



LEEDS
BECKETT
UNIVERSITY

Citation:

Darlow, A and Bickerstaffe, T and Burden, T and Green, J and Jassi, S and Johnson, S and Kelsey, S and Purcell, M and South, J and Walton, F (2005) Researching Bradford: A review of social research on Bradford District. Project Report. Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Link to Leeds Beckett Repository record:

<https://eprints.leedsbeckett.ac.uk/id/eprint/882/>

Document Version:

Monograph (Other)

The aim of the Leeds Beckett Repository is to provide open access to our research, as required by funder policies and permitted by publishers and copyright law.

The Leeds Beckett repository holds a wide range of publications, each of which has been checked for copyright and the relevant embargo period has been applied by the Research Services team.

We operate on a standard take-down policy. If you are the author or publisher of an output and you would like it removed from the repository, please [contact us](#) and we will investigate on a case-by-case basis.

Each thesis in the repository has been cleared where necessary by the author for third party copyright. If you would like a thesis to be removed from the repository or believe there is an issue with copyright, please contact us on openaccess@leedsbeckett.ac.uk and we will investigate on a case-by-case basis.

Researching Bradford

This report synthesises findings from a wide range of social research undertaken on the District of Bradford.

The review of research was undertaken to inform future JRF research and development projects within Bradford District. The aim of the review was to identify what is already known about Bradford District, identify common themes and messages and possible gaps in knowledge. A wide range of literature sources were accessed, and around 200 reports, papers and book chapters were included in the Review. The report summarises the findings from the review around eight broad thematic areas: community cohesion; housing neighbourhoods and regeneration; business and enterprise; health, disability and social care; children and young people; education, skills and the labour market; and crime and community safety. The report includes a full bibliography of literature included in the Review and areas for possible further research.



**Available
in alternative
formats**

This publication can be provided in alternative formats, such as large print, Braille, audiotape and on disk. Please contact: Communications Department, Joseph Rowntree Foundation, The Homestead, 40 Water End, York YO30 6WP.
Tel: 01904 615905
Email: info@jrf.org.uk

Researching Bradford

A review of social research on Bradford District

*Alison Darlow, Tim Bickerstaffe, Tom Burden,
Jackie Green, Sukky Jassi, Steve Johnson, Sarah Kelsey,
Martin Purcell, Jane South and Fiona Walton*



The Joseph Rowntree Foundation has supported this project as part of its programme of research and innovative development projects, which it hopes will be of value to policy makers, practitioners and service users. The facts presented and views expressed in this report are, however, those of the authors and not necessarily those of the Foundation.

Joseph Rowntree Foundation
The Homestead
40 Water End
York YO30 6WP
Website: www.jrf.org.uk

© Leeds Metropolitan University 2005

First published 2005 by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation

All rights reserved. Reproduction of this report by photocopying or electronic means for non-commercial purposes is permitted. Otherwise, no part of this report may be reproduced, adapted, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, or otherwise without the prior written permission of the Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	6
<i>Summary</i>	7
1 Introduction	12
2 Bradford District: social, economic and institutional context	19
3 Community cohesion	26
4 Housing, neighbourhoods and regeneration	36
5 Business and enterprise	42
6 Health, disability and social care	48
7 Children and young people	55
8 Education, skills and the labour market	60
9 Crime and community safety	67
10 Bradford: A future research agenda	76
<i>Bibliography</i>	81

Acknowledgements

We would like to thank those organisations and individuals in Bradford who have assisted the Review team, in particular Sarah Kelsey and Ben Mitchell for their hard work in identifying and sourcing the research. We would also like to thank the Project Advisory Group, who provided useful help and guidance at various stages of the project. The members of the Advisory Group were

Phil Williams City of Bradford MDC

Marie Macey University of Bradford

Steve Schofield Bradford Vision

Mike Quiggin Bradford Resource Centre and Community Statistics Project

Helen Brown Bradford Health Informatics Service

Atif Imtiaz Asian Trade Link

Bana Gora Joseph Rowntree Foundation

Anne Harrop Joseph Rowntree Foundation

Summary

This report synthesises the findings from a wide range of social research undertaken, primarily between 1995 and 2005, on the District of Bradford. The main purpose of the review was to provide the Joseph Rowntree Foundation and local organisations in Bradford with a firm basis upon which to build future work in the District.

The project – undertaken by the Policy Research Institute and the Centre for Public Health Research at Leeds Metropolitan University – involved identifying, obtaining and reviewing almost 200 books, reports, research papers and articles. The key results have been summarised under broad thematic headings and gaps identified that might be addressed in future research.

Bradford: the social, economic and institutional context

The District of Bradford is part of the West Yorkshire conurbation, one of the largest and most densely populated in the UK outside London. In contrast to many other urban areas, Bradford's population is growing. Centred on the city of Bradford, the District also comprises a number of smaller towns and semi-rural areas.

Key features of Bradford District – emphasised throughout the Review – include a relatively high concentration of minority ethnic groups within its population, low levels of economic activity and educational qualifications, and high levels of social deprivation in inner city and some outlying areas.

Local governance in Bradford is complex, with the elected District Council being supplemented by a range of structures linked, on the one hand, to neighbourhood renewal initiatives and, on the other, to the regional and subregional agendas.

Community cohesion

Much of the research and associated commentary on community cohesion in Bradford District is linked to the two waves of 'disturbances' that occurred in the city in 1995 and 2001. While there is broad agreement in the literature that community relations in Bradford are not as good as might be desired, there is less agreement

about the causes and consequences of this, and the appropriate actions required to address this situation.

The review suggests that further research into the socio-economic and ethno-cultural circumstances of a range of groups within Bradford, in addition to those that have been researched in detail, would be valuable, as would a more in-depth understanding of the factors contributing to racism in the District.

Housing, neighbourhoods and regeneration

Access to housing services by minority ethnic groups, particularly in relation to the social rented sector, emerged as a key issue from a review of the literature in this field. Much of the available research is dated, however, and there is a case for further research into the complex relationship between social exclusion, deprivation and housing. The links between physical regeneration and community cohesion and the housing needs of people living in the rural parts of the District are also potential issues for research.

Business and enterprise

Most business and enterprise research in or on Bradford District is descriptive in nature, with little offered in the way of effective solutions. The role of minority ethnic groups – as business owners and as customers – has been examined but there is scope for further research, along with studies of key sectors in Bradford's economy, the role of inward investment and the causes and consequences of recruitment difficulties among the District's employers.

Health, disability and social care

Research into health and disability issues in Bradford has been disparate in nature and focused primarily on identifying differences in health experiences and outcomes according to ethnic group. Access to information and services regarding health and disability has also been a key research theme, as has community involvement in the development of health and related services.

The review found little robust evidence of effective interventions to address the inequalities identified through research, for example in relation to the health needs of Bradford's South Asian population. Social care and disability issues have been less

extensively researched than health issues, and the prevailing focus on ethnicity may mask other health issues in the District.

Key issues for future research include the perspectives of children and young people on health and social care; generational differences in knowledge, attitudes and practices; and methods of improving health information and advice to different population groups.

Children and young people

Much of the research that has been undertaken on children and young people in Bradford District focuses on the needs of quite specific groups within the community. Nevertheless there is clearly the potential to build on existing research to create a more comprehensive understanding of issues and themes. Some of the research that has been undertaken on young people, particularly some studies of how young people consume services, is now quite dated.

Areas for further research identified by the review include more up to date research on children and young people's use of key services; how to remove barriers preventing young people from accessing services; and studies of the views, attitudes and perceptions of young people from the white community in Bradford compared with those of their peers in minority ethnic communities.

Education, skills and the labour market

Most research in this field is descriptive rather than prescriptive and lacks a longitudinal element that would allow changes over time to be analysed in some depth. The research highlights the relatively low levels of educational attainment among many local residents and points to a number of barriers preventing many individuals and groups from undertaking learning activities that would improve their position in the labour market. Young people's transition from education to employment is also a recurring theme.

Identified gaps in the research literature include studies of the reasons for low levels of labour market participation among some population groups; barriers to training and employment; participation in labour market programmes; and the potential for self-employment to address problems related to low rates of labour market participation.

Crime and community safety

A considerable amount of statistical information exists about experiences and perceptions of crime in Bradford focusing on issues such as overall patterns of crime, community perceptions of crime, youth crime and race crime. As with many other themes included within the Review, the quest for effective solutions was not a key element in much of the research considered, with the exception of work on Street Wardens and police Community Support Officers.

Comparative work on issues of race, racism and policing in other countries would be useful, as would comparisons between the perceptions and behaviour of different ethnic groups in different local contexts. Issues regarding community safety perceptions and the fear of crime would warrant a comprehensive study.

Bradford: a future research agenda

This review of research has identified a wealth of research studies and papers on Bradford District. These reflect a wide range of approaches and methodologies, ranging from academic papers through to much more practitioner orientated studies.

A key question that has been raised in relation to the Review is whether Bradford District has been 'over-researched'. Based on the evidence we have gathered it is clear that while a great deal of material has been identified, *significant gaps remain in knowledge and understanding about Bradford District.*

Not surprisingly, a considerable proportion of research on social issues in Bradford has focused on its *minority ethnic communities*, and in particular the Pakistani and Bangladeshi communities who suffer the highest levels of deprivation. This focus is justified to an extent; however, there is a danger that problems facing *other sections of the community* – including white people who make up 78 per cent of Bradford's population – are not being addressed sufficiently in social research in the District.

A further consideration is the fact that, despite the wealth of information on Bradford's minority ethnic communities, only a small proportion of research studies provide a robust *comparative* dimension, either in relation to other groups within the District or with similar groups in other similar cities in the UK or overseas. Moreover, issues relating to the *interaction* between different groups – including between faith groups

within the minority ethnic communities – are not covered in great depth in the research that has been reviewed.

Despite the complexity of this study and the disparate nature of the research reviewed, it is clear that it is possible to identify a number of common findings and concerns that point to where more work is needed. These include:

- *A greater focus on comparative work:* between areas and groups in Bradford; with other areas in the subregion; with other areas with similar characteristics in the UK (Oldham, Rochdale, Derby) and overseas.
- *A focus on gender related issues,* particularly in terms of the position and role of Muslim women.
- Issues around the *accessibility of services by key groups* within the community, in particular where there are language and cultural barriers. These barriers have significant implications in terms of services such as care, health and housing, all of which will have a major impact on those most likely to experience poverty and deprivation.
- Research investigating the *complex link between deprivation and other aspects of the Review* such as health, economic status, housing, opportunity and access to services. Furthermore there is a case for research to focus more specifically on the causes of problems such as poverty and deprivation.
- The *broad range of geographical differences,* in particular the need for geographically targeted research, including more research in outlying towns (e.g. Shipley) and rural areas.
- The convergence of poverty and deprivation *within particular concentrated geographical areas.*

1 Introduction

Background to the Review

The rationale for Researching Bradford is that there is a wealth of existing social research that has been undertaken on the District of Bradford, but that this has not been consistently mapped or reviewed.

The background to the project is that the Joseph Rowntree Foundation (JRF) has, for the last two years, been forging closer links with Bradford District to add to its growing evidence base and to gain new insights into some of the core themes and interests of JRF. The Review seeks to use the existing evidence base to map the extent of knowledge relating to social issues in Bradford District.

This Review is designed to inform future JRF research and development projects within Bradford District. It aims to provide a consistent basis from which to design research and development projects, by reviewing and synthesising the available evidence and highlighting key information and research gaps. Furthermore, by providing a fully comprehensive and independent synthesis of available evidence, there is potential for the Review to inform wider policy making within Bradford District.

Clearly an undertaking of this kind appears at first to be an almost impossible task: extensive research has been undertaken within Bradford District by a wide range of actors, including local and national public agencies, voluntary and community groups, residents' groups, and regeneration programmes, as well as local universities and consultancies. Attempting to draw the findings together from such a diverse range of research projects, with varying aims and objectives, approaches, rationales and theoretical approaches, presents a considerable challenge.

Nevertheless it is clear that there is a growing evidence base about the District, the problems it faces and potential solutions to these problems. This is the report of the findings from the Review.

Aims and objectives

The aim of the project was to undertake a thorough and consistent review of social research relating to Bradford District. In particular the Review focused upon the following key questions:

- What is already known about Bradford District? What is *the extent of 'knowledge'* about Bradford District? How robust is this research?
- What are the *common themes and messages* that emerge from existing social research undertaken within Bradford District? Do these have a *geographical basis*?
- What *potential solutions* to key issues facing Bradford District are identified in the research?
- What specific issues relating to *race, ethnicity and faith* emerge from social research relating to Bradford District?
- What *gaps exist in current knowledge* and how do these shape a future research agenda?

Our approach

The Review had essentially four main phases: a scoping phase; literature search; literature review; and synthesis. As part of this process a detailed Literature Review Protocol was developed. This set out the approach adopted by the Review team in more detail and included criteria for inclusion of research within the Review as well as quality guidelines. The criteria that were adopted for the purposes of the Review are outlined below.

Criteria for inclusion in the Review

- The Review covered *original research* undertaken on the whole or part of the District of Bradford.
- *Syntheses of existing data* (for example the Census) were not included in the Review. Reanalysis of existing data (for example, use of Census data to look at migration patterns) would be included.
- The Review included both *published and unpublished research* (or 'grey' literature) where this met our quality guidelines.
- Research undertaken *over the last 10 years* (i.e. 1995 onwards). However, key research undertaken prior to this date was included in the Review if it was considered to be particularly relevant or significant.
- Research covering the *whole, or part of the District of Bradford*. Research covering the broader region or subregion was included where robust findings for Bradford are clearly identified within the report. Research using Bradford District as a case study was included where findings for Bradford could be identified.

For the purpose of the Review, 'research' was defined in a relatively broad sense to be '*a systematic investigation to increase knowledge or understanding*'. The focus was on applied research that seeks to contribute to an understanding of a particular area or problem. The Review included findings from relevant outcome-focused (rather than process) evaluations where collection has been undertaken of original data which provide useful insights into Bradford District. The Review did not include findings from consultation exercises. The Review provides *a snapshot of the state of knowledge* and does not look at change over time (however, this did not exclude research findings which focused on change over time). Equally the Review does not attempt to provide a digest of all relevant data on Bradford District. We have, however, signposted the reader to further information on data sources wherever possible.

The *literature search* was critical to the success of the Review and it was important that, as far as possible, all relevant and appropriate research was captured, including 'grey' literature. A range of sources were used to identify relevant literature. These included searches of formal sources such as online databases and indices, and more informal sources through networks and contacts within Bradford District.

Inevitably in undertakings of this type what is included and excluded from the Review will be a matter of debate: in practice, the application of strict inclusion/exclusion criteria is fraught with difficulties, with frequent discussions about whether a piece of work meets the agreed criteria and whether it is of sufficient quality to be included in the Review. The Review team believes the approach that has been adopted has been rigorous given time and resource constraints, and appropriate advice has been taken on literature that has been included in the Review.

Almost 200 documents were selected to be included within the Review. These include a wide range of types of documents, from very practical policy orientated documents through to more academic papers. Each document was reviewed against a set of criteria focusing in particular on key findings, evidence of effective solutions and further research needs. All of the documents and studies that have been included in the Review are listed in the Bibliography at the end of the report.

Methodological issues and limitations of the Review

Several aspects of the process presented challenges in the design and implementation of the Review. The first aspect is the intrinsic difficulty of undertaking this kind of work because of the practical problems in accessing and compiling the relevant research studies. Accessing some of the literature presented a considerable challenge for the Review team, especially for older documents that were not available in electronic format. Quite simply, attempting to review all social research across such a disparate number of policy areas is an impossible task!

Furthermore, it can be argued that there is an underlying epistemological assumption behind attempting to consider a range of research projects which have a broadly common theme. This assumption – that combining a range of material on a common theme can give a coherent overall view of the field of study – is a viewpoint which has been strongly criticised. For example, C. Wright Mills, in *The Sociological Imagination*, describes the belief that the combination of results from a range of research projects would somehow give a truthful overall picture as ‘abstracted empiricism’. This approach implies that a series of separate and often unrelated building blocks can be combined together to produce a structure which gives a valid depiction of a particular social phenomenon.

The second aspect concerns those difficulties which arise in undertaking this kind of work in relation to the sorts of research likely to be found on local issues in the UK at present. The contingent issues stemming from this attempt to bring together a set of thematic studies to provide an overall picture of the state of social knowledge about Bradford arise because of the conceptual foundations of much of the work under consideration.

The key problem is that a great deal of the literature considered under all the themes has been produced for the purposes of understanding, formulating or evaluating policy or policy initiatives of various kinds. Indeed, this is recognised in the commitment to identify those parts of the literature which display ‘evidence of effective solutions’. This raises further questions around what counts as evidence (in particular it raises the question of ‘evidence for whom?’) and also about the underpinning values associated with identifying effective solutions.

With an undertaking of this kind it is likely there will be some disagreement among key stakeholders about the literature that has been included and excluded in the Review and about the overall approach that has been adopted, for example in the areas that have been addressed, the conclusions that have been drawn (for example in resolving research with conflicting findings) and the research 'gaps' that have been identified. Nevertheless, while useful guidance and support has been gratefully received from the Project Advisory Group, the authors must take responsibility for the content of the report.

Bradford is a complex District and we cannot here even attempt to do full justice to the depth of some of the material we have identified: the breadth of the project, and the range of research we have accessed, have meant that it has been impossible to go into depth in any one area, and clearly further research may be required in areas that are of particular relevance. A further challenge is that much of the research that has been undertaken about Bradford District, particularly in terms of community cohesion, is highly politicised and questions can be raised about the extent to which this constitutes 'effective' research.

Despite these issues, and taking into account some of the methodological difficulties outlined above, this Review represents an addition to our existing knowledge and is designed to provide a useful background to discussions about future research priorities in relation to social issues in Bradford District.

A note on terminologies

It is useful here to provide a brief note on some of the terminologies used within the report. There are two areas in particular where clarification may be helpful.

The first relates to *race and faith* and the use of terminologies to identify particular groups within Bradford District. It was clear when reviewing the literature that research on Bradford District has utilised a wide range of different terms and approaches in identifying groups of particular faiths or ethnic origin within the District. This has posed a number of challenges for the Review team.

In the first place, the issues of race and religion are frequently conflated in some of the research that we have identified. It has been difficult, therefore, to effectively synthesise research findings in relation to race and faith.

In the second place, many of the studies group findings together according to certain communities. This may be for valid reasons, for example where statistically speaking further disaggregation into more specific groups would lead to a high level of uncertainty about the reliability of results. In many cases this means that the research findings do not reflect the diversity of many of these groups. For example, much of the research refers to the 'white community', which includes sizeable populations with very diverse origins – for example, Byelorussia, Estonia, Hungary, Ireland, Italy, Germany, Latvia, Lithuania and Poland. Other research identifies findings relating to the 'Asian' or 'South Asian' communities, which again does not reflect the diversity of these communities, or their particular needs, concerns and experiences.

Dealing with these issues when undertaking a review of this kind is difficult, particularly in terms of identifying findings from research that are of relevance to specific communities within Bradford District. The approach we have adopted in the production of this report is to use the terminologies as they have been utilised within the original research. This is far from ideal, but without undertaking further primary research the Review has had to be bound by the quality and focus of the research that we have considered.

The second note of caution relates to some of the geographical terms that have been used throughout the Review. The focus of the Review is on the District of Bradford. Throughout the report we have tried to identify whether the research relates to specific places in the District or to other defined geographical areas of the District, for example to the City of Bradford, to the surrounding towns and villages, or to parts of inner city Bradford.

Structure of the report

The report is structured around a series of broad themes, which were designed to address the current core themes of JRF as well as a number of additional areas. Race, faith and ethnicity have been addressed as a cross cutting theme throughout the review, as a very high proportion of research within the District focused specifically on these issues.

The structure of the report is as follows.

Chapter 2 focuses briefly on the social, economic and institutional setting of Bradford District. This chapter is not intended to provide a complete in-depth analysis of Bradford District, as this has been more than adequately undertaken elsewhere; instead it establishes the overall context for the Review.

Chapters 3 to 9 provide summaries of research under each of the themes that have been adopted for the Review: community cohesion; housing, neighbourhoods and regeneration; business and enterprise; health, disability and social care; children and young people; education, skills and the labour market; and crime and community safety. Under each theme key research findings are summarised, focusing in particular on evidence of 'effective solutions' and potential 'gaps' in research. The thematic structure of the Review was developed in conjunction with JRF to reflect its current policy concerns and areas of interest and also in conjunction with the Project Advisory Group.

Chapter 10 outlines a future research agenda for Bradford District, identifying key research gaps and summarising the findings from the Review.

2 Bradford District: social, economic and institutional context

Introduction

This chapter presents some key features of the society, economy and local governance framework of the Bradford District in order to set the context for the subsequent material in this report and to highlight some key characteristics of the District. There exists a wide range of statistical and other sources that provide detailed information about various aspects of Bradford, and this detailed information will not be replicated here. The individual chapters of this report also present some contextual information, drawn from the available research, about specific thematic areas.

In summary, the available statistical and qualitative evidence paints a picture of a city and District:

- built on a rich history linked strongly to the wool textile industry;
- that is an integral part of one of the largest and most densely populated conurbations in the UK outside London;
- that contains a mixture of deprived inner city areas, commuter towns and rural areas;
- whose population is growing, in contrast to many other urban areas, with one consequence being a relatively high concentration of young people;
- which has a relatively high proportion of residents from minority ethnic groups, following on from successive waves of immigration dating back to the 19th century;
- with levels of economic activity that are lower than the regional and national average;
- whose population has qualification levels that are significantly below the national average;
- that is ranked 30th out of 354 local authorities and districts in England on the Index of Multiple Deprivation;
- ...and which achieved unwanted notoriety in 2001 due to the disturbances that occurred during the summer of that year.

Partly as a consequence of the above, and in particular the aftermath of the 2001 disturbances, the local governance situation in Bradford is highly complex and has evolved rapidly over recent years.

Geography

Bradford District is based around the city of Bradford, but takes in the towns of Bingley, Shipley, Ilkley and Keighley and a number of other towns and villages, most of which are in rural or semi-rural locations. Bradford is an integral component of the West Yorkshire subregion, a conurbation of over 2 million residents. Leeds is the biggest city within the subregion, and other districts (and main centres of population) are Calderdale (Halifax), Kirklees (Huddersfield) and Wakefield. The subregion fits within the broader region of Yorkshire and Humber.

Bradford's geographical location means that its economic and social situation is inextricably tied up with developments in neighbouring districts, with considerable flows of people occurring between the districts of West Yorkshire, primarily for employment purposes but also for personal, social and other reasons.

Population

According to the mid 2003 population estimates there were 477,700 people residing in Bradford District, of whom 48.7 per cent were male and 51.3 per cent were female. Children under five accounted for approximately 7 per cent of the resident population of Bradford. This compares with almost 6 per cent for England and Wales overall. The Bradford population is growing more rapidly than the national average, with a projected population increase for West Yorkshire of 2.2 per cent between 2004 and 2016.

A key aspect of Bradford's population distinguishing it from many other districts is the relatively high concentration of residents from minority ethnic groups. According to the 2001 Census, 78 per cent of Bradford's population was of white ethnic origin (compared with 91 per cent for England) and 19 per cent (5 per cent for England) described themselves as 'Asian or Asian British'.

Table 2.1: Ethnicity of resident population (percentages), 2001

	Bradford District	Yorkshire and Humber	England and Wales
White	78.3	93.5	91.3
White British	76.1	91.7	87.5
White Irish	0.7	0.7	1.2
White Other	1.5	1.2	2.6
Mixed	1.5	0.9	1.3
Mixed White and Black Caribbean	0.6	0.4	0.5
Mixed White and Black African	0.1	0.1	0.2
Mixed White and Asian	0.6	0.3	0.4
Mixed Other Mixed	0.2	0.2	0.3
Asian or Asian British	18.9	4.5	4.4
Asian or Asian British – Indian	2.7	1.0	2.0
Asian or Asian British – Pakistani	14.5	2.9	1.4
Asian or Asian British – Bangladeshi	1.1	0.3	0.5
Asian or Asian British – Other	0.6	0.3	0.5
Black or Black British	0.9	0.7	2.2
Black or Black British – Caribbean	0.7	0.4	1.1
Black or Black British – African	0.2	0.2	0.9
Black or Black British – Other	0.1	0.1	0.2
Chinese or other ethnic group	0.4	0.4	0.9

Source: Census 2001, ONS

This factor is one that runs through this report and will not be elaborated here, apart from noting the concentration of minority ethnic populations in a small number of wards, notably Manningham (79 per cent in 2001), Toller (75 per cent), Bradford Moor (70 per cent), City (63 per cent), Little Horton (53 per cent) and Keighley Central (42 per cent).

Pakistani and Bangladeshi Muslims make up the largest minority ethnic group in Bradford District. Of these the largest presence is from the Mirpuri community who are from North Pakistan (mainly Kashmir). Both communities are predominantly from rural areas in Pakistan, are working class, experience high rates of unemployment

and reside within deprived inner city neighbourhoods in Bradford. The Sikh community is a minority community within the population of South Asian origin in Bradford.

Economy and labour market

Historically, Bradford's economy was built on the wool trade, with the city being described as 'the wool capital of the world' in the mid 19th century. Related industries such as engineering and services (for example finance) developed alongside the wool industry. One key social consequence of the rapid industrialisation of the area throughout the 19th century was a huge increase in population, achieved primarily through immigration, initially from Ireland and subsequently from Germany, Central and Eastern Europe and – from the 1950s onwards – from Asia and the West Indies.

The wool textile industry declined considerably in the latter part of the 20th century, with important implications for the employment prospects of large sections of the city's population, although manufacturing employment still employs around 18 per cent of Bradford's workforce (compared to 13 per cent for Great Britain). Public administration, education and health account for a relatively high proportion of employment in Bradford, 29 per cent compared with a GB average of 26 per cent.

The occupations of Bradford's workforce tend to reflect its manufacturing past, with a relatively high proportion concentrated in elementary and operative occupations, although personal services and sales occupations are growing. Managerial and professional occupations make up 37 per cent of the District's workforce; however, commuting patterns make it difficult to assess what proportion of these residents actually work in Bradford District.

Bradford's population is less well qualified than the regional and national average, 21 per cent possessing no qualifications compared with a national rate of 15 per cent. At the other end of the scale, 37 per cent of Bradford's population is qualified to NVQ Level 3 or above ('A' Level or higher vocational qualification) in comparison with a figure of 43 per cent for Great Britain. Perhaps as a consequence of this, Bradford workers tend to earn less than the regional and national average.

Statistics suggest that, while the majority of businesses in Bradford are small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs), new businesses are being created at a relatively

slow rate and tend to be less dynamic and innovative than average, leading to low survival rates by national standards.

While unemployment in 2004, at 4.6 per cent, was at a historical low, this is still higher than the regional and national average, with concerns about continuing long term unemployment among some groups within the population. More generally, levels of economic activity in Bradford tend to be relatively low, particularly among women. Seventy five per cent of men and 68 per cent of women in Bradford were economically active (i.e. in work or actively seeking work) in 2004; the equivalent figures for Great Britain were 78 and 73 per cent.

The economy and labour market in Bradford, to the extent that they can be distinguished from those of the wider West Yorkshire conurbation, have undergone a period of significant change over the last 20–30 years. This change appears to have affected some parts of the population more than others, with groups who had previously relied upon low-skilled manufacturing work that needs few qualifications being particularly hard hit by the relative decline of the manufacturing sector. These groups are also less well placed than others to take advantage of growth in areas such as financial and personal services.

Social indicators

The Index of Multiple Deprivation (IMD) summarises a range of indicators that are associated with the relative social well-being of an area. Combining factors such as income, employment, education, health, housing, environment, crime and access to services presents an overall picture of deprivation in a given area (for detailed information see www.neighbourhood.statistics.gov.uk). The most recent statistics have been disaggregated to ward level and to very small areas known as Super Output Areas (SOAs), with a typical population of 1,500 people.

In 2001, Bradford District as a whole ranked 30th out of 354 local authority areas in England on the aggregate IMD, although the extent and nature of this deprivation varies between wards and SOAs. Analysis of the SOAs reveals a more detailed portrait of disadvantage within Bradford District:

- Fourteen of Bradford's SOAs, primarily around inner Bradford, are within the most deprived 1 per cent of areas in England.

- A further 41 SOAs fall into the 5 per cent most deprived in England, again primarily in inner Bradford, but also taking in parts of Shipley and Keighley.
- Over 40 per cent of all SOAs in Bradford District (127 out of 307) fall into the 20 per cent most deprived areas in England.
- Only four of Bradford's 30 wards – Ilkley and three rural areas – have no SOA areas within the 20 per cent most deprived areas in England.

The precise pattern of deprivation varies by ward, with some wards (e.g. Little Horton) affected particularly in terms of income and employment and others such as Bradford Moor being affected especially by issues relating to the local environment.

Other indicators of the relative social position of Bradford's population include life expectancy (lowest in West Yorkshire), incidence of domestic violence, teenage pregnancy, young people leaving care, incidence of long term illness or disability, mental health needs, drug and alcohol problems and homelessness. The limitations of available statistics mean that it is difficult to provide precise comparisons; however, they suggest that Bradford District faces more of these types of problems than might be expected in relation to its population size.

Local governance

Bradford Metropolitan District Council is the unitary authority responsible for local government issues across the Bradford District, with 90 councillors representing 30 wards. Many areas of council decision-making are vested in the nine-member Executive, with individual portfolios covering areas such as regeneration and housing, education, environment and social care. There are five parliamentary constituencies within the District – Bradford North, South and West, Shipley and Keighley.

The 2001 disturbances and the report of the subsequent inquiry, outlined in more detail in chapter 3, raised issues around the degree of decentralisation of power within Bradford and the extent to which some groups and communities felt engaged with the democratic process. One consequence of this was the establishment of a range of area based structures within the District, for example council committees covering each of the parliamentary constituencies.

The developing neighbourhood renewal and local government modernisation agendas – and associated funding streams – have in addition given rise to a plethora of partnerships and forums at District and local level. The Community Strategy produced by Bradford Vision (the Local Strategic Partnership for the District), for example, lists 30 partnerships and 27 strategies or plans covering specific issues, population groups and/or areas.

As with the District's economy, Bradford's governance structures are closely tied up with those of the region and wider subregion, influenced in particular by Yorkshire Forward (the Regional Development Agency) and, to a lesser extent, by European Union funding streams. A subregional strategy for West Yorkshire has been developed as part of the Regional Economic Strategy developed by Yorkshire Forward, which has responsibility for the distribution of a significant proportion of regeneration funding and for key services such as small business support. The West Yorkshire Learning and Skills Council has the lead responsibility for allocating European Social Fund monies.

This brief overview illustrates the complexities of the governance structures within which individuals and institutions within Bradford must operate in order to attempt to address many of the social issues identified in this report. The Local Strategic Partnership, Bradford Vision, may help to streamline and simplify the situation in the long term; however, the short term picture in Bradford is one of complex and overlapping responsibilities for a range of social and related issues.

3 Community cohesion

While the amount of research on what might accurately be termed 'community cohesion' in Bradford District is not substantial, a wide-ranging commentary about the issue is ongoing in the academic and political literature (as well as the popular media), much of it arising from consideration of the public 'disturbances' in areas of Bradford which took place in June 1995 and July 2001. It is worth noting that some of the findings from the literature are not based on an analysis of systematic research based in the communities on which they comment. However, there is some commonality in the arguments presented, and this summary attempts to draw together some of the more pertinent and well supported of these findings and observations.

While the popular press most commonly refers to the events of both June 1995 and July 2001 as 'riots', they were ascribed different categories by the authorities, with only one period of the 2001 events being categorised as a 'riot'. Many of the authors of the papers included in this review contest the validity of this term altogether, and many different terms are used to refer to the events. For consistency and simplicity the term 'disturbance(s)' has been used throughout the Review.

The majority of studies reviewed in this chapter deal specifically with the 2001 disturbances in the Manningham area of Bradford; a further two consider issues around the 1995 disturbances. All of these papers offer views on the causes and consequences of the disturbances, and in some cases they include recommendations to secure improvements in community relations and to avert similar incidents in the future. While there is much agreement between the papers, differences in interpretation are evident, both in terms of the causes of the disturbances, and of what needs to be done. Research identified for this theme can be seen as located on a continuum in relation to the rhetoric surrounding community cohesion, with key differences emerging in the analysis of the current state of community relations in Bradford, and in their critique of the political response to the disturbances.

Summary of findings

There is overall agreement within the literature that community relations in Bradford District are not as good as might be desired. While some papers acknowledge that the situation in relation to community relations in Bradford is not necessarily

dissimilar to that in other towns and cities in the UK, several trends are identified as having contributed to the polarisation and segregation of communities in the Bradford District, and as having – it is suggested – contributed to the disturbances of 1995 and 2001. They include:

- *'White flight'*/middle class movement out of the city leaves behind an underclass of relatively poor white people and visible minority ethnic communities.
- *Segregation* between minority ethnic groups is evident (e.g. Sikhs and Hindus 'drifting away' to Pudsey).
- Self-styled *'Community Leaders'* seek to maintain the status quo of control and segregation.
- *Communication* between politicians, leaders, institutions and local people is poor, allowing misconceptions about 'other' cultures to thrive.
- Different communities *protect their identities and culture*, and discourage contact with other communities and institutions.
- Sections of the white community resent the 'Asian' community, perceiving their monocultural leaders as *advocates of segregation*.
- *Minority ethnic communities*, and subgroups within them (e.g. women) are excluded from participating in wider community decision-making processes.
- Representation from minority ethnic communities on *decision-making bodies* does not reflect the make-up of the District's population.
- *Competition for regeneration funding* between deprived communities generates divisions and resentment.
- Individuals within minority communities are fearful of *harassment and violent crime*, and victims of discrimination are inadequately supported.
- *Anti-social and criminal behaviour* is prevalent among young people due to boredom, frustration and a lack of facilities/services.
- *Police methods* are perceived by minority ethnic communities to be insensitive and inappropriate for their needs, and are inhibited by the police's fear of accusations of racism.
- The diversity of the District's population *is not reflected in the workplace*, and employers have failed to ensure fair treatment and equality.
- *Segregation is entrenched* in the 'virtual apartheid' *education system*, and many schools fail to deal adequately with racial incidents, or to promote better understanding of diversity.

- *Parental prejudices* reinforce divisive views among children, and parental choice exacerbates segregation between schools.

A crucial aspect of disagreement between the reports relates to the extent to which this process can be put down to 'self-segregation' by minority ethnic populations, particularly the British Muslim communities of Pakistani and Bangladeshi heritage. The 'establishment view' – as presented in the Ouseley Report, for example – reflects on the 'very worrying drift towards self-segregation' (Ouseley, 2001, p. i), and asserts that these communities have looked to themselves for mutual succour and support.

Conversely, other papers suggest that this is an oversimplistic analysis, failing as it does to take into account the effects of recurring racism and 'structural constraints on choice' (Webster, 2003, p. 114), such as disparities in income and employment opportunities and limitations on housing options. Further research by Simpson (2004) also challenges the 'myth of self-segregation', suggesting that in Bradford, and other northern cities, 'the number of majority South Asian areas has increased due to a growth in population from immigration and from natural increase, but not from movement of South Asian residents towards areas of South Asian concentration' (p. 677).

Whatever analysis is adopted, it is clear that the District's largest minority ethnic community is highly 'visible' in some of the most deprived and socially excluded areas of Bradford. British Pakistani and Bangladeshi populations have been shown to live in 'distinctively more deprived conditions, compared to the majority and other minority ethnic groups' (Webster, 2003, p. 101), not just in Bradford but also in other parts of the country. In particular, they have higher rates of unemployment and economic inactivity; receive poor pay for the work they do; and are the most vulnerable to changes in the economic fortunes of their employers.

Several of the papers report on changes in the age structure of Bradford's Pakistani and Bangladeshi population. In Manningham, more than half of the Pakistani community (which itself comprises 53 per cent of the population) is reported as being less than 25 years of age (Jan-Khan, 2003, p. 37). Combined with the limited economic opportunities described above, this population trend has resulted in a concentration of relatively poor young men of Pakistani and Bangladeshi heritage

being concentrated in deprived neighbourhoods and 'increasingly spending their free time on the streets' there (Burlet and Reid, 1998, p. 275).

Their socio-economic circumstances alone do not explain the involvement of young British Asian males in the 2001 disturbances, or those which occurred in 1995. While some reports present the segregation and isolation as sufficient context for the disturbances and do not explore their specific causes, some of the papers identify the particular frustrations of young British Asian males as contributing directly to the incidence of these disturbances, seeing them as

- a response to threats of intrusion and incursion into and violence against the community by fascist groups;
- a response to alleged specific instances of police brutality, as well as a perception of institutional insensitivity by the police to the community;
- frustration at the continued failure of community leaders to understand or incorporate into their view consideration of the experiences of young men;
- a manifestation of young men's frustrations at being 'disempowered and disenfranchised' (Burlet and Reid, 1998, p. 272).

Some commentators assert that second and third generation Asian men in the Manningham community – young 'British Asians' caught between the demands of two conflicting cultural traditions – were left with no 'alternative form of expression', because 'Western' models of participation are 'alien' (Jan-Khan, 2003, p. 41). The 'rampage of Asian youths' is similarly portrayed as a means of making a 'citizenship claim, that cannot be reduced to complaints of ethnic or religious mooring, or passing youth masculinity' (Amin, 2003, p. 462). This view is further encapsulated in the assertion that, through the disturbances, a 'generation of Asians, discarded for their class, excluded for their race, stigmatised for their religion, ghettoised and forgotten, has found its voice' (Kundnani, 2001, p. 110). Macey (1999a) argues that there has been an increase in religion related disorders exemplified by the Rushdie affair in 1989, by-election disorders involving disputes between different clans, and disorders associated with campaigns against the sex trade in which Pakistani Muslim youths have employed harassment and violence against local sex workers.

The focus of much of this part of the analysis is on the young men who took part in the disturbances. One paper incorporates a different analytical reference point,

highlighting the impact of gender on the experiences of those living in the communities in which the 1995 disturbances were located. Not only did women not participate in these disturbances, but they were involved centrally in the actions which brought about their conclusion. Perceiving the disturbances as an expression of the 'macho religio-cultural identity' that had developed in the community, women wanted to 'disassociate themselves from it' (Burlet and Reid, 1998, p. 280). While, in the aftermath of the 1995 disturbances, proposals were considered to enhance young male representation, it is argued that the public sphere needs to incorporate greater representation of 'diversity within the community' (1998, p. 284).

One interpretation of the disturbances, as applied by politicians and community leaders alike, was that they reflected the criminality of the participants. For example, it is reported that the Home Secretary's view – in refusing to initiate a full inquiry into the causes of the disturbances – was that it was 'overwhelmingly local people who have damaged their own community' (Allen, 2003, p. 23). The judiciary is also charged with having adopted this interpretation, handing down 'severe' punishments to those found guilty of offences during the disturbances. It is recorded that the sentencing was far more severe than for similar offences committed in other parts of the country, and it is claimed that this 'overzealous and questionable approach' (2003, p. 47) reflects the imposition of a 'pre-meditative communal sentencing framework' to 'punish the community' (2003, p. 48). It is asserted that these actions will 'only hinder rather than help bridge that gulf between communities divided on far too many different lines of segregation' (2003, p. 49). While this view of the sentencing is not held universally (other pools of opinion are reported as believing that the sentencing was justified), it is acknowledged that the impact of the sentences on community relations within Bradford will be significant and long-lasting, if only because of the 'potentially divisive effect of the controversy over justice' (Carling et al, 2004, p. 1).

The disturbances are further assessed in the light of the relationship between the media, academia and political discourse, with particular attention being given to 'contemporary understandings of raced/ethnic, gendered and generational identities' (Alexander, 2004, p. 526). It is claimed that there is a mixing of structural (e.g. related to poverty, economic restructuring and social exclusion) with cultural (e.g. self-segregating communities) arguments which fails to acknowledge the impact of racism, and in so doing generates a 'racialised discourse' (2004, p. 531). Thus, it is argued, misconceptions about 'static, inward looking and primordial' Asian cultures

and identities are perpetuated, and Muslim cultural identities in particular are perceived as being 'anachronistic and problematic' (2004, p. 534). Ultimately, it is claimed, this analysis 'feeds easily into New Right discourse around unscrutinised cultural difference and cultural antipathy' (2004, p. 538). As a result, it is argued, proposals arising from this analysis to promote community cohesion are flawed, with the concept of 'celebrating difference' having been replaced with strategies to 'manage diversity' which challenge Asian Muslim communities in particular to 'renounce their culture to become citizens ... (while remaining) ... unable to renounce their ethnicity and mode of being' (2004, p. 541).

The challenges presented to authorities and communities alike in achieving community cohesion are compounded by the different interpretations of the concept of 'citizenship'. Research conducted in Bradford's British Pakistani community after the 2001 disturbances (McGhee, 2003) explored the complex relationship between citizenship, ethnicity, culture and religion within the identities held by British Pakistanis. While the widely held academic position is reported as seeing citizenship as a 'universal, rights-based discourse embedded in the nation-state and identity', it is asserted that this is 'exclusionary' and 'creates social divisions as much as creating the means to overcome them' (2003, p. 409). The research confirmed that there are 'critical differences in citizenship status and identity between the generations' (2003, p. 410) which go some way to explain the disturbances. While the citizenship identities of the older generations were found to be weak, for the younger generations their British citizenship was found to be 'central to their self-understandings and assertions of who they are' (2003, p. 411). It is asserted that the concept of citizenship is complicated for them by the fact that they see themselves simultaneously as members of religious, racial, ethnic and linguistic groups. Not only is there a perception that these groups receive different treatment from the state and its institutions, but there is also a recognition that these different aspects of an individual's identity may come into conflict with one another. While it is emphasised that the younger generations of British-Pakistanis have a sense of belonging through their place of birth, it is asserted that their identities are 'hybridised, synthesising South Asian culture, Islam and Western culture within their identities as British citizens' (2003, p. 420).

As these papers highlight, Bradford faces many challenges in achieving its stated aspirations for community cohesion, and in particular in overcoming the problems arising from the disturbances. Several papers give specific consideration to ways in

which the District can work to overcome the divides that have become apparent, especially in the aftermath of the disturbances. For example, a discussion document produced after the 2001 disturbances by the Programme for a Peaceful City (an initiative established to build shared understanding of problems facing Bradford and to open dialogue around issues of race, ethnicity and cultural diversity in the District) identified a range of issues, many of which are included in the foregoing summary. Proposals to assist in the achievement of community cohesion focus on the need to develop a framework (based on 'bridging social capital') so that a 'variety of different communities can co-exist happily: cohesion between communities perhaps, but not a single cohesive community' (Buhler et al, 2002, p. 11). The notion of 'multicultural citizenship' is identified as central to this process, with the requirement being that its practice is sufficiently strong to 'support social order and positive interpersonal relationships' while 'avoiding the kind of specific cultural content that is offensive to the deepest beliefs of sections of the population' (2002, p. 12).

A report on the outcomes of an exchange and learning programme between individuals and groups from Bradford and Northern Ireland highlights lessons learnt from the approach to bridging the divide between segregated communities in Northern Ireland, and suggests ways in which they might be applied in building community cohesion in Bradford. In particular, the report emphasises the need to 'link economic development and peace-building initiatives', to develop policies that are 'mindful of conflict', and for 'open dialogues and appropriate community relations work' (Kelly and Philpott, 2003, pp. 13–14). Asserting that existing regeneration and community development initiatives need to be reassessed, it is stressed that there is a need for 'more critical engagement with existing models of participation, to ensure more genuine involvement of all stakeholders in the design and delivery of positive change' (2003, p. 15). One example from Northern Ireland cited in the report as a potential means of achieving this is the Community Dialogue project, which it is felt 'might be relevant in Bradford, to allow for the full expression of different views and experiences, from the various groups and sub-groups in the District' (2003, p. 33). The report also raises questions about the relationship between research, policy making and implementation, suggesting that the problems in Bradford are already well known, and that the challenge for Bradford is to 'translate this knowledge into appropriate policy, and policy into meaningful change' (2003, p. 37).

Established to present an overview of the causes of the 1995 disturbances, the Bradford Commission produced a detailed report (Bradford Congress, 1996), which

included consideration of a range of factors impacting on the communities in which they occurred. The report placed responsibility for providing leadership and the wider community cohesion agenda squarely with the local agencies, and the Council in particular: 'The City Council is constitutionally designed to sort out local priorities, and it should concentrate on this role as the organised "centre", as a counterweight to the diffusions and confusions of separate geographical, social, ethnic, financial and operational forces of which it is presently a part' (Bradford Congress, 1996).

One analysis about community cohesion presents a bleak picture about the potential for success in achieving these aims. In considering the current academic and political 'discourses' about community cohesion (including a specific focus on Bradford), it is asserted that the aim of creating a 'multi-cultural British citizenship established through the forging of common values shared by all communities and the social project associated with de-polarizing communities in culturally disharmonious areas ... are, despite the best intentions, unobtainable ideals' (McGhee, 2003, p. 400). This conclusion incorporates two key findings: first, that recommendations for overcoming cultural differences might be at the expense of 'a corresponding engagement and examination' of socio-economic inequalities; and, perhaps most importantly for Bradford, that the sentencing policy in the aftermath of the disturbances adds 'yet another level of injustice ... perceived by the Asian community in Bradford ... as not offering them equal treatment' (2003, p. 401).

Key issues and research gaps

The papers included in the community cohesion theme focus on how the factors contributing to the social exclusion faced by people from Bradford's Muslim Pakistani and Bangladeshi communities – especially young second and third generation males – are exacerbated by their experience of overt discrimination. A key issue is that there is little available research into the experiences of people with other racial, ethnic or faith heritages (such as Sikhs and Hindus, or African Caribbean, Chinese and minority white communities), or from other groups such as asylum seekers and refugees.

What the papers included in the community cohesion theme address, in the main, is a very specific set of circumstances prevailing in the Muslim Pakistani and Bangladeshi communities within Bradford District. In particular, they consider the circumstances that contributed to the disturbances in parts of the city in 2001 (and, to

a lesser extent, those that occurred in 1995). By default, the papers fail to address the socio-economic and ethno-cultural circumstances of other communities in the city or the district, undermining attempts to assess the cohesiveness of the District's different communities.

The complexities of achieving community cohesion in Bradford are compounded by the use, however well intentioned, of what is perceived by many people as inappropriate terminology to describe the social, ethnic and cultural heritage of different groups and individuals. The authors of the different papers have themselves elected to use different terminologies, sometimes when referring to the same people. Many papers fail to reflect the complexity of the make-up of the communities they describe, and the term 'community' is often used without acknowledging the multiplicity of elements it comprises.

Reference is made in the papers included under this theme to the effect of racist attacks and of institutional racism by local agencies on the lives of Bradford's Muslim Pakistani and Bangladeshi communities. What is lacking in the papers is evidence that the policy discourse incorporates a sophisticated understanding of what has contributed to racism in the city and wider district, and whether or not local initiatives have had any impact on reducing the incidence of intercommunity violence.

Several of the papers included in the theme appear to articulate the views of their authors, and as such are not based on empirical research. Some of the remaining papers comment on the findings of other research and on the conclusions drawn by other commentators, so there is a cyclical reinforcing of views, without the empirical data to back up the conclusions. Consequently, there is a need to establish how closely the circumstances of the Muslim Pakistani and Bangladeshi communities in Bradford – and those of young Asian males in particular – currently reflect the scenarios outlined here.

In order that this process does not serve to reinforce the perceptions of some excluded 'indigenous' communities (for instance, hardening the view of those people who resent the 'Asian' community receiving 'special treatment'), it is recommended that any such research be undertaken as a comparative exercise, incorporating analysis of the circumstances of other excluded communities in the District. This approach reflects the recommendations in the report of the exchange programme between Bradford and Northern Ireland, which include reference to the need first to

identify 'categories of identity/difference through which social groups define themselves or are defined by others' (Kelly and Philpott, 2002, p. 28). On the basis of other understandings gained from this exploration, it should be possible to examine fully issues around community dynamics, inequality, politicisation and segregation (along with others included in the foregoing summary) and to generate proposals for policies and interventions to address shortcomings. It is thus necessary to develop through ongoing research a better shared understanding of the needs, concerns and aspirations of different groups and communities within the District, in order to inform the policy making process.

Key areas for further research could include:

- Investigations that contribute to an understanding of the socio-economic and ethno-cultural circumstances of other communities in Bradford District, including research focusing on groups within the majority white community.
- A more in-depth understanding of factors that contribute to racism in the District, and whether or not local initiatives have had any impact on reducing the incidence of intercommunity violence.
- Improved and more robust empirical data on excluded communities in the District, in order to provide a framework within which qualitative and attitudinal research can be situated.
- A focus upon the rich history of community action within Bradford District, its relationship with the state, and how this can be used to inform contemporary efforts at community engagement.

4 Housing, neighbourhoods and regeneration

The literature search identified a large number of studies relating to various aspects of housing in Bradford, examining housing needs within different communities (including geographical communities and a number of communities of interest). Other studies have focused upon the condition of the housing stock and levels of satisfaction with housing. A second significant area of research within this field has dealt with what has been termed by some authors the 'racialisation of space' within Bradford. Research within this area contributes a number of perspectives, including the role of estate agents in determining patterns of residence and the take-up of social housing among South Asian households. Finally there are a number of studies relating to the wider city environment, including issues around food, perceptions of the city and wider stakeholder perceptions.

Summary of findings

Housing conditions and needs

There are a large number of studies relating to housing needs within Bradford District. Studies have been undertaken both in terms of specific geographical areas and also with a number of communities. A number of recent housing needs studies have been undertaken on small rural communities, including Burley in Wharfedale, Oxenhope, Haworth and Cullingworth (Hemming and King, 2003a, 2003b, 2004, 2005). Findings vary across the communities but key questions emerge around the shortage of affordable housing for local residents as well as concerns about overdevelopment in some rural communities.

Several studies have focused upon housing needs within communities in Bradford District. These have included the housing needs of people with disabilities, older people, those in sheltered housing, the homeless, asylum seekers and refugees. Other studies consider the needs of different minority ethnic communities in Bradford District, in particular the needs of the black and African Caribbean and South Asian communities.

Analyses have been undertaken of Census data and House Condition Surveys to identify issues relating to specific communities within Bradford District. A study undertaken in 1996 (Ratcliffe, 1996) in particular pointed to the housing conditions of minority ethnic communities. It highlighted issues around (Western norms of)

overcrowding, particularly in the Pakistani and Bangladeshi communities, as well as high levels of reported disrepair. Other research has suggested that Pakistani and Bangladeshi communities fare worse than other minority communities due to other factors which may contribute to housing stress. These include large family units, a high proportion of households with no one in full-time work, higher levels of benefit dependence and a higher level of reported defects in properties due to a lack of funds to undertake essential repairs.

A number of the studies touched upon wider problems in terms of access to services (such as welfare benefits, health and social services) and linking into the relationship between poor housing and social exclusion. For example, research (Ahmad and Walker, 1997) has highlighted the specific needs of Asian older people in relation to housing, health and access to services. The study found that a considerable number of older Asians in Bradford suffer poverty, inadequate housing, limited entitlements, limited knowledge of services and problems of access to welfare benefits, health and social services.

A comprehensive study was undertaken in 2001 (City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council and Northern Consortium of Housing Authorities, 2001) focusing specifically upon the likely demand for housing over the following 20 years. The study found that housing need was greatest in the inner city and peripheral housing estates, and identified critical issues concerning future housing demand by tenure and geographical location.

Spatial residential patterns

Bradford District has a complex socio-economic geography. A number of research reports and papers have addressed what a number of authors have termed the 'racialisation of space' within Bradford (Phillips, Butt and Davies, 2002; Phillips 2002; Ratcliffe, 1998, 1999). On the whole the studies have focused upon the various factors which contribute to and perpetuate patterns of residence within Bradford District.

While a disproportionately large section of the South Asian population remains concentrated in the inner urban areas, thereby suffering the familiar problems associated with a poor quality environment, there is some evidence that South Asians are relocating elsewhere within the city, although some research (see for

example Phillips, 2002) suggests that this is happening less in Bradford than in other cities.

Some studies also challenge the conception of self-segregation among the Asian community, arguing that factors such as racism, financial limitations and concerns about harassment and/or unequal opportunities in the housing market constrain where people live rather than an unwillingness to mix with others (see for example Bowes, Dar and Sim, 2002). The role and practices of estate agents in determining residential patterns in particular have been the subject of a number of studies (see for example Cater, 1981). Possible discrimination within housing markets has been identified, among both estate agents and mortgage lenders, which may perpetuate existing residential patterns, although some of this research is now quite dated.

Access to the social rented sector by minority ethnic communities emerges as a key issue. A study undertaken in 2001 (Ratcliffe et al, 2001) identifies a number of barriers to accessing social rented housing, focusing in particular on perceptions of social housing estates among Asians, the stigma associated with being a council tenant, and problems around the size and location of available properties. Many institutions are viewed as catering mainly for the needs of the white population. Nevertheless it is clear that there are strong cultural preferences among South Asian communities for home ownership.

Regeneration and the wider city environment

Bradford District has a complex regeneration history, and it is beyond the scope of this Review to map this out in detail. Nevertheless recent research undertaken in relation to regeneration in the District is briefly outlined.

Over the last ten years Bradford District has been in receipt of monies from a number of area-based regeneration programmes, most notably the Single Regeneration Budget (SRB) and New Deal for Communities. The majority of these SRB programmes are now completed, with the exception of Regen 2000 which is focused around the eastern part of Bradford's inner city. For the remaining SRB programmes – in parts of Keighley, Newlands, Royds, and Manningham and Girdlington – final end of programme evaluations have been produced (Evaluations Research Strategies, 2003; Meridien Pure, 2004a, 2004b, 2005a, 2005b). While these evaluations focus on process and partnership issues, they also highlight a number of questions in

relation to the wider regeneration of Bradford District, particularly for example in terms of community engagement and involvement within regeneration programmes.

It is also worth noting the findings from a review of regeneration policy and programming undertaken in 2003 and commissioned by Yorkshire Forward (KPMG, 2002). The review was undertaken because of concerns about how far regeneration programmes in the District were aligned with the Regional Economic Strategy. A recurrent theme was the extent to which regeneration programmes and partnerships are 'overpoliticised' and an absence of a strong strategic focus.

A number of studies have focused specifically on community involvement within regeneration, in particular looking at the involvement of specific groups in the process. Research by Farnell et al (2003) on behalf of the Joseph Rowntree Foundation considers faith in the context of regeneration, focusing on four urban centres, including Bradford. The research found that many faith communities were already making a significant contribution to regeneration, although there were significant inequalities among faiths in their current ability to engage in regeneration work. In addition the diversity of faith communities in terms of their theologies, values and organisation needed to be recognised and official agencies needed 'religious literacy'. Other work has focused on the issue of the participation of young women in urban regeneration programmes (Alsop, Clisby and Craig, 2001). This study found that young women are not targeted as a specific and distinct group within urban regeneration programmes and as a result suffer under-representation at all levels of the regeneration process.

Relatively little research has been undertaken about the wider city environment, particularly the built environment. One study (Howe, 2002) investigated the relationship between urban food growing and planning, focusing on the role of allotments, urban farms and community gardens.

Other research (Trueman, Klemm and Giroud, 2004) has considered Bradford as a 'brand', with the aim of understanding stakeholders' perceptions and how they can be enhanced by improvements to key corridors into the city as a catalyst for change. It is suggested that previous marketing of Bradford has led to inconsistency and confusion about what Bradford is saying about itself. This research attempted to unpick stakeholder perceptions of Bradford to identify what positive aspects of the city should be emphasised.

Further research (Killingbeck and Trueman, 2002) has linked the Bradford 'brand' to the need for signs of positive change, particularly within the built environment of the city centre, as a means of improving stakeholder and community relationships.

Key issues and research gaps

A key theme that emerges throughout the literature on housing is access to services, particularly the social rented sector, by minority ethnic communities within Bradford. Potential ways to address this situation include the need for housing providers to have a range of housing types on their stocks in order to meet the needs of different communities more effectively; attention to the location of social rented housing; actions to ensure that allocation systems do not act in discriminatory ways; and ethnic monitoring of housing allocations.

Other solutions to housing related issues concerned the provision of more affordable housing options within some areas of the District, as well as the provision of better advice to minority ethnic groups on a range of housing options. Some of this research focused upon the wider needs of certain groups, in terms of support, care and access to services, for example by providing a more holistic support package for single tenants in the social housing sector.

There is consensus that the problems facing minority ethnic communities in relation to housing need are complex. This links into other wider questions of social exclusion, discrimination, employment, skills, deprivation and opportunity and access to services.

While a substantial number of studies have been undertaken on the housing needs of a range of groups within Bradford, in particular focusing on the needs of minority ethnic communities in the District and spatial residential patterns in the city, some of this research is now relatively dated. An area for further investigation may be to undertake a more up to date analysis of population movements within the city.

Other research dealing with the Bradford 'brand' has pointed to the need for signs of positive change, particularly in the built environment of the city centre, as a way to improve stakeholder and community relationships.

Additionally areas where further research would be beneficial include:

- The physical regeneration of the city, in particular focusing on perceptions of residents and stakeholders and the link to community cohesion.
- Physical segregation within the city, and how this connects with questions of community cohesion.
- The links between social exclusion, deprivation, housing and, importantly, school choice are an area of further possible investigation. There may be a case for assessing the evidence in this area in relation to a wider range of groups within the city than has been done so far, including the white community.

5 Business and enterprise

Three areas of research were identified under the theme of business and enterprise. A number of research studies concentrated on providing a profile of overall business and enterprise activity in the District. This research is based either on surveys of businesses or summarises data to present an overview of the business structure of the District. Secondly, there are a small number of studies focused on particular sectors, particularly in relation to the cultural and tourism sectors. Finally research has been undertaken on issues affecting the business landscape as a whole, including for example those relating to minority ethnic communities and crime.

Summary of findings

Profile of business and enterprise activity

In terms of business units, the key sectors of the economy in Bradford are wholesale and retail trade, real estate and renting, and manufacturing. However, when analysed by employment, a different picture emerges: the public sector accounts for more than a quarter of all employment in the District, and more than a fifth of employees are based in the manufacturing sector.

The importance of the manufacturing sector to Bradford is a recurring theme. Although the sector remains a vital employer in the District, employment in manufacturing continues to decline (by 9 per cent between 1998 and 2001) and this trend is regarded as a potential threat to economic well-being. Indeed, the Local Futures Group identified the need to improve the competitiveness of businesses in the manufacturing sector as a key objective for economic competitiveness more generally (Local Futures Group, 1998). In particular, the need to build on the strength of specific subsectors, such as electronics, in which Bradford has achieved local and regional success, was emphasised.

The manufacturing sector accounted for 9.1 per cent of the regional business stock, which together provided 192,000 employment positions for 280,000 local people of working age. The majority of local businesses are small, with 82 per cent employing ten or fewer workers, and a majority of these businesses are local or regional workplaces of larger organisations. Compared to national averages, the District has a large representation of business operating in manufacturing, and wholesale and retail trade.

In addition to the industrial structure of the economy, the size structure of local businesses was also regarded as a key issue. In particular, given that over 80 per cent of businesses have fewer than ten employees, the need to increase growth, competitiveness and employment within these businesses was identified as a strategic priority.

Two regular surveys of local businesses are undertaken by Bradford Chamber of Commerce and Industry (2004) and Yorkshire Futures (2004b), and provide more detailed information on current business performance in the District. The findings from the most recent of these surveys are relatively positive. Businesses in Bradford were more optimistic about the business situation for the next six months (from November 2004) than was the case for businesses in the region as a whole, and findings also indicated an optimistic outlook among businesses in relation to employment and output growth over the next twelve months. The major barrier to growth identified by local firms was the difficulty in attracting staff to the region.

The Chamber of Commerce survey disaggregates the findings into the manufacturing and service sectors, with the overall conclusion that confidence within the former is increasing, but with two thirds of manufacturing businesses seeking to recruit, recruitment difficulties remain an issue for the sector. Indeed, the most recent survey of employers (Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire, 2003b) indicated that 37 per cent of manufacturing businesses had experienced recruitment difficulties in the previous twelve months.

A further survey (Bradford Chamber of Commerce and Industry, 2003) asked businesses to identify their priorities for action from a list of identified issues. The three key areas in which businesses wanted action to be taken were: regeneration of Bradford city centre; more attention to reducing crime and disorder; and help for manufacturing firms.

Sector specific research

Research into the cultural industries (Heathcote and Taylor, 2002) indicates that just over 5,700 individuals were employed by the sector in 2000, accounting for approximately 3 per cent of employment in the economy as a whole. In total, the sector generated £150,000,000 of income in this year. In thinking about the

contribution that the sector can make to the economy in the future, a number of findings from the research are relevant. In terms of markets, the key area for the majority of businesses in the sector is the Bradford District, although a few businesses have developed markets more widely across the Yorkshire and Humber region. Training requirements in the sector were identified as IT, sales, marketing and management skills, while the key areas for concern for cultural industries businesses were funding, premises, promotion and networking.

There are clearly links between the cultural industries, which include, for example, music performance, visual arts and sculpture, and the tourism sector, particularly in an area such as Bradford District where visitor attractions, such as the Alhambra Theatre, form a key part of the tourism package.

Tourism related research acknowledges that Bradford 'is not a "natural" tourism attraction' (Hope and Klemm, 2001) but that a number of different approaches to developing the sector have been taken since the mid 1980s. The most recent has been the development of a public/private sector partnership, the Bradford Tourism Partnership, which views the sector not only as a contributor to economic development, but also as a tool in the regeneration of local communities. Successes relating to the tourism sector are identified as the development of a 'tourism pole' in the city centre, as well as the contribution of the minority ethnic communities in the District, building upon multicultural events such as the annual Mela festival. However, despite the positives, the research indicates that the development of tourism in Bradford remains a challenge, partly as a result of increased competition from other cities appealing to the short break sector, and partly due to problems with the image of the city.

A study conducted into tourism choices among minority ethnic groups which focused on Asians in Bradford (Klemm, 2000) showed that ethnic groups appeared to be ignored by the mainstream companies, and it was not clear whether this was seen to be a specialist market. The survey of British citizens of Asian origin revealed that frequency of holidays taken and holiday preferences were not substantially different from the British population as a whole. The study concluded that promotional methods of selling by the travel industry, including major tour operators and chains of travel agents, were perceived as negative towards South Asian groups.

Issues affecting the business and enterprise landscape

Two issues with an impact across the business landscape were covered by the research. The first of these relates to the minority ethnic population in the District, and the second concerns the effect of crime on businesses in the District.

A number of studies have focused upon issues in relation to the minority ethnic population. Specifically, research has been undertaken into the development of Asian businesses in the District, providing a comparative analysis of Muslim and non-Muslim owned enterprises. Work has also been carried out on the subject of minority ethnic communities as consumers in the travel industry, and subsequently into the attitudes of travel companies to the potential minority ethnic market.

Research into Asian entrepreneurial activity (Rafiq, 1992) identified stark differences between the establishment and development of Muslim and non-Muslim owned businesses. In particular, non-Muslim firms are more likely to have a higher turnover than Muslim firms; they are more likely to be located in the suburbs, while Muslim businesses are largely located in the deprived inner city areas; and they are more likely to have higher rates of growth than Muslim owned firms. The research concludes that the key determinant of these differences is the relative socio-economic status of the two groups, rather than any direct cultural influence. It does, however, acknowledge that the lower socio-economic status of Muslims is, in part, related to some cultural differences between Muslim and non-Muslim Asians, in particular the low participation of Muslim women in the labour force. These findings are particularly important, given that the contribution of the Asian business sector to the economic development of the District is expected to continue to grow.

The minority ethnic population as consumers has been researched and found to be significant for business development in a District with such a high proportion of residents from these groups. Relating this to the travel industry, Klemm and Kelsey (2002, 2004) found that the travel preferences of the Muslim population were not significantly different from those of the white population, but that travel agencies failed to market and promote their holidays in a culturally sensitive way. As a result, Asian consumers tend to use Asian specialist travel agents, who have a greater understanding of their needs, but who provide only a very limited travel service, usually in terms of arranging flight-only trips to the Asian subcontinent. The lack of cultural sensitivity and the limited recruitment of employees from minority ethnic

backgrounds were identified as significant barriers to the opening up of the 'mainstream' holiday market to minority ethnic consumers.

The problem of crime has been identified as a key concern among local businesses. For example, reducing crime and disorder was second in the list of priorities identified by local businesses (Bradford Chamber of Commerce and Industry, 2003). One study (Bradford Chamber of Commerce, 2001) found that almost 70 per cent of businesses in Bradford had been victims of crime (slightly higher than was the case regionally and ten percentage points above the national figure), but that one in ten of these did not report the crime to the police. The most frequently cited reason was a lack of confidence in the police response. The impact of crime can be wide-ranging, with businesses stating that trade disruption, higher insurance costs and low staff morale were the most common consequences. The financial costs can be high, with just over a fifth of those who had experienced crime indicating that it had cost them more than £10,000. Key measures identified for reducing crime included tougher sentencing, faster police response and grant assistance for security.

Key issues and research gaps

Current research that is available in relation to business and enterprise in Bradford is quite disparate, and there is clearly the potential to build on the standard business profile and performance information to develop a more robust picture of activity in the District.

While a number of issues are raised in the research covering business and enterprise, little is provided by way of effective solutions. The only exception to this is in relation to the travel sector where a series of recommendations are presented to encourage the sector to become more culturally aware and to employ more minority ethnic staff.

Some of the research that has been identified is focused on the contribution and role of minority ethnic groups in relation to business and enterprise in the District. Specifically, this includes a comparative analysis of entrepreneurship among Muslim and non-Muslim Asians, and an assessment of ethnic minorities as consumers in the travel sector. The common theme emerging from this research is that an awareness of the needs of the minority ethnic community, as both business owners and consumers of products, is required if the potential contribution of this section of the

population to the district's economy is to be realised. Research into the travel industry clearly demonstrated that minority ethnic groups, specifically Muslims, were not accessing mainstream travel services, as they perceived that they did not offer a service that was appropriate to their needs. While the research was specific to the travel sector, and did indicate that some other sectors were taking a more proactive role in attracting minority ethnic consumers, it is likely that the findings relating to cultural sensitivity in marketing and promotion can be more fully taken on board.

A number of areas where further information may be useful can be identified. These largely relate to areas where it is considered there is the need or potential for growth and development in the future, or where there appears currently to be a lack of information. They include:

- The contribution, performance and needs of the small business sector.
- The contribution, performance and needs of the Asian business sector, particularly an examination of the potential to help this sector to move into more value added activities.
- A wider assessment of the extent to which business marketing and promotional activities successfully attract the minority ethnic consumer.
- More sectoral research, building on the strengths of the District, including potential growth sectors and linking this into current government policy and the Regional Economic Strategy.
- An examination of the existence of and reasons for recruitment difficulties, linked to business perceptions that it is difficult to encourage staff to come to the region.
- An examination of questions of inward investment into the District, potential barriers to attracting firms from outside the area, and the most appropriate ways for inward investment activity to be encouraged.

6 Health, disability and social care

A broad range of social research was reviewed under the health and disability theme. The main areas were health and disease; health behaviours (in particular looking at cultural factors); access to information and services; and the organisation of health services.

Research included in the Review varied from small, in-depth studies to surveys across the District, and issues of scale and quality need to be taken into account in appraising the findings. There was a clear point of distinction between research done on Bradford with the primary purpose of understanding the health needs of the population and improving local service provision, and that carried out in Bradford for a range of purposes not explicitly concerned with benefiting the population – other than raising awareness of health needs generally or with specific reference to the South Asian community.

Much of the research was concerned with ethnicity and health and the different patterns of health and disease in the South Asian and non-Asian populations. Studies also examined the needs of black and minority ethnic service users and their experiences of health and social care. Clear findings on inequalities in health emerged; however, very few of the studies considered the impact of poverty and deprivation on health and healthcare.

Summary of findings

Health and disease

The high proportion of people from South Asia has attracted researchers interested in exploring the effect of ethnicity on health status. While there was no attempt to systematically compare disease patterns overall in South Asian and non-South Asian communities some specific differences were studied. For example, research on children found incidence rates for childhood diabetes to be similar in both groups. However, because the rate of increase is greater among Asian children, by 2010 they are expected to make up 45 per cent of the diabetic population in Bradford District, although only 33 per cent of the population as a whole (Feltblower et al, 2002). Cancer is slightly more common in South Asian children, but not significantly so. However the peak age is 5–9 for South Asian children compared with 0–4 for non-South Asian children (McKinney et al, 2003). Five year old Asian children had

significantly higher levels of dental disease (but not 12 year olds). Bradford has one of the highest levels of dental disease in the Yorkshire and Humber region (Godson, 2001, 2002). For both the 5 year old and 12 year old age groups there is variation in the prevalence of dental disease between areas, with the inner city having the highest levels.

In relation to visual impairment, boys have twice the rate of girls, and the rate is significantly higher in the Pakistani population (Schwartz et al, 2002). For adults, those registered as visually impaired tend to be younger in the Asian community than in the white population, with differences in clinical profile (Pardhan and Mahomed, 2002).

In the adult population the risk of ischaemic heart disease (IHD) is known to be high among South Asian communities. Risk markers would appear to be different between Asian and Caucasian men (Knight et al, 1993), which has implications for preventive strategies. IHD is also common in socially deprived areas, and Bradford has the second highest Standardised Mortality Ratio in England. The incidence of cancer among Asians is lower than the rate for the UK, with the exception of cancer of the hypopharynx in men and the gall bladder in women. However, lung and breast cancer rates are increasing to the level in non-Asians. This may be due to exposure to environmental and behavioural risk factors and also demographic changes (Barker and Baker, 1990). Some hereditary bleeding disorders are more common in the Pakistani population (Macheta, Minford and Parapia, 1997), while abdominal aortic aneurism is very much more common among the white population (Spark et al, 2001).

The prevalence of psychiatric disorders among Asian older people was high (depression 20 per cent, dementia 4 per cent and anxiety neurosis 4 per cent). Bhatnagar and Frank (1997) attribute this to break-up of close family ties, retirement, social isolation and low status within the host community.

Not all health related research in Bradford is focused on ethnicity or deprivation. For example Hillman et al (1996) explored factors associated with consulting health professionals about back pain. They predicted that the change in policy towards greater emphasis on primary care would result in increased demand for 'physical therapy'.

Health behaviours

Cultural and lifestyle factors can account for differences in health but need to be seen in the context of wider social and environmental determinants of health. Food and dietary patterns were one area of study. Jamal (1998) found that there had been relatively little change in the traditional diet of the Pakistani community – particularly among the older generations.

Parsons et al (1999) found that with regard to infant feeding in the Pakistani community there was little difference between first and second generations. Traditional foods were eaten at midday and in the evening but not at breakfast. Second generation parents were more likely to occasionally introduce Western foods. Godson and Williams (1996) also found no statistically significant differences in most infant feeding and dental hygiene practices between 3 year old children of UK born and Pakistan born mothers in the Bradford Pakistani community.

The research challenged some widely held assumptions about health behaviour. Eating disorders are often believed to be uncommon in non-Western societies and among non-Caucasians in the West. Mumford, Whitehouse and Platt (1991) found that the prevalence of bulimia was 0.6 per cent among Caucasian girls and 3.4 per cent among Asian girls. Asian girls showed more concern about food and weight than Caucasian girls and this was particularly so for girls with a more traditional cultural orientation. Asian girls may be adopting Western patterns of responding to personal conflict and stressful events such as tensions between traditional upbringing and their educational experience.

There is also a widely held view that drug use among Asian young people is uncommon, an assumption supported by the low use of drug services by Asians. However, research undertaken by Pearson and Patel (1998) found patterns of recreational drug use among Asian young men very similar to those in the white community. Arora and Khann (1998) also looked at substance use among Asian young people. They found that half had tried tobacco, a quarter drugs and an eighth alcohol. The study also found that parents had some accurate awareness of drug use in the area, but also some misconceptions, which appeared to be informed by media representations.

A more recent project undertaken in Keighley (Rehman et al, 2005) examined the extent and patterns of drug use within the South Asian community. The study concluded that younger Asian males were the most vulnerable to 'being drawn into using and dealing drugs' (2005, p. 4), and in an area where there were high unemployment rates, underachieving schools and poor housing, drugs were 'filling that void'. The most commonly used drugs were cited as Ecstasy, alcohol and cocaine.

Access to information and services

Research on access and service utilisation provided strong evidence of the existence of significant barriers across the spectrum of care from health advice through to long-term support needs. A study of twelve Bangladeshi diabetic patients (Rhodes, Nocon and Wright, 2003) illustrated how access to care was restricted at all points in the system, from seeking help and obtaining a diagnosis, to receiving regular check-ups. Lack of a common language was a significant barrier to good communication with health professionals but the study suggests that the underlying problem of poor quality care was more widespread.

Godson and Williams (1996) found that in the Pakistani community just under half of UK born and Pakistan born mothers had received dental advice, and there was a low level of awareness about antenatal classes. Second generation mothers were more likely to be aware of eligibility for free dental care, to have attended a dentist, and to have received advice there. Pardhan and Mahomed (2002) found that fewer older people were registered as visually impaired among the Asian population. Language and cultural factors may influence registration.

A study by Yoong et al (2005) into the take-up of hospital services by families with deaf children, however, found that there was no differential take-up of hospital services by Pakistani and white families, despite different risk profiles for childhood deafness for the two groups.

Baylies, Law and Mercer (1993) showed that the needs of black and minority ethnic psychiatric patients discharged from hospital were not being met. Factors affecting service utilisation included language and cultural barriers, inappropriate services, and poorly integrated aftercare services. Carers' support needs were not being addressed. The lack of attention to South Asian carers' needs is also confirmed by

Katbamna et al (2001). Walker and Ahmad (1994) point to the marginalisation of Asian and black elders in community care planning and delivery. Lack of mainstream provision resulted in many elderly people being cared for by informal carers or by the black and Asian voluntary sector. Opolot and Kyoyagala (2004) discuss the HIV related needs of asylum seekers and refugees from Sub-Saharan Africa. Many come from countries with a high prevalence of HIV and the reason for migration, the process and experiences on arrival may all be associated with exposure to risk factors. For many there is a sense of hopelessness about HIV/AIDS and low levels of awareness about the value of voluntary testing and the benefits of treatment. Poor relationships with GPs were reported.

In terms of drug related services, Rehman et al refer to the 'shame and honour ideology' (2005, p. 5) which acts as a barrier to seeking treatment, coupled with a lack of awareness about treatment services, and with services which are neither inviting nor culturally appropriate to their needs.

Language is a significant issue affecting access to health information. Communication barriers, limited language support services and poor cultural awareness were key themes in studies. A language needs assessment for Bradford Community Health Trust (Singh and Arora, 1995) found inadequate provision of language support. Around half of the service users had difficulties understanding or speaking English, including reading appointments letters or communicating with health workers. Pardhan, Mughal and Mahomed (2000) found that in a central area of Bradford 57 per cent of Asians aged over 50 with eye diseases wanted more information. Only 31 per cent of those with diabetes realised the importance of good control to reduce the risk of eye disease, and there was little understanding of the role of the optometrist. Overall the Review indicates that inadequate language support leads to low levels of awareness of available services, missed appointments, and a lack of opportunity for people to discuss problems or receive health advice. There has been some progress in Bradford in improving language support but unmet needs remain (Nazir, 2003).

Findings from a wide range of research studies highlight the importance of providing culturally sensitive services. Walker and Ahmad (1994) found evidence of discriminatory practices in community care. Another study (Cortis, 2000) found that Pakistani patients' expectations of caring were not met. The respondents wanted nurses to be friendly, listen and develop a relationship as part of caring but this was

not typical of their experiences. An important issue is the cross-cultural applicability of diagnostic tools. Bhatnagar and Frank (1997) question the accuracy of tools such as the Geriatric Mental Assessment Schedule for persons from different cultural backgrounds and those with lower levels of literacy.

Organisation of health services

Changes in national health policy led to the creation of four Primary Care Trusts (PCTs) covering the Bradford District. Research has highlighted differences in patterns of health provision between and within PCTs (Proctor and Campbell, 1999; Small and Proctor, 2001). A report of the implementation of clinical governance in Bradford South and West PCT found there was wide variation in the organisation of general practices. In Bradford City PCT, 55 per cent of the population are of South Asian origin. A salaried GP scheme, aimed at addressing GP recruitment and retention in the inner city, was reported to be successful and offered benefits to practices and doctors (Dickinson, Greasley and Small, 2002).

A study of the implementation of patient and public involvement in the PCTs found that there had been some progress made towards engaging the community and voluntary sector (South, 2004). There were other examples of service user involvement, in the development of primary care guidelines for South Asian carers (Katbamna et al, 2001) and in a service user research advisory group (Rhodes et al, 2002). Looking wider than health services, Glen (1993) argued for the importance of community practitioners in mobilising support to improve access to services in communities. The findings suggest that in 1993 the community work sector in Bradford was diverse, active and to some extent supported by public sector funding.

Overall there is an impression of a sense of commitment to community and user involvement by some Bradford service providers, combined with a willingness to innovate. There are, however, variations in service provision and many of the studies highlighted concerns about the capacity of health services to work with all communities and to deliver change.

Key issues and research gaps

On the whole there is little robust evidence about effective interventions. Many of the studies recommend more attention to the needs of the South Asian population, with a greater emphasis on communication, and provision of quality information can be

seen as a prerequisite for improving health and ensuring equitable access to services. It is clear that current provision addresses some of those aspects but there remains a need for more investment.

Inevitably there are gaps in knowledge. Research on health services has been undertaken, but very little research on social care and disability, although issues relating to disability and young people are referred to in the chapter on 'Children and young people' below. Notably, research investigating the experiences and perceptions of children and young people on health issues is limited.

Nationally (and internationally) there is an extensive literature on health inequalities. The Review finds a highlight on the health needs of specific population groups in Bradford but the almost exclusive focus on ethnicity may mask other health issues in the District.

Overall the Review provides strong evidence of inequalities but there is a need for more evaluations of successful methods to address barriers to health and healthcare. Additional areas for further research include:

- The perspectives of children and young people on health and healthcare.
- Generational differences in knowledge, attitudes and practices.
- Research that considers issues around gender and health.
- Disability and the management of long term illness.
- Methods of improving health information and advice to different population groups.
- The impact of poverty and deprivation on health and healthcare.
- Research that focuses upon the health aspects of environmental emissions, particularly by local industry.

7 Children and young people

Research on children and young people in Bradford District falls into four broad areas. First there are a number of user surveys with young people which examine issues such as knowledge about drugs or crime, the participation and inclusion of young people and young people's worries and concerns. Secondly research has been undertaken in order to capture and measure the achievements and aspirations of young people, with particular reference to education and employment. A third area is research around the role of parenting and families, including research into cultural upbringing. Finally a body of work exists on the experiences and needs of young disabled people.

Summary of findings

User surveys with young people

A number of studies have been undertaken which assess the quality, impact and appropriateness of youth and community projects or support services. Many of the studies are very small and focused on specific localities within Bradford District, and therefore many of the findings are specific to particular areas of Bradford District.

Many of the surveys focused on what young people in Bradford District do in their spare time and on understanding how to engage more young people in youth and community programmes. Other research has attempted to identify the key concerns of young people in terms of, for example, unemployment, education and crime. One survey examined attitudes and perceptions of crime among young people in Bradford (Swift Research Limited, 1996). This revealed a lack of confidence in the ability of the police to deal effectively with crime and a perceived 'drugs problem', as well as evidence of under-reporting of crime. The survey also provided evidence of under-reporting of crime among young people.

Achievements and aspirations of young people

A number of research studies have been undertaken on the future intentions of young people in terms of employment and education. A longitudinal study of young people in Bradford District (Walton, 2000) found a significant degree of optimism about future employment opportunities. Nevertheless there were variations across different communities, with higher levels of pessimism about future opportunities among Pakistani and Indian respondents. Pakistani and Indian respondents tended

to be more concerned than white respondents that they would not be able to obtain the type of job that they would like. Key issues emerged around guidance facilities, access to Jobcentres, newspapers, local libraries and independent careers advice services.

Other work on the aspirations of young people has been undertaken by Katz (2002) as part of a larger national study. This research highlighted a number of concerns of young people in Bradford District, and benchmarked these against the national situation. For example, despite feeling that they had the same basic abilities as their peers, fewer than half of those questioned felt positive about the future or believed they would achieve their goals in life, and only one in ten felt they had the necessary 'life skills' compared to 34 per cent at the national level.

Both Walton (2000) and Katz (2002) highlighted the importance of parental advice in future education and career choices. This was viewed as being more important than the advice of teachers, careers advisers or friends, a critical issue for some communities where, according to research, many spoke very little English.

Parenting and families

A substantial body of research has been undertaken on parenting and family role and values focused upon Bradford District. Much of this research concentrates on the specific needs and concerns of minority ethnic groups, particularly the Pakistani and Bangladeshi communities.

The studies emphasise that family values, religion, culture and ethnicity are central to how young Pakistani people define themselves and are defined by others within the wider community. Young people make sense of these values in the context of their own lives and, perhaps unsurprisingly, the symbolic meanings of Pakistani origin for parents, grandparents and young people are different. For many parents and grandparents the link with Pakistan is through lived memories of past, kinship and friendship. For young people born and brought up in Bradford there is still the feeling that they need to seek the meaning of their roots and engage with their parents' and grandparents' past, but the importance of Pakistani origin for them depends on the actual presence of kin and material and symbolic links with Pakistan. These links vary between families. Wider perceptions of Pakistani origin and Islam also play a role in how young people see these links.

Other research looks at differences in terms of play culture. For example, a comparative analysis of 8 year olds in schools across Keighley (Curtis, 2000) found that schools with a large Asian population show differences in their play culture compared with schools with predominantly white pupils. The paper examines the Asian culture in Keighley and identifies several reasons for the existence of a separate play culture, including a stronger oral tradition among Punjabi-speaking families, and the existence of intergenerational households with close ties to relatives who live nearby and close links with Pakistani communities who live in other areas of the UK.

Assessment of need and access to services

A number of studies have focused upon the assessment of needs and the take-up of health and social services by young people. In research financed by the Community Fund (Chattoo, Atkin and McNeish, 2004) the influence of culture on the lives of young Pakistani people is analysed in terms of its impact on the design and delivery of health and social care services to this particular group. The report found that health and social care practices reflect a Western ethnocentric view and, consequently, the questions arising about health and social care for minority ethnic families tend to be focused upon the different cultural practices and lifestyles of minority ethnic communities. At the same time, stereotypes of Asian, and in particular Pakistani, families as 'taking care of their own' often mean that their needs are not recognised or that there is an assumption by health workers that the extended family will help or that young people 'have a duty to care for their own'.

A substantial body of research has been undertaken on the needs of young disabled people (see, for example, Priestley, Rabiee, and Harris, 2003; Rabiee, Priestley and Knowles, 2001; C. Harris et al, 2002). The research has found that although young South Asian people were over-represented in the local disabled population, they were under-represented among young disabled people using 'looked after' services. Specifically, young Asian disabled people were much less likely to use overnight stays away from home than their peers from other ethnic backgrounds.

The studies also found that the range of contact for disabled children in care with family and foster parents varied considerably. Continuity of family contact was particularly difficult for those young people moved from one place to another or

placed outside of the authority. For those disabled young people who had the stability of long term foster care, it was sometimes assumed by social workers that they would simply stay with their foster families with little or no change when they reached adulthood.

Many disabled leavers from care, many with learning difficulties, fell through the gap between mainstream services and disability services. Children labelled as having 'severe learning difficulties' were more likely to stay on at school. Going to college was a popular option, although more and more colleges appeared to be taking on young disabled people who had nowhere else to go and specialist units in FE colleges were functioning as day care centres in all but name. Residential institutions offering accommodation to adults with learning difficulties were increasingly being renamed as 'colleges'. Some childcare social workers lacked knowledge about independent living options for disabled people and saw specialist residential placements as more appropriate. The range of accommodation options presented to young disabled people was often determined by vacancies in existing adult services rather than by the needs or wishes of the young people themselves.

Furthermore, research suggested that young disabled people lacked the information they needed to make informed decisions about their futures. Many were dependent on adults for their information. Young disabled people who did not have adult advocates (such as parents or long term foster parents) to argue on their behalf were often at a disadvantage in accessing information and making decisions.

Finally a number of research studies have been undertaken on child sexual abuse in Asian communities. This has focused on the needs of children and their parents and carers (Bokhari et al, 1996), on barriers to the disclosure of child sexual abuse (Gilligan with Akhtar, forthcoming b) and on developing materials to raise awareness of child sexual abuse (Gilligan with Akhtar, forthcoming a).

Key issues and research gaps

Much of the research that has been undertaken on children and young people in Bradford District focuses on the needs of quite specific groups within the community. Nevertheless there is clearly the potential to build on existing research to create a more comprehensive understanding of issues and themes. Some of the research on

young people, particularly some studies of how young people consume services, is now quite dated.

There are also several calls within the research for partnership working and for joined up thinking that uses community outreach to engage young people and their families, especially those from minority communities. The use of peer education revolving around friendship networks has been highlighted as a method of raising drugs awareness among young people.

Key areas for further research include:

- More up to date studies on children and young people, particularly focusing on their use of key services.
- Further work on how services can best be tailored to meet the needs of children and young people, and to remove barriers that might be preventing them from accessing services.
- Investigation of the views, attitudes and perceptions of young people from the communities within Bradford District where relatively little research has been undertaken, including the white community, the African Caribbean and Indian communities, as well as among the growing Chinese population and asylum seekers and refugees.

8 Education, skills and the labour market

A range of types of data sources and research were identified in terms of education, skills and the labour market. Many of the studies refer to official government statistics, which enable Bradford District as a whole to be benchmarked against the UK, region and subregion. A number of studies also outline relevant aspects of Bradford's recent history in relation to developments in local industry and the consequent effects for residents learning or working in the city. The findings from contemporary research are supplemented by several reports published in previous decades, and taken together they help reveal patterns of continuity and change in the district. Yet these patterns often refer to dimensions of disadvantage that have affected much of the local population over the last 20 or so years.

Research identified for this theme can be broadly placed within two general perspectives. Much of the quantitative research addresses, either together or separately, the educational attainment, the skills base or skills needs, and the labour market profile of Bradford District in general. Most of the qualitative studies concentrate on the situation or experiences of particular groups within the city.

Summary of findings

Educational attainment (pre 16)

Formal government statistics indicate that education attainment in schools across Bradford District as a whole is below the national and regional average. For example, in terms of attainment of GCSEs and equivalent in 2004, 39.9 per cent of 15 year olds gained five or more GCSEs (graded A*–C), compared to 47.1 per cent in Yorkshire and Humber and 53.7 per cent in England. When data is considered from a longitudinal perspective, however, it is clear that the gap between Bradford District and the regional and national levels has narrowed in recent years. Education remains a critical issue for the District, and this has been reflected in a number of significant policy developments in relation to education.

It is beyond the scope of the Review to mine educational statistics in detail; rather it focuses upon research studies which explain and explore some of the issues in relation to education in Bradford District.

Many studies on education in Bradford have looked individually at the educational attainment and experiences of different communities. For example, in 2003 the Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire published the findings of a study into the learning experiences of minority ethnic communities (Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire, 2003a).

The cohort of Indian males who were interviewed as part of the study reported experiencing 'general enjoyment and fulfilment' in their educational experiences, reflecting perhaps the higher level of educational attainment among the city's Indian community: a majority of the respondents were following education courses in fields such as law, pharmacy, psychology and mathematics.

Pakistani men similarly reported very positive attitudes towards education. Those in the group who were parents were particularly pleased with the positive experiences of education evident among their children. Responses from the Pakistani women interviewed were also broadly positive, yet the report recommends that the city's educational and training opportunities need to cater better for Muslim women, who need readily available women-only courses.

Bangladeshi men interviewed as part of the same study valued educational qualifications, but it was felt that it was only in combination with vocational skills that educational attainment would be rewarded in the labour market. However, many of the men worked in their family's restaurant business and did not feel the need to access educational programmes.

Among the Bangladeshi women interviewed, where only three out of 27 were first generation migrants, Bengali remained the primary language used. In another study, Kotler, Wegerif and LeVoi (2001) state that among the Bangladeshi and Pakistani communities, a large proportion of school pupils have English as an additional language (EAL). They recommend a system of 'talking partners' be introduced in the city's schools to help with some pupils' oracy skills as a means to help reverse the current trend where EAL pupils achieve results in English tests at age 7 in line with the national average but then see these results plummet in tests undertaken at age 11.

An ESRC-funded study which reported in 2000 focused specifically on the transition from school to work, concentrating on issues of gender and ethnicity (Husband,

2000). Given the spread of GCSE results achieved by Bradford school pupils in previous years, the report concluded that every second pupil in the questionnaire cohort would not receive the results they anticipated. Indeed, this projection would increase to two in every three among pupils from Asian or African-Caribbean backgrounds.

Skills and learning (post 16)

An up to date collection of data and statistics in relation to skills and learning published by the Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire (2005b) provides a comprehensive assessment of the current situation with regard to skills in the District. Drawing on a range of data sources, it identifies a number of key concerns in relation to basic skills, qualifications and workforce development. In particular, it documents the low level of basic skills within the District (Bradford District has four out of the ten worst wards in terms of basic skills in West Yorkshire).

A number of research projects have been undertaken in the District in relation to skills and training. These have addressed this issue from a number of different perspectives. A recent study commissioned by the Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire provides the most comprehensive and up to date assessment of skill levels across Bradford District (Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire, 2005a). This study, based on a telephone survey of Bradford residents, found that 23 per cent of the population within the District held no qualifications. Qualifications tended to be towards the lower end of the scale, when compared to West Yorkshire as a whole.

Research by Husband (2000), drawing on a series of focus groups with a cross-section of Bradford young people undertaking vocational training, found that participants on New Deal programmes felt that they were simply 'cheap labour' for employers, yet the majority reported positive experiences of training and said that the providers offered a supportive learning environment.

A study commissioned by Bradford Trident (MORI, 2001) focused on employment and training issues specifically in the Little Horton New Deal for Communities area. This found that 45 per cent of employed respondents had participated in some type of education or training course in the previous 12 months, with the majority of these employees having received specific work-related training. This was much lower than

levels across the District as whole. For example, research undertaken on behalf of the Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire (2005c) found that 58 per cent across the District as a whole had undertaken training in the last year (compared to 61 per cent in West Yorkshire). Levels of training were much lower for older workers, white workers and those employed in small businesses (fewer than ten employees).

A representative sample of 400 Bradford businesses (Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire, 2003b) were asked to indicate the best potential ways to solve their recruitment difficulties. The majority of businesses in the manufacturing and retail sectors indicated that the provision of more and better training was key; for construction and distribution firms, the main answer was to recruit more apprentices; transport companies believed that job stability, a more diverse workforce and an improved sector image would benefit them; for public service organisations, the answer was to improve salaries; while those companies operating in finance believed that a higher profile for the sector would benefit recruitment.

Identifying barriers to learning and reasons for non-participation is an area which has been investigated in a study published in 2002 (Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire, 2002). While the study covers the whole of the subregion, some characteristics of non-learners in Bradford District are presented. The study identified a series of conditions necessary to re-engage non-learners, including a range of motivators, desirable factors, and essential factors. It also described areas of the District where the 'most hardcore non-learners' were located, in particular some of the outer lying estates, such as Holmewood, inner city areas such as Little Horton and smaller towns including parts of Shipley and Keighley.

The labour market

Under the classifications of the Index of Multiple Deprivation, Bradford is the most deprived District of any in West Yorkshire. Thirty-four per cent of the local population lives in wards that rank with the 10 per cent worst wards in the country. A third of Bradford's residents are income deprived – the fifth worst District in the country – and four of the five inner city wards lie in the top 2 per cent of deprived wards in England and Wales.

In 2004, according to official figures, the unemployment rate for Bradford District as a whole stood at 4.6 per cent. While the District has more usually – throughout a period

over the last 25 years of deindustrialisation and loss of manufacturing jobs – experienced levels of unemployment higher than regional averages, the most recent figures indicate that rates are slightly lower than levels in both West Yorkshire and the region (Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire, 2005b). These figures, however, mask considerable geographical variation, with the highest rates in the inner city wards. They also mask ‘hidden unemployment’, particularly the shift of claimants to other forms of benefit.

There are limitations in the data, particularly official figures in terms of unemployment in relation to ethnicity. Census data, quoted by the Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire (2005b), suggest that unemployment does vary by ethnicity, with 24 per cent of all those unemployed being from the Pakistani community.

In 2004, Bradford District accounted for 9 per cent of all regional employment, and 21 per cent of subregional employment. In the same year, the economic activity rate for all those of working age in the District was 75.1 per cent, which is the lowest rate in West Yorkshire. Participant rates for different communities vary widely, with the lowest rates being in the Bangladeshi and Pakistani communities.

A high proportion of the District’s employees worked in process plant and machine occupations, and in administrative, secretarial and elementary occupations. Bradford has a relatively low wage economy: the latest available figures indicate that average full-time earnings are below the levels for West Yorkshire as a whole (Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire, 2005b). A related area, and one that is highly pertinent to Bradford District, is dealt with by Ballard (2003) in work on remittances and their economic impact within the home country in areas of mass overseas migration. This work suggests that remittances are not being invested in productive areas or into infrastructure within the home country, which is where investment is needed, and the author notes that migrant workers are ‘skilled and for the most part successful entrepreneurs’ (2003, p. 4).

While official figures go some way to providing a picture of the labour market within Bradford District, further research has been undertaken on some of the underlying issues.

A number of studies have focused on the transition faced by young people when they enter the labour market, particularly highlighting the differential experiences of young people from different communities and backgrounds.

An early study undertaken in 1982 found that only 28 per cent were in regular employment a year after leaving school (Campbell and Jones, 1982). However, although all the respondents had achieved broadly similar educational attainment, and despite a rapid deterioration in the Bradford labour market at the time, unemployment among the Asian school-leavers was disproportionately higher than among non-Asians. Moreover, many of these young Asians had sought work with the same employers who had hired non-Asian school-leavers.

The ESRC-funded study, which reported in 2000, also focused on the transition from school to work, in particular examining issues around gender and ethnicity (Husband, 2000). In this study, Asian school-leavers believed that they would suffer some form of religious or racial discrimination in the labour market. And indeed, the responses gained from the cohort of 20–25 year olds revealed ethnicity and gender to be powerful features in shaping their experiences of both education and work. Furthermore, these young people's experiences pointed to significant 'churning' in Bradford's increasingly flexible labour market. Among all groups, and especially working class young people, biographies of a range of low skilled, low paid jobs, along with periods of unemployment, were common. Interviews with employers, however, indicated they were primarily interested in a job candidate's generic qualities – such as 'flexibility', 'people skills' and 'the right attitude' – rather than their ethnic background.

A further study (Johnson and Burden, 2003), funded by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation, looked at the initial experiences of young people entering the labour market for the first time after leaving school, college or university. This study highlighted the importance of the induction process and the value placed on employability and work experience by employers, issues that, while the study was undertaken within Bradford District, are likely to have a wider resonance.

Research conducted for the 'Fair Cities' initiative, which is designed to increase job opportunities for all minority ethnic groups, concluded that people from minority ethnic communities face many barriers to employment such as discrimination and stereotyping by employers (Back to Work Company, 2003). It also recognised the

dangers of grouping minority ethnic communities together as a single community seen to have the same needs and issues.

Key issues and research gaps

Much of the research that has been undertaken on education, skills and labour markets is descriptive rather than prescriptive. However, several of the larger scale reports call for further related research to be conducted longitudinally. Future studies conducted in the District could well reveal the degree of success of a range of initiatives and intended improvements in provision and services for Bradford residents.

The research included in this theme summary provides quite a comprehensive picture of skills and the labour market within the District. Bradford is a multicultural District seeking to address long term disadvantage in certain deprived areas and among much of its minority ethnic population; it is attempting to improve its education and training provision for both children and adults; and it is also experiencing local effects of widespread structural labour market change.

Future research examining and evaluating these efforts and experiences would provide important information for the District. Specific themes for future research include:

- An examination of the reasons for the relatively low rate of labour market participation among different groups in the Bradford labour market.
- Following on from this, a consideration of barriers to training and employment, focusing on the links between employment and other factors, including social capital, education, health, housing, transport and discrimination.
- Studies examining participation in labour market programmes and use of Jobcentre Plus services from the viewpoint of the service user.
- Investigation of the potential of self-employment to alleviate problems associated with low rates of labour market participation

9 Crime and community safety

Research into issues around crime and community safety focuses both on the use of official statistics and data to assess actual levels of crime and more in-depth research investigating particular aspects of crime. Areas covered in this section include research on patterns of crime, research on community safety (including perceptions of crime and fear of crime), and specific questions around youth and race in relation to crime.

Summary of findings

Crime patterns

In terms of the general picture of crime in the Bradford District, according to the Safer Communities Audit 2004 (City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council, 2004) there has been an overall reduction in the total number of recorded crimes of 16 per cent between 2001/02 and 2003/04. The overall crime rate for Bradford District was slightly higher than the average for England and Wales. Crime levels vary widely within the District, however, with higher levels of crime experienced, in general terms, in the south and east of the District, in particular some of the outer lying housing estates and some inner city areas.

In terms of domestic burglary, offences fell by 28 per cent between 2001/02 and 2003/04, to the lowest number of burglaries recorded in the District for over a decade. Similarly vehicle crime has fallen by 25 per cent and robbery by 42 per cent over the same period.

Official statistics indicate that there has been an increase in levels of violent crime, rising by 133 per cent between 2001/02 and 2003/04. These figures should be treated with caution, however, due to changes in the way that violent crime is recorded. The violent crime rate in Bradford is below that of most of the other cities included by the Home Office in the same 'family' for comparison purposes. In terms of 'hate' crime, reported incidents of domestic abuse have increased by 29 per cent, occurring mainly in former council housing estates. Among victims of domestic abuse 87 per cent were female.

The number of racist incidents was slightly above the West Yorkshire average. Nearly half the incidents involved abuse, and approximately one in five involved

violence. Another important category of hate crime involves homophobic incidents. These are now being systematically recorded. Verbal abuse was the largest single category (39 per cent); however, a significant proportion involved assault and wounding (28 per cent). More than half of the victims were male, 50 per cent were white and 38 per cent were Asian.

Drug related crime is believed to be relatively high but no figures are produced under this heading. In Bradford, as elsewhere, there are clear links between drugs and crime. These links occur because people commit crimes in order to pay for drugs, but they may also commit crimes while under the influence of drugs. There are also large numbers of alcohol related crimes where people commit offences while intoxicated. This is a major factor in more than half of violent crimes and the vast majority of cases of criminal damage.

The number of arrests for drug dealing has increased, this being a priority for the police, although the number of arrests for possession has decreased, for the opposite reason. Half of all drug seizures consist of cannabis, with a third of the total consisting of heroin. Crack cocaine and cocaine make up about 5 per cent of the total of seizures.

Over 160,000 incidents of various kinds were reported to the police: 28 per cent involved crimes, 22 per cent disorder, 13 per cent traffic issues, 7 per cent were alarms going off, and 30 per cent were classified as 'miscellaneous'. The peak time for disorder was Saturday evening.

According to the official statistics youth crime has fallen by 2 per cent over a 4 year period. The most common offences are theft and handling. There are also considerable numbers of cases of violence, vehicle theft, and arson or criminal damage. Most of the offences are committed by males. The peak age is 16–17.

Arson attacks appear to have risen by around 50 per cent over a 4 year period. The rate in Bradford is above average. The most common targets set alight are road vehicles, schools and homes. The vast majority of these incidents, almost 80 per cent, involve road vehicles. The main reasons are insurance fraud and joyriding. The arson cases dealt with by the fire service are frequently not recorded in police statistics. Other offences concerning the fire service are malicious false alarms, and attacks on fire crews, 58 in a 12 month period up to March 2001.

Anti-social behaviour is a category of behaviour defined under the Crime and Disorder Act 1998. It is not recorded as such in the crime statistics since the activities which can be deemed to be anti-social need not themselves be criminal. The data in the audit predate the more widespread use of anti-social behaviour orders.

Community perceptions

Fear of crime figures for 2000 were very similar to those for 1998. The crimes about which people were most fearful were burglary, vandalism to a car, theft from a car, and theft of a car. People also provided information about their concerns about the likelihood of being a victim, as a way to measure their sense of security. Over half of those questioned thought they were very or quite likely to be a victim, within 12 months, of the offences of theft of, damage to, or theft from a vehicle; 49 per cent thought they were quite or very likely to be a victim of domestic burglary. The proportion of people who thought crime had increased, for a number of crimes, was substantially greater than those who thought it had decreased.

Personal safety was also assessed by recording the numbers of people feeling unsafe undertaking various activities. The numbers feeling fairly or very unsafe during daylight hours exceeded 50 per cent for those making use of cash machines or car parks. The figures for those feeling very or fairly unsafe during hours of darkness were much higher, reaching 92 per cent for those in parkland areas; the figure fell to 33 per cent for those at out of town shopping centres after dark, while 39 per cent felt fairly or very unsafe while driving.

The majority of people took a range of precautions to reduce their chances of being a victim of crime. The most common were leaving lights on in the house when they went out, avoiding particular places after dark, and reducing the amount of cash they carried when they went out. Forty per cent would go out with someone else rather than alone; 25 per cent used taxis rather than walk or use public transport; and 24 per cent never go out after dark.

Views on the police are mixed. The response time for incidents is criticised as being too long. Many people believe that the different ethnic minorities are not treated in an even-handed fashion. Over 90 per cent view having more police officers on foot patrol as an effective way of making them feel safer. So far as the priorities of the

police are concerned, the following tasks were seen as important or very important by more than 60 per cent of respondents: ensuring an immediate response to emergencies, investigating crime, enforcing drink–drive laws, dealing with vandalism, patrolling by foot, and providing help and support to victims.

Youth crime

A major victim study with a focus on Asian and white young people was carried out in a survey undertaken in Keighley between 1988 and 1993 (Webster, 1996). The research was designed to give a clear picture of the level and form of racial harassment involving white and Asian youths in the area. The research was designed to improve knowledge of both offending and the experience of being a victim.

The research found that racial abuse and violence were much less likely to be reported than many other types of crime. A third of the young people interviewed had been a victim of a criminal offence or a number of offences, and half of these had reported incidents to the police. The proportion of white young people who said that they had been a victim was greater than the proportion of Asians.

A significant finding of the research involved the need to think more carefully about what 'racism' and 'racial motivation' meant to the young people in the area. Racism was understood in terms of actual experiences of being victimised, and of feeling fearful about particular areas. Racism was not viewed in terms of injustice or discrimination, or in terms of the perceived inferiority or superiority of the other group. It was more likely to be viewed as involving unfairness about who gets what, and in terms of freedom to go to particular places without feeling threatened. Both white and Asian groups in the research felt that their 'identity' and freedom were threatened by the other group.

One piece of research dealt with a range of projects designed to address the issue of youth crime in the Little Horton area of Bradford (Hawtin and Percy-Smith, 2004). The report provides very brief summary descriptions of 13 projects and looked in more detail at four key projects. These included an Intensive Supervision and Surveillance Programme for persistent offenders, a Youth Inclusion Programme for young people in the 13–16 age group, the Prince's Trust volunteer scheme funding young people from the Bradford Trident area to complete courses, and a Home–

School Mediation project to deal with conflicts between young people and their families.

Successful projects were seen to have a clear rationale in terms of the theoretical approach to crime on which they were based. Targeting young people at risk of offending seemed to be effective. Partnership working between statutory agencies and the community and voluntary sector also appeared to be an important factor in success. Involvement and engagement of young people in the management and delivery of the services appeared important.

Race crime

In relation to crime, the issue of race and ethnicity emerged in a number of research studies, although some of these are now quite dated. In the main, the focus of the research was on the extent to which different ethnic groups had a distinctive pattern of crime compared to that found in other ethnic groups, whether other minorities or the white population. A number of areas of crime were covered in these papers, including crime generally, racial attacks, disorder, and domestic violence. The methods used in these papers varied considerably. Some were based on qualitative ethnographic research involving interviews with participants. Others employed statistical comparisons. The sources of data for these were either the official statistics, or data gathered from surveys in the area.

A feature of this research, given the contentious theoretical status of 'race', was an interest in conceptual development. There were also attempts in places to engage with significant theoretical debates within criminology. Another aspect taken up in several of the papers concerned the kinds of social changes going on within the minority communities in Bradford and their relationship to observed, or perceived, national trends.

Two of the studies examined, which were published in the early 1980s (Mawby and Batta, 1980; Batta, Mawby and McCulloch, 1981), constitute an extended examination of Asian crime rates in Bradford. They also include a comparative historical analysis of crime rates in different societies among first and second generation immigrants. These show generally low rates in the first generation, with an increase in the second. Comparison is also made between West Indian and Asian youths in Bradford.

So far as adult crime rates were concerned, the research shows that in the 1970s both adult and juvenile crime rates for Asian groups were lower than those for whites. Comparisons are also made between different Asian groups, in particular between Indians and Pakistanis. The author ascribes the relatively low crime rates of the Asian minority groups to their distinctive culture

One study dealt with disorderly behaviour among Asian youths (Goodey, 2001). The study was based on in-depth interviews with Pakistan youths in Bradford. The key question underlying the research was whether or not it was true that crime rates among young Pakistanis were increasing. The author was also interested in the public depiction of this group, particularly by the media. It was also noted that there was evidence from the early 1980s that crime rates among young Pakistanis were lower than those among young African Caribbean males. The main explanation offered for this was the close-knit solidarity of the Pakistani community.

Reference is also made in this study to changes in the perception of the Asian minority resulting from a series of events; the Southall riots in 1976, the Salman Rushdie affair in 1989, and the Bradford riots in 1995. All of these tended to shift the stereotype towards one with more stress on violence and aggression. The author adopts 'labelling theory' to suggest that these depictions may be a factor explaining the behaviour of young people. In other words, there is evidence of this community becoming more assertive, and of the white community responding by depicting it in a different fashion.

One study (Webster, 1994) examined the problem of interracial violence between young teenagers. A variety of methods were employed, including a sample survey, a cohort study of 70 victims and perpetrators lasting 4 years, and a follow-up study of 65 young people. The survey involved a representative group of 412 young people in the age range 13–19.

The survey findings showed there had been a decline in the levels of violence against Asian young people. An interesting element in the findings was that white young people reported having been victims of violent racism and abuse more than Asians. Some of the factors they referred to involved changing perspectives and actions on behalf of Asian young people. Some of the decrease was due to organised self-defence on the part of Asian young people. This involved a form of

what the author describes as 'informal vigilantism'. This helped Asian areas to become seen as no-go areas for whites. Alcohol use among whites fuelling racial violence had also declined. Some links between white and Asian young people had developed, particularly in terms of Asians supplying young white people with drugs. Asian young people had also started using local youth clubs, which helped to increase their sense of ethnic solidarity.

Work by Macey (1999a, 1999b) examined Pakistani male violence in both the public sphere, such as the community, and the private sphere, the family. For both studies, data was collected over a 4 year period from a range of people, including students, prostitutes, people who had experienced domestic violence, those who worked with these groups, and drug project staff. The focus of one of the papers (Macey, 1999a) was on public order issues, especially the disorders associated with the Bradford disturbances of 1995 (see chapter 3 above for further analysis and discussion of the disturbances in 1995 and 2001). In the other, the author applied the analysis mainly to issues relating to violence against women (Macey, 1999b).

In each of the articles the author shows how religion is used to justify violence. So far as women are concerned this violence occurs both in the public sphere and in the private sphere. The violence is related to attempts to enforce what are viewed as religiously appropriate forms of female behaviour. It is often related to issues which are seen to be connected to family and community honour, where religion plays a key part. The family and the community are dishonoured if women refuse to follow traditional religious norms of dress, marriage, family orientation and sexual and leisure behaviour. In public they may be harassed by young males in an attempt to enforce traditional religious norms.

The theoretically significant point about these arguments is that religion is highlighted over and against ethnicity. The violence in the community and the family is also seen to be driven not by white racism but by the attempt to enforce existing and traditional cultural norms within the Asian community.

The subject of domestic violence is also taken up in a report which considers the past and future provision of refuge facilities for women from minorities who are victims of domestic violence (Thiara and Rai, 1998). This document was produced for the Manningham Housing Association and was designed to lay down principles for the establishment of a successful refuge for women in these circumstances. Work was

undertaken through interviews with project workers and agency representatives, a postal questionnaire to relevant organisations, and an examination of documentary evidence.

It mainly deals with practical issues, drawing on lessons of past failure to identify key principles for the effective establishment of a new service to provide a refuge for minority ethnic women who experience domestic violence. It does not take up any significant theoretical or conceptual problems. The approach is 'administrative'.

Another relevant study (Bernard et al, 2003) was designed to consider gang activity among young people in the 13–18 year old age group in five towns or cities in West Yorkshire. This research was intended to provide a basis for the establishment of a strategy for the early identification of young people becoming involved in gangs, and to develop preventive and diversionary activities to head this off. One of the areas subject to study was Bradford. The report includes a short case study of the work undertaken in Bradford.

It examined gang activity in four areas of the city. A gang was defined as a self-formed group with recognised symbols, leadership, territory and collective actions to carry out crimes. It found groups of young people which largely fitted this definition of a gang in West Bowling, Heaton and Girdlington.

These groups generally involved young Pakistani males; they were relatively aggressive but the level of criminality was relatively low among these 'gangs' and most of their activities would be more normally described as anti-social behaviour. The research did not find evidence of the kind of serious organised crime referred to in the research objectives, where reference was made to the 'new and alarming phenomenon' of 'violent car jackings, premeditated gangland slayings, drive-by shootings, and co-ordinated robberies of person'.

Key issues and research gaps

Success in the quest for effective solutions was not a key element in much of the research considered. The reasons for this are that some of the pieces were academic in nature rather than being policy oriented. In others, where solutions were offered, they were not necessarily of a generalised kind, or based on evidence. This

was the case with the proposals made in relation to the establishment of a refuge for minority ethnic women experiencing domestic violence.

The one exception to this concerned the two pieces of research on different elements in the area of Plural Policing. In the case of both the Street Wardens, and the Police Community Support Officers, it was shown that they did provide at least a partial solution to improving the visibility of policing and to increasing the level of reassurance of the public and reducing fear of crime in the areas where they were operating.

There is a considerable amount of primary and secondary data available on crime and community safety within Bradford District. Nevertheless a number of research gaps may be identified. These include:

- Further comparative work on minority ethnic communities in other countries in the area of race, racism and policing.
- Further comparative work on different ethnic minorities in different local contexts and their perceptions and behaviour relating to crime and relations with official agencies such as the police and schools.
- A comprehensive depiction of community safety perceptions and fear of crime, based on a systematic sample of the Bradford population. This would need to be broken down by different groups, allowing an analysis by gender, age, area of residence and ethnicity.

10 Bradford: a future research agenda

Overview of research on Bradford District

The Review has identified a wealth of research studies and papers on Bradford District. These reflect a wide range of approaches and methodologies, ranging from academic papers through to much more practitioner orientated studies.

The Review undertook a comprehensive search of relevant databases, utilised online searches and accessed relevant documentation through a range of organisations, networks and individuals within Bradford District. It is interesting to note that, largely due to the diverse population in Bradford District, many national studies have been undertaken on Bradford, frequently using Bradford as a case study and comparing findings with other cities. Further to this it should be noted that many of the research findings are not peculiar to Bradford District; many of the findings will have wider applicability to other areas. Similarly research focused on other localities will have important implications and findings relevant to Bradford District, but this is beyond the scope of this Review.

A key issue that has been raised in relation to the Review is whether Bradford District has been 'over-researched'? Based on the evidence we have gathered it is clear that while a great deal of material has been identified, there remain significant gaps in knowledge and understanding about Bradford District. It may be that the trend towards increasing amounts of consultation of service users, for example, or through community planning processes, is conflated with social research that seeks to understand Bradford District.

A considerable proportion of research on social issues in Bradford District has focused on its minority ethnic communities, and in particular the Pakistani and Bangladeshi communities that suffer the highest levels of deprivation. This focus is justified; however, there is a danger that problems facing other sections of the community are not being addressed sufficiently in social research in the District. A key point is also that much of this research explores effects rather than causality in terms of issues such as poverty, deprivation, social exclusion and so on.

A further consideration is the fact that, despite the wealth of information on some of Bradford's minority ethnic communities, only a small proportion of research studies (for example Farnell et al, 2003) provide a robust comparative dimension, either in

relation to other groups within the District or with similar groups in other similar cities in the UK or overseas. Moreover, the interaction between different groups – including between faith groups within the minority ethnic communities – is not covered in great depth in the research that has been reviewed.

As noted in chapter 2, Bradford's economy, labour market and society are inextricably connected to the wider subregional and regional environment, and mapping the extent and nature of relationships between different groups (social, ethnic, spatial) in Bradford and the wider West Yorkshire conurbation would make a useful contribution to our understanding of social dynamics in the District. This might include, for example, travel patterns in relation to education, employment, and social and family relationships.

Overall the process of undertaking the Review has emphasised the complexity of a city such as Bradford, of the range of issues facing the city, and of the processes that shape the District as a whole. There is therefore a need to avoid oversimplistic analyses of the evidence and the adoption of untested or inappropriate solutions to social 'problems'.

A future research agenda

The individual themes covered in the Review summarise findings from a large number of research studies, all with varying aims, remits and audiences. It is therefore a significant challenge to identify clear messages from such a broad range of material.

Nevertheless it is clear from reviewing the evidence that it is possible to identify a number of common findings and areas for further work. These include:

- A need for more comparative work: between areas and groups in Bradford; with other areas in the subregion; and with other areas with similar characteristics in the UK and overseas.
- More attention to gender related issues, particularly in terms of the position and role of Muslim women.
- Questions about the accessibility of services by key groups within the community, in particular where there are language and cultural barriers. These barriers have significant implications for services such as care, health and housing, all of which

will have a major impact on those most likely to experience poverty and deprivation.

- More investigation of the complex link between deprivation and other aspects of the Review such as health, economic status, housing, opportunity and access to services. Furthermore there is a case for research to focus more specifically on the causes rather than the effects of problems such as poverty and deprivation.
- Consideration of the broad range of geographical differences, prompting the need for geographically targeted research, including more research in outlying towns and rural areas.
- Studies of the effects of poverty and deprivation where they converge within particular concentrated geographical areas.

In terms of the individual themes covered by this Review a number of more specific areas of possible future research may be identified:

Community cohesion

- Research that contributes to an understanding of the socio-economic and ethno-cultural circumstances of other communities in Bradford District.
- A more in-depth understanding of factors that contribute to racism in the city and wider District, and whether or not local initiatives have had any impact on reducing the incidence of intercommunity violence.
- Collection of robust empirical data on excluded communities in the city and wider District.
- Research examining the rich history of community action within Bradford District, its relationship with the state, and how this can be used to inform contemporary efforts at community engagement.

Housing, neighbourhoods and regeneration

- Research that unpicks some of issues underlying the physical regeneration of the city, in particular on perceptions of residents and stakeholders and how these link to issues around community cohesion.
- There may be a need to update work undertaken on physical segregation within the city, and the way this affects community cohesion.
- The link between social exclusion, deprivation, housing and importantly school choice is an area of further possible investigation. There may be a case for

assessing the evidence in this area in relation to a wider range of groups within the city, including the white community.

Business and enterprise

- The contribution, performance and needs of the small business sector.
- The contribution, performance and needs of the Asian business sector. Particularly an examination of the potential to move this sector into more value added activities.
- A wider assessment of the extent to which business marketing and promotional activities successfully attract the minority ethnic consumer.
- More sectoral research, building on the strengths of the District and linking this to current government policy.
- An examination of the existence of and reasons for recruitment difficulties, linked to business perceptions that it is difficult to encourage staff to come to the region;
- An examination of issues around inward investment in the District, potential barriers to attracting firms from outside the area, and the most appropriate ways for inward investment activity to be targeted.

Health, disability and social care

- The perspectives of children and young people on health and healthcare.
- Generational differences in knowledge, attitudes and practices.
- Research that considers issues around gender and health.
- Disability and the management of long term illness.
- Methods of improving health information and advice to different population groups.
- The impact of poverty and deprivation on health and healthcare.
- Research that focuses on the health aspects of environmental emissions, particularly by local industry.

Children and young people

- There is a need for more up to date research on children and young people, particularly on their use of key services.
- Further research may need to be undertaken on how services can best be tailored to meet the needs of children and young people, and to remove barriers that might be preventing them from accessing services.

- Some communities have been less well covered by research into the views, attitudes and perceptions of young people in Bradford District, including the white community, the African Caribbean and Indian communities, as well as the growing Chinese population and asylum seekers and refugees.

Education, skills and labour markets

- An examination of the reasons for the relatively low rate of labour market participation among different groups in the Bradford labour market.
- Following on from this, a consideration of barriers to training and employment, focusing on the links between employment and other factors such as social capital, education, health, housing, transport, travel to work patterns and discrimination.
- Studies examining participation in labour market programmes and use of Jobcentre Plus services from the viewpoint of the service user.
- Investigation of the potential of self-employment to alleviate problems associated with low rates of labour market participation.

Crime and community safety

- Further comparative work on minority ethnic communities in other countries in the area of race, racism and policing.
- Further comparative work on different ethnic minorities in different local contexts and their perceptions and behaviour relating to crime and relations with official agencies such as the police and schools.
- A comprehensive depiction of community safety perceptions and fear of crime, based on a systematic sample of the Bradford population. This would need to be broken down by different groups, allowing analysis by gender, age, area of residence, ethnicity, etc.

Bibliography

- Action for Black Community Development (ABCD) (2005) *A study into barriers to employment and productivity faced by people of African and African-Caribbean origin in Bradford: Summary of research with job seekers*. Bradford: Action for Black Community Development.
- Afshar, H. (1989) Gender roles and the moral economy of kin amongst Pakistani women in West Yorkshire. *New Community*, 15(20): 211–25.
- Afshar, H. (1995) Muslim women in West Yorkshire: Growing up with real and imaginary. In H. Afshar and M. Maynard (eds) *Values amidst conflicting views of self and society: The dynamics of 'race' and gender*. Abingdon: Taylor and Francis.
- Ahmad, W. I. U. and Walker, R. (1997) Asian older people: Housing, health and access to services. *Ageing and Society*, 17: 141–65.
- Airedale NHS Primary Care Trust (2001) *Annual report of the Director of Public Health*. Bradford: Airedale NHS Primary Care Trust.
- Alexander, C. (2004) Imagining the Asian gang: Ethnicity, masculinity and youth after 'the riots'. *Critical Social Policy*, 24(4): 526–49.
- Ali, Y. (1992) Muslim women and the politics of ethnicity and culture in Northern England. In G. Sahgal and N. Yuval-Davis (eds), *Refusing holy orders: Women and fundamentalism in Britain*. London: Virago.
- Allen, C. (2003) *Fair justice: The Bradford disturbances, the sentencing and the impact*. London: Forum against Islamophobia and Racism.
- Alsop, R., Clisby, S. and Craig, G. (2001) *Young, urban and female: Young women and city regeneration*. Oxford: YWCA.
- Amin, A. (2002) Ethnicity and the multicultural city: Living with diversity. In *Environment and Planning A*, 34: 959–80.
- Amin, A. (2003) Unruly strangers? The 2001 urban riots in Britain. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 27(2): 460–3.
- Amir, Z., Wright, A., Kernohan, E. M. and Hart, G. (2000) Attitudes, beliefs and behaviour regarding the use of sunbeds amongst healthcare workers in Bradford. *European Journal of Cancer Care*, 9(2): 76–9.
- Arora, R. and Khann, A. (1998) *No to Nasha: Drugs, alcohol and tobacco in Bradford's Asian communities*. Bradford: Bradford and District TEC and Bradford and Ilkley Community College.
- Back to Work Company (2003) *Black and minority ethnic communities in Bradford and Leeds*. Leeds: The Back to Work Company.
- Bagguley, P. and Hussain, Y. (2003a) The Bradford 'riot' of 2001: A preliminary analysis. In C. Barker and M. Tyldesley (eds), *Ninth International Conference on Alternative Futures and Popular Protest*. Manchester: Manchester Metropolitan University.

- Bagguley, P. and Hussain, Y. (2003b) Conflict and cohesion: Constructions of 'community' around the 2001 'riots'. Paper presented to the Communities Conference, 18–20 September.
- Ballard, R. (2003) Remittances and their economic impact in areas of mass overseas migration: Two contrasting South Asian case studies (Mirpur, Azad Kashmir, Pakistan; and Jullunduri Doab, Kashmir, India). Paper presented to SLSO–ASREP Lunchtime Seminar, London, 4 March.
- Barker, R. M. and Baker, M. R. (1990) Incidence of cancer in Bradford Asians. *Journal of Epidemiology and Community Health*, 44: 125–9.
- Batta, I. D., Mawby, R. I. and McCulloch, J. W. (1981) Crime, social problems and Asian immigration: The Bradford Experience. *International Journal of Contemporary Sociology*, 18(12): 135–68.
- Baylies, C., Law, I and Mercer, G. (1993) The nature of care in a multi-racial community: Summary report of an investigation of the support for black and minority ethnic persons after discharge from psychiatric hospitals in Bradford and Leeds. Sociology and Social Policy Research Working Paper 8, School of Sociology and Social Policy, University of Leeds.
- Bernard, N., Brown, D., Brown, M., Crowther, C., Gale, P., Noel, D. and Petrie, A. (2003) Gang deterrence project. Phase one: Assessment of gang activity. Leeds: Government Office for Yorkshire and Humber.
- Bhatnagar, K. and Frank, J. (1997) Psychiatric disorders in elderly from the Indian sub-continent living in Bradford. *International Journal of Geriatric Psychiatry*, 12: 907–12.
- Bokhari, S., Khan, S., Sagoo, K. and Race, T. (1996) *Report of research project to evaluate the needs of Asian children who have been sexually abused in Bradford*. Bradford: Bradford Family Service Unit.
- Bowes, A., Dar, N. and Sim, D. (1998) *'Too white, too rough, and too many problems': A study of Pakistani housing in Britain*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.
- Bowes, A., Dar, N., Sim, D. (2002) Differentiation in housing careers: The case of Pakistanis in the UK. *Housing Studies*, 17(3): 381–99.
- Bradford Chamber of Commerce and Industry (2001) *Bradford Chamber of Commerce and Industry – Business Crime Survey results*. Bradford: Bradford Chamber of Commerce and Industry.
- Bradford Chamber of Commerce and Industry (2003) *Driving economic development – Business Priorities Survey Dec. 2003*. Bradford: Bradford Chamber of Commerce and Industry.
- Bradford Chamber of Commerce and Industry (2004) *Quarterly Economic Survey: Results of the 2nd quarter 2004*. Bradford: Bradford Chamber of Commerce and Industry.
- Bradford Congress (1996) *The Bradford Commission report*. Bradford: The Bradford Congress.
- Bradford Housing Forum and Bradford Young People's Housing Consortium (1999) *Young single homeless in Bradford 1999*. Bradford: Bradford Young People's Housing Consortium.
- Bradford Metropolitan Faith in the City Forum (1995) *Powerful whispers: The report of the Bradford urban hearings*. Bradford: Bradford Metropolitan Faith in the City Forum.

- Bradford NHS Health Authority (2001) *Annual report of the Director of Public Health 2001*. Bradford: Bradford Health Authority.
- Bridge Project, Bradford (1996) *Drugs and Asian Women in Bradford*. Bradford: The Bridge Project.
- Brown, D., Dickens, R., Gregg, P., Machin, S. and Manning, A. (2001) *Everything under a fiver: Recruitment and retention in lower paying labour markets*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.
- Buhler, U., Bujra, J., Carling, A., Cumming, L., Hamman, M., Lewis, P., Macey, M., Nias, P., Pankhurst, D., Pearce, J., Samad, Y. and Vine, I. (2002) *Bradford: One year on. Breaking the silences*. Bradford: Programme for a Peaceful City.
- Burgess, S., Wilson, D. and Lupton, R. (2005) Parallel lives? Ethnic segregation in schools and neighbourhoods. *Urban Studies*, 42(7): 1027–56.
- Burlet, S. and Reid, H. (1998) A gendered uprising: Political representation and minority ethnic communities. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 21(2): 270–87.
- Byrne, D. (1998) Class and ethnicity in complex cities: The cases of Leicester and Bradford. In *Environment and Planning A*, 30(4): 703–20.
- Campbell, M. and Jones, D. (1982) *Asian youths in the labour market: A study in Bradford*. EEC/DES Transition to Work Project, Bradford: Bradford College.
- Cann, E. (2002) *Getting the picture: The views of people using supported housing services in Bradford on consultation and involvement*. Bradford: Bradford Supporting People.
- Carling, A., Davies, D., Fernanded-Bakshi, A., Jarman, N. and Nias, P. (2004) *Fair justice for all? The response of the criminal justice system to the Bradford disturbances of July 2001*. Bradford: Programme for a Peaceful City and Joseph Rowntree Charitable Trust.
- Cater, J. (1981) The impact of Asian estate agents on patterns of ethnic residence: A case study of Bradford. In P. Jackson and S. Smith (eds), *Social interaction and ethnic segregation*. Bristol: Institute of British Geographers.
- Chattoo, S., Atkin, C. and McNeish, D. (2004) *Young people of Pakistani origin and their families: Implications for providing support to young people and their families*. London and Leeds: Centre for Research in Primary Care, University of Leeds and Barnardos.
- City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council (1994) *Bierley Youth Social Needs Survey*. Bradford: City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council.
- City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council (1997a) *Youth and Community Service Users Survey*. Bradford: City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council.
- City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council (1997b) *Youth and Community Service Staff Survey*. Bradford: City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council.
- City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council (1998) *Bradford research reviews – Young people in Bradford: Employment, aspirations and participation*. Bradford: Bradford Metropolitan District Council.
- City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council (2001a) *Crime and Disorder Audit*. Bradford: City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council.
- City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council (2001b) *Tenant Satisfaction Survey*. Bradford: City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council.

- City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council (2004) *Safer Communities Audit 2004*. Bradford: City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council.
- City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council and Northern Consortium of Housing Authorities (2001) *Modelling housing markets in Bradford*. Bradford: City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council.
- Cohen, T., Pender, J. and Watkin, C. (2003) *Literature review of labour market discrimination on the basis of age, disability, ethnicity and gender research in West Yorkshire*. Bradford: Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire.
- Commission for Racial Equality (2002) *A place for us all: Learning from Bradford, Oldham and Burnley*. London: Commission for Racial Equality.
- Cortis, J. D. (2000) Caring as experienced by minority ethnic patients. *International Nursing Review*, 47: 53–62.
- Crawford, A., Blackburn, S., Lister, S. and Shepherd, P. (2004) *Patrolling with purpose: An evaluation of Police Community Support Officers in Leeds and Bradford city centres*. Leeds: Nuffield Foundation and West Yorkshire Police.
- Curtis, M. (2000) Zig, zag zoo and other games: The oral tradition of children of Asian origin in Keighley. *Folk Life*, 18: 71–82.
- Darling, D. (2004) *Sheltered housing review*. Bradford: Bradford Social Services.
- Darr, A. and Thomson, B. (1993) *Girlington Community Survey*. Bradford: Bradford West Area Panel.
- Dickinson, P., Greasley, P. and Small, N. (2002) The Bradford salaried non-principal scheme: Addressing the problems of GP recruitment and retention in the inner city – it's not just the money but the support. *Primary Health Care Research and Development*, 3: 85–95.
- Evaluations Research Strategies (2003) *Keighley SRB final programme evaluation*. Keighley: Keighley Regeneration Partnership.
- Farnell, R., Furbey, R., Hills, S., Macey, M. and Smith, G. (2003) *'Faith' in urban regeneration? Engaging faith communities in urban regeneration*. Bristol: Policy Press.
- Feltbower, R. G., Bodansky, H. J., McKinney, P. A., Houghton, J., Stephenson, C. R. and Haigh, D. (2002) Trends in the incidence of childhood diabetes in South Asians and other children in Bradford Diabetes UK. *Diabetic Medicine*, 19: 162–6.
- Gilligan, P. A. with Ahktar, S. (forthcoming a) Child sexual abuse amongst Asian communities: Developing materials to raise awareness in Bradford. *Practice*.
- Gilligan, P. A. with Ahktar, S. (forthcoming b) Cultural barriers to the disclosure of child sexual abuse in Asian communities: Listening to what women say. *British Journal of Social Work*.
- Gledhill, J. (1995) *Engaging communities: A discussion paper on the role of schools in urban and national renewal strategies*. Bradford: Bradford Education.
- Glen, A. (1993) *A survey of community practitioners in Bradford*. Bradford: Bradford and Ilkley Community College, Centre for Research, Department of Applied and Community Studies..
- Godson, J. (2001) *The oral health of Bradford 12 year olds*. Bradford: Bradford City NHS Primary Care Trust.

- Godson, J. (2002) *The oral health of Bradford 5 year olds*. Bradford: Bradford City NHS Primary Care Trust.
- Godson, J. H. and Williams, S. A. (1996) Oral health and health related behaviours among three-year-old children born to first and second generation Pakistani mothers in Bradford, UK. *Community Dental Health*, 13: 27–33.
- Goodey, J. (2001) The criminalization of British Asian youth: Research from Bradford and Sheffield. *Journal of Youth Studies*, 4(4): 429–50.
- Harris, C., Roach, P., Thiara, R., Amory, D. and Yusuf, R. (2002) *Emergent citizens? African-Caribbean and Pakistani young people in Birmingham and Bradford*. Leicester: National Youth Agency.
- Harris, J., Rabiee, P. and Priestley, M. (2002) Enabled by the Act? The reframing of after care services for young disabled people. In A. Wheal (ed.), *The RHP Companion to Leaving Care*. Lyme Regis: Russell House, pp. 157–69.
- Haughton, G., Johnson, S., Murphy, L. and Thomas, K. (1993) Local geographies of unemployment: Long-term unemployment in areas of local deprivation. In G. Haughton, S. Johnson, L. Murphy and K. Thomas, *Local geographies of unemployment*. Aldershot: Avebury.
- Hawtin, M. and Percy-Smith, J. (2004) *Attitudes to crime: Project evaluation*. Bradford: Bradford Trident.
- Health and Safety Executive (1994) *The fire at Allied Colloids Ltd: A report of HSE's investigation into the fire at Allied Colloids Ltd, Low Moor, Bradford on 21 July 1992*. London: HSE Books.
- Heathcote, C. and Taylor, C. (2002) *Key data: The cultural industries in Bradford*. Bretton: Bretton Hall, a college of the University of Leeds.
- Hemming, C. and King, H. (2003a) *Burley in Wharfedale Housing Needs Survey*. Bradford: Burley Community Council with Bradford Rural Housing Enabler Scheme.
- Hemming, C. and King, H. (2003b) *Cullingworth Housing Needs Survey*. Bradford: Cullingworth Parish Council with Bradford Rural Housing Enabler Scheme.
- Hemming, C. and King, H. (2004) *Oxenhope Housing Needs Survey*. Bradford, Oxenhope Parish Council in conjunction with the Bradford Rural Housing Enabler Scheme.
- Hemming, C. and King, H. (2005) *Haworth Housing Needs Survey*. Bradford: Haworth Parish Council with Bradford Rural Housing Enabler Scheme.
- Hillman, M., Wright, A., Rajaratnam, G., Tennant, A. and Chamberlain, M. (1996) Prevalence of low back pain in the community: Implications for service provision in Bradford, UK. *Journal of Epidemiology and Community Health*, 50: 347–52.
- Hope, C. A. and Klemm, M. S. (2001) Tourism in difficult areas revisited: The case of Bradford. *Tourism Management*, 22: 629–35.
- Housing Consultancy Ltd (2001) *Private Sector House Condition Survey*. Bradford: City of Bradford Metropolitan District.
- Howe, J. (2002) Planning for urban food: The experience of two UK cities. *Planning Practice and Research*, 17(2): 125–44.
- Husband, C. (2000) *Managing social cohesion and young people's entry into the labour market: Final report*. Swindon: Economic and Social Research Council.

- Jamal, A. (1998) Food consumption among ethnic minorities: The case of British Pakistanis in Bradford, UK. *British Food Journal*, 100(5): 221–7.
- James, K., Curteis, S., Griffiths, S. and Woodhead, J. (2003) *'Just surviving': The housing and support needs of people on the fringes of homelessness and/or the criminal justice system in West Yorkshire*. Leeds: Leeds Supporting People.
- Jan-Khan, M. (2003) The right to riot? *Community Development Journal*, 38(1): 32–42.
- Johnson, S. and Burden, T. (2003) *Young people, employability and the induction process*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.
- Johnston, R., Poulsen, M. and Forrest, J. (2005) On the measurement and meaning of residential segregation: A response to Simpson. *Urban Studies*, 42(7): 1221–7.
- Katbamna, S., Baker, R., Ahmad, W., Bhakta, P. and Parker, G. (2001) Development of guidelines to facilitate improved support of South Asian carers by primary health care teams. *Quality in Health Care*, 10: 166–72.
- Katz, A. (2002) *Thwarted dreams: Young views from Bradford*. London: Young Voice.
- Kelly, R. and Philpott, S. (2002) Community cohesion – moving Bradford forward: Lessons from Northern Ireland. Bradford: City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council, Government Office for Yorkshire and Humber, Bradford Vision, University of Bradford and Bradford College.
- Khan, V. S. (1977) The Pakistanis: Mirpuri villagers at home and in Bradford. In J. L. Watson (ed.), *Between two cultures: Migrants and minorities in Britain*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Killingbeck, A. and Trueman, M. (2002) Redrawing the perceptual map of a city. University of Bradford Working Paper Series, University of Bradford Management Centre.
- Klemm, M. (2000) Tourism and ethnic minorities in Bradford: Concepts and evidence. University of Bradford Working Paper Series, University of Bradford Management Centre.
- Klemm, M. (2002) Tourism and ethnic minorities in Bradford: The invisible segment. *Journal of Travel Research*, 41: 85–91.
- Klemm, M. and Kelsey, S. (2002) Catering for a minority? Ethnic groups and the British travel industry. University of Bradford Working Paper Series, University of Bradford Management Centre.
- Klemm, M. and Kelsey, S. (2004) Ethnic groups and the British travel industry: Servicing a minority. *Services Industries Journal*, 24(4): 115–28.
- Knight, T., Smith, Z., Lockton, J., Sahota, P., Bedford, A., Toop, M., Kernohan, E. and Baker, M. (1993) Ethnic differences in risk markers for heart disease in Bradford and implications for preventive strategies. *Journal of Epidemiology and Community Health*, 47: 89–95.
- Knight, T. M., Smith, Z., Whittles, A., Sahota, P., Lockton, J. A., Hogg, G., Bedford, A., Toop, M., Kernohan, E. E. M. and Baker, M. R. (1992) Insulin resistance, diabetes, and risk markers for ischaemic heart disease in Asian men and non-Asian men in Bradford. *British Heart Journal*, 67: 343–50.
- Knott, K. and Khokher, S. (1993) Religious and ethnic identity among young Muslim women in Bradford. *New Community*, 19(4): 593–610.

- Knox, M. and Alcock, D. (2002) *Approaches to community governance: Models for mixed tenure communities*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.
- Kotler, A., Wegerif, R. and LeVoi, M. (2001) Oracy and the educational achievement of pupils with English as an additional language. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 4(6): 403–19
- KPMG (2002) *Bradford Programme Review*. Leeds: Yorkshire Forward.
- Kundnani, A. (2001) From Oldham to Bradford: The violence of the violated. *Race and Class*, 43(2): 105–31.
- Lane, T. (2001) Victims of Stalin and Hitler: The Polish community of Bradford. *Immigrants and Minorities*, 20(3): 43–58.
- Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire (2002) *Engaging non-learners: Background and detailed findings*. Bradford: Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire.
- Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire (2003a) *Ethnic Minorities Learning Survey for the Learning and Skills Council*. Bradford: Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire and Community Research Partnerships Ltd.
- Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire (2003b) *Skills Survey 2003: Bradford and District summary report*. Bradford: Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire.
- Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire (2003c) *Bradford and District in depth 2003: An economic, learning and labour market profile of Bradford and District*. Bradford: Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire.
- Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire (2005a) *Bradford and District Household Survey 2005*. Bradford: Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire and Bradford and District Learning Partnership
- Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire (2005b) *West Yorkshire in focus: A learning, skills and labour market profile of the learning and skills market in West Yorkshire*. Bradford: Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire.
- Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire (2005c) *Bradford in depth: A learning, skills and labour market profile of Bradford*. Bradford: Learning and Skills Council for West Yorkshire.
- Lewis, P. (2002) Bradford: Britain's Islamabad. In P. Lewis, *Islamic Britain: Religion, politics and identity among British Muslims*. London: I. B. Taurus.
- Local Futures Group (1998) *Bradford and District futures: A strategy for sustainable economic development*. Bradford: Bradford and District TEC and Bradford MDC.
- Lockhart, L. (2001) *An analysis of the training needs of voluntary and community organisations in West Yorkshire*. Leeds: West Yorkshire Learning Consortium.
- Macey, M. (1999a) Class, gender and religious influences on changing patterns of Pakistani Muslim male violence in Bradford. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 22(5): 845–66.
- Macey, M. (1999b) Religion, male violence, and the control of women: Pakistani Muslim men in Bradford, UK. *Gender and Development*, 7(1): 48–55.
- Macey, M. (2002) Interpreting Islam: Young Muslim men's involvement in criminal activity in Bradford. In B. Spalek (ed.), *Islam, crime and criminal justice*. Cullompton: Willan.

- Macheta, M. P., Minford, M. B. and Parapia, L. A. (1997) Incidence of hereditary bleeding disorders in Bradford, UK: Variation with ethnic group. *Haemophilia*, 3: 292–4.
- Mawby, R. I. and Batta, I. D. (1980) *Asians and crime: The Bradford experience*. London: Scope Publications.
- McGhee, D. (2003) Moving to 'our' common ground: A critical examination of cohesion discourse in twenty-first century Britain. *Sociological Review*, 51(3): 376–463.
- McKinney, P. A., Feltbower, R. G., Parslow, R. C., Lewis, I. J., Glaser, A. W. and Kinsey, S. E. (2003) Patterns of childhood cancer by ethnic group in Bradford, UK 1974–1997. *European Journal of Cancer*, 39: 92–7.
- McLoughlin, S. (1998) The Mosque centre, community-mosque: Multi-functions, functions and the reconstruction of Islam and Bradford. *Scottish Journal of Religious Studies*, 19(2): 211–27.
- MEL Research and Service Development (2002) *Bradford African and African Caribbean housing needs: Report of survey findings*. Bradford: Manningham Housing Association.
- Meridian Pure (2004a) *Newlands Integrated Regeneration Strategy SRB Round 3 Scheme: Final evaluation report*. Bradford: City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council.
- Meridian Pure (2004b) *Interim report of the Regen 2000 SRB Scheme: Final report*. Bradford: City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council.
- Meridian Pure (2005a) *SRB5 Highfield Community Action: End of scheme evaluation: Final report*. Bradford: City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council.
- Meridian Pure (2005b) *Facing the Challenge SRB: End of scheme evaluation: Final report*. Bradford: Manningham and Girlington Regeneration Partnership.
- Mirza, K. (1989) *The silent cry: Second generation Bradford Muslim women speak*. Birmingham: Centre for the Study of Islam and Christian Relations.
- MORI (2001) *Employment and Training Survey: Qualitative research report for Bradford Trident*. Bradford: Bradford Trident New Deal for Communities.
- Mumford, D. B., Whitehouse, A. M. and Platt, M. (1991) Sociocultural correlates of eating disorders among Asian schoolgirls in Bradford. *British Journal of Psychiatry*, 158: 222–8.
- Nazir, N. (2003) *Integrated Language Service Project: Mapping of existing language support resources*. Bradford: Bradford Health Informatics Service.
- NHS (2004) *Health information and health inequalities across the Bradford Metropolitan District 2004*. Bradford: Bradford NHS.
- Opolot, O. and Kyoyagala, P. (2004) *The HIV related needs of asylum seekers and refugees of sub-Saharan African origin in Bradford*. Bradford: Bradford District Public Health Partnerships and Health Development.
- Ouseley, H. (2001) *Community pride not prejudice: Making diversity work in Bradford*. Bradford: Bradford Vision.
- Pardhan, S. and Mahomed, I. (2002) The clinical characteristics of Asian and Caucasian patients on Bradford's low vision register. *Eye*, 16: 572–6.
- Pardhan, S., Mughal, N. and Mahomed, I. (2000) Self-reported eye disease in elderly South Asian subjects from an inner city cluster in Bradford: A small scale

- study to investigate knowledge and awareness of ocular disease. *Eye*, 14: 620–4.
- Parsons, S., Godson, J. H., William, S. A. and Cade, J. E. (1999) Are there intergenerational differences in the diets of young children born to first- and second-generation Pakistani Muslims in Bradford West Yorkshire, UK? *Journal of Human Nutrition and Dietetics*, 12: 113–22.
- Pearson, G. and Patel, K. (1998) Drugs, deprivation, and ethnicity: Outreach among Asian drug users in a northern English city. *Journal of Drug Issues*, 28(1): 199–225.
- Phillips, D. (2002) *Movement to opportunity? South Asian relocation in northern cities*. Swindon: Economic and Social Research Council.
- Phillips, D., Butt, F. and Davis, C. (2002) The racialisation of space in Bradford. *Yorkshire and Humber Regional Review*, July: 9–10.
- Popay, E. and Marshall, E. (1997) *Young people's drug use and knowledge: Royd's drug initiative*. Bradford: Royd's Drug Initiative.
- Priestley, M., Rabiee, P. and Harris, J. (2003) Young disabled people and the 'new arrangements' for leaving care in England and Wales. *Children and Youth Services Review*, 25(11): 863–90.
- Proctor, S. R. and Campbell, J. L. (1999) Towards primary care groups managing the future in Bradford. *British Medical Journal*, 318: 783–5.
- Rabiee, P., Priestley, M. and Knowles, J. (2001) *Whatever next? Young disabled people leaving care*. London: National Lottery Charities Board.
- Rafiq, M. (1992) Ethnicity and enterprise: A comparison of Muslim and non-Muslim owned Asian businesses in Britain. *New Community*, 19(1): 43–60.
- Ratcliffe, P. (1996) *'Race' and housing in Bradford: Addressing the needs of the South Asian, African and Caribbean communities*. Bradford: Bradford Housing Forum.
- Ratcliffe, P. (1997) Housing needs and urban regeneration: A case study of Bradford. *Local Government Policy Making*, 3(5): 20–6.
- Ratcliffe, P. (1998) 'Race', housing and social exclusion. *Housing Studies*, 13(6): 807–18.
- Ratcliffe, P. (1999) Housing inequality and 'race': Some critical reflections on the concept of 'social exclusion'. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 22(1): 1–22.
- Ratcliffe, P., Harrison, M., Hogg, R., Line, B., Phillips, D. and Tomlins, R. (2001) *Breaking down the barriers: Improving Asian access to social rented housing*. Bradford: Bradford Metropolitan District Council.
- RBA Research (2004) *Street Wardens/Fear of Crime Survey 2004*. Bradford: City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council.
- Rees, P., Phillips, D. and Medway, D. (1995) The socio-economic geography of ethnic groups in two northern British cities. In *Environment and Planning A*, vol. 27, pp. 557–91.
- Rehman, S., Akram, N., Ashraf, N., Hussain, S., Sajid, M. and Shukoor, A. (2005) *Report of the community-led research project focusing on the extent, patterns and perceptions of treatment services amongst the South Asian communities in Keighley*. Project 6, Keighley.

- Rex, J. and Samad, Y. (1996) Multiculturalism and political integration in Birmingham and Bradford. *Innovation: The European Journal of Social Sciences*, 9(1): 11–32.
- Rhodes, P. and Nocon, A. (2003) A problem of communication? Diabetes care among Bangladeshi people in Bradford. *Health and Social Care in the Community*, 11(1): 25–54.
- Rhodes, P., Nocon, A. and Wright, J. (2003) Access to diabetes services: The experiences of Bangladeshi people in Bradford, UK. *Ethnicity and Health*, 8(3): 171–88.
- Rhodes, P., Nocon, A., Booth, M., Chowdrey, M. Y., Fabian, A., Lambert, N., Mohammed, F. and Walgrove, T. (2002) A service users' research advisory group from the perspectives of both service users and researchers. *Health and Social in the Community*, 10(5): 402–9.
- Robinson, D. (2005) The search for community cohesion: Key themes and dominant concepts of the public policy agenda. *Urban Studies*, 42(8): 1411–27.
- Samad, Y. (1992) Book burning and race relations: Political mobilisation of Bradford Muslims. *New Community*, 18: 507–19.
- Samad, Y. (1998) Media and Muslim identity: Intersections of generation and gender. *Innovation*, 11(4): 425–38.
- Samad, Y. and Eade, J. (2002) *Community perceptions of forced marriage*. London: Foreign and Commonwealth Office.
- Schwarz, K., Yeung, S., Symons, N. and Bradbury, J. (2002) Survey of school children with visual impairment in Bradford. *Eye*, 16: 530–4.
- Simpson, L. (2003) Social change, migration and ethnic group: New evidence from the Census. BURISA, June 2003.
- Simpson, L. (2004) Statistics of racial segregation: Measures, evidence and policy. *Urban Studies*, 41(3): 661–81.
- Simpson, S. (1993) *Areas of stress within Bradford District: A report from the 1991 Census and other sources*. Bradford: City of Bradford Metropolitan Council.
- Simpson, S. (1997) Demography and ethnicity: Case studies from Bradford. *New Community*, 23(1): 89–107.
- Singh, M. and Arora, R. (1995) *The language needs assessment project: Report of a research project funded by the patient's charter*. Bradford: Bradford Community Health NHS Trust.
- Singh, R. (1992) *Immigrants to citizens: The Sikh community in Bradford*. Bradford: Race Relations Research Unit, Bradford and Ilkley Community College.
- Small, N. and Proctor, S. (2001) Primary care in Bradford: From group to trust and beyond. *British Medical Journal*, 323 (17 Nov.).
- Smith, G. and Jackson, P. (1999) Narrating the nation: The 'imagined' community of Ukrainians in Bradford. *Journal of Historical Geography*, 25(3): 367–87.
- Social Policy Research Unit, University of York (2000) *Briefing home care staff about older people's individual needs*. York: Social Policy Research Unit, University of York.
- South, J. (2004) *Rising to the challenge: A study of patient and public involvement in four primary care trusts*. *Primary Health Care Research and Development*, 5: 134.

- Spark, J. I., Baker, J. L., Vowden, P. and Wilkinson, D. (2001) Epidemiology of abdominal aortic aneurysms in the Asian community. *British Journal of Surgery*, 88: 382–4.
- Sullivan, B. and Laffey, C. (1997) *Single people: Why should we care?* Bradford: Housing Corporation, Brunel Housing and Horton Housing Association.
- Swift Research Limited (1996) *Report on Toller Lane Division: Attitude research with young people*. Bradford: West Yorkshire Police.
- Taj, M. (1006) *A 'can do' city: Supplementary observations, comments and recommendations to the Bradford Commission Report*. Bradford: Taj.
- Thiara, R. K. and Rai, D. K. (1998) *Domestic violence research project*, Bradford: Manningham Housing Association.
- Thomas, W., Webber, D. and Walton, F. (2002) The school leaving intentions at the age of sixteen: Evidence from a multicultural city environment. *Economic Issues*, 7(1): 1–14.
- Trescom Research and Consultancy (2002) *Tailor-made housing packages for people with disabilities*. Bradford: Manningham Housing Association.
- Trescom Research and Consultancy (2004) *The nature and extent of racial disadvantage*. Bradford: Bradford Trident.
- Trueman, M., Klemm, M. and Giroud, A. (2004) Can a city communicate? Bradford as a corporate brand. *Corporate Communications*, 9(4): 317–30.
- Vertovec, S. (1998) Young Muslims in Keighley West Yorkshire: Cultural identity, context and 'community'. In S. Vertovec and A. Rodgers (eds), *Muslim European youth: Reproducing ethnicity, religion, culture*. Aldershot: Ashgate.
- Walker, L. (2004) *Report on the provision of housing for asylum seekers and refugees in Bradford and possible responses by Manningham Housing Association*. Bradford: Manningham Housing Association.
- Walker, R. and Ahmad, W. (1994) Asian and black elders and community care: A survey of care providers. *New Community*, 20(4): 635–46.
- Walsh, M. and Small, N. (2001) Clinical governance in primary care: Early impressions based on Bradford South and West Primary Care Group's experience. *British Journal of Clinical Governance*, 6(2): 109–18.
- Walton, F. (2000) *Bradford and District Youth Cohort Study II: Sweep 3*. Bradford: Bradford and District Training and Enterprise Council.
- Waxman, R., Tennant, A. and Helliwell, P. (1998) Community survey of factors associated with consultation for low back pain. *British Medical Journal*, 317(7172): 1564–6.
- Webster, C. (1994) *Youth crime, victimisation and racial harassment: The Keighley crime survey*. Bradford: Bradford Safer Cities.
- Webster, C. (1996) Local heroes: Violent racism, localism and spacism among Asian and white young people. *Youth and Policy*, 53: 15–27.
- Webster, C. (2003) Race, space and fear: Imagined geographies of racism, crime, violence and disorder in Northern England. *Capital and Class* (22 June): 95–121.
- Windhill Community Centre, Bradford (1996) *Well sorted: Windhill Youth Social Needs Survey*. Bradford: Windhill Community Centre.

- Wiseman, J. and Elliott, J. (2004) *Needs, experiences and aspirations of young people from minority ethnic backgrounds in Yorkshire and Humberside*, Bradford: Learning and Skills Councils in Yorkshire and Humberside.
- Worden, M. (2003) *Health of Men Project: Annual monitoring report*. Bradford: Health of Men Project.
- Yoong, S. Y., Feltbower, R., Spencer, N. and McKinney, P. A. (2005) Families affected by deafness: Hospital services uptake in a multiethnic population. *Archives of Disease in Childhood*, 90: 454–9.
- Yorkshire Futures (2004a) *Bradford in brief*. Leeds: Yorkshire Futures.
- Yorkshire Futures (2004b) *Survey of regional economic trends: Bradford*. Leeds: Yorkshire Futures.
- Yorkshire Futures (2005) *Progress in the region 2004*. Leeds: Yorkshire Forward.