordinator. The feedback direct from participants to the project revolved around the value of the social network that had been developed (personal and professional) and the significance of the skills learnt to address racism through their sporting work.

10.4.3 Part of the underpinning philosophy for the *Social Centres of Excellence* that the *Youth Charter for Sport, Culture & the
COUNT ME IN

*Arts* is trying to develop is a shared set of values. The centres aim to use sport and the arts to bind disadvantaged young people into positive and constructive contracts that they will benefit from if they stay out of trouble. Participants are encouraged to recognise where mutual benefit lies. The *Youth Charter for Sport, Culture & the Arts* present this as a ‘win-win situation’ as the community gains from a safer neighbourhood and the participants in the project benefit from doing things that they want to do like BMX, skateboarding and ‘extreme’ sports as well as more traditional sports. Again, this constitutes part of the social inclusion agenda discussed earlier. The contribution to social cohesion through each young person’s ongoing link to a supportive organisation with a network like the *Youth Charter for Sport, Culture & the Arts* is a factor also valued by youngsters in Charlton and Newham above.
11. Making Structures More Open

11.1 The Nature of Citizenship

11.1.1 There has developed a substantial literature in the political sciences about the changing nature of citizenship and the individual’s relationship with civil society and government. Throughout the post-war period, writers have pointed to the development of collectivism in the form of the welfare state, the public provision of a range of both universal and selectively targeted services. In the UK, citizens not only had legal and political rights to health, education, housing and income support, but also the right to participate in policy, planning and decision-making processes. During the 1990s, government was keen to refocus the notion of citizen rights; people were redefined as consumers of public services, so to encourage notions of choice, customer care and value for money. Citizens’ Charters were introduced to lay down benchmarks to secure the quality of public service.

11.1.2 Marquand and Seldon (1996) argue that different political ideologies have traditionally been categorised in relation to individualism and collectivism but they are best understood as to whether they have, and actively pursue, a moral agenda. A project of active citizenship demands duties and responsibilities from individuals and is described as moralistic. In contrast, in the absence of a moral project, governments are content to let the people retreat into the private sphere and pursue their individual interests (providing they do not damage others or disturb social order). Marquand and Seldon (1996) describe this general position as hedonistic.

11.1.3 Using this fourfold typology post-war government in the UK can be divided into four distinct and major phases – from 1945 to 1955– the moralistic collectivism of the Keynesian welfare state, 1955-1979 hedonistic collectivism of MacMillan’s ‘never had it so good’ consumerism; 1979-1985 moralistic individualism of Thatcher’s Victorian values and New Right,1985-1995 hedonistic individualism of Essex Man and Nigel Lawson’s credit-card fuelled consumerism. Since 1997, New Labour has attempted to rediscover a moralist agenda, suggesting that individuals should be active citizens, volunteer, turn towards the local community and so belong to a ‘stakeholder society’. All citizens are exhorted to contribute to New Labour’s ‘progressive’ modernising policies and resist the forces of conservatism (whether embedded on the left or the right).
11.1.4 Such a view of active participatory citizenship is the distinctive feature of Doyal and Gough’s (1991) theory of human needs. All individuals have basic universal needs – for physical health, autonomy of agency and also critical autonomy to challenge existing cultural and institutional forms. Societal preconditions provide the foundation or specific satisfiers for individuals to exercise freedom and participate in decision making and politics. Doyal and Gough demand that citizens also develop a critical edge in chosen forms of life, so there is the need for freedom of information as well as access to appropriate knowledge, technologies and means of communication. Castells (1996) too argues that new technologies and global communications have redrawn the boundaries between the individual, regions and the rest of the world.

11.1.5 One response of New Labour to such changes was to promote a ‘stakeholder society’ in which everyone felt they had a part to play in promoting the common good. The concern with people being outside the system has been sharpened more recently by growing levels of electoral apathy. Perhaps stimulated by falling interest in the electoral process attention has been directed to citizen involvement in local decision-making - people’s parliaments, citizens’ panels, surveys to measure best value, elected mayors, etc. For example there has been some considerable activity around the involvement of young people in decision-making with initiatives like the Young People’s Charter of Participation from the Children’s Society.

11.1.6 Talk of social inclusion invites the question of what people are being invited to be included in and what say they might have in that. Certainly at a national level then one might expect a strategy for social inclusion to be concerned to make the structures of society and organisational networks more open in order to foster:

- Involvement in decision-making and agenda setting
- Active citizenship (exercising rights and taking responsibilities)

11.1.7 But these are related, and dependent on some of the other outcomes grouped under personal development and social cohesion. Community cohesion would encourage people to press for greater involvement in setting agendas and

---

13 Gough summarises this as the capacity to make informed choices about what should be done and how to go about doing it – is the definitive attribute of human beings. We contend that autonomy is impaired when there is a deficit of three attributes: mental health, cognitive skills and opportunities to engage in social participation p.9 in What are Human Needs’ in Percy-Smith, Jane and Sanderson, I. Understanding Local Needs IPPR Publications
decision-making. Greater self-esteem and self-confidence may be necessary for exercising rights, even more so for taking responsibilities for others. For both (a) and (b) to happen there needs to be:

- **community empowerment & self determination**
  This entails being able to make collective decisions within the community rather than being passive recipients of the policy process and its service delivery. In discussing community empowerment and self-determination Matarasso (1997: 38) observes that ‘there is nothing automatically empowering about participating in the arts: it’s not what you do but the way that you do it’. The previous chapters have dealt with the development of individual and collective expertise that is necessary to this end, but for their to be empowerment there has to be the space within which to exercise those skills.

- **a building of community organisational capacity**
  The collective array of skills and experience in some communities means that they are able to organise projects in their own interest and to negotiate with existing institutions and various agencies to secure the resources and services they desire. In other areas this capacity is conspicuously lacking, and as a result they tend not to get an equitable ‘share of the action’ or funding. Community development workers have long recognised the importance of developing not just the individual skills necessary but the ways of working together to remedy this shortfall. Indications that this has been successful might include being able to compete for other resources, exercising rights, engaging with the political process, developing networks and becoming part of the organisation of other groups.

### 11.2 Involvement in Decision-Making

#### 11.2.1 Inside the project

**11.2.1.1** Because of these various considerations, the extent to which the projects are a response to demands from below as opposed to being imposed from above is critical in this context. The 14 projects are keen to engage the grass roots in their delivered activities (without this they would clearly fail) but less so in respect of their own agenda setting and decision-making.

**11.2.1.2** For the most part people from the respective excluded groups were not instrumental in **setting-up** these 14 projects. However, a public consultation exercise was conducted (and independently monitored) around the proposed *Thetford Centre* by the Out of School Childcare Research Unit at Brunel University. Twenty parents took part in two focus
groups which discussed a range of issues including focus and purpose, location, activities, roles, responsibilities and fees. At the time this confirmed the benefit of early parental consultation and seemed to be very positive in generating enthusiasm, but the Centre remains at the gestation stage and activities are restricted to the outreach project.

11.2.1.3 Having ‘bought into’ the scheme, some of these projects allow scope for participants to make decisions about outputs. This is evidenced in decisions about the content of the Sorted magazine in Brighton where the participants form the editorial board and are also responsible for the marketing plan. In both Tyne and Wear Common Knowledge and Walsall Arts and Health work, local steering groups meet to decide what form/direction the project should take and then tasks or individual projects and commissions are contracted out to a community artist or community arts groups. These animateurs encourage local participation, ownership and evaluation of arts into health projects.

11.2.1.4 In the context of our current concern with evaluation principles of social inclusion might suggest that it would be reasonable to expect participants to be instrumental in determining the nature of the evaluation process. As Jermyn (2001: 7) noted, ‘for some organisations involving participants in evaluation reflects an organisational commitment to the ideals of democracy and empowerment’. However, the structure of most of these 14 projects is such that this is rarely easy to achieve. When people have only a fleeting contact with the project or there is a continual turnover of cohorts or funders demand satisfaction, the nature of the evaluation is normally determined before the participants appear over the horizon. Nonetheless, there are examples in Arts into Health work in both Tyne and Wear and in Walsall of encouraging key stakeholders to meet, to network and to build a common strategic vision of policy and shared rationale for local participation.

11.2.1.5 The activity of the programmes may themselves promote the involvement of others in decision-making forums. For example, by being a stimulus for parents to come into the schools, the events and exhibitions of work of the HLZ Arts Programme have lead to parental involvement and interest in the schools’ general activities.

11.2.2 Beyond the project

11.2.2.1 One of the processes of inclusion is to begin to engage with other organisations/institutions. So for example two of the LFCL teams have gone on to successfully attract their own funding. One from the NACRO Youth Inclusion Initiative and one from the Neighbourhood Support Fund, which allows it to
operate semi-independently. Others have successfully managed to attract kit sponsorship. For community groups that had little experience of negotiating deals these represent significant achievements.

11.2.2.2 There may also be less direct impacts on decision-making via the products of the projects, as was the case with the Factory 21 videos passed to the Lea Valley Authority and the Metropolitan Police.

11.3 Active Citizenship

11.3.1 Becoming ‘stakeholders’ requires a change in both the political situation and in attitudes towards citizenship. The concept of active citizenship invokes the twins of rights and responsibilities

11.3.2 The exercising of rights requires knowledge. Those at Factory 21 are introduced to the legalities of copyright and professional contracts so that they will be in a better position to exercise and protect their rights in the world of music and video. Castells (2000) has suggested that the rise of what he calls ‘informationalism’ has led to greater inequality and social exclusion. There is an information divide just as there is a health divide (and other divides). It is possible for some cultural projects to connect people with global networks and promote what might be seen as electronic citizenship. The internet connections of the mobile library service in Somerset allow some scope for retrieving information, but unfortunately the length of each stop (20-30 minutes) and the other tasks the librarian has to perform, mean that in practice this opportunity is only available to those already familiar with how to use the internet effectively. Although most of the borrowers are readers for pleasure people also use the mobile service for their information needs, some of which are a necessary precursor to exercising rights and entitlements.

11.3.3 The HAZ projects are clearly about the dissemination of information to allow people to make more informed choices. Health promotion projects seek to work through existing community groups and encourage separate groups to share and tackle common problems. Considerable efforts have been made to open up access via the Internet. Web pages allow their work to contribute to the wellbeing of people beyond the immediate project and to share information and advice with others.

11.3.4 One of the challenges of the Sorted magazine in Brighton is also to communicate with people who are ‘at risk’. It is accepted by the project managers that the magazine is
COUNT ME IN

successful in doing that because of the involvement of similar people on the project.

11.3.5 Citizenship is not just about exercising rights, but also recognising responsibilities to self and others. Both the football projects contain this as a facet of their work. The Leeds Football Community Link has worked with 12 community groups to train local people and help them set-up football teams. That this is sustainable is demonstrated by having 8 still operating despite funding difficulties and constraints on the geographical area in which they can offer financial assistance to projects. The CARE coaching qualifications are similarly intended to enable participants to act as community leaders the output here is hundreds of qualifications, but the outcome in terms of those being translated into community contributions is less well recorded. Nonetheless it is known that, armed with their training successful leaders have developed their active citizenship proactively through volunteering to work on events like the Charlton Athletic FC Red White and Black race awareness days and other community events. Similarly, a graduate of the PAYES scheme has returned to assist in running a residential course.
12. Good Practice

The aim of this study was not to produce a guide to good practice, but where we have been able to we have identified some aspects of the work of these 14 projects that might appear in any such guide. These have been addressed in two strands: the first is in terms of good practice in promoting social inclusion; the second is in evaluating that practice.

12.1 The Practice of Promoting Social Inclusion

12.1.1 Reaching the excluded

12.1.1.1 Making provision available to the excluded is a necessary but not sufficient condition to ensure they benefit from a general initiative. Locating projects in disadvantaged areas provides an obvious, though frequently overlooked and neglected platform for tackling social exclusion. But new policies, initiatives and projects need to be sensitive to precise community locations and neighbourhood networks to ensure a visible presence and successful outcomes among those most in need. The PAYES scheme uses other agencies working closely with the community in Bootle to screen the population and identify young people who might benefit from the project. As one project has become all to aware, it is then essential to make sure that any intermediary is regularly refamiliarised with the projects goals, especially as staff change. Winning positive PR (as in Halifax, for example) keeps the public in the picture about the aims and activities of the project and reduces the gap between it and the local community.

12.1.1.2 The need to reassess the precise focus of community-based development work is even more pressing in times of change in employment, education, family lifestyles and in new technologies. Policies and projects are more likely to work in addressing issues around social exclusion, if they tune into existing ethnic, social and cultural networks, both in terms of being sensitive to their interests and making use of their contacts. In terms of health care in the West Midlands, men are more likely to undergo health MOTs in local working men’s clubs and pubs, administered by community nurses, than they are to make appointments with locally-based GP practices. But even when taking health services right into the heart of the community, target groups can still choose to remain in the back room watching satellite TV rather than walking across the entrance into the lounge where health-promotion entertainments are staged. It is something of a tautology that social exclusion projects need to think
COUNT ME IN

creatively about how to target those disadvantaged groups untouched by mainstream services. For example, in order to try to target the desired groups the Galleries of Justice ran a competition through the local free newspaper - the prize being a visit to the Museum by a family group. Prizewinners were chosen on the basis of postal code so that disadvantaged communities could be targeted.

12.1.1.3 One of the most commonly ignored of all excluded groups are those with special educational needs. The HLZ Arts Programme has encouraged a special needs secondary school to play a prominent part in their joint schools public performances and has sponsored a publication recording their work on a landscape project. This has boosted the confidence of the children concerned, but has also helped to gain public acceptance that those with special needs have the potential to play a full part in the life of the community.

12.1.1.4 Because of their funding arrangements and associated systems and networks, some of the projects find it difficult to reach those who are most excluded from 'society'. Workers from one of the projects observed:

There is a lack of fundamental understanding [by the funding agency] of the considerable and complex issues that can result in exclusion and unemployment, and how policies developed to address such issues should be developed in consultation with community organisations and initiatives (already working effectively in these areas), and indeed the target client groups themselves. Individuals need support and encouragement to develop long term... If a greater consultative process can be achieved with those organisations that possess considerable expertise in these particular areas, then perhaps more may be achieved in the future with an element of remodelling of existing agency policies.

12.1.2 Starting ‘where they’re at’

12.1.2.1 Recognising that if people feel excluded they are unlikely to participate whatever the initiative, both building projects (Toxteth, Thetford) had sought to engage people from the disadvantaged communities in the planning of the project. Unfortunately neither project has been able to start building within the timespan of this study (which may serve to alienate further those who now feel frustrated).

12.1.2.2 The Leeds Football Community Link has always been insistent that they will not organise a football team for a community group. Instead whenever a community group expresses interest in setting-up a football team for local
COUNT ME IN

youngsters LFCL provides maximum assistance with advice, training, a structure to slot into and booking facilities.

12.1.2.3 If people feel excluded any effort to re-engage them has to start with their interests. This is part of the vision of the Health Action Zone (HAZ) projects as they aim to construct partnerships between health professionals and local communities so as to encourage disadvantaged groups to participate in the identification of health concerns and in planning relevant health projects. This precludes a ‘one size fits all’ approach, so policy makers should not be concerned if there are (say) an adventure project and a media project with apparently similar aims in the same area; they offer the prospect of including different people. Whether football in Leeds (or sport in Charlton), music in Haringey or broadcasting in Newham, it is the personal identification with the project that makes the social identification outcomes possible. It is the potential offered by this identification that makes cultural projects different.

12.1.2.4 A rather different approach is adopted in Manchester where membership of the scheme is presented as a privilege to be earned and valued. Therefore the young people who are accepted are required to maintain high standards or they are disqualified from the programme.

12.1.3 Including the workers

12.1.3.1 At the outset the Leeds Football Community Link was devised not just as a way of ‘doing something for the kids’, but as a means of contributing to personal and social capital. Each community group had to identify volunteers to run the teams and the emphasis was to be equally on enhancing their capabilities. As such projects mature and people come to ‘know the score’ it is easy for this aspect to slip into the background and continual review is necessary if the developmental opportunity is not to be lost.

12.1.4 Part of a larger whole

12.1.4.1 Being part of a wider project can sometimes help a cultural initiative by making important links for staff and participants and increasing the impact of the initiative in which all share. Stand alone projects are especially vulnerable to the shifting sands of the funding system and greater permanence/continuity may be offered by a larger organisation that may also have more political ‘clout’.

12.1.5 Integration within the project
In the context of the NACRO project in Brighton the people on the New Deal programme work in an open plan office alongside regular members of staff. This encourages better understanding by both groups and helps the young people on the programme to come to terms with working in a normal office environment.

12.1.6 Linking

Links beyond the bounds of the project can make an important contribution to processes of inclusion. In the absence of planned work placements, linking video production to the interests of an outside organisation has increased inclusive practice at Factory 21 in Haringey.

Engaging in public performances and presenting public exhibitions (appropriately reported in the local press) boosts the self-esteem and confidence of the participating pupils in Calderdale. Outside applause and approval shows them that their activities are valued and worthwhile. The Halifax Learning Zone also found that projects need to relate well not only to direct participants but also to essential intermediaries, whose enthusiasm and co-operation may be necessary for the project to succeed. Getting the participating schools to network, co-operate and exchange ideas has been a very positive aspect of the HLZ's work.

12.1.7 Putting something back

At CARE in Charlton there is an expectation that once people have completed the scheme and gained their qualification they will ‘put something back’ by contributing in turn to the local community. Being part of a verbal rather than a written contract this can hardly be enforced, but when delivered represents a very real contribution to social inclusion. Project participants do get involved in the ‘Red, White and Black’ anti-racism days at Charlton and other Charlton Athletic Football in the Community events.

12.1.8 Customer care as social service

The social contact represented by most of these projects can offer a social service dimension, as with the older users of the mobile library provision in Somerset where the service is enhanced by the rapport between the librarian and users of the service. Knowing the name and interests of all of the users and able to relate extremely well to them affords personal attention that is itself inclusive.

It seems that one of the major reasons many of these projects are seen to be successful is because of the commitment and
enthusiasm of the staff involved. While we can recognise this as good practice it cannot be legislated for, though clearly appointments procedures and training do help.

12.2 The Practice of Evaluation

What is considered to ‘work’ is largely the instinctual response of the professionals responsible for the projects. Only rarely were they able to draw on supportive research evidence. In their own projects the project teams took it as an indicator of success that people turned up and stayed. The presumption (perhaps quite correct) is that they will then have benefited from what the project has to offer.

12.2.1 Outcomes

12.2.1.1 If the link with social inclusion is to be established, recognising the importance of considering outcomes is essential. Brathay Hall (the PAYES partner) is sponsoring a doctoral research project in conjunction with Nottingham University (which might itself be seen to constitute good practice), that investigates the processes and outcomes of outdoor development training. In an attempt to move beyond simple outputs this has addressed the impact of the Brathay experience on life effectiveness domains which include dimensions such as ‘locus of control’ and ‘social competence’ (Tucker, 2000). Having demonstrated that these benefits can accrue, the interest is in establishing the processes most likely to deliver them.

12.2.2 Surveys of participants

12.2.2.1 People may not be entirely reliable in answering survey questions, but their responses should at least provide useful indicators if the questions are designed to address the intended social inclusion outcomes of the project. The ad hoc survey conducted at Leeds Football Community Link, for example, does at least offer an indication of the high level of satisfaction with the work it is doing to those ends. And for the projects in Nottingham and Thetford the follow-up evaluation is done not with the participants themselves but via a questionnaire completed by group leaders / teachers a short time after their visits.

Recognising the challenge that conducting evaluation at any more than a basic level presents to many organisers of outdoor residential courses, the Brathay Trust is devising a standard approach that could be used to gain consistent data. The intention is that this should be widely applicable and capable of producing information useful to a number of
different stakeholders, and that it should be followed by the
development of an administrative and report-writing system
to support the use of this tool. In other areas this type of
package has already been developed – e.g. for evaluating arts
education projects (Woolf, 1999).

12.2.3 Exit interviews

12.2.3.1 There is a natural temptation to think that the end of a
person’s involvement with a project is the end. However, exit
interviews (e.g. when they are conducted in Haringey) can be
useful in fine tuning the project and providing the basis for
guidance to the participant for future directions, as well as
helping to evaluate the success of the project in meeting its
goals. It is not always easy, however, to get good quality data
from people when they are ‘demob happy’.

12.2.4 Longitudinal appraisal

12.2.4.1 Ideally the assessment of change should be based on
longitudinal data, but these were hard to find. The doctoral
research at Brathay has been based on young people
completing questionnaires before going on the course and
again three months after the course. This longitudinal
approach might beneficially be transferred to the PAYES
scheme so that youngsters are followed-up once they are back
in Bootle to establish the longer term impacts of the outdoors
experience. Moreover, the involvement of many young people
over four years could provide very revealing information on
personal development.

12.2.4.2 In some cases comparable data are collected on repeated
occasions (e.g. attendance records at Haringey), but as these
are processed to satisfy the monitoring requirements of the
funding agency on a periodic basis they are not consolidated
into longitudinal data sets. The potential is there, but may
need additional staff inputs to release it.

12.2.5 In the longer term

12.2.5.1 One project identifies specific outcomes, the checking of
which in the light of experience should prove feasible as the
project progresses. What may count in the long run is some
form of changed behaviour and a favourable community
impact which may only become apparent at a much later date
and which may be influenced by factors outside the project.
Some form of survey of expressions of intent on the part of
participants (expressed intent to quit smoking, stay out of
trouble, continue to participate in sport, etc.) if answered
truthfully may offer a surrogate and a means of deriving
information important for evolving project management.
12.2.5.2 It is crucial to focus and develop projects in specific localities over a period of time so that participants in the first phase of a project, say in health, may be monitored throughout later stages which in themselves may involve different strategies, professionals and policy agendas.

12.2.5.3 In the Youth Charter for Sport, Culture & Arts personal contact allows some feedback from those who have been on the programme to try to indicate whether or not they have relapsed into crime, drug abuse or anti-social behaviour. When the Key-In project has been able to track participants after they have left the project (usually after 6 months) it has provided useful information on career development, indicating whether the programme has had a lasting impact. However this process is time consuming and it has not been possible to undertake this follow up for many people.

12.2.6 An external view

12.2.6.1 Though not without its problems, using outside evaluators has proved useful to several of the projects (e.g. Tyneside, Charlton). This not only draws in additional skills, but a more disinterested perspective helps to persuade external organisations of the credibility of the findings. Apart from the product of the final report, using these external skills can contribute to the professional development of project staff. This can be seen not just in terms of increasing their abilities to evaluate, but also through inviting a more critical development of the project – for obvious reasons people tend not to write the bad news about their own project and may avoid the critique that is necessary to take it forward.

12.2.7 Consumer Panels

12.2.7.1 Some of the providers make use of Consumer Panels to aid their evaluation (e.g. Somerset, where they are used to supplement a standard CIPFA ‘value for money’ questionnaire). These have to be carefully constructed and conducted to make sure that they address the desired outcomes of the project. Getting meaningful results from such Consumer Panels requires a trained facilitator with a degree of independence from the project officers.

12.2.7.2 Some projects have invested considerable effort in challenging the boundaries of mainstream professional practice by organising events to encourage partnerships between the major ‘stakeholders’ in a policy area and stimulate debate. Both Walsall and Tyneside have hosted national and regional conferences (e.g. Revelation Days) about arts into health in order to build up healthy alliances,
generate common policy agendas and share exemplars of good practice. Such events can be used to encourage a critical review of outcomes.

12.2.8 Recording

12.2.8.1 Detailed recording of events/activities – photographs, exhibits, publication, etc., as has been practised in Calderdale, Walsall and Tyneside, for example, does not constitute evaluation in and of itself, but it does allow others to make a more informed assessment of the project and its capacity to include. These recordings provide softer ‘testimonies of evidence’ which can be used both to convince stakeholders of the legitimacy of individual projects and to provide a tangible means for those involved in projects/events for self expression and collective critical reflection.

12.2.9 Positive feedback

12.2.9.1 The good line of communications maintained with staff at the participating schools provides the Halifax Learning Zone with good feedback on their arts activities. Being able to use evaluation of the events in ZAP2K as PR for the schools in Calderdale improved the image of the schools, thereby serving to increase both pupil morale and parental involvement.

Sometimes these good practices are not recognised by the projects themselves; they are just accepted as part of what they naturally do. This oversight is in part because of the requirement of funding agencies to present records of outputs. As a consequence there may be little celebration of good work.
13. Conclusions, recommendations and the way ahead

13.1 Our experience of the projects validates their selection as initiatives making a difference to the lives of individuals within selected target groups. Many of the projects were designed with no particular intention in mind to address social inclusion per se. However, we identified aspects of the work of all 14 projects that promote social inclusion against some of the seven dimensions discussed in this report and there is considerable anecdotal evidence to confirm this delivery.

13.2 Project evaluation generally generates the feedback necessary for their own management purposes and to satisfy funding agencies, who do indeed appear to be impressed with their success. However, there is little effective evaluation against social inclusion outcomes. Hence while milestones are registered, some outputs recorded and levels of satisfaction sometimes assessed, outcomes less often play a part (though as we have noted, in some cases apparent output measures may be indicators of outcomes - e.g. continued involvement/attendance). The PAT 10 (1999) report and the concern with social exclusion generally, imply a recognition of the importance of considering not just what benefits, but also who benefits. However, even at this relatively simple level, few of the projects are able to identify the socio-demographic characteristics of the participants.

13.3 In part, this shortage of material evaluating the effects on social inclusion may be a consequence of the timing of this exercise. The projects are more concerned to demonstrate that they are delivering the services that they committed themselves to than to engage in the complexities of evaluation. Indeed, evaluation of outcomes capable of ‘proving’ the case may be beyond the resources/capacity of projects like these. We have to question how much evaluation it is reasonable to expect often small projects with overstretched staff to do. They have to address competing priorities on limited resources and keep funding agents happy with a view to extending the life of the project (and in some cases their own employment). The position here stands in marked contrast to others where the government has invested large sums in the evaluation process, as has happened with the Sure Start initiative and the Home Office’s measures to combat crime, for example.
13.4 In this study we were not conducting original research ourselves but were dependent on the evaluation conducted by project workers. Outcomes, as opposed to milestones and outputs are not really an integral part of the mindsets of project managers. They are often preoccupied with organising and managing current activities and planning for the future, particularly securing funding. As one of our contacts observed:

My sincere apologies for not being able to respond to your email before now. Not only did we spend the summer applying for funding, but the autumn has been taken up with resubmitting new profiles and redesigning all the projects! As I think I may have mentioned to you, we have also had problems with our funding streams for the Programme. The New Deal intermediary in ____ has consistently been owing us back payments ever since we started, and those have risen to over £40k now. We are trying to contract direct with Employment Services, although this may not help a great deal. The Objective 2 support finished last December, and the new O2 programme will only start at the end of this year. This meant applying for 10 months' gap funding, which still hasn't come through. And the final funding stream is SRB, and this has been delayed and caught up in all sorts of local politics. Our 2000/01 funds only arrived in the summer of 2001, and the 2001/02 funds have still to be formally approved and paid. So you can imagine that it has been a cashflow nightmare to keep the project performing and meeting its outputs and objectives.

(quoted with permission)

13.5 There is little or no incentive to collect data (and often not the means), and many projects devote their energies to promoting their activities to political decision-makers and key stakeholders and fostering good relations with them. In such circumstances too there is pressure for the findings to show the project in a good light; there are clear imperatives to present a positive impression of the work of projects. Indeed an important aspect of some projects is their contribution to good public relations.

13.6 Some of the anticipated outcomes do not readily lend themselves to establishing causal relationships and evaluation is further complicated by the bounds of the project. Key outcomes may accrue beyond the jurisdiction of the project (e.g. in schools). Moreover, the key outcomes may accrue beyond the timescale of the project, or alternatively be lost over that period of time. Many such projects have limited lifespans; indeed the Health Action Zone and Education
Action Zone programmes as a whole will not continue beyond the current term of funding.

13.7 Our examination of projects demonstrated how their scope can contribute to difficulties in evaluating their success. We sometimes found a lack of clarity of outcomes and what they constitute, which projects would do well to address regardless of whether or not they will be conducting evaluation (there is, of course, a need to recognise that objectives may change with changes in staff and project funding is typically associated with quite rapid turnover). There is a temptation for projects to claim a wide range of benefits in order to make themselves more attractive politically and increase their chances of securing funding. They thereby construct an agenda that is difficult to deliver and might be better advised to make more modest claims. Missing high targets associated with grand claims may be damaging to a project successfully delivering quite small benefits that may in fact be very cost effective, especially in the long term.

13.8 Some of the work of these projects may be of good quality and highly desirable in its own right without necessarily addressing social inclusion. This of course depends on what is considered to constitute social inclusion. Chapter 3 provided an introduction to the tensions involved in that debate. For the purposes of this study we took as our starting point the key concerns of DCMS with education, employment, crime and health and extended those to other dimensions emerging from the literature on social inclusion.

13.9 Because employment is something that typically happens after involvement in the project accurate records tend not to be held by cultural projects of the type considered here. Project staff at the Haringey Arts Council managed to ‘cobble together’ figures for us, but it is clear that the Employment Services are in a better position to collate such information and make sure it is fed through the system. The most obvious audience for this is the project staff themselves so that they can be informed of the success of their labours. The projects have met with some success in easing people into jobs, but their more obvious and demonstrable success is in moving them towards job-readiness. An impact on skill levels, aptitudes and orientations is secured in large part because of their clients’ identification with the cultural activities concerned.

13.10 Much of the benefit in education and employment is attributable to various aspects of personal development. Much of this relates to self-esteem and confidence, but also involves the kind of social skills essential to co-operating with others. Project workers ‘see this for themselves’ and in some cases it confirmed by people external to the project (e.g.
teachers), but have little longitudinal data. In some cases this is because people are involved in the project because they have been identified as being in need of certain things which successful completion of the programme, almost by definition will deliver.

13.11 It is reassuring to note that outcomes of the education projects include:

- an improvement in individual pupil motivation, about which there is anecdotal evidence and OFSTED comments (cf. Chapter 9 on self-esteem)
- improvements in the general ethos of the schools, respected by parents and people outside but which should also result in improved individual performance
- dealing with particular problems eg. transfer from primary to secondary (evidenced both by Aiming Higher and by comments from a *Halifax Learning Zone* primary head)
- a widening of pupils' cultural experiences, which in the case of those living in deprived areas tend to be narrow (*Halifax Learning Zone* secondary head teacher's comments).

13.12 The projects expecting to have an impact on anti-social behaviour tend to work on the presumption that getting people involved in their activities will have that effect. They may well be very successful in reducing crime and delinquent behaviour, but they have little evidence that this is the case. Projects and their evaluation need to be constructed differently depending upon whether they are intended to provide a diversionary programme or have a therapeutic purpose in preventing re-offending.

13.13 Data on the impact on health status are similarly elusive. However, there is evidence here of cultural projects promoting health networks and increasing referrals to the health services. Such health data needs to be collected systematically (eg. by all GP practices in the project area) to be valid and reliable. However, it is no small task to encourage practices to take on such research work to monitor the impacts of health promotion initiatives of short duration. The impact of these projects may be on a fairly small scale but they have been working with 'hard to reach' groups who had previously been left largely untouched by the health services. Their engagement offers the prospect not just of better health for them, but also of lessening future costs of treatment.

13.14 The kind of interaction between people with common interests that these projects are capable of stimulating also provides the basis of a cohesiveness that is of collective
benefit. Whether pride in the local area or people working more effectively together the fabric of the community is enriched. It may take some time for any observable community benefit to be observed though. One of the key indicators here is the demonstration of ‘putting something back’ into the community, which should be documented carefully by the projects to offer to sceptics as one indicator of the project’s worth.

13.15 These aspects though lead into more fundamental questions about just what it is that people are expected to become included in, and the extent to which they have any say in the shape of that. One facet of social inclusion is involvement in the institutions of society and the decision-making associated with them. Most of these projects are designed to deliver something to repeated groups of people so the scope for self-determination by participants (beyond the ‘professionals’) is limited. However, within certain parameters projects like those in Haringey and Brighton do allow a say in determining the direction of small scale ventures within the programme. Individual projects may work hard to welcome participation, but appear to have little success in opening-up wider decision-making processes beyond the project. The limited success in opening doors to people typically seen to be disenfranchised can hardly be seen as a failing of small scale initiatives; it requires a more fundamental review of the formulation and delivery of social policy.

13.16 In the course of the work we have tried to signal some of the complexities of the challenge faced by those seeking to promote social inclusion. For example, just because a project is delivered in a disadvantaged area does not necessarily mean that the presumed benefits are accruing to the socially excluded. Just because the project is working with the socially excluded and delivering benefits to them does not necessarily mean it does anything to promote social inclusion. Judgements of the success of such projects have to be conditional upon the value criteria by which they are assessed and so it is probably inappropriate to expect that a single unequivocal answer can be delivered. There is little doubt that such projects can deliver some benefits that might be considered to represent social inclusion under some definitions of the term. We do not have enough information to judge whether any such gains are ‘enough’ or are efficiently and effectively gained. Although it might be possible to construct some measures of efficiency (e.g. number of people engaged per unit of expenditure), the lack of attention to outcomes as opposed to outputs means that it is virtually impossible to address cost-effectiveness. Moreover, whether they are desirable benefits is a political judgement that might shift from time to time.
The projects are being evaluated, but not against the same criteria or even agenda as DCMS adopts. The language used may be very similar, but the meanings different (e.g. linked into artistic practice rather than an agenda of social inclusion). We therefore support the QUEST recommendation that ‘a dialogue be opened about bridging the gap between the current language and measurement of social inclusion and the actual activities and contribution of the cultural and sporting sectors’

Emler (2001: 60) concluded that evaluation of assorted initiatives to improve self esteem has failed to demonstrate ‘whether the gains achieved are sustained in the longer term’. Our research suggests that the same point can be made more generally regarding the contribution of cultural projects to social inclusion. The nature of several of the outcomes requires longitudinal research to assess them. This will not just necessitate extending operations into the future, but securing baseline data at the outset. The demonstration of change may thereby be effected, but that would not necessarily establish a causal relationship. In truth this can rarely be achieved in the evaluation of social policy, though it may be worth investigating the research design for the Sure Start programme to see if that lends a model that could be adopted.

We also support QUEST’s proposal to establish a research forum to make maximum use of existing research and shape future research to ensure that it is both efficient and effective. However, rather than being a one-off event this needs to be constructed as a rolling, evolving programme.

During the course of this study we received several requests for help in conducting research that project managers felt was beyond their capabilities. Given the structure of these cultural projects it would not be realistic to expect them to take on the complex challenges of researching the relationship with social inclusion on their own – and probably not even to take the lead. However, some of the ‘evidence’ that is likely to be produced is dependent on the ‘knowing’ (the knowledge that comes from direct experience) of the individuals directly involved, so we think it important that both project workers and participants be integrally involved in any future research. This suggests a collaborative enterprise. Sensitive researchers working with individual projects can probably foster an ethos of working towards shared goals that might be more productive in terms of producing data for evaluation. However, this is harder to achieve when working with a wide range of very different projects as is normally expected in informing policy.
13.21 We are concerned that much of what we have written in this report is redolent of social engineering. While all societies engage in such processes it would be disconcerting if it was felt that projects were unable to offer activities for their intrinsic benefits. We were persuaded that these projects were enjoyed in and of themselves, offering fun and a contribution to quality of life.
## Appendix I - Taxonomy of Measurable Indicators

### Examples of outcome measures that might provide evidence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Crime Prevention</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- More/improved educational qualifications</td>
<td>- Reduced incidence of graffiti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Improved attendance record</td>
<td>- Reduced incidence of vandalism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Increased take-up of FE/HE places</td>
<td>- Reduced number of prosecutions of identified sector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Improved social structures within a school community</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Reduced incidence of re-offending by identified sector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Reduced number of complaints re anti-social behaviour (eg. by young people)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Reduction in litter/ rubbish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Reduction on drug trafficking</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Health</th>
<th>Employment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Reduction of drug abuse</td>
<td>- Reduction in unemployment levels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Reduction in teenage pregnancy</td>
<td>- More highly skilled and productive workforce</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- More visits to GPs (for those not normally engaging with health practitioners)</td>
<td>- Wider recruitment area (socially as well as geographically) for employers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Fewer visits to GPs (for those frequently experiencing symptoms of ill-health)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regeneration</th>
<th>Equity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Increased incidence of new business in an area</td>
<td>- Fewer incidence of intolerance or disadvantage based upon:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Reduction in damaged or dilapidated buildings</td>
<td>- Gender</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Increased community pride</td>
<td>- Disability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Ethnic origin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Socio-economic status</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Engagement</th>
<th>Quality of Life</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Formation and growth of voluntary organisations (eg. sports clubs, community networks, common interest groups)</td>
<td>- Wider appreciation of the intrinsic benefits of wider range of culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Increased voluntary support for the disadvantaged (eg. elderly or disabled)</td>
<td>- Increased engagement of hitherto socially excluded groups with an increasing range of cultural activities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*NB. The above list shows examples only. It is not intended that it constitutes an exhaustive or comprehensive list*
Appendix II - References


Count Me In


Local Government Association (2001a) All together now? A survey of local authority approaches to social inclusion and anti-poverty. London, LGA.

Local Government Association (2001b) Realising the potential of cultural services: Making a difference to the quality of life. London, LGA.


Youth Charter for Sport (1998) YCS as a contributor to social regeneration. Manchester, YCS.


APPENDIX III - Other Useful Literature

This listing of additional references is not intended as a comprehensive bibliography; it simply comprises useful references we came across in the course of the study.


Arts Council of Wales (1999) *Briefcases: Arts case studies to make the case for the arts in Wales.* Cardiff, Arts Council of Wales


COUNT ME IN


Centre for Applied Business Research (1986) Americas Cup: economic impact. Nedlands, University of Western Australia.


Coalter, F with Allison, M & Taylor, J (2000) The role of sport in regenerating deprived areas. Edinburgh, HMSO.


Department for Culture, Media & Sport (2001) *Building on PAT 10: progress report on social inclusion*. London, DCMS [also available on their web site].


COUNT ME IN

Department of National Heritage (1995) Sport - Raising the game. London, HMSO


Donnelly, P. (1996) Approaches to social inequality in the sociology of sport. Quest, 48, 221-42


Gooding, A. (ed.) 101 ways to succeed in sports development. Reading, ILAM.


Hill, R. and Moriarty,G. ...as broadcast in Beijing: a social impact study. Merseyside ACME: Liverpool.


Institute of Leisure and Amenity Management (1999) *Contribution of the arts and sports to neighbourhood renewal and reducing social exclusion.* ILAM: Reading


Johnson, D. & Moss, L. (1997) *Regeneration through the arts: a study into the potential for arts based social and economic development projects in the objective 5B area of Lancashire.* Lancashire, Lancashire County Council.


COUNT ME IN


MacDonald, R., (ed.), *Youth the “underclass” and social exclusion.* London, Routledge.


Sage, G.H. (eds.) *Handbook of social science of sport*. Champagn, IL, Stipes, pp.119-146.


Sports Council Research Unit (North West) (undated) *Solent Sports Counselling Project: Final evaluation report*. Hampshire Probation Service


Sports Council for Wales (1995) *Active Communities: local initiatives for leisure*. Cardiff, SCW.


Willis, A (1977) *Recreation and deprivation in inner urban areas.* London, HMSO.


COUNT ME IN


Young Mens’ Christian Association (1999) Contribution of the arts and sports to neighbourhood renewal and reducing social exclusion. London, YMCA.

# APPENDIX IV - Summary of Projects Studied

## ZAP 2K – A Feast for The Arts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location: Halifax, West Yorkshire</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Project Aims:</strong> Based in Yorkshire, the project aims at encouraging and enabling schools to make learning about culture and art a fun and accessible experience through the organisation of creative activity weeks, exhibiting the children's work at project Halifax venues. If successful this will make school a more positive experience for previously alienated youngsters, thereby improving the ethos of the school &amp; raising institutional morale. The project aims at raising pupils' aspirations and ambitions, developing interpersonal skills and fostering relationships with Arts professionals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Project Organisation &amp; Management:</strong> Independent artists/performers. One of a number of Education Action Zone projects reporting to Action Forum. Halifax Learning Zone – a charitable trust established by government to take Action Zone initiatives (partnerships between schools and industry)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Activities of Project - where &amp; when:</strong> 1999 Activity Week at end of school year in the form of a celebration to launch the project and involving visiting artists, performers etc with fair degree of school choice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Geographical Area covered:</strong> Calderdale Education Action Zone</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Somerset Mobile Library Services

| **Project Aims:** Contained within the Library Plan, but essentially to serve the library needs of the rural communities, particularly serving people who are less mobile. Also to bring information technology to those without direct access to it by including internet access. |
| **Project Organisation & Management:** Within the structure of the local authority |
| **Activities of Project - where & when:** Deliver library services to rural areas from base chosen for location, parking facility and ability to stock and support the vehicle |
| **Geographical Area covered:** Area of Somerset County Council |
| **Target Population – who, how engaged & recruited:** Rural population, particularly the elderly, the housebound, mothers with young children and others without access to a car or public transport |

## Thetford Centre for Curiosity and Imagination

| **Project Aims:** To foster and develop the enjoyment and understanding of words, languages, communication and health issues and to provide an informal venue for families to share experiences. |
| **Project Organisation & Management:** Planning by ‘Imagine Development Group’ which includes Thetford Partnership, Norfolk Museums Service and Kids Clubs Network Project Manager. |
| **Activities of Project - where & when:** Thetford Centre – at planning stage, with consultation with families, design work. 5 other centres are being planned. Kids Club recommend inclusion of Children’s Discovery Centre East London in monitoring. |
**Target Population - who, how engaged & recruited:** Thetford (population 23,000) generally has been assessed as an area of high disadvantage, but the project will focus on estates built as London overspill in the 1960s. The scheme is designed to draw-in the disadvantaged, but is not directed specifically at them. Will also serve families from the surrounding villages. Target group: families with young children (pre-school and children up to 12 years) living in an area of deprivation.

---

**Common Knowledge (Tyne & Wear HAZ Arts in Health Initiative)**

**Location:** West Newcastle-upon-Tyne

**Project Aims:** Based in Tyne & Wear Health Action Zone and run by NORAB, the project aims to encourage the development of healthy citizenship of the region through the use of Arts and the media. The project is aimed at all members of the Tyne & Wear communities and will allow the development formally accredited educational skills, the promotion of a community identity and improvements in health by encouraging self esteem, confidence and employment opportunities. There are 20 separate pilot projects being undertaken as part of the overall project.

**Project Organisation & Management:** Steering Group of services health managers, regional arts development officers, health promotion officers, health promotion advisers.

**Activities of Project - where & when:** This is a 3-year project. Year 1 – training events, search gatherings to enable creation of hybrid project – Year 2 - (2000) project development – 15 projects identified by consultation process with nutrition project taken to schools and communities in all five boroughs.

**Geographical Area covered:** Tyne and Wear Health Authority – five boroughs

**Target Population - who, how engaged & recruited:** Community Arts network experience but contact within health institutes eg hospitals, surgeries

---

**Walsall Health Action Zones, Arts into Health**

**Project Aims:** Nine individual health projects are aimed at measurable improving the community’s health through the use of Arts as a medium for stimulating awareness and discussion around particular health issues.

**Project Organisation & Management:** Partnership between Health Authority and Community Arts Team, Walsall Council. Steering group for each of 4 Health Action Zone with sub-group for individual projects, but also networking.

**Activities of Project - where & when:** Project themes identified and planning groups established 1999. Projects have varying time scales, some continuing, others revised as necessary, with evaluation at local level. Project themes established according to each Health Action Zone’s priorities.

**Geographical Area covered:** Walsall

**Target Population - who, how engaged & recruited:** Specific groups are identified eg. Asian Community, Young People, Men’s Health with recruitment using Community Arts experience in the area. Diversity of approaches (e.g. young people approached on street corners, men in pubs and clubs)
# Leeds Football Community Link

**Location:** Beeston, South Leeds

**Project Aims:** Based in Yorkshire, the project is a city-wide community safety initiative and is run via a partnership between NACRO, Leeds City Council and the participating Community Groups of Leeds. The project is targeted at 5-16 year olds from low income communities and uses the widespread popularity of football to engage young and divert those at risk from self-destructive anti-social and criminal behaviour. Provision for young; increased skills and confidence of adult volunteers; and strengthen good community relations.

**Project Organisation & Management:** The idea is taken to local groups rather than the usual developmental approach of allowing ideas to grow out of discussions with local people. All local teams have to be set-up by established community groups so that there is local support for the volunteers. NACRO provide the model and the basic equipment (not strips), negotiate the use of the facilities with the city council (have directed lettings from the Education Department or use local leisure centre), pave the way for coaching courses (and pay), help in bidding for funds (one of the clubs has just won £27k from Neighbourhood Support). Volunteers organise weekly training sessions using local facilities and equipment provided by project. There is a volunteers’ forum and volunteers’ management committee.

**Activities of Project - where & when:** Weekly training at each club + tournaments in school holidays (including half-terms) for U8, U10, U13, U16 and an open age competition for the volunteers – mainly 5 a-side, but some 7 and 11 a-side. Rolling programme of FA accredited training courses, plus footy fundays and inter-city friendlies. There are now 11 clubs/teams (Bramley folded, but may be about to restart). Teams in the NACRO project do not get involved in the leagues.

**Geographical Area covered:** Based on similar model in Salford & imported to Leeds 3+ years ago. Based in Beeston, South Leeds (started on the back of a Council needs analysis), but also elsewhere in city in low income neighbourhoods. Have had enquiries from other parts of Leeds, but have been unable to respond because of the funding problems, and SRB funds can only be used for those clubs in the SRB4 area.

**Target Population - who, how engaged & recruited:** Young people aged 5 – 16, but not normally under 8 unless accompanied by parent (or appropriate other). All recruitment done via the community organisation that has set up the team.

---

# Community Arts Programme for the Young Unemployed

**Location:** London Borough of Haringey

**Project Aims:** Based in London and run by Haringey Arts Council, the project aims to produce choice and flexibility to unemployed young people in Tottenham through exciting 6 month work experience projects at schools and arts-based businesses. The project aims to develop personal and generic skills alongside specialist and basic training and assistance with a tailor job search.

**Project Organisation & Management:** A Community Arts Programme with collaboration of voluntary sector organisations. Steering committee originally but now replaced by management team.

**Activities of Project - where & when:** Essentially 6 month work experience projects based on the arts/media – programme of *experiential training* *ie not* formal training.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Sports Coach Qualifications CARE (Charlton Athletic Race Equality)</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Location:</strong> Charlton, London Borough of Greenwich</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Project Aims:</strong> The project offers courses and recognised qualifications in a variety of sports and leisure pursuits targeted at ethnic minorities. Developing and utilising young people’s leadership skills as educators by using peer exercises to tackle issues such as racism, prejudice and other social issues drawing from their experiences. Skills gained include raised self esteem and confidence and the fostering of young peoples commitment to anti-racism and justice.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Project Organisation &amp; Management:</strong> CARE Partnership consists of voluntary organisation representatives and local authority officer. Projects report to the CARE Forum and Steering Group.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Activities of Project - where &amp; when:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999: Coaching Courses in football, netball and basketball and ranged from 2-day event to 16 week programmes*, according to needs of participants. (* Football Certificates - 95 participants)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000: Diversification of courses to also include badminton, cricket, personal development according to community needs. Race Equality Awareness is incorporated into all courses.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Geographical Area covered:</strong> Borough of Greenwich</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Target Population - who, how engaged &amp; recruited:</strong> Black and ethnic minority groups, residents of large estates and the disadvantaged.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Human Activity and the Built Environment</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Location:</strong> Galleries of Justice, Nottingham</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Project Aims:</strong> To develop a new audience for heritage through the performing arts. To provide a high quality and effective education project. To encourage young people to enjoy and learn about their heritage environment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Project Organisation &amp; Management:</strong> Within formal management of the museum, which is run by a charitable trust.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Activities of Project - where &amp; when:</strong> 136 drama sessions for 3700 children, young people and families. Distribution of resource pack.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Geographical Area covered:</strong> Within 1 hour catchment of Nottingham i.e. East Midlands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Target Population - who, how engaged &amp; recruited:</strong> Primary &amp; Secondary School pupils. Young people with special needs. Disaffected young people. Young people with families and carers.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Focus 101.4 FM Youth Radio

**Location:** London Borough of Newham

**Project Aims:** The project is targeted at disadvantaged young people between the ages of 16-25 in the Newham area, some of whom are accommodated in the Foyer. It aims to develop their basic skills and raise their awareness of employment opportunities and educational benefits within the professional music radio broadcasting industry.

**Project Organisation & Management:** Focus 101.4FM is a Foyer, established as a charity within the umbrella of East Thames Housing Group. The project is managed by the Foyer Manager, who reports to the Director. The training course is run in conjunction with Newham College.

**Activities of Project - where & when:** within the Foyer, although participation is not limited to Foyer tenants. Although all Foyer tenants are required to follow an approved training course, of which the project is one. June-October 1999 16 week, course of which 12 weeks part-time course and 4 weeks ‘on-air’. Target 40 participants, groups of 10, taught by radio professionals but 50 took part. Comprehensive report of 1999 project in file. Similar programme in 2000.

**Geographical Area covered:** East London- mainly but not exclusively within Newham Borough

**Target Population - who, how engaged & recruited:** unemployed and homeless 16-24 year olds,

### The Key-In Project – Sorted Magazine

**Location:** Brighton, Sussex

**Project Aims:** The “Sorted?” magazine project, run by NACRO Services – Sussex, works with young ex-offenders, unemployed and unqualified people and provides them with literacy, lifestyle and publishing skills through the production of the magazine. It aims to prevent or reduce criminal offending and anti-social activity by encouraging creativity and the development of communication and expression coupled with formal educational training, such as RSA Internet Technologies.

**Project Organisation & Management:** Within the structure of the Youth Training Centre with reporting to Area and Regional Managers.

**Activities of Project - where & when:** Magazine written and produced by young people (those at risk of offending etc); Youth Training Foundation – course for 16 year olds; Volunteers Programme; Outreach Work.

**Geographical Area covered:** Urban areas – main focus is Brighton.

**Target Population - who, how engaged & recruited:** Young people at risk (ex-local authority care, unemployed and known to Police or Probation Service).
# Youth Charter for Sport, Culture and the Arts

**Location (Headquarters):** Salford

**Project Aims:** The Youth Charter for Sport, Culture and the Arts was established in 1993 as a collective response in recognising the role of sport and the arts in combating anti-social behaviour amongst young people. The project aims to encourage the development of cross-curricular social and personal development by exposing sports and the arts to young people at risk to establish lifelong learning and citizenship pathways.

**Project Organisation & Management:** Advisory Group has been established and meets regularly. Co-Chairs – Geoff Thompson and Chief Executive of Business Team. Links with community partners have been formed.

**Activities of Project - where & when:** Promotion of sports courses and courses concerned with personal development, spiritual well-being, arts programmes, social enterprises, involvement of big sporting names etc. Attendance to be encouraged by system of credits for tangible rewards.

**Geographical Area covered:** This is a national project

**Target Population - who, how engaged & recruited:** Disadvantaged young people.

# Aiming Higher

**Location:** Birmingham and Aberdovey

**Project Aims:** The project is run by Birmingham Outdoor Education Centre of Birmingham City Council and it targets young people with a declining attendance record at schools. The project aims to raise their potential for learning to raise their potential for learning with the resultant effect of improving attendance at schools amongst young people in Birmingham and raising their levels of achievement and self esteem.

**Project Organisation & Management:** Steering group– representatives from Outdoor Education, the schools and Birmingham Education Department. Project planning Group from 4 primary and 4 secondary schools.

**Activities of Project - where & when:**
- Project 1 – pupils at transition stage between primary and secondary education
- Project 2 – pupils in level 8 needing motivation ‘boost’
- Pilot scheme launched Jan 2000
- Residential course at Outward Bound Aberdovey with post-residential work March – September.
- September – March 2001 Further group work with residential in March.

**Geographical Area covered:** Birmingham – schools in Education Action Zone, schools under special measures and schools in deprived areas.

**Target Population - who, how engaged & recruited:** Pupils with declining attendance records, low parental support and in general lacking motivation within the educational system. 4 Primary Schools (level 6) an 4 Secondary Schools (level 8) - 18 from each school – 36 on Outward Bound School (3 groups of 12)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Location:</strong></th>
<th>Sefton and Crosby in Merseyside and Brathay in Cumbria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Project Aims:</strong></td>
<td>To discourage 12-14 year olds from becoming involved with crime by encouraging the young to participate in activities which are designed to challenge them and encourage self value, community involvement and trust. (The Trust also provides a training forum for management development courses for personal, functional and organisational development.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Project Organisation &amp; Management:</strong></td>
<td>PAYES Committee. Brathay Hall management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Activities of Project - where &amp; when:</strong></td>
<td>Evening activities in Sefton and Crosby followed by residential courses (levels 1, 2 &amp; 3) at Brathay and elsewhere, using adventure education and learning by experience as a means of personal development. Staff training for police support and mentoring volunteers is included.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Geographical Area covered:</strong></td>
<td>Merseyside, Sefton and Crosby</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Target Population - who, how engaged &amp; recruited:</strong></td>
<td>12-14 year olds who might be tempted into crime. Nominated by schools, youth groups or police and interviewed for suitability</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>