## Citation:

Jacob, I and Jones, G and Francis, P and Johnson, MI (2024) A review of studies that used B mode Ultrasound to estimate age-related changes in anterior thigh skeletal muscle thickness across the adult lifespan. Archives of Gerontology and Geriatrics Plus, 1 (3). pp. 1-7. ISSN 2950-3078 DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aggp.2024.100037

Link to Leeds Beckett Repository record:
https://eprints.leedsbeckett.ac.uk/id/eprint/10864/

Document Version:
Article (Published Version)

Creative Commons: Attribution 4.0
(C) 2024 The Authors

The aim of the Leeds Beckett Repository is to provide open access to our research, as required by funder policies and permitted by publishers and copyright law.

The Leeds Beckett repository holds a wide range of publications, each of which has been checked for copyright and the relevant embargo period has been applied by the Research Services team.

We operate on a standard take-down policy. If you are the author or publisher of an output and you would like it removed from the repository, please contact us and we will investigate on a case-by-case basis.

Each thesis in the repository has been cleared where necessary by the author for third party copyright. If you would like a thesis to be removed from the repository or believe there is an issue with copyright, please contact us on openaccess@leedsbeckett.ac.uk and we will investigate on a case-by-case basis.

# A review of studies that used B mode ultrasound to estimate age-related changes in anterior thigh skeletal muscle thickness across the adult lifespan 

Isobel Jacob ${ }^{\text {a, }}$, Gareth Jones ${ }^{\text {a }}$, Peter Francis ${ }^{\text {a,c }}$, Mark I Johnson ${ }^{\text {b }}$<br>${ }^{\text {a }}$ Musculoskeletal Research Group, Leeds Beckett University, Leeds, United Kingdom<br>${ }^{\mathrm{b}}$ Centre for Pain Research, Leeds Beckett University, Leeds, United Kingdom<br>${ }^{\text {c }}$ The EVOLVE Research Group, Department of Health and Sport Science, South East Technological University, Carlow, Ireland

## ARTICLE INFO

## Keywords:

Muscle thickness
Ultrasound
Ageing
Adult lifespan


#### Abstract

Background: The purpose of this review was to synthesise and determine the age-related change per annum in muscle thickness of the anterior thigh across the adult lifespan. Methods: Electronic databases (PubMed, SPORTDiscus and MEDLINE) were searched for primary studies that were screened for eligibility. Results: Following screening against eligibility criteria, 27 studies were included in the quantitative analysis. Linear regression revealed a $0.02 \mathrm{~cm}(95 \% \mathrm{CI}:-0.01,-0.03, p<0.05)$ decline in mean muscle thickness per annum from 18 to 80 years of age, a $0.03 \mathrm{~cm}(95 \%$ CI: -0.01 to -0.05 ) decline per annum between 20 and 49 years of age and a $0.05 \mathrm{~cm}(95 \% \mathrm{CI}:-0.03,-0.07)$ decline per annum between 50 and 80 years of age. There was a $1.5 \mathrm{~cm}(\mathrm{t}(25)=6.12, p<0.05 ; 95 \% \mathrm{CI}=0.98-1.97 \mathrm{~cm})$ mean difference in muscle thickness between the youngest ( $18-29 y r s: 5.13 \mathrm{~cm} \pm 0.38$ ) and oldest adults ( $70-80 \mathrm{yrs}$ ) $3.63 \mathrm{~cm} \pm 0.63$ ). There was no difference in the rate of decline of mean muscle thickness between males ( $-0.05 \mathrm{~cm} /$ annum, $95 \% \mathrm{CI}=-0.08,-0.02$ ) and females $(-0.04 \mathrm{~cm} /$ annum, $95 \% \mathrm{CI}=-0.07,-0.02)$. There was a larger difference in anterior thigh muscle thickness between the youngest and oldest in females ( 4.98 cm vs. $3.34 \mathrm{~cm}, 33 \%, p<0.05$ ) compared with males ( 5.23 cm vs. $3.98 \mathrm{~cm}, 24 \%, p<0.05$ ). Conclusion: Mean anterior thigh thickness was estimated to decrease at a rate of 0.02 cm per annum and this rate of decrease was greater after 50 years of age. Females were more susceptible to age-related reductions in anterior thigh muscle thickness than males.


## Introduction

Research investigating age-related changes of anterior thigh muscle mass in healthy adults $<70$ years (yrs) is underdeveloped. Research to date has been conducted in older adults (Frontera et al., 1985) and young vs. older adults (Maden-Wilkinson et al., 2013) because measurements in the younger adults are used to generate normative data to compare with older adults, as recommended by the European Working Group on Sarcopenia in Older People (Cruz-Jentoft et al., 2019). However, this has resulted in a paucity of data for healthy adults $<70 \mathrm{yrs}$ of age, specifically, those aged $30-50 \mathrm{yrs}$. On the other hand, research in adults over 70 yrs is well established due to data gathered by The Healthy Ageing Body Composition study that measured muscle mass, strength and quality (Delmonico et al., 2009; Goodpaster et al., 2006; Newman et al., 2003). Cross sectional analysis of adults aged 70-79yrs
has revealed a 9-10 \% decline per decade in leg lean tissue mass, and longitudinal analysis revealed larger age-related declines in muscle strength compared to muscle mass (Delmonico et al., 2009; Goodpaster et al., 2006). Yet, due to the narrow age range of the sample population, these findings cannot be generalised across other ages.

The quantity of muscles of the thigh do not decline alike. The muscles of the anterior thigh (rectus femoris, vastus lateralis, vastus medialis, vastus intermedius) undergo larger age-related declines in mass than the muscles of the posterior thigh (Frontera et al., 1985; Janssen et al., 1985; Maden-Wilkinson et al., 2013). However, there is a lack of studies evaluating the rate of change per annum and cross-sectional differences in anterior thigh muscle mass across the adult lifespan. Thus, it is not known if anterior thigh muscle mass changes after $18-30$ yrs or the trajectory of anterior thigh muscle mass within the 18-30yrs age-band. Furthermore, we do not know the magnitude of change in anterior thigh

[^0]https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aggp.2024.100037
Received 9 February 2024; Received in revised form 9 May 2024; Accepted 10 May 2024
Available online 11 May 2024
2950-3078/© 2024 The Authors. Published by Elsevier B.V. This is an open access article under the CC BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).
muscle mass per annum and whether this rate of change is greater after certain time points.

Magnetic Resonance Imaging (MRI) and Computed Tomography (CT) are the gold standard techniques to measure muscle mass (English et al., 2012). B mode ultrasonography (US) can directly image the tissue of interest and measurements of muscle thickness (MT) using B mode US have been used to estimate whole body and regional muscle mass (Sanada et al., 2006). Additionally, positive relationships have been found between measurements of knee extensor MT and muscle volume (measured by MRI) (Miyatani et al., 2002). Unlike MRI and CT, B mode US is an imaging tool which is portable, relatively inexpensive, does not have an extensive list of exclusions and the time taken to image the muscle and take measurements is relatively short (Reimers et al., 1993; Stringer \& Wilson, 2018). The clinical utility of B mode US is advantageous, and research studies have evaluated measurements of anterior thigh MT across the adult lifespan in relation to muscle wasting in the lower and upper extremities (Abe et al., 2014a), site specific muscle loss in females and males (Abe et al., 2011), prevalence of site-specific thigh sarcopenia in females and males (Abe et al., 2014b) and muscle architectural differences in females (Kubo et al., 2003).

There are primary studies that measured MT at multiple sites in individuals aged $20-79 y r s$. For example, Abe et al. (2014a) estimated anterior thigh MT between age bands that provided evidence of age-related differences in across the adult lifespan and in males and females. However, Abe et al. did not calculate the rate of change in anterior thigh MT per annum, nor analyse potential differences in MT between age bands. Thus, there is a lack of comparative data available as we currently do not know the estimated rate of change in anterior thigh MT per annum in healthy adults aged 18-70yrs. Furthermore, it is not known whether anterior thigh MT changes alike in healthy males and females aged 18-70yrs.

To our knowledge, there has been no attempt to pool data from primary research studies to estimate age-related changes in anterior thigh MT measured using B mode US across the adult lifespan. The findings of such an analysis could provide comparative data that would be valuable for identifying individuals with low MT, and therefore low muscle quantity, which is a risk factor for sarcopenia, functional capability and strength (Abe et al., 2012a; Abe et al., 2014c; 2014d). Additionally, such data would provide further evidence on the physiological age-related changes in MT that occur across the lifespan and per age band.

The aim of this review was to determine the rate of change per annum and age-related differences in anterior thigh MT measured using $B$ mode US across the lifespan in healthy adults.

## Materials and methods

This review was developed from procedures described by the Cochrane Collaboration for undertaking systematic reviews (Higgins et al., 2019). Inclusion and exclusion criteria for the screening of abstracts and full text were developed prior to conducting the search. The PICOS tool was used to develop the research question and the search strategy:

- Population-Healthy adults aged 18-80yrs.
- Intervention-Physical activity or nutritional interventions, but only baseline data will be included.
- Comparison- not applicable.
- Outcome- Rate of decline in anterior thigh MT per annum and mean MT per age band.
- Study design- Cross sectional, longitudinal (baseline data only), randomised control trials (baseline data only) and interventions (baseline data only).


## Eligibility criteria

Studies were included if they:

1. Used B mode US.
2. Measured the thickness of quadriceps and/or anterior thigh muscles ( cm or mm ) using B mode US either across the adult lifespan, between different age categories, as part of an intervention or as a comparison between groups (within a sport or between sports/ exercise).
3. Measured MT to estimate muscle quality and/or MT ratios and/or cross-sectional area and/or skeletal muscle mass and/or volume.
4. Included a sample of participants aged $18 y$ yrs and over, described as healthy and independent living.
5. Cross sectional studies, longitudinal and intervention studies providing baseline data prior to an intervention i.e. pre-intervention data.
6. Only full texts of academic journal studies written in English were included.

Studies were excluded if they were reported in an abstract and/or included participants who relied on others for care or resided in a residential care home, nursing home were frail or functionally impaired.

## Electronic searches

One author (IJ) searched electronic databases (PubMed Central, SPORTDiscus, MEDLINE and Discover) for studies which quantified anterior thigh skeletal MT using B mode ultrasound in January 2020 and using the following search strings:
("Skeletal muscle mass" OR "muscle mass") AND (image" technique OR MRI OR CT OR computed tomography OR ultrasound OR ultrasonography)
("Skeletal muscle thickness" OR "muscle thickness") AND (age OR ageing OR age-related) ("Skeletal muscle mass" OR "muscle mass") AND (age OR ageing OR age-related).

Studies were included irrespective of language.

## Data screening

One reviewer (IJ) removed duplicates and screened title and abstracts of records obtained from the search followed by full text reports against the eligibility criteria.

## Data extraction and management of relevant information

One author (IJ) extracted information from full reports including: study characteristics (authors and year of publication), sample characteristics (sample size including the number of males and females where applicable, gender, age range (minimum and maximum) and mean age ( $\pm$ standard deviation)), the muscles included in the measurement anterior thigh or quadriceps MT and the mean and standard deviation of the MT value. Co-authors spot checked the results of screening and information extracted for accuracy. A table summarising the characteristics of included studies is available in supplementary file 1.

## Data synthesis and analysis

Numerical data for age and MT was analysed using SPPS v.25. Correlation analysis was conducted to determine the degree of the relationship between age and MT, and regression analysis was conducted to predict the amount of change in MT as a result of age. Data were plotted on a scatter graph, with the mean age range on the x axis and mean MT on the y axis to visually assess for a linear regression between age and MT. The rate of change in MT per annum was determined using the slope of the linear line.

Data for MT was grouped according to mean age(s) in a similar manner to that described by Abe et al. (2014b) as follows: 18-29yrs; 30-39yrs; 40-49yrs; 50-59yrs; 60-69yrs; 70-79yrs; 80-90yrs).

Descriptive statistics were conducted in SPSS v.25. The mean MT $\pm$ standard deviation (SD) for each age band was calculated from the single point mean MT values $\pm$ SD and the percentage difference between the
youngest and oldest adults analysed using an independent $t$-test.

## Results

The initial search returned 2326 records. After removing 27 duplicates, 2299 records were screened by title and abstract and the full text reports of 50 potentially relevant studies were obtained and screened, see Fig. 1. Nine studies were excluded because investigators did not include healthy subjects $(n=1)$, did not report or measure age of participants ( $n=1$ ), did not measure quadriceps MT ( $n=4$ ), measured muscle volume instead of thickness $(n=1)$ or did not provide the MT measurements ( $n=2$ ).

## Characteristics of included studies

There were 41 studies included with a total of 7474 adults (3464 males and 4010 females). There were 29 studies that measured rectus femoris (RF) and vastus intermedius (VI) muscles (please see supplementary file 1), 7 studies measured vastus lateralis (VL) and vastus intermedius (VI) (Candow et al., 2006; Candow et al., 2008; Candow et al., 2011; Candow et al., 2014; Cornish \& Chilibeck, 2009; Joy et al., 2015; Sipilä \& Suominen, 1996) muscles and 5 studies measured other muscles (Cadore et al., 2012a; 2012b; Matta et al., 2017; Rech et al., 2014; Watanabe et al., 2013a). It was decided to pool data from the RF and VI because they comprised the largest data set and not to pool data
from muscles used in the remaining 12 studies because of physiological heterogeneity.

The mean age of the groups was not reported in two (Fukumoto et al., 2015; Abe et al., 2014e) of the 29 studies with data for rectus femoris and vastus intermedius so these studies were not included in the analysis. Thus, data was extracted and analysed from 27 studies measuring rectus femoris and vastus intermedius variables (Abe et al., 2014f; Abe et al., 2018; Akima et al., 2017; Herrick et al., 2017; Hida \& al., 2018; Kanehisa \& Fukunaga, 2013; Meirelles \& Gomes, 2016; Nakatani et al., 2016; Nishihara et al., 2018; Sanada et al., 2006; Abe et al., 2012a; 2012b; Abe et al., 2014a; 2014b; 2014c; 2014d; 2014g; 2014h; Abe et al., 2015a; 2015b; Takai et al., 2013; Takai et al., 2014; Taniguchi et al., 2017; Thiebaud et al., 2017; Fukumoto et al., 2012a; 2012b; Watanabe et al., 2013b), please see supplementary file 1.

## Descriptive statistics

Descriptive statistics are provided in Table 1. There was a statistically significant difference in MT between youngest (18-29yrs: mean $\pm$ $\mathrm{SD}=5.13 \mathrm{~cm} \pm 0.38$ ) and oldest adults (70-80yrs: $3.60 \mathrm{~cm} \pm 0.66$ ) of $1.5 \mathrm{~cm}(95 \% \mathrm{CI}=0.94-2.07 \mathrm{~cm}, \mathrm{t}(21)=5.54, p<0.05)$.

Two studies did not report MT by gender and were excluded from the analysis (Meirelles \& Gomes, 2016; Nakatani et al., 2016). In adults mean MT was larger in males ( $4.71 \pm 0.66 \mathrm{~cm}$ ) compared with females ( $4.05 \mathrm{~cm} \pm 0.55 \mathrm{~cm}$ ) with the magnitude of difference being 0.66 ( t (60)


Fig. 1. Preferred reporting items for systematic review and meta-analysis flow diagram.

Table 1
Mean MT $\pm$ SD for the anterior thigh (cm) by age and gender.

| Age group (years) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 18-29yrs | 30-39yrs | 40-49yrs | 50-59yrs | 60-69ys | 70-80yrs |
| All MT | $5.13 \pm 0.38$ | $4.49 \pm 0.54$ | $4.25 \pm 0.59$ | $4.48 \pm 0.55$ | $4.24 \pm 0.62$ | $3.60 \pm 0.66$ |
| Male MT | $5.23 \pm 0.38$ | $5.02 \pm 0.10$ | $4.70 \pm 0.13$ | $4.82 \pm 0.54$ | $4.71 \pm 0.58$ | $3.98 \pm 0.51$ |
| Female MT | $4.98 \pm 0.40$ | $4.32 \pm 0.09$ | $4.30 \pm 0.11$ | $4.22 \pm 0.37$ | $3.81 \pm 0.36$ | $3.34 \pm 0.57$ |

$=-4.24, p<0.01)$. The extent of the difference in MT between youngest and oldest females (youngest $=4.98 \mathrm{~cm} \pm 0.40$, oldest $=3.34 \mathrm{~cm} \pm$ 0.57 , mean ( $95 \% \mathrm{CI}$ ) difference $=1.63 \mathrm{~cm}, 95 \% \mathrm{CI}=0.85,2.42, p<$ 0.005 ) was larger than that for males (youngest $=5.23 \mathrm{~cm} \pm 0.38$, oldest $=3.98 \mathrm{~cm} \pm 0.51$, mean difference $=1.25 \mathrm{~cm}, 95 \% \mathrm{CI}=0.68$, $1.82, p<0.05)$.

## Correlations and linear regression (rate of change)

There was a weak-moderate correlation between MT and age across the lifespan ( $\mathrm{r}^{2}=0.26, p<0.01$ ). There was a decrease in anterior thigh MT per annum, estimated from the slope of the linear regression line, of 0.02 cm ( $95 \% \mathrm{CI}:-0.01,-0.03, p<0.05$ ) for all adults irrespective of age. The rate of decrease in mean anterior thigh MT was 0.03 cm ( $95 \%$ CI: -0.01 to -0.05 ) per annum between 20 and 49 yrs of age and 0.05 cm ( $95 \% \mathrm{CI}:-0.03,-0.07$ ) per annum between 50 and $80 y r s$ of age, see Fig. 2.

The data from the studies was split by gender and using the same method as previously described, the rate of change per annum was calculated. Mean MT was lower by -0.02 cm per annum (male and female $95 \% \mathrm{CI}=-0.03,-0.01$ ) separately for both males and females aged 18-76 years. A stronger correlation between MT and age $\geq 50 \mathrm{yrs}$ was observed in the females ( $\mathrm{r}^{2}=0.33, p<0.01$ ) compared to males ( $\mathrm{r}^{2}$ $=0.30, p<0.01$ ), whilst mean MT declined at a similar rate in males and females, $-0.05 \mathrm{~cm}(95 \% \mathrm{CI}=-0.08,-0.02)$ and $-0.04 \mathrm{~cm}(95 \% \mathrm{CI}=$ $-0.07,-0.02$ ) per annum respectively, see Fig. 3.

Discussion
To our knowledge this is the first attempt to analyse primary research data to determine the rate of change per annum in anterior thigh MT measured using B mode US across the adult lifespan. We estimated the rate of decrease in anterior thigh MT of 0.02 cm per annum between 18 and 80 years of age. There was a larger rate of decrease in anterior thigh MT after 50 years of age compared with adults under the age of 50 years. The difference in anterior thigh MT between youngest (18-29yrs) and oldest adults ( $70-80 \mathrm{yrs}$ ) was $29 \%$. There was no difference in the rate of decrease in anterior thigh MT between males and females who were 50 yrs or more.

The 29 \% difference in MT between youngest (18-29yrs) and oldest ( $70-80 y r s$ ) adults measured by B mode US reported in our review is similar in magnitude to that measured using MRI (Maden-Wilkinson et al., 2013) and may be representative of age-related changes in thigh SM mass. Considering MRI is the gold standard imaging tool for quantifying SM mass, the findings from this review highlight the use of $B$ mode US as an alternative portable and inexpensive imaging tool to quantify age-related changes in MT which can reflect changes in SM mass.

The findings from our review further evidence that there is a greater decline in MT in those $\geq 50$ years and that B mode US is an imaging tool that can detect these changes in MT across the lifespan. The greater decline after 50yrs is similar to the findings from other research studies which have evidenced declines in thigh SM mass in those $\geq 50$ years


Fig. 2. Scatter plot of mean anterior thigh MT across the adult lifespan. Lines of regression were added to investigate the rate of decline in anterior thigh MT in adults aged $22-49 \mathrm{yrs}$ of age (represented by the blue line) and in adults aged $\geq 50 \mathrm{yrs}$ (represented by the red line).


Fig. 3. Mean anterior thigh MT in male and female adults aged 50-75yrs. The blue squares represent the male MT data and the orange dots represent the female MT data. A line of regression was added for both males and females (blue $=$ males and orange $=$ females) to assess the rate of change in anterior thigh MT for both genders.
(Hughes et al., 2002; Janssen et al., 1985; Kyle et al., 2001). Collectively, the findings from this review and previous evidence support the implementation of interventions to prevent sarcopenia in adults aged $50 y r s$ and older.

The larger rate of decrease of MT at 50 years observed in our analysis may be due to lower physical activity levels (Janssen et al., 1985). The muscles of the anterior thigh are used to perform activities of daily living such as rising from a chair and are regularly used in physical activity. When an individual is sedentary these muscles are not used as frequently. Therefore, researchers have claimed that reductions in physical activity including activities of daily living, contributes to reductions in the quantity of the anterior thigh muscles compared to muscles of the upper limbs and posterior thigh muscles (Frontera et al., 1985; Janssen et al., 1985; Kubo et al., 2003; T. Abe et al., 2014).

There is no consensus on specific interventions to preserve muscle health and prevent sarcopenia. Furthermore, most interventions target older adults ( $>65$ years of age) despite noticeable declines in SM, MT and strength at 50 yrs of age, as demonstrated by the findings of our analysis and previously studies by others (Janssen et al., 1985; Lindle et al., 1985; Lynch et al., 1985). Thus, it could be argued that interventions focussing on physical activity, nutrition and hormonal status should be introduced for individuals prior to 50 yrs to slow down and/or prevent decreases in anterior thigh MT and associated functionality.

Our analysis revealed thicker anterior thigh muscle in males compared to females, this is consistent with the current knowledge that males have higher total and regional SM mass, irrespective of adult age (Abe et al., 2003; Gallagher et al., 1985). However, we found that males and females aged 50 yrs and over had similar rates of decrease of MT ( 0.04 cm and. 0.05 cm , respectively). Physical activity levels of participants may have been a confounder in our analysis, but we could not explore the influence of physical activity in any depth because the physical activity levels of participants were not recorded in the included studies of this review. Future research should include levels of physical as a variable in data analysis when exploring age-related differences in anterior thigh MT.

When comparing differences in anterior thigh MT between the youngest and oldest adults by gender, the findings from our review revealed larger age-related differences in MT in the females compared to the males. Further analysis also revealed that age was more strongly associated with anterior thigh MT in the females compared to the males. These findings suggest that females are more sensitive to age-related
changes in the thickness of the anterior thigh compared to males. In contrast, Abe et al. (Abe et al., 2011) reported stronger associations between age and anterior thigh MT relative to thigh length in males ( $r=$ $-0.53 p<0.05$ ) than in females ( $r=-0.49, p<0.05$ ). Similarly, Janssen et al. (1985) and Maden-Wilkinson et al. (2013) reported the difference between young vs. older adults SM mass to be larger in males (25 \% reported by Janssen et al. (1985) and 32 \% reported by Maden-Wilkinson et al. (2013)) compared to females (22 \% (Janssen et al., 1985) and $28 \%$ (Maden-Wilkinson et al., 2013)). However, comparison of precise estimates in this field may not be appropriate due to unequal numbers of participants between genders and age bands both in the experimental studies (Janssen et al., 1985; Maden-Wilkinson et al., 2013) and this review. Therefore, there is a need for further studies which measure MT using similar proportions of healthy females and males.

## Limitations

Variations in cut points and reporting of age bands in primary reports were managed by grouping age bands using mean age and checking whether the standard deviation overlapped age band boundaries. In fact, there was overlap of SDs between age band boundaries, reducing confidence in the accuracy of mean MT. However, we argue that this did not have a serious impact on estimates of rate of decline in mean MT because this was calculated using the mean age and single point estimates of MT reported for each study.

The number of mean MT data points in each age decade varied (18-29yrs had 8 data points, $30-39 \mathrm{yrs}=5,40-49 \mathrm{yrs}=5,50-59 \mathrm{yrs}=13$, $60-69 \mathrm{yrs}=30$ and $70-80 \mathrm{yrs}=18$ ), as did the number of study participants with fewer participants in younger than older age bands, for example the $30-39 y r s$ had a total of 410 participants compared to the $60-69 y r s$ who had 2286 participants. We appreciate that variation of participants per group limits the ability to make robust comparisons per age band, however, as this was a review, we could not predict the number of studies, and subsequently the number of participants that would be included. We acknowledge this as a limitation of this review and we suggest that future studies should try to have similar numbers of data points to reduce the impact of confounding factors on the analysis, allowing for more meaningful analysis and comparisons.

The primary aim of many studies included in our review was not to determine the rate of change across the adult lifespan, and consequently, methodological heterogeneity was present across the included studies
with variations in aims, levels and nature of physical activity and activities of daily living, sample population and study context. For example, some study sample populations consisted of different sports or same sports and different activity levels. Several of the included studies did not report physical activity levels, and therefore, we could not control for this as a confounding factor due to the lack of extractable data. We acknowledge the importance of physical activity levels on muscle morphology and function, however, our primary aim was to determine the magnitude of change in anterior thigh MT, Therefore, based on the evidence and studies not including physical activity data, it was decided to report the age-related decline in anterior thigh MT per annum.

Gender differences have been reported within this review, however, we have only provided crude estimates of age-related changes in anterior thigh MT rather. This was appropriate as missing data from the included studies impacted on the level of analysis that could have been included. We appreciate that we do not provide a complete picture of gender differences across age bands, and we recommend that future reviews provide a more robust analysis of gender differences which include factors such as body mass, height and physical activity levels.

A shortcoming of the analysis was that we only pooled data from studies of the rectus femoris and vastus intermedius muscles. This provided consistency but meant that studies measuring thickness of other thigh muscles were excluded. We acknowledge that this precludes gaining a complete picture of anterior thigh muscle change and we recommend that future reviewers evaluate different sites to provide a comprehensive overview. Additionally, another issue with the analysis of the review is the use of single point estimates as this makes the conclusions of about the rate of decline less reliable, however, due to the heterogeneity of the included studies, we felt that further analysis was not appropriate and instead provide a single point rate of change across the lifespan and per decade. Future reviews, with lower heterogeneity, should conduct further multi-level analysis to improve the robustness of conclusions.

The authors are aware that the conclusions made from this review are somewhat limited by not controlling for confounding factors such as physical activity data. That said, this is the first review to provide preliminary data on age-related changes in anterior MT across the lifespan and age decades. These initial findings provide comparative data that can be used both in clinical practice and future research. Despite some of these limitations being addressed in our review, we encourage investigators of future studies to document levels of physical activity and report age range and mean age of samples, and if possible, banding age categories by decades to standardise reporting and categorising of age groups.

## Conclusion

In conclusion, the rate of decrease in mean anterior thigh MT of adults ( $18-80 \mathrm{yrs}$ ) was 0.02 cm per annum and 0.05 cm per annum between 50 and $80 y r s$ of age. The $29 \%$ difference observed within this review between the youngest and oldest group is similar to those from studies which have used MRI to quantify age related changes. We provide evidence that females are more susceptible to age-related decreases in mean anterior thigh MT (33 \%) than males (24 \%). These findings provide comparative data for clinical practice and future research and offer initial insights to changes in anterior thigh MT for males and females through the adult lifespan.

The evidence from primary research suggests that $B$ mode US can detect age-related differences in anterior thigh MT and could be used by health care professionals as a diagnostic imaging tool for sarcopenia in field settings because it is portable, versatile and inexpensive compared with MRI and Dual X-ray Absorptiometry. We recommend the need for more longitudinal and cross-sectional studies on a large sample of healthy adults with similar proportions of participants in each decade to provide robust data on the age-related changes in anterior thigh MT.

## CRediT authorship contribution statement

Isobel Jacob: Writing - review \& editing, Writing - original draft, Visualization, Validation, Resources, Project administration, Methodology, Investigation, Formal analysis, Data curation, Conceptualization. Gareth Jones: Writing - review \& editing, Validation, Supervision, Methodology, Conceptualization. Peter Francis: Writing - review \& editing, Validation, Supervision, Methodology, Conceptualization. Mark I Johnson: Writing - review \& editing, Validation, Supervision, Methodology, Conceptualization.

## Declaration of competing interest

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

## Data availability

Data will be made available on request.

## Declarations

Ethics and consent for publication: Not applicable

## Funding

no funding was received for this project

## Availability of data and materials

The datasets used and/or analysed during the current study are available from the corresponding author on reasonable request

Peter Francis receives research funding in support of research projects from minimalist footwear company Vivobarefoot. Peter advises the live barefoot foundation on its scientific strategy and the accuracy of its outreach activities; he receives an honorarium for this work.

Mark I. Johnson reports no affiliation to private companies, founding a private company, receiving any personal grants from a private company, holding shares of a private company, and/or holding patents. Within the previous 5 years Mark I. Johnson reports that he has received book royalties from Oxford University press. Within the previous 5 years Mark I. Johnson's employer has received financial income from GlaxoSmithKline, TENSCare Ltd. and LifeCare Ltd. for expert consultancy services. Within the previous 5 years Mark I. Johnson has received research awards / grants from The Neuromodulation Society of the United Kingdom and Ireland to develop an online distance learning educational package, and GalaxoSmithKline to lead an Investigator Sponsored Study on transcutaneous electrical nerve stimulation to alleviate pain.

## Supplementary materials

Supplementary material associated with this article can be found, in the online version, at doi:10.1016/j.aggp.2024.100037.

## References

Abe, T., et al. (2011). Age-related, site-specific muscle loss in 1507 Japanese men and women aged 20 to 95 years. Journal of Sports Science \& Medicine, 10(1), 145-150. Abe, T., et al. (2012b). Relationship between site-specific loss of thigh muscle and gait performance in women: The HIREGASAKI study. Archives of Gerontology and Geriatrics, 55(2), e21-e25.
Abe, T., et al. (2012a). Lower body site-specific sarcopenia and accelerometerdetermined moderate and vigorous physical activity: The HIREGASAKI study. Aging Clinical and Experimental Research, 24(6), 657-662.

Abe, T., et al. (2014h). Site-specific thigh muscle loss as an independent phenomenon for age-related muscle loss in middle-aged and older men and women. Age (Dordrecht, Netherlands), 36(3), 9634
Abe, T., et al. (2014g). Is muscle strength ratio a criterion for diagnosis of site-specific muscle loss? Geriatrics \& Gerontology International, 14(4), 837-844.
Abe, T., et al. (2014e). Skeletal muscle mass, bone mineral density, and walking performance in masters cyclists. Rejuvenation Research, 17(3), 291-296.
Abe, T., et al. (2014d). Association between forearm muscle thickness and age-related loss of skeletal muscle mass, handgrip and knee extension strength and walking performance in old men and women: A pilot study. Ultrasound in Medicine \& Biology, 40(9), 2069-2075.
Abe, T., et al. (2014c). Association between site-specific muscle loss of lower body and one-leg standing balance in active women: The HIREGASAKI study. Geriatrics \& Gerontology International, 14(2), 381-387.
Abe, T., et al. (2014b). Prevalence of site-specific thigh sarcopenia in Japanese men and women. Age (Dordrecht, Netherlands), 36(1), 417-426.
Abe, T., et al. (2014a). Age-related site-specific muscle wasting of upper and lower extremities and trunk in Japanese men and women. Age (Dordrecht, Netherlands), 36 (2), 813-821.

Abe, T., et al. (2015b). Prediction and validation of DXA-derived appendicular lean soft tissue mass by ultrasound in older adults. Age (Dordrecht, Netherlands), 37(6), 114.
Abe, T., et al. (2015a). Validity of ultrasound prediction equations for total and regional muscularity in middle-aged and older men and women. Ultrasound in Medicine \& Biology, 41(2), 557-564.
Abe, T., et al. (2018). DXA-rectified appendicular lean mass: Development of ultrasound prediction models in older adults. The Journal of Nutrition, Health \& Aging, 22(9), 1080-1085.
Abe, T., Kearns, C. F., \& Fukunaga, T. (2003). Sex differences in whole body skeletal muscle mass measured by magnetic resonance imaging and its distribution in young Japanese adults. British Journal of Sports Medicine, 37(5), 436-440.
Abe, T., Kojima, K., \& Stager, J. M. (2014f). Skeletal muscle mass and muscular function in master swimmers is related to training distance. Rejuvenation Research, 17(5), 415-421.
Akima, H., et al. (2017). Relationship between quadriceps echo intensity and functional and morphological characteristics in older men and women. Archives of Gerontology and Geriatrics, 70, 105-111.
Cadore, E. L., et al. (2012b). Echo intensity is associated with skeletal muscle power and cardiovascular performance in elderly men. Exp Gerontol, 47(6), 473-478.
Cadore, E. L., et al. (2012a). Strength prior to endurance intra-session exercise sequence optimizes neuromuscular and cardiovascular gains in elderly men. Exp Gerontol, 47 (2), 164-169.

Candow, D. G., et al. (2006). Protein supplementation before and after resistance training in older men. The European Journal of Applied Physiology, 97(5), 548-556.
Candow, D. G., et al. (2008). Low-dose creatine combined with protein during resistance training in older men. Medicine and Science in Sports and Exercise, 40(9), 1645-1652.
Candow, D. G., et al. (2011). Short-term heavy resistance training eliminates age-related deficits in muscle mass and strength in healthy older males. Journal of Strength and Conditioning Research / National Strength \& Conditioning Association, 25(2), 326-333.
Candow, D. G., et al. (2014). Comparison of creatine supplementation before versus after supervised resistance training in healthy older adults. Research in Sports Medicine (Print), 22(1), 61-74.
Cornish, S. M., \& Chilibeck, P. D. (2009). Alpha-linolenic acid supplementation and resistance training in older adults. Applied Physiology, Nutrition, and Metabolism = Physiologie Appliquee, Nutrition et Metabolisme, 34(1), 49-59.
Cruz-Jentoft, A. J., et al. (2019). Sarcopenia: Revised European consensus on definition and diagnosis. Age and Ageing, 16-31.
Delmonico, M. J., et al. (2009). Longitudinal study of muscle strength, quality, and adipose tissue infiltration. The American Journal of Clinical Nutrition, 90(6), 1579-1585.
English, C., Fisher, L., \& Thoirs, K. (2012). Reliability of real-time ultrasound for measuring skeletal muscle size in human limbs in vivo: A systematic review. Clinical Rehabilitation, 26(10), 934-944.
Frontera, W. R., et al. (1985). Muscle fiber size and function in elderly humans: A longitudinal study. Journal of Applied Physiology, 105(2), 637-642, 2008.
Fukumoto, Y., et al. (2012b). Skeletal muscle quality assessed from echo intensity is associated with muscle strength of middle-aged and elderly persons. European Journal of Applied Physiology, 112(4), 1519-1525.
Fukumoto, Y., et al. (2012a). Muscle mass and composition of the hip, thigh and abdominal muscles in women with and without hip osteoarthritis. Ultrasound in Medicine \& Biology, 38(9), 1540-1545.
Fukumoto, Y., et al. (2015). Age-related ultrasound changes in muscle quantity and quality in women. Ultrasound in Medicine \& Biology, 41(11), 3013-3017.
Gallagher, D., et al. (1985). Appendicular skeletal muscle mass: Effects of age, gender, and ethnicity. Journal of Applied Physiology, 83(1), 229-239, 1997.
Goodpaster, B. H., et al. (2006). The loss of skeletal muscle strength, mass, and quality in older adults: The health, aging and body composition study. The Journal of Gerontology. Series A, Biological Sciences and Medical Sciences, 61(10), 1059-1064.
Herrick, I., et al. (2017). Anterior thigh tissue thickness measured using ultrasound imaging in older recreational female golfers and sedentary controls. Geriatrics (Basel, Switzerland), 2(1), 10.

Hida, T., et al. (2018). <Editors' Choice> Ultrasound measurement of thigh muscle thickness for assessment of sarcopenia. Nagoya Journal of Medical Science, 80(4), 519-527.
Higgins, J. P. T., Higgins, J. P. T., \& Cochrane, C. (2019). Cochrane handbook for systematic reviews of interventions, in cochrane book series. Hoboken, NJ: WileyBlackwell. p. xxviii, 694 pp.: Illustrations (some colour.
Hughes, V. A., et al. (2002). Longitudinal changes in body composition in older men and women: Role of body weight change and physical activity. The American Journal of Clinical Nutrition, 76(2), 473-481.
Janssen, I., et al. (1985). Skeletal muscle mass and distribution in 468 men and women aged 18-88yr. Journal of Applied Physiology, 89(1), 81-88.
Joy, J. M., et al. (2015). Supplementation with a proprietary blend of ancient peat and apple extract may improve body composition without affecting hematology in resistance-trained men. Applied Physiology, Nutrition, and Metabolism $=$ Physiologie Appliquee, Nutrition et Metabolisme, 40(11), 1171-1177.
Kanehisa, H., \& Fukunaga, T. (2013). Association between body mass index and muscularity in healthy older Japanese women and men. Journal of Physiological Anthropology, 32(1), 4.
Kubo, K., et al. (2003). Muscle architectural characteristics in women aged 20-79 years. Medicine and Science in Sports and Exercise, 35(1), 39-44.
Kyle, U. G., et al. (2001). Age-related differences in fat-free mass, skeletal muscle, body cell mass and fat mass between 18 and 94 years. European Journal of Clinical Nutrition, 55(8), 663-672.
Lindle, R. S., et al. (1985). Age and gender comparisons of muscle strength in 654 women and men aged 20-93 yr. Journal of Applied Physiology, 83(5), 1581-1587, 1997.
Lynch, N. A., et al. (1985). Muscle quality. I. Age-associated differences between arm and leg muscle groups. Journal of Applied Physiology, 86(1), 188-194, 1999.
Maden-Wilkinson, T. M., et al. (2013). Comparison of MRI and DXA to measure muscle size and age-related atrophy in thigh muscles. Journal of Musculoskeletal \& Neuronal Interactions, 13(3), 320-328.
Matta, T. T., et al. (2017). Selective hypertrophy of the quadriceps musculature after 14 weeks of isokinetic and conventional resistance training. Clinical Physiology and Functional Imaging, 37(2), 137-142.
Meirelles, C. M., \& Gomes, P. S. C. (2016). Effects of short-term carbohydrate restrictive and conventional hypoenergetic diets and resistance training on strength gains and muscle thickness. Journal of Sports Science \& Medicine, 15(4), 578-584.
Miyatani, M., et al. (2002). Validity of ultrasonograph muscle thickness measurements for estimating muscle volume of knee extensors in humans. The European Journal of Applied Physiology, 86(3), 203-208.
Nakatani, M., et al. (2016). Validity of muscle thickness-based prediction equation for quadriceps femoris volume in middle-aged and older men and women. European Journal of Applied Physiology, 116(11-12), 2125-2133.
Newman, A. B., et al. (2003). Strength and muscle quality in a well-functioning cohort of older adults: The health, aging and body composition study. Journal of the American Geriatrics Society, 51(3), 323-330.
Nishihara, K., et al. (2018). Correlation of physical function with the thickness of multiple muscles of the quadriceps femoris in community-dwelling elderly individuals. Clinical Interventions in Aging, 13, 1945-1951.
Rech, A., et al. (2014). Echo intensity is negatively associated with functional capacity in older women. Age (Dordrecht, Netherlands), 36(5), 9708.
Reimers, K., et al. (1993). Skeletal muscle sonography: A correlative study of echogenicity and morphology. Journal of Ultrasound in Medicine : Official Journal of the American Institute of Ultrasound in Medicine, 12(2), 73-77.
Sanada, K., et al. (2006). Prediction and validation of total and regional skeletal muscle mass by ultrasound in Japanese adults. The European Journal of Applied Physiology, 96 (1), 24-31.

Sipilä, S., \& Suominen, H. (1996). Quantitative ultrasonography of muscle: Detection of adaptations to training in elderly women. Archives of Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation, 77(11), 1173-1178.
Stringer, H. J., \& Wilson, D. (2018). The role of ultrasound as a diagnostic tool for sarcopenia. The Journal of Frailty \& Aging, 7(4), 258-261.
Takai, Y., et al. (2013). Validity of ultrasound muscle thickness measurements for predicting leg skeletal muscle mass in healthy Japanese middle-aged and older individuals. Journal of Physiological Anthropology, 32(1), 12-12.
Takai, Y., et al. (2014). Applicability of ultrasound muscle thickness measurements for predicting fat-free mass in elderly population. The Journal of Nutrition, Health \& Aging, 18(6), 579-585.
Taniguchi, M., et al. (2017). Increase in echo intensity and extracellular-to-intracellular water ratio is independently associated with muscle weakness in elderly women. The European Journal of Applied Physiology, 117(10), 2001-2007.
Thiebaud, R. S., et al. (2017). Appendicular lean mass and site-specific muscle loss in the extremities correlate with dynamic strength. Clinical Physiology and Functional Imaging, 37(3), 328-331.
Watanabe, Y., et al. (2013b). Echo intensity obtained from ultrasonography images reflecting muscle strength in elderly men. Clinical Interventions in Aging, 8, 993-998.
Watanabe, Y., et al. (2013a). Increased muscle size and strength from slow-movement, low-intensity resistance exercise and tonic force generation. Journal of Aging and Physical Activity, 21(1), 71-84.


[^0]:    * Corresponding author at: Musculoskeletal Research Group, Leeds Beckett University, City Campus, Leeds LS1 3HE, United Kingdom.

    E-mail address: i.jacob@leedsbeckett.ac.uk (I. Jacob).

